

From Radha-Syama to Maya-devi Dhama

Introduction

This blog is about the original position of the soul.

Was the soul originally in love with Sri Sri Radha Krishna in the Goloka Vrndavana planet, or with one of Their Sri Sri Laksmi-Narayana expansions on a Vaikuntha planet?

Or were we eternally in the Brahmajyoti, Krishna's effulgence and then on coming out we had the choice to either fall down to the clouds of illusion, the material world or rise up to Krishna seva, Krishna consciousness, the spiritual world?-brahman-tatastha-patita-vada.

Or are we eternally here?-anadi-patita-vada.

Or are we still in the spiritual world with a pastime expansion going around through the prison cells, the material bodies, of Durga-devi dhama?-svapna-matra-patita-vada or dream-vada.

This last theory is explained in the section "dream vada".

The conclusion: we were originally in the love of Sri Sri Radha Krishna in Their planet.

Srila Prabhupada said: "So the Mayavadi philosopher, their spiritual life means to merge into the Brahman effulgence, and the Vaisnava philosopher to go back to Goloka Vrndavana, Vaikuntha, where God is situated, and become His associate person." (Philosophy, Srila Prabhupada discussions with Hayagriva, on Arthur Schopenhauer)

The book is in the form of debates.

The different chapters treat the various aspects of the subject, and can be read independently; you don't have to read from 1 to 2 to 3 etc.

Please chant

Hare Krishna Hare Krishna
Krishna Krishna Hare Hare
Hare Rama Hare Rama
Rama Rama Hare Hare

and go back to Sri Sri Radha Krishna's planet.

Contents

1. Fall-vada in the Mahabharata, the Puranas and Upanisads
2. Three latest acaryas on fall of the jiva
3. Scriptures and tattva-darsinas on fall-vada
4. We fell from Srimati Radharani originally, not from Sri Maha-Visnu
5. Misconceptions on jiva-origin and fall
6. We tried to be tatastha...
7. Maha-Visnu-envy-fall-vada (mef) is 94% Goloka-envy-fall-vada (gef)
8. "From Vaikuntha no one falls" is not a categorical absolute
9. Soul falling from brahmajyoti is rejected by Srila Prabhupada
10. Margin is always in contact with matter and spirit
11. From Radha-Syama to Maya-devi dhama
12. A servant of the lord cannot fall from Vaikuntha
13. Goloka Fall-down is confirmed by Srila Prabhupada
14. Bona-fide study rests the case; we fell from love
15. Back to Godhead means back to the Head God, Krishna
16. Lost paradise football
17. We fell from the rasa-lila
18. Jiva dance back to rasa-lila
19. The point has no length, no breadth, Essay on sakhalAnAm: no unsteadiness
20. Displeasing Me, do fall into the mortal world
21. Back to home is the oasis, not the desert
22. Come back to Me and dance with Me. Why rot in this rotting dance?

Dream vada

23. Liberated souls don't expand fallen amsas
24. Liberated souls expand lila amsas
25. Gopis don't dance in Durga's rasa-lila even in dreams
26. O, Hare, O, Krishna, kindly accept me again. I am fallen in this material world

Three Latest Acaryas on Fall of the Jiva

The recent article, "Mahavakyas of Goloka-Envy-Fallvadis" by Av. dasa is based on a misinterpretation of Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura's Jaiva Dharma ch. 15-16. The statements in these chapters of falling as an associate of Maha-Visnu— as Av. dasa explains in his version— should be understood as that the soul is on the way down from Goloka or Vaikuntha and gets a second chance of choice at the border of the spiritual and material world.

Srila Prabhupada writes in SB 3.12.3: “The Lord first of all tries to protect him from the trap, but when the living entity persists on gliding down to hell, the Lord helps him to forget his real position to give the chance to see if he is happy by misusing his independence”.

Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura, in his Sri Sri Kalyana kalpa-taru, describes that the soul originally falls from Vrndavana, for example, from dancing in the rasa-lila.

cid-dhama-bhaskara Krishna, tanra jyotirgata
ananta citkana jiba tisthe avirata

Krishna is the shining sun of this all-cognizant spiritual abode, and within His effulgence dwell innumerable fine particles of pure cognizance called jiva.

sei jiba prema-dharmi, Krishna-gata-prana
sada Krishnakrsta, bhakti-sudha kore' pana

These jiva souls are by very nature full of pure ecstatic love and are all the dearly beloved of Lord Krishna. Always being attracted by Krishna, they continuously drink the ambrosial nectar of devotion.

nana-bhava-misrita piya dasya-rasa
krsner ananta-gune sada thake basa

Enjoying a mixture of various moods in the mellow of servitude, the jivas eternally remain subjugated and controlled by Krishna's unlimited virtuous qualities.

Krishna mata, Krishna pita, Krishna sahka, pati
ei sab bhinna-bhava Krishna kore rati

They also love Krishna in all the different moods of being related to Him as a mother, father, friend, or husband.

Krishna se purusa ek nitya brndabane
jiba-gana nari-brnda, rame Krishna sane

Eternally in Vrndavana Krishna is the only male (purusa), and all the jivas there enjoy pastimes in His company in the role of females (prakrti).

sei to' ananda-lila ja'r nai anta
ataeva Krishna-lila akhanda ananta

There is no end to all of these blissful pastimes; therefore Krishna's pastimes are known for being undisputedly supreme and unlimited.

je-sab jiber 'bhoga-banca upajilo
purusa bhavete ta'ra jade paravesilo

All the souls, in whom the desire to enjoy separately awakens, have to enter into the material world under the false conception of being a male (a purusa).

maya-karya jada maya--nitya-sakti-chaya
Krishna-dasi sei satya, kara-kartri maya

Illusory material activities as well as maya herself are both the shadow reflections of the eternal potency. In reality, maya is the eternal maidservant of Krishna, but her job is to be in charge of operating the prison-house of the material world.

sei maya adarser samasta bisesa
loiya gathilo bisva jahe purna klesa

This illusory energy maya, has created the material universe exactly like an imitation model of the real spiritual variegatedness, but with the added feature of being full of various miseries.

jiba jadi hoilena Krishna-bahimukha
mayadevi tabe ta'r jachilena sukha

If by chance a living entity becomes averse to the Supreme Lord Krishna, then Mayadevi's duty is to voluntarily offer her temptations of material happiness.

maya-sukhe matta jiba sri-Krishna bhulilo
sei se avidya-base asmita janmilo

Intoxicated by maya's illusory happiness, the living entity then forgets Krishna. Under the influence of such ignorance, false egoistic selfishness arises.

bhramite bhramite jadi sadhu-sanga hoy
punaraya gupta nitya-dharmer udoy

Thus wandering and wandering, if by chance the poor soul gets the association of the devotees of the Lord, then her eternal nature, which has been for so long covered over, will once again become aroused.

sadhu-sange Krishna-katha hoy alocana
purva-bhava udi' kate mayar bandhan

By discussing topics concerning Krishna in the association of devotees, and thus awakening her previous mentality of servitude to Krishna, all bondage to maya's illusion become severed.

Krishna-prati jiba jabe korena iksana

bidya-rupa maya kore' bandhana chedana

When the conditioned soul thus looks towards Krishna, then by such an act, this very same maya, in the form of transcendental knowledge, severs all of her material bonds.

mayika jagate bidya nitya-brndabana
jiber sadhana-janya kore' bibhavana

The seat of this transcendental knowledge is present within this very universe as the eternal Vrndavana-dhama in India . Lord Krishna expands His abode and pastimes at this Vrndavana just to facilitate the conditioned souls' practice of devotional service.

sei brndabane jiba bhavavistha ho'ye
nitya seva labha kore' caitanya-asraye

When she comes into contact with this Vrndavana, the living entity becomes overwhelmed and lost in emotional ecstasy. Remaining under the shelter of Lord Caitanya, she attains eternal service.

prakatita lila, ar goloka-bilasa
ek tattva, bhinna noy, dvidvidha prakasa

The Lord's pastimes of appearing in this world, as well as His pastimes in Goloka, are one and the same truth. Being non-different, they are simply two types of manifestations of the same pastimes.

nitya-lila nitya-dasa-ganer niloy
e prakata-lila baddha-jiber asroy

The eternal pastimes in Goloka are the abode of all the eternally liberated servitors, whereas the manifest pastimes in the material world are the refuge for all of the bound-up conditioned living entities.

ataeva brndabana jiber avasa
asar samsare nitya-tattver prakasa

Therefore Vrndavana is the living entities original eternal home, manifesting its own eternally true nature within the dead material world. (Kalyana kalpataru 13-36)

Also, see these statements from Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati's Harmonist:

"We are expelled Adams and Eves from paradise.... Dislocated stars like us shooting from the ever-glowing infinite fountainhead of the Transcendence. The shooting stars are again retracted by the same fountainhead through the power of instructions and bliss.... this will carry them back to their original position to be dovetailed with the Absolute."

“Question: I cannot understand this world.

Answer: It is camp life. This world is not our original abode. It is meant for certain purposes. After that we are to proceed to our original home. This world is not a desirable place. It is not good to be enticed to stay here for a long time, forgetting our original abode. We stay there

with Godhead. We are the eternal servants of Godhead. But the real truth is that we are to serve Godhead in the five different capacities. It is only when we deem it fit to come down to this world to lord it over other finite entities for our enjoyment that our real position happens to be forgot to some extent. This contingency arises when we want to deprive our Lord.” (Forgetfulness of the Humanists, An article originally published in The Harmonist on Sept 19th, 1934 - Vol XXI No.2)

Comment: We were originally in our original home or abode, with the Godhead. This is our real eternal position. Then we wanted to deprive our Lord and deemed it fit to come down to this world. We don't come originally from the Brahman effulgence.

"Sri Radhika is the Source of all individual souls whose function is to be employed in the service of Sri Krishna by the alternative methods [of] loyal conscious submission, neutrality or actual opposition. The individual souls serve Sri Krishna as constituents of Sri Radhika. When they forget that they are constituents of Sri Radhika they forget the nature of their own selves, and engage in the abnormal activities of the mundane plane." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 615)

He writes three pages later:

"Siva and mahamaya are closely connected with the jiva. The connection of jiva with Siva and mahamaya is established only when he is disassociated from the service of Sri Sri Radha Krishna."

And, this from his commentaries on Srimad Bhagavatam:

"Having forgotten Krishna, the conditioned living entity is suffering the misdirection and perversion of his own so-called intelligence. The living entities are fragmental parts of the supreme shelter, Krishna , but have fallen from Krishna's kingdom of spiritual pastimes." (Srimad Bhagavatam 11.2.38 purport by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakur)

And from his Caitanya Bhagavata's translation and commentaries:

"toma-saba' lagiya krishnera avatara
hena krishna bhaja, saba chada anacara"

"Krishna has incarnated for your benefit. Therefore give up all sinful activities and worship Krishna."

Commentary: The eternal pastimes that svayam-rupa Krishna performs with His 'attracted' associates in Vraja are meant for removing the misfortune of the living entities, so to engage in service other than the worship of Krishna is most unbecoming . Therefore, understanding yourselves as 'attracted' in your relationship with the Lord, you should try to awaken your constitutional propensities... Attracted living entities have no propensity other than the worship of that Krishna. The moment the attracted souls are distracted , they glance towards maya from Vaikuntha. At that time the universe is created and material enjoyment overcomes the constitutional duties of the living entities belonging to the marginal potency of the Lord and makes them averse to Krishna."

(Caitanya Bhagavata chapter 13, text 84 commentary of Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati)

Our further comments on the points of Av. dasa:

On "no one falls": The spiritual world is unlimited and the material world is a limited area (see Srila Rupa Gosvami's Laghu-bhagavatamrta 5.286). Millions, trillions, etc., of souls in the material world means "no one" compared to the *unlimited* souls in the *unlimited* spiritual world. Just as a point has no length and breadth.

This is also concluded in the following statements of Abhaya Carana Bhaktivedanta Swami Srila Prabhupada, where he states that only a few fall down:

" Question Dr. John Mize : the soul somehow falls out of this blissful condition due to pride, much like the Christian thesis that the devil fell out of heaven due to pride...why the soul would be so silly, so foolish, so insane, as to do such a thing.

Prabhupada: That is his independence... They committed offense...That was their fault...So we sometimes commit mistake. That is also misuse of independence.

Dr. John Mize: Are more souls falling all the time?

Prabhupada: Not all the time. But there is the tendency of fall down, not for all, but because there is independence...Just like a government constructing a city and constructs also prison house because the government knows that somebody will be criminal... in the prison house, there are some population, but they are not majority. The majority of the population, they are outside the prison house. Similarly, majority of living being, part and parcel of God, they are in the spiritual world. Only a few fall down.... If you make it one way only, that you cannot become fallen down, that is not independence. That is force." (Srila Prabhupada Conversation, June 23, 1975)

And he states that the soul doesn't fall originally from the brahmayjoti.

"Because he falls down from brahma-sayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krishna... in His lila or sport." (SPL, 1973)

"The next question, about the living entities falling down in this material world are not from the impersonal brahman. Existence in the impersonal brahman is also within the category of non-Krishna consciousness. Those who are in the brahman effulgence they are also in the fallen condition, so there is no question of falling down from a fallen condition. When fall takes place, it means falling down from the non-fallen condition. The non-fallen condition is Krishna consciousness. So long one can maintain pure Krishna consciousness he is not fallen down. As soon as he becomes out of Krishna consciousness immediately he is fallen down." (Srila Prabhupada Letter, June 13, 1970)

Here he states the souls fall from the Krishna's spiritual kingdom to His secondary kingdom:

"...the kingdom of God where spiritual varieties are there. They are not variety-less. Otherwise, the Lord would not have said that samstha. There is a regular establishment... We are all belong to that establishment, but being forgetful, we are now in this material world. Just like sometimes some of us becomes crazy and he is, goes to the lunatic asylum, similarly, those who become crazy, such spiritual identities, they are put into this lunatic asylum. It is called material world." (Srila Prabhupada Lecture on Bhagavad-gita 6.11-21)

Next statement is that the soul falls from Krishna's pastimes on Krishna-loka. Guru-kripa: "How is it that, if everything is free from envy, free from bad material elements...

Srila Prabhupada: That is independence. In spite of all these things, because you have got little independence, you can violate.

Sudama: It is very hard thing to understand.

Srila Prabhupada: No, it is not difficult. It is not difficult.

Acyutananda: It is not difficult. They don't want to understand.

Srila Prabhupada: Because you are part and parcel of God, God has got full independence, but you have got little independence, proportionately, because you are part and parcel...

Acyutananda: But in the Gita, it says, "Once coming there, he never returns."

Srila Prabhupada: But if he likes, he can return.

Acyutananda: He can return.

Srila Prabhupada: That independence has to be accepted, little independence. We can misuse that. Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare. That misuse is the cause of our fall down.

Acyutananda: In Krishna book it says that there were some color fighting in Dvaraka. They were throwing color. And some men became lusty seeing the women. So is... Will that be the first part of their fall down, to be in Vaikuntha and think of personal lust with Krishna's associates?

Srila Prabhupada: Yes." (Srila Prabhupada Conversation, Mayapur, February 19, 1976)

In the next quote, Srila Prabhupada explains how one can fall from the association of any form of the Lord: Maha-Vishnu, Narayana, Krishna, etc.

"Regarding your questions concerning the spirit souls falling into Maya's influence, it is not that those who have developed a passive relationship with Krishna are more likely to fall into nescient activities. Usually anyone who has developed his relationship with Krishna does not fall down in any circumstance, but because the independence is always there, the soul may fall down from any position or any relationship by misusing his independence. But his relationship with Krishna is never lost, simply it is forgotten by the influence of Maya, so it may be regained or revived by the process of hearing the Holy Name of Krishna and then the devotee engages himself in the service of the Lord which is his original or constitutional position. The relationship of the living entity with Krishna is eternal as both Krishna and the living entity are eternal; the process is one of revival only, nothing new." (Srila Prabhupada Letter, February 27, 1970)

Here again he states that the soul falls from Krishna's sports:

"First the attachment comes to enjoy sense gratification. Even with Krishna desire for sense gratification is there. There is a dormant attitude for forgetting Krishna and creating an atmosphere for enjoying independently. Just like at the edge of the beach, sometimes the water covers, sometimes there is dry sand, coming and going. Our position is like that, sometimes covered, sometimes free, just like at the edge of the tide. As soon as we forget, immediately the illusion is there. Just like as soon as we sleep, dream is there... As soon as we try to become Lord, immediately we are covered by Maya. Formerly we were with Krishna in His lila or sport.... Because he falls down from brahma-sayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krishna... in His lila or sport" (Srila Prabhupada Letter, June 6, 1972)

In the next quote, Srila Prabhupada states how one falls down from playing football with Krishna.

"....so long the spark is within the fire, it has got the same quality, illumination and burning quality. But as soon as he falls down- he is extinguished, no more illumination, no more burning power. So our position is like that. Although we are part and parcel of God, mamaivamso [Bg. 15.7], because we have cyuta, fallen down from our spiritual atmosphere.....Just like spiritual atmosphere, Krishna's friends, cowherd boys, they're playing

with Krishna. That is also playing. And here in this material world the boys they also play football play. But these two plays are different. One is spiritual and another is material....There are three chances. One chance is the spark falls down on dry grass-then there is fire. As soon as the spark falls down on the dry grass there is fire for some time. And when the spark falls down on the ground, it is extinguished. And when the fire, spark, falls down on the water, then it is not only extinguished; it becomes no more inflammable. Very difficult to inflame. Similarly, when we fall down from the fire, spiritual world, we associate with three qualities." (Srla Prabhupada Lecture on Srimad Bhagavatam 1.7.16, Vrndavana)

"Devotee: Did Krishna play that? (soccer, football play)
Prabhupada: Unless Krishna played, how you can play?"

The last quotes are from the philosophy conversations with Hayagriva on the neo-Platonist, Plotinus.

Hayagriva: "Plotinus writes, "Let us flee then to the beloved fatherland. Here is sound council. But what is this flight? How are we to gain the open sea? The fatherland for us is there whence we have come. There is the father... "If the souls remain in the intelligible or spiritual realm with the Soul, or Supersoul, they are beyond harm and share in the soul's governance. They are like kings who live with the high King and govern with Him and like Him do not come down from the palace. But if they wish to be independent, if they are tired, you may say, of living with someone else"... So when the individual soul decides to withdraw, he becomes fragmented, isolated and weak, when he decides to withdraw from the, what he calls the palace of the King.

He uses this following metaphor. He says, "We are like a chorus grouped about a conductor who allow their attention to be distracted by the audience. If, however, they"—that is we, the individual souls—"were to turn toward their conductor, they would sing as they should and would really be with him. We are always around the One. If we were not, we would dissolve and cease to exist. Yet our gaze does not remain fixed upon the One. When we look at it, we then attain the end of our desires and find rest. Then it is that all discord passes. We dance an inspired dance around it. In this dance the soul looks upon the source of life, the source of the intelligence, the root of being, the cause of the good, the root of the soul. All these entities emanate from the One without any lessening, for it is not a material mass."

Srla Prabhupada: Yes, when we divert our attention to the illusory energy, then we fall down.

Hayagriva: Plotinus accounts for the fall of the soul in this way. He says, "How is it that souls forget the divinity that begot them? This evil that has befallen them has its source in self-will, in being born, in becoming different and desiring to be independent...Once having tasted the pleasures of independence, they use their freedom to go any direction that leads away from their origin, and when they have gone a great distance, they even forget that they came from it."

Srla Prabhupada: That's a fact."

Scriptures and Tattva-darsinas on Fall-vada

The following is a reply to Av. dasa's article, "The Characteristics of Goloka-Envy-Fallvada". He quotes Srila Prabhupada on Srimad Bhagavatam 3.15.33 to proof his non fall-vada: "...complete harmony in Vaikuntha...", but see Srila Prabhupada in 4.28.54 purport explaining this:

"The original home of the living entity and the Supreme Personality of Godhead is the spiritual world. In the spiritual world both the Lord and the living entities live together very peacefully. Since the living entity remains engaged in the service of the Lord, they both share a blissful life in the spiritual world. However, when the living entity wants to enjoy himself, he falls down into the material world..... Because of his forgetfulness, the living entity does not know that the Supreme Lord is accompanying him as the Supersoul. ... Although the Lord follows him as a friend, the living entity, because of forgetful material existence, does not recognize Him."

Next point, reply on Av. dasa quoting SB 7.1.34: "How can someone fall down? It is unbelievable." We are part and parcel of the Supreme Inconceivable. So we have a spark of His inconceivability and can do something inconceivably foolish...and fall down.

Similarly, souls fall away from the presence and association of a pure devotee? Why? He is perfect. Why abandon him? So, one can also turn away from the perfect spiritual world. Is it that maya is more powerful than the pure soul?

If Yogamaya can be active in the material world (as Mahamaya or as Yogamaya; naham prakasa sarvasya yoga-maya samavrtah), why can't maya be active in the spiritual world (and take the rebel jiva out). After all, Mahamaya is an eternal associate and amsa of Yogamaya. You want to say Mahamaya is some kind of a devi, demigoddess, who is in Maha-maya? Yogamaya is the almighty Lord's energy. She can call her servants or amsa, Mahamaya or another of her agents into action at any time, as the police can enter the king's palace to seize an envious servant. True, Maya is generally not in the spiritual world (SB 2.9.10), but there can be exceptions; it is also rare that a soul is to fall down: "The population of the prison house is *nothing* in comparison to the whole population of the state".

On this also see Sri Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura on SB 3.15.25 Sarartha Darsini-commentary that even materialists can enter the spiritual world, by the will of the Lord.

"In Puranas and other scriptures, one sometimes hears that there is some momentary appearance of demons in the spiritual world, but this should not be considered actually entrance into the spiritual world, since they lack realization of spiritual happiness. However, an example may be given. Sometimes tigers or bears enter into the jewel-covered palace of the king endowed with various fragrances, since for amusement, the king desires that the populace see those animals. Similarly, the Supreme Lord, for fun, by his will brings material objects, ferocious demons, saintly persons like Bhrgu, or persons beyond the three gunas such as the Kumaras to Vaikuntha, to show to them the inhabitants of the spiritual world, and then quickly takes them away as is suitable for his purpose."

Also in Sri Brihad Bhagavatamrta we see that there are armies and army commanders in the spiritual world. They can put a criminal into the Durga or prison of the material world:

Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.1.18: "The many kinds of Vaikuntha perfection... being posted as commander of the Lord's army"

Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.4.29: "These Vaikuntha residents whom Gopa-kumara saw entering the gateway last were army commanders and other important authorities, returning late because they had been busy with various responsibilities outside."

There is scriptural evidence of eternal associates turning against the Lord, in the Puranas:

Skanda purana

5.2.57.2 "Mahesvara to Parvati: "An excellent gana (His associates, body of followers or attendants under the superintendence of lord Ganesa), proficient in music, named Ghanta was my favorite. During the period of Caksusa Manu, once, out of curiosity, he proceeded to Brahma's abode to see Brahma to show his musical proficiency. "I will propitiate Brahma, the Lord of the worlds, with my songs". Narada told this to Lord Siva. Siva angrily cursed the gana: " O Ghanta, as you have left Me and have gone to another abode for service, be fallen on the earth"..... he became a Gana once again and attained the greatest position at My side with no cause for further rebirths."

and

5.2.77.34 "A brahmana did tapa to Lord Siva for a son not born of a womb. Lord Siva called the gana's and asked: "Who among you will offer himself as his son". All stood with faces turned downwards. Pushpadanta spoke: "The gana's will not leave You and go off to the earth. They will stay here forever in Your vicinity enjoying excellent joy and not enter the despicable human womb in the greatest hell". Lord Siva answered: "Displeasing Me, do fall into the mortal world"..... Again attained the eternal position. I (Lord Siva) embraced him and placed him on My lap."

Next point of Av. Dasa: "Considering the Brahma Samhita quote 5.11 that Maha Vishnu is the creator of souls, just in the karana-samudra or causal ocean"

That is wrong. Maha-Visnu is creator of universes and souls. The translation used is of a disciple of Srila Bhaktisiddhanta. HH Bhanu Maharaja, the translator of Jiva Gosvamis commentary on Brahma samhita, wrote: "sahasra-sūu literally means "giving birth to thousands" without specifying what thousands. Therefore this cannot be used as a definite proof of Mahavisnu giving rise to all the jivas as tatastha sakti."

One Bhakta wrote "Please note that this does not refer to the unlimited nitya-baddha jīvas who are sleeping within Mahā Viṣṇu after the dissolution of the previous universe. Those jīvas are referred to separately in verse 20 of Brahma-samhitā."

We asked the translator: "I don't see two classes of souls from Maha-visnu. Is that true, are there two classes? One the conditioned souls, the other, souls just dropping from the brahmayjoti?"

Answer. "Nothing in the text or commentaries makes such a distinction.

Of course, repeatedly all the conditioned souls enter the material universes from Mahavisnu. A more decisive statement of what he is trying to prove is in Paramatma sandarbha. However, there it states that baddhas and nitya muktas arise

from tatastha sakti, while he says something different in his article.” Here the texts from Paramatma sandarbha.

37. Thus, though jīva is a śakti, it is different from the material śakti, since it is called taṭastha. It is called taṭastha because it cannot be classed as māyā since it surpasses māyā-śakti (being conscious) and it cannot be classed as Paramātmā since Paramātmā is not subject to jīva's fault of being overcome by ignorance. Though it is the śakti of Paramātmā, Paramātmā is not tinged by jīva's faults just as the sun is not covered though one ray of the sun can be covered by shadow.

47. Thus the jīvas or taṭastha-śaktis are unlimited (ananta). There are two classes of these śaktis. One is favorable to the Lord without beginning (anādīta) since these jīvas have knowledge of the Lord by their nature. The other jīvas are averse to the Lord without beginning (anādīta) since they lack knowledge of the Lord by their nature. The first type of taṭastha-śakti is endowed with the manifestation of the antaranga-śakti and consists of the eternal associates of the Lord like Garuda. These are described in Padma Purāṇa, Uttara-khaṇḍa, which is quoted in Bhagavat-sandarbha, starting with the phrase tripād-vibhūter lokāḥ tu. These jīvas of the first type are taṭastha in nature since they do not enter into the category of the Lord (īśvara): they are fixed as jīvas.”

Our comment. Thus, it is not that the jīvas in the spiritual world are not tatastha, and cannot fall down. It is not that only Maha-Visnu's emanations are tatastha jīvas, who can fall or rise. The jīvas are everywhere, always tatastha.

Brahma samhita 5.11 is thus:

sahasra-sirsa purusah sahasraksah sahasra-pat
sahasra-bahur visvatma sahasramsah sahasra-suh

"This form of Maha-visnu, the soul of the universe, creates countless universes and souls. Because he has countless avatara forms within the universes, he is said to have countless heads, countless eyes, countless feet and countless arms."

Next point:

The Bhagavad Gita verses quoted, Krishna stating that once you go back to Him, you will never return to this material world, are not about the original fall down, but about not falling again after going back to Godhead. But Srila Prabhupada states:

“Acyutananda: But in the Gita, it says, "Once coming there, he never returns.

Prabhupada: But if he likes, he can return.

Acyutananda: He can return.

Prabhupada: That independence has to be accepted, little independence. We can misuse that.

Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare. That misuse is the cause of our falldown.”

(Conversation, Mayapur, Feb. 19, 1976)

Lastly, we have had many quotes and logic in our discussions with Av. dasa. This could go on forever. Another approach is to consult the enlightened sages.

tarko 'pratishthah srutayo vibhinna nasav rishir yasya matam na bhinnam dharmasya tattvam nihitam guhayam mahajano yena gatah sa panthah:

"Dry arguments are inconclusive. A great personality whose opinion does not differ from others is not considered a great sage. Simply by studying the Vedas, which are variegated, one cannot come to the right path by which religious principles are understood. The solid truth of religious principles is hidden in the heart of an unadulterated, self-realized person. Consequently, as the sastras confirm, one should accept whatever progressive path the mahajanas advocate."

mahajano yena gatha sa pantha

We need a tattva-darsinah (Bhagavad-gita 4.34), a seer of the truth, to settle the truth. I know one spiritual master, here in ISKCON, who has pure love of Krishna; regularly, Radha Krishna, Caitanya, Nityananda, etc. visit him, also in dreams. The same as the accounts in, for example, Bhakti Ratnakara and Narottama Vilasa of Sri Narahari Chakravarti Thakura.

About one year ago, he saw the soul falling from the spiritual planets. Stopping at the border of the material and spiritual worlds for a last, second choice and "blooping" into the material world.

So, in your next article we want to hear how a tattva-darsinah in your camp in a similar way can confirm your Brahman-kaka-vada (brahmayjoti-Käraëäbdhiçäyë or Karanadakasayi Visnu karana-samudra patita-vada).

"We fall from Srimati Radharani originally", not from Sri Maha-Visnu

"Sri Radhika is the Source of all individual souls whose function is to be employed in the service of Sri Krishna by the alternative methods [of] loyal conscious submission, neutrality or actual opposition. The individual souls serve Sri Krishna as constituents of Sri Radhika. When they forget that they are constituents of Sri Radhika they forget the nature of their own selves, and engage in the abnormal activities of the mundane plane."

So says Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura in Sri Caitanya's Teaching p. 615.

In this passage, we learn that the original position of the soul is to serve Krishna as a constituent of Sri Radhika. The 'three alternative methods' means the different positions or roles servants take in the pastimes or lila's of the Lord. Only when they forget this do they "engage in the abnormal activities of the mundane plane."

We come from Radha- means eternally dependent-We fell from Radha and should go back to home, Radha.

Srila Prabhupada explains the same:

"living entities, we also belong to the spiritual prakriti, we are expansion of spiritual prakriti. Just like Srimati Radharani is always engaged in the service of the Lord, anaradhyate. Aradhyate, it is Radharani. The Radharani, the name has come from the word aradhyate. Aradhana. Aradhana means worshiping. So everyone is meant, beginning from Radharani and her expansion, Lakshmi, in Vaikuntha, lakshmi sahasra sata sambhrama sevyamanam govindam adi-purusham tam aham bhajami [Bs. 5.29]... Here we worship mother Lakshmi, goddess of fortune, to receive some favor. But in the Vaikuntha world there are many hundred thousands of Lakshmi, lakshmi sahasra sata, and they are sambhrama sevyamanam: with great respect, they are engaged in serving the Supreme Lord. So we being expansion of the spiritual Lakshmi, or Radharani, our duty is to serve Radharani, and through Radharani to serve Krishna. This is Krishna consciousness movement. We are missing this point, that instead of learning from Radharani how to serve Krishna, we are being controlled by the another prakriti, material energy, Durga..... Kirtanad eva krishnasya mukta-sangah param vrajet [SB 12.3.51]: if one takes to chanting this Hare Krishna mantra, then he becomes relieved or freed from the all contamination of this age, and param mukta-sangah, he becomes liberated and he goes back to home, back to Godhead, simply by chanting..... Just like if you become honest, if you are not criminal, then there is no police control—police may be there. But as soon as you become criminal, you come under the control of police." (Srimad-Bhagavatam 7.6.1, December 16, 1975, Bombay)

On the way down from Goloka, the falling soul gets another chance at the border between matter and spirit. Srila Prabhupada writes that the falling soul gets a warning of protection. Then there is gazing at matter and spirit, as Av. dasa proposes.

Erroneous Brahman-Kaka-patita-vada or Kaka-vada

Kaka = Karanabdhisaya or Karanadakasayi (or Maha) Visnu karana-samudra or causal ocean, patita or fall-vada

vada = theory

Kaka-vada, as presented by Av. dasa, is the theory of falling from Karanabdhisaya Visnu in the causal ocean or karana-samudra. His theory says that the soul emanates from Lord Sri Maha-Visnu after a literal beginningless- anadir- eternal, dreamless sleep or susupti in the

Brahmajyoti. And, while flying or swimming out from Maha-Visnu, the soul sees for the first time the material and the spiritual world.

This is wrong.

Kaka is also the sound the crows make.

To have a fair choice the soul should be fully Krishna conscious and see the whole of the spiritual and material worlds.

If the soul would not be fully enlightened, but dozy after the anadi-susupti and make the wrong choice - for the hell of the material world, for many mahakalpas (lifetimes of Brahma. One life of Brahma and the in-between period to the next Brahma is 622 trillion 80 billion years), that wouldn't be righteous. The soul should at that moment clearly see the Supreme Enjoyer and Controller with all His servants and decide not to surrender and be envious based on some knowledge.

Seeing the Lord and the spiritual world is on the absolute platform and non-different from being there. Thus, in this Kaka-vada all the souls in the material world have fallen down from the spiritual world, after having seen it. Just as sat-vada teaches (vada is philosophy. Sat - Soul Always Tatastha, that the soul is always tatastha, or marginal; the soul can fall from the spiritual world).

If, as Kaka-vada teaches, that the soul can fall from the border, at the beginning of his awakened life, having seen Krishna, the soul can fall from Krishna's association in the spiritual world. It is the same Krishna.

Thus, using the same logic, the soul can also originally fall from the free state in Radha-Krishna's lila.

The idea that a short gaze from the border can give pure love of Godhead is another story; conditioned souls must struggle in rituals for many many lifetimes and that soul in a few seconds gets the mercy of Krishna-consciousness— only , all krpa-siddhas there— why?

Kaka-vada is also wrong because why would the Lord lay down souls in empty sleep forever. He is lilamaya, anandamaya'bhyasat. He wants everyone in His pastimes always.

Sat-vada

The question on a real life example of fall down becomes easily answered. Whether you choose for kaka-vada or sat-vada, the soul's relation with Krishna is eternal : nitya siddha Krishna prema sadhya kabu naya sravanadi-suddha-citte karaye udaya (Caitanya-caritamrta 2.22.107) -- every soul has been with Krishna in his or her eternal relationship (svarupa).

All the sadhana- and krpa-siddhas here, had their nitya- svarupa with the Lord before they came down. Knowing their eternal relation with Lord Sri Krishna after perfecting their sadhana or after the krpa they received, we can know from which position they descended. Both are the same— generally.

Thus, wherever we read devotees becoming liberated to their nitya-svarupa; that was their original position.

One example is in the Brhad Bhagavatamrta 2.4.81-87, When the gopa, Svarupa or Gopa kumara, came back in the spiritual world, Lord Narayana says to him:

"For so long I have been eager to see you... hope had Me dancing like a fool, thinking "perhaps in this lifetime, or this, or this, or this... "

Here Srila Sanatana Gosvami comments:

"The Lord had been waiting a long time for Gopa Kumara to come back to Vaikuntha. The gopa had forgotten the Lord for many life times".

This also refutes the anadi-patita vada, the philosophy that all souls in the material world are since time eternal, without beginning, in the material world. All the other souls are eternally in the spiritual world. These eternally liberated souls will never fall. According to that idea the soul in the material world has been nowhere else ever, can get liberated and then will never return here. The souls are in the material world for no reason. All the souls could be in ecstatic love in the spiritual world, but somehow matter is there eternally and needs some residents. So they say.

But, Srila Sanatana Gosvami says: "the gopa had forgotten the Lord". That means he knew the Lord from before, from the spiritual world, because Srila Sanatana Gosvami comments: "In previous [material] lives Gopa Kumara had never chanted the names of the Lord, not even namabhasa", for which the Lord could have given him a birth near Govardhana.

But, one may counter, when Gopa Kumara comes to Krishna loka he is called "nutna", newcomer. This is because Krishna loka is the place of the Lord's nara-lila or human like pastimes. For example, Krishna again and again goes to Mathura to kill Kamsa etc., but this is forgotten again and again. The Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.6.356/357/361 and commentary describes:

"Krishna subdues Kaliya time and again, in the same way, and time and again lifts Govardhana Hill. And again and yet again He performs His many other wonderful pastimes. Thus the Lord enchants the hearts of His devotees."

Commentary (Srila Sanatana Gosvami): Since all of Krishna's pastimes, beginning with the killing of Putana, are eternal, Krishna enjoys them with His devotees in Goloka as often as they like. Yet each time a pastime is repeated, it seems completely new, as if never seen or heard of before.

"But the residents of Vraja, completely bewildered by the kalakuta poison of their supreme love for Sri Krishna, never think that any of these events has ever occurred before."

Commentary: Because the Vraja-vasis are never aware that Krishna's pastimes are repeat performances, the attraction they feel for those pastimes is never impeded. The highest states of Krishnaprema have the power to create such bewilderment.

"And, oh, the most glorious thing is that the foremost of enlightened persons, the Lord Himself, while drowning in an ocean of love for His dear devotees, cannot always remember what He has done and what He is going to do."

Commentary: Isn't perfect knowledge an automatic byproduct of love of God? Why then are the pure devotees of Goloka so forgetful? Yes, to one who has prema omniscience comes naturally, but prema, being all-powerful, can redefine what is knowledge and what is ignorance.

“The Personality of Godhead Himself, by the influence of His Yogamaya, also forgets what He did before. But though He often forgets, He sometimes remembers, if it serves the purpose of His pastimes.”

Misconceptions on Jiva-origin and Fall

In this article, we will counter some of the points made by Kb. dasa in his article, "Fall of the Jiva"

On 'how can an eternal associate fall from bhakti and become a worm in the dirt'.

The Purana's describe that once Lord Indra was cursed by Brhaspati to become a hog in the dirt. Lord Brahma wanted to bring him back to heaven, but Indra refused because he was enjoying family life or hog romance. According to the Taittiriya Upanisad 2.8.1 the happiness on Indra-loka is 10^{14} better than the highest happiness on Earth. So if you stretch this 10^{14} a little more you can understand the fall from the spiritual world.

This is also understood from Srila Prabhupada:

Devotee: But if our love for Krishna originally is perfect why should we have left?

Prabhupada: Just like somebody is daily eating puris and halava, and he wants to eat puffed rice. So that tendency is there. That is also a side of enjoyment. "I am eating daily this, let me eat this." What is the difficulty? That tendency is there. That is also enjoyment. After all, we are hankering after enjoyment, anandamayo 'bhyasat (Vedanta-sutra 1.1.12). So different taste we desire, that "Let me taste this, let me taste that, let me taste that." (Srila Prabhupada's lecture in New Mayapur on Bg 15.15)

On 'Perfect jiva's being as perfect as Krishna', and 'how the jiva can fall from perfection'.

The spiritual world is perfect, but the living entity is not perfect (or purna). Bhaktivinoda Thakur's Jaiva Dharma describes the living entity, jiva as apurna-sakti. The jiva is limited in knowledge and bliss and can therefore do something imperfect (apurna), the jiva is not a svarupa sakti living entity who is full of knowledge and bliss and who is always perfect (purna). The jiva is tatastha or marginal. Tatastha means as the line between land and water; it is always close to both matter and spirit

On "Radharani does not manifest jiva's".

Srila Prabhupada says in a lecture, on Srimad Bhagavatam 7.6.1 in Bombay December-17-1975: "We are expansions of Radharani".

Alternatively, if jivas are not directly expanded, then indirectly, is also an expansion.

Nor is the spectrum of female consorts of Srimati Radharani only svarupa sakti, because the Bhaktirasamrta Sindhu describes kamarupa-ragatmika bhakti sadhana in 1.2.283 by which the jiva sakti living entity can become a gopi.

Alternatively, the main associates are sakti-tattva.

The all powerful original mother, mula- or adi-sakti can manifest all types of living beings on behalf of Krishna (mamaivamso' jiva loke Bg 15.7) as a queen does the household duties of a king. A ksatriya queen can do all the duties of the king, and the king can sit back and enjoy.

According to Sri Caitanya Caritamrta Madhya-lila 20.165 Krishna expands the Visnu-tattva's (Gods) and Saktyavesa-avatara's to dominate (these are the purusa functions, male or enjoyer).

Similarly, CC Adi-lila 4.76 states that Radharani expands all the sakti's, energies, beginning with the milkmaids in Vraja and then the queens in Dvaraka and Vaikuntha (the prakrti functions, the enjoyed and controlled).

Sri Visvanatha Cakravarti comments on SB 6.16.57: "Some jivas, with desires for dasya etc., who have perfected themselves by pure bhakti, or by the mercy of nitya-mukti bhaktas, are included among the the eternal associates as dasas. They are also considered to be nondifferent from the svarupa of the Lord, since they are empowered by the svarupa-sakti."

This is also written by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakur.

Not in an "emotional outburst", as Kb. dasa says, but in a philosophical book, Sri Caitanya's Teachings.

The context does not indicate that he is emotional and making a hyperbole.

"Sri Radhika is the Source of all individual souls whose function is to be employed in the service of Sri Krishna ... The individual souls serve Sri Krishna as constituents of Sri Radhika. When they forget that they are constituents of Sri Radhika they forget the nature of their own selves, and engage in the abnormal activities of the mundane plane."

He writes three pages later:

"Siva and mahamaya are closely connected with the jiva. The connection of jiva with Siva and mahamaya is established only when he is disassociated from the service of Sri Sri Radha Krishna."

When saints are emotional, they still speak absolute truth under the direction of yogamaya. Sri Caitanya-caritamrta (antya 5.97) gives the standard: no rasabhava, overlapping of transcendental mellows and no siddhanta-viroddha or apa-siddhanta, theories contrary to the principles of the bhakti cult.

On Kb dasa stating, "Lord Krishna and his lost servant unite again in Vraja".

This is right. Some light in the darkness. It was meant to be some darkness; Suddha-sarasvati enlightened him.

"Lost Servant" means Krishna had that servant but then Krishna lost him. Now Krishna regained his lost servant. "Unite again in Vrndavana" means they were united in Vrndavana then the servant got lost and then came back again to unite with the master.

On "The lord and devotee speak incomprehensible and mad in ecstasy".

This is when it is said: "no one falls from Goloka". In ecstasy they speak "who can leave us, it is so nice here".

Another point on this; according to Skanda Purana 2.2.27 this material world has 3½ crores or 35 million brahmandas or universes. But the spiritual world is unlimited. The material world, the souls here and the chance that a soul falls to maya are thus 'nothing' compared to the spiritual world. Because in mathematics any event that has just one *chance* in 10^{50} is dismissed by mathematicians as never happening, therefore the conclusion can be made that no one or hardly anyone falls from Goloka, which is the infinite world.

On "In the absolute world there is no begin and end".

This is a misunderstanding and mistranslation of Brahma Samhita 5.56 - nimesArdhAkhyo vA vrajati na hi yarapi samayah - "not even a moment of time passes".

Samayah na vrajati "time does not proceed for even half a second", means according to Jiva Gosvami's purport that "the inhabitants in Goloka do not know time at all because they are absorbed in Govinda. Or the meaning can be 'the faults of time do not exist there.'"

Srila Prabhupada explains that no time in the spiritual world means that the destructive feature of material time is absent. There is spiritual time. The astakaliya-lila revolves on and on, day after day. Astakaliya means the 8 periods of the day with pastimes at the end of the night, morning pastimes, forenoon pastimes, midday pastimes, afternoon pastimes, dusk pastimes, evening pastimes and midnight pastimes, as described in Krishnahnika Kaumudi, Govinda lilamrta, Krishna bhavanamrta. There is beginning and end of every period.

Also, the jiva tatastha fallen soul goes to the spiritual world after the nightmare of maya. He originally left Krishna or Narayana, and goes Back to Godhead. The jiva began his material life, was gone from the spiritual world. That material life ended. Then the jiva began spiritual life again. Thus, there is beginning and end.

But there is no death and old age. And the spiritual forms of the houses and kunjja's- forest huts do not get broken down by time. By the arrangement of Sri Krishna's lila-sakti there is eating, cooking, making of new flower garlands etc. This means blissful changing of services of the souls (= the cintamani's or spiritual atoms, the building blocks of the spiritual world see Brahma Samhita T 29 purport)

In this world also the atoms (paramanus) are souls, but they are covered by the three modes of material nature.

Srila Prabhupada says:

"Everything is generated from Krishna, but according to consciousness they are divided into superior and inferior energy. The more the consciousness is developed one comes to the superior platform of life....." (Lecture on SB 5.5 21-22)

"It is the same energy of the lord, but one is developed and the other is not developed. Like this there are varieties of developed consciousness within the material world...Living entities, they have knowledge. That is the difference between matter and living entities. The dull matter still requires to be developed. There is knowledge, but it is covered." (Lecture by Srila Prabhupada on SB 3.26.5, Bombay, December 17, 1974)

But in the spiritual world the souls are surrounded by the spiritual atoms of earth, water, fire, air, ether. In the CC Adi-lila 5.53 we read: "The earth, water, fire, air and ether of Vaikuntha are all spiritual. Material elements are not found there".

These elements are composed of spiritual atoms, cintamani's, souls.

As Bhagavad gita 15.1 states urdhva-mulam adhah-sakham: This world is a perverted reflection of the spiritual world.

On "Soul returned to Godhead not being allowed to remember the maya energy". "Living entities in the spiritual world don't glance at maya"

This is not so. In Brhad Bhagavatamrta 2.3.77-91, Ganesha is showing, seeing and describing many parties of Vaikuntha devotees who go down from the spiritual world beyond Siva or Mahesha-dhama (which is just in the spiritual world, so beyond the mahat-tattva or maya) to the many universes in the material world to preach and spread pure devotion.

Ganesa showed this to Gopakumara who was in Mahesha dhama He saw a group of attractive four-armed persons from Vaikuntha arrive. They were adorned with all the opulence's of youth, charm, beauty and good fortune.

They made the Saivites seem invisible by their effulgence and were immersed in the blissful rasa of singing the sublime glories of the lord

Also in Brihad Bhagavatamrta 1.3.46. we read:

"They travel freely wherever they want, protecting and promoting the cause of the Lord's devotees and the Lord's devotional service."

Commentary: "These eternally liberated Vaikuntha-vasis are always helping others. Acting in the material world, they protect sincere persons from misunderstanding the principles of devotional service and thereby falling down and being punished by the agents of Yama-rajā. The Vaikuntha-vasis encourage the descent of advanced devotees into saintly families, act for the increased prosperity and influence of those devotees, and render unseen help to the devotees' preaching"

According to Sri Jiva Gosvami in Bhakti Sandarbha, anu 180: "the souls returned again to the spiritual world are the best for going to the material world to save fallen souls, because they have experience of suffering, they can most feelingly bestow their grace sometimes recalling their own previous suffering in the same way as a person recalls a nightmare upon waking...Mercy is the movement of the heart which occurs only when the suffering of another person touches one's heart. But the devotee in the spiritual world ever relishes supreme bliss. Therefore, suffering arising out of ignorance cannot penetrate his heart, just as darkness can never contact the sun...Consequently, there is no possibility of compassion being aroused in that devotee's heart at the plight of such suffering."

"Devotee: When they go back to Godhead, some people can remember their past lives.

Prabhupada: Yes.

Devotee: In the mind.

Prabhupada: Yes.

Devotee: I thought the mind was left behind.

Prabhupada: No. Actually mind carries you to the next body. So mind goes with you. The material mind, material ego, material intelligence become nil when you are completely liberated. But at that time your spiritual mind acts. It is not very difficult to understand. Somebody is acting under the impression... Just like one of our students, he was acting under the impression that he is Frenchman and doing something subversive, and now he is thinking that "I am Krishna's." (chuckles) He has stopped all those nonsense. [break] When he was thinking that he's a Frenchman, that mind was there. And now he's thinking that "I am Krishna's," the mind is there. So where is the chance of losing the mind?" (Lecture, SB 7.9.11, Montreal)

On "Maha-Visnu creating new incomplete souls sorely deficient in bhakti".

Here Kb. dasa creates a god who for his sadistic fun of playing 'the saving hero', creates souls in the various hellish prison cells (bodies) of the material world. This kaka-vada he took from the book 'in Vaikuntha not even the leaves fall'. The main author of this book changed his

mind on this subject, after being defeated by the book “our original position”. He had made so many translation mistakes to come to the Brahman-tatastha-fall theory. He is now an anadir-patita-vadi. That nitya-patita-vada, philosophy is even more fallen. According to them there is no logic to the souls being in the material world. The material world is not needed. The spiritual world alone would be perfect and sufficient. Somehow the mistaken creation of the maya is an eternal fact. Even Krishna doesn't want it, but it is eternally designed like that, so He cannot change the dogma.

In Vaikuntha leaves ‘do’ fall down. In one of the Six Gosvami's of Vrndavana's rasika books there is a description of Krishna waiting in a kunjra for Radharani to come. Krishna hears the movement, caused by the wind, of dried fallen leaves on the ground. He thinks this the sound of Radharani coming and walking on the dried leaves. He asks: "Is it You, Radha?"

This kaka-vada is also the philosophy of the Calvinists and Madhvides. With this god "Gaudiya Vaishnavism has to grow and expand around the world"? Do the other than ISKCON-Gaudiya-Vaisnava groups want to stay behind and not grow up and fill in the gaps of undeveloped areas of their philosophies. Of no one we have so much words as of Srila Prabhupada; no wonder all is very clear, as for example the original position of the soul.

Gaudiya Vaisnavism has to grow into the rationalistic scientific world and give logical answers. Teachers in the past may not have presented this issue elaborately, or not all their words have reached us. We know one Radhakunda Mahanta who had no knowledge at all about this topic. But Srila Prabhupada knew:

*... then he becomes fit for going back to home, back to Godhead.” ...Everyone is immortal, but he is fallen in such material condition that he thinks himself as mortal. Because I am spirit soul, therefore the Vedic injunction...aham brahmasmi, so 'ham, means “I am as good as the Supreme Being,” means “He is eternal; I am also eternal. He is also living being; I am also living being.” That means qualitatively we are one, God and me. But quantitatively, He is great; we are small. So we have to realize this, that we can become eternal, immortal, all qualified like God, if we get out of these material clutches....And as soon as you become dhira, you are the first-class candidate for going back to home, back to Godhead.

Hridayananda: [translating question] He says that if we are originally in the spiritual world and full of knowledge, how can we try to lord it over, or, in other words, how can we try to do something which actually cannot be done? And if we are originally full of pleasure, then why would we accept an inferior thing?

Prabhupada: That I have already explained, that although you have got the God's qualities, but you are very small. Just like a big fire and the sparks of the fire, similarly, God is big fire and we are like sparks of the fire. When the sparks come down from the fire, it becomes extinguished. So because we are very small, as soon as we become out of the big fire, out of touch with God, then we become extinguished. So somehow or other, if you are again go to the fire, you have your original, brightened, illuminating quality, the spark. So at the present moment, somehow or other, being fallen in this material condition, we have lost our godly qualities. We can cure that. Just like a diseased man lost his appetite, but by treatment he can again awaken his appetite and eat properly. So we, being very small—we may say "a small god"—therefore we fall under the clutches of maya, illusion. But it can be cured. We can again revive our original position.

Hridayananda: [translating] She said if we have not already achieved perfection, then how can the soul achieve the perfection? It seems that he has to reincarnate slowly in time to

achieve the perfection.

Prabhupada: No, that is no argument. If you are diseased, you can be cured if you take the proper medicine, treatment. That's all. Disease is not hopelessness. Otherwise, why the people go for treatment to a physician? Similarly, out of ignorance you are now in this miserable condition, but if you become treated by bona fide spiritual master, then you'll be cured. Originally every one of us—pure. Now, by material condition we are now contaminated. That... But there is process to get out of this material contamination. Then again we become pure. And as soon as we become pure, there is no more birth, death, old age and disease. Finished.

Hridayananda: [translating] Why it seems that when the soul comes into contact with material nature it becomes contaminated?

Prabhupada: He wants to enjoy this material enjoyment. Just like everyone is going to the restaurant for eating something palatable, but we are not going; and somebody is going to cinema, but we are not going to the cinema. Similarly, there are two kinds of men: one is attracted, one is not attracted. Those who are not attracted, they are called nitya-siddha, eternally liberated. And those who are being attracted, they are called nitya-baddha, eternally conditioned. So you'll find always two classes of men. So one is attracted; one is not attracted. In the spiritual world the number of liberated person—many, many times greater than these conditioned soul. Just like the prison house and outside the prison house. The population outside the prison house, their number is very great, but within the prison house there are small number, criminals. So there are innumerable living entities. Out of them, some of them become attracted to this material enjoyment; others not. So one who does not want to serve Krishna and wants to serve his senses, he's put into this material world. And he's given all facilities to enjoy, but he becomes entangled. This is the position. (Bg 02-15 MEX City 1975-02)

Our comment. All souls were originally pure, nitya-siddha. “Originally every one of us—pure“, “we are originally in the spiritual world and full of knowledge, originally full of pleasure“, “we have lost our godly qualities“. But “by treatment he can again awaken“, “We can again revive our original position“, “there is process to get out of this material contamination. Then again we become pure.” And “then he becomes fit for going back to home, back to Godhead.”” if you are again go to the fire, you have your original, brightened, illuminating quality.”

We Tried to Be Tatastha...

...or neutral on studying S. dasa's recent paper, "Jiva-tattva As It Is" on the soul's fall from tatastha or– as he defined it– the ocean between the material and spiritual world.

He states: (S. dasa's points indented):

- "...in the ocean of causes one has a slight dizzy vision of Vasudeva".

That is not fair. This is like half educating your child and throwing it in the ocean between Rama's kingdom and Ravana's svarna (golden) Lanka. Better foster the child in Ramaraja and then give it a free choice. Therefore we fall from love of God in the spiritual world.

One even gets a warning of protection (SB 3.12.3 purport)

"Anyone who has some independence may sometimes misuse it due to ignorance. When the living entity prefers to misuse his independence and glide down towards nescience, the all-merciful Lord first of all tries to protect him from the trap, but when the living entity persists in gliding down to hell, the Lord helps him to forget his real position...the Lord naturally does not like to see anyone falling down from his real position".

"His real position" means prema-bhakti, not the brahmajyoti and ocean of causes. One falls from loving service to Krishna.

"our position is manah shashtanindriyani prakriti-sthani karshati [Bg. 15.7]. Detached from Krishna, we are in this prakriti, material nature, and our business is struggle for existence for the same pleasure, which is never obtainable in this material world. Therefore the intelligence is that we should again go back to home, go back to Krishna, and dance with Him in His rasa dance." (Srimad-Bhagavatam 3.26.19, Bombay, December 28, 1974)

- "Krishna has full power over His energies – not over the tatastha."

It is S. dasa's axiom that Krishna has full power only over every nitya siddha. Why He does not exert full power over every jiva so no one has to fall down, and suffer. According to S. dasa only some living beings are generated perfectly either as nitya-siddha-jiva-sakti, svarupa-sakti or Visnu tattva with fully developed siddha deha and free will. God should have created all the jivas like that. There would be no need of a Viraja region nor of a material world. Everyone eternally happy! Why the jivas in the spiritual world, with free will, are exempt from going through a Viraja-mahat-tattva trial. They also need "a perfect spiritual environment of neutrality to choose," as S. dasa puts it, or are they forced to love?

- "Out of curiosity 25% of the souls in the ocean of causes lean towards maya, 75% go to the spiritual world".

He comes to this because he thinks $\frac{3}{4}$ th of the souls had to come to the spiritual world and $\frac{1}{4}$ th to the maya world.

This is the quantitative wrong idea of ekapada - tripada vibhuti. The actual meaning of this is that the Lord has 4 vibutis or excellences: the spiritual energy of the spiritual world – the svarupa-sakti, the Brahmajyoti, the marginal energy and the material world.

tripad-vibhuter dhamatvat tripadbhutam tu tat padam
vibhutih mayiki sarva prokta padatmikayatah

Vaikuntha is called tripad-bhutam because it is the abode which possess three portions of power. All the powers of the material realm are called only one portion.

Commentary: When Vaikuntha is described as tripad-bhutam it means that the material powers of the material realm consisting of one pad or segment, do not exist in Vaikuntha. (Laghu Bhagavatamrta 5.286)

- "Fall means the Lord lacks control over His world".

In Ramaraja, Ravana and other demons are expelled or destroyed. Why force a Ravana into a holy kingdom. That would cause fear in a paradise.

- "In suddha sattva viraja inconceivably the pure soul gets its false ego".

However, there is no false ego in the Viraja ocean, false ego is only a later development. The Viraja ocean expands the pradhana; pradhana expands the mahat-tattva; and mahat-tattva expands false ego.

- "We can't argue why false ego arises from pure consciousness."

This statement simply means that at any moment maya can further captivate or entangle someone who is in the maya world. See the context of this statement (SB 3.26.23); there is no discussion of the causal ocean there.

Another point is that when the souls are coming out of Maha-Visnu, there is no maya world yet to glance at to become attracted to and lean towards. This is S. dasa's own theory.

This glancing to maya and Krishna (described in the Jaiva-dharma chapter 7, 15, 16) is when the soul comes down from the spiritual planets and gets a second choice at the border with the maya world. The first choice is on the spiritual planets; the second choice is with the warning of protection.

Alternatively, this glancing describes the ontological nature of the marginal energy; he is free to go to Krishna or to the material world.

Next point: Srila Prabhupada says: "he [the jiva] forgets his relation with Acyuta."

S. dasa twists that to mean that the jiva forgets that at the border of Viraja, he was in dizzy Vasudeva consciousness. The quote to support his view, S. dasa gives, is SB 4.3.22:

sattvam visuddham vasudeva-sabditam
yad iyate tatra puman apavritah
sattve ca tasmin bhagavan vasudevo
hy adhokshajo me namasa vidhiyate

"I am always engaged in offering obeisances to Lord Vasudeva in pure Krishna consciousness. Krishna consciousness is always pure consciousness, in which the Supreme Personality of Godhead, known as Vasudeva, is revealed without any covering".

This and the previous verses are spoken by Siva who is not in maya, nor in the Viraja. Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura comments in 4.3.29 "I [Siva] residing in Vaikuntha at every moment, worship the Lord". He meditates on Vasudeva without any covering. Vasudeva is suddha sattva in Vaikuntha. (see the purport to SB 4.3.22)

And if we go along with the S. dasa's argument, that envy and false ego can enter the jiva in suddha sattva Viraja, where there is no guna-maya, then envy can enter the soul also in suddha sattva Goloka or Vaikuntha.

It is not that in the ocean of causes, the soul has "only vision of Vasudeva without His energies." Garga samhita 1.2.14-20 describes that the demigods came to Krishna to ask to destroy the burden on the earth planet (also see SB 10.1). Immediately after passing the shells around the universe they came to Krishna-loka (not even Visnu or Narayana-lokas).

Skanda purana 2.9.16.12-20 states the same; Narada Muni passes the shells of the universe and at the other side of the ocean of causes he came in Krishna-loka. Narada saw that the ocean of causes had the fragrance of sandal due to the bath taken by multitudes of cowherds (gopas) and cowherdesses (gopis); Krishna's associates. It was full of lotuses, swans and water-birds. The banks were full of rows of kalpa-vrksas (wish-yielding trees) and kamadhenu (wish-fulfilling) cows drinking the water and innumerable bowers suitable for the amorous sports of Sri Sri Radha-Krishna.

- "There is no santa rasa in Goloka. One can fall only from santarasa, not from the others."

There is santa-rasa in Goloka. In the commentary to CC Madhya 8.294 we read: "Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura points out that in Vrajabhumi there is the Yamuna River with its sandy banks. There are kadamba trees, cows, Krishna's sticks with which He herds cows, and Krishna's flute. All of these belong to santa-rasa, the mellow of neutrality in devotional service".

"Sri Krishna is known as Rasaraja. This name implies that He tastes all rasas, and it refers to Him in His Vraja-lila. From this it should be clear that he tastes santa rasa in Vraja. This is also confirmed in Bhakti-rasamrta-sindhu 4.3.85. There Srila Rupa Gosvami writes that Krishna tasted santa rasa along with all other rasas while lifting Govardhana hill. In this example Sri Krishna tastes santa rasa and is the shelter (asraya alambana) of santa rasa. Later in Mathura he tasted santa rasa as the object (visaya alambana) of love when he was wrestling in Kamsa's arena, SB 10.43.17. The sages present experienced santa rasa in relation to Sri Krishna".

So if one can fall only from santa-rasa, since this rasa is also in Goloka, one can fall from Goloka.

We have another 100 points of irregular compositions (more than permissible as per SB 1.5.11; a little is permitted), needless repetitions (over and over saying the same thing including copying and pasting), and superficial sloppy ill-naming and accusations. He says for example that government agencies (the CIA?) may have implanted the fall-vada in ISKCON. He calls a fall vadi worse than a mayavadi because fall-vada says that the nitya-

siddha has free will. Therefore the nitya-siddha is equal to Krishna, and the fall-vadi wants to become Krishna.

Conclusion: Bhauma patanavada or falling only from Krishna's lila within the material world and kaka-vada (falling from Karanadakasayi or Maha-Visnu in the Karana samudra or ocean between the material and spiritual worlds) is not in the scripture or in the Bhaktivedanta purports.

S. dasa took it from outside of Srila Prabhupada's teachings and then tried to find it in Srila Prabhupada's teachings.

S. dasa speaks so highly of sakyavesa-avatara Srila Prabhupada and his Bhaktivedanta purports. Why he went outside of these to solve the questions on the fall of the soul.

Footnote:

[1] Tatastha means neutral, in between area. Also named Viraja (vi = no, raja = raja-guna or any modes of nature, raja-guna here representing all the modes of nature). Viraja is described as ocean or river because it is like a delta of a river. It surrounds the millions of universes, which are like islands in space. A delta surrounds islands. As a delta as e.g. the end of the Ganga can be seen as river or ocean.

“From Vaikuntha no one falls” is not a categorical absolute

In his posting ‘Open Letter to ISKCON’ S. dasa tries to make “from Vaikuntha no one falls” a categorical absolute. But, also in his purport on Srimad Bhagavatam 5.11.12 Srila Prabhupada states both versions, fall and not fall with the conclusion: the “now again liberated soul knows how he has become conditioned and returns home back to Godhead.”

The purport in full is:

“In this sloka the word kshetrajna refers to an ordinary living being, not the supreme living being. This ordinary living being is of two kinds -- nitya-baddha or nitya-mukta. One is eternally conditioned and the other eternally liberated. The eternally liberated living being; are in the Vaikuntha jagat, the spiritual world, and they never fall into the material world. Those in the material world are conditioned souls, nitya-baddha. The nitya-baddhas can become liberated by controlling the mind because the cause of conditioned life is the mind. When the mind is trained and the soul is not under the mind's control, the soul can be liberated even in this material world. When it is liberated, one is called jivan-mukta. A jivan-mukta knows how he has become conditioned; therefore he tries to purify himself and return home, back to Godhead.”

When Srila Prabhupada states “the nitya siddhas in Vaikuntha never fall into the material world” this means that sometimes some fall. Because he states a few sentences later “the jiva-mukta knows how he has become conditioned...and returns home.” Return means where he came from.

The souls that fall, comprise a very small amount, compared to the infinite souls in the spiritual world.

The material world ends at the Viraja river surrounding the material universes.

“That original Personality of Godhead, named Sankarshana, first lies down in the river Viraja, which serves as a border between the material and the spiritual world.” (Caitanya Caritamrta Madhya 20.268)

Thus the material world is a tiny little point in the infinity.

Compared to the infinite spiritual world, the material world is practically nothing. So, yes practically no one falls.

The fall of the soul from Home, Krishna-loka, is confirmed in the Bhaktivedanta purport to SB 4.28.54-55:

“The original home of the living entity and the Supreme Personality of Godhead is the spiritual world. In the spiritual world both the Lord and the living entities live together very peacefully. Since the living entity remains engaged in the service of the Lord, they both share a blissful life in the spiritual world. However, when the living entity wants to enjoy himself, he falls down into the material world...The material world, created by this external energy, becomes the so-called home of the conditioned soul... By the process of bhakti yoga he can return home back to Godhead and again become a member of the spiritual world.”

Also here: “if you want to be perfect, full freedom, full creative power, everything in fullness, then we must join with the Supreme Full, complete, whole. Just like a very rich man, the servants in the house of a rich man, they are also rich men. But they're also eating in the same way. They are eating in the same palace. This is a crude example. So there is a spiritual world

where Krishna is there. Krishna is everywhere, here, there, He's personally there. Here in this material world Krishna is present by His energy. Just like the president of your country, he's in his white house, but at the same time, he's present everywhere. His energy, his power is there. Nobody can deny it. Everywhere the picture of Mr. Nixon is there, and everyone is conscious that our ruler, our chief man, is Mr. Nixon. Similarly, Krishna is also everywhere by His power. But He has still got His own abode. So everyone of us can go back to him, in His abode. (720527BG-LOS ANGELES - May 27, 1972)

S. dasa likes the quotes from books more than from lectures etc.
Here some from Sri Caitanya Caritamṛta:

"In our original relationship with the Supreme Lord there is real love, and that love is reflected pervertedly through material conditions. Our real love is continuous and unending, but because that love is reflected pervertedly in this material world, it lacks continuity and is inebriating." (Cc., Introduction, p. 9)

"The conditioned state is caused by misuse of the individual independence of the spiritual platform, for this separates the living entity from the association of the spiritual energy. But when the living entity is enlightened by the grace of the Supreme Lord or His pure devotee and becomes inclined to revive his original state of loving service, he is on the most auspicious platform of eternal bliss and knowledge. The marginal jiva, or living entity, misuses his independence and becomes averse to the eternal service attitude when he independently thinks he is not energy but the energetic. This misconception of his own existence leads him to the attitude of lording it over material nature." (Cc. Adi 5.66, purport)

"krishna bhuli' sei jiva anadi-bahirmukha
ataeva maya tare deya samsara-duhkha

krishna bhuli'—forgetting Krishna; sei jiva—that living entity; anadi—from time immemorial; bahir-mukha—attracted by the external feature; ataeva—therefore; maya—illusory energy; tare—to him; deya—gives; samsara-duhkha—miseries of material existence.

“Forgetting Krishna, the living entity has been attracted by the external feature from time immemorial. Therefore the illusory energy [maya] gives him all kinds of misery in his material existence.

Purport: When the living entity forgets his constitutional position as an eternal servant of Krishna, he is immediately entrapped by the illusory, external energy. The living entity is originally part and parcel of Krishna and is therefore the superior energy of Krishna...the living entity, forgetting his position, is situated in material energy. The living entity is called the marginal energy because by nature he is spiritual but by forgetfulness he is situated in the material energy. Thus he has the power to live either in the material energy or in the spiritual energy, and for this reason he is called marginal energy. Being in the marginal position, he is sometimes attracted by the external, illusory energy, and this is the beginning of his material life... The living entity is eternal, and he existed before the creation of this material world. Unfortunately he has forgotten his relationship with Krishna. The living entity's forgetfulness is described herein as anadi, which indicates that it has existed since time immemorial. One should understand that due to his desire to enjoy himself in competition with Krishna, the living entity comes into material existence.” (CC.Madhya 20.117)

Comment: anadi—from time immemorial. The jiva ‘came’ into material existence, a long time ago.

"Thus Krishna knows the cause of the distressed condition of the conditioned soul. He therefore descends from His original position to instruct the conditioned soul and inform him about his forgetfulness of his relationship with Krishna. Krishna exhibits Himself in His relationships in Vrindavana and at the Battle of Kurukshetra so that people will be attracted to Him and will again return home, back to Godhead... If we revive our original intimate relationship with Krishna, our distressed condition in the material world will be mitigated." (Cc. Madhya 20.130, purport)

He used the following quotes, according to the Bhaktivedanta Vedabase, in his books.

Back to Goloka Vrindavana - 4 x

Back to the Vaikuntha planets – 4x

Go back to Jagannatha – 1x

Back to the rasa-lila dance – 3x

Back to Vaikuntha – 3x

Back to Krishna – 16x

Back to our eternal home in the kingdom of Krishna – 1 x

Return to the kingdom of God – 8 x

Back to the kingdom of God – 8x

Back to the kingdom of Godhead – 3x

Back to Godhead – 1003x

Back to home back to godhead 3x

Return to the spiritual world – 10x

Back home back to godhead – 448x

Back to our original home, back to God – 2 x

Back to the spiritual world – 6x

Back to the Vaikuntha - 1x

He said Back to Godhead 1457 times. Back to Godhead means back to Krishna:

“Prabhupada: God means Supreme Person. But these advaitavadi, Mayavadis, they have made God everyone. God means Supreme Person, that is the dictionary word. "Supreme Being." That is the dictionary meaning. God does not mean ordinary, but they have made ordinary, anyone God: "I am God, you are God, he is God." Then what is meaning of God?

Devotee: Therefore we say Godhead.

Prabhupada: Yes. Head man. There are many men; He is the head man. Godhead word is also there in the dictionary. You find out.

Devotee: "Godhead: being God or a God, divine nature, Deity, the Godhead, God.”

(Room Conversation with Professor Francois Chenique, August 5, 1976, New Mayapur [French farm], Lucay de La Male)

Thus, only a few fall- eternally liberated, with a footnote.

In the same “open letter...,” S. dasa proposes his book “Tatastha-sakti-tattva,” as the ultimate truth on the fall of the jiva. In the introduction he says that his diksa guru is A. C. Bhaktivedanta Swami Srila Prabhupada and his siksa guru Bhaktiraksaka Sridhar Swami and many others. In the book there are interviews with Kapoor, Narayana Maharaja, Bhaktisundara Govinda swami and purports by Bhaktiraksaka Sridhar Swami. We studied the book -166 pages- carefully. It is more or less the same as his last book ‘Jiva tattva as it is’ on which we have commented in the article "We Tried to Be Tatastha.”

Suddha-Sarasvati, the transcendental goddess of learning, appearing on their tongue, also makes them speak the absolute truths: “Sridhara Maharaja: What Bhaktivinoda conceived and Prabhupada tried to, according to his conception, to translate into action in his last days. Anyhow, we find that through Swami Maharaja these revelations have been fulfilled. We are happy. We are glad. We are proud of Swami Maharaja, with love to all.

Our Guru Maharaja told that when one person comes to take diksa and to stay in the Matha, then we may say that after wandering a long time in a foreign land he is again coming back to his home, homeward. Home means homeward, back to God, back to home, back to Godhead. Back to Godhead means back to home, sweet, sweet home. Our home and life is there, and nowhere else.

So we may be quite free there; no apprehension of any misgivings or misconduct. With such boldness and clear faith we can go on, onward and onward. What are we leaving on the back—that is all mortal things, transient. Hare Krishna, Hare Krishna.” (730317TO-MAYAPUR - March 17, 1973)

Narayana Maharaja: “you have been thrown to this world from Goloka Vrindavana. The guard of that Goloka planet, Yogamaya-devi, threw us into this world. You are actually a male or female servant of Sri Sri Radha-Krishna, but you wanted to enjoy sense gratification and have forgotten your true heritage.”

To conclude:

Srila Prabhupada states nitya siddhas never fall but if some, in the million times million times million times million times million times million, fall and purify themselves they know how and when they fell and then return back home to Godhead.

Maha-Visnu-envy-fall-vada (MEF) is 94% Goloka-envy-fall-vada (GEF).

Contemplating the two types of 'jiva fall' scenarios of Rp. Dasa. MEF or GEF.

1) Rp. dasa states "The jiva expands from Mahavisnu and becomes an envious rebel of Mahavisnu."

C (=Contemplation):

According to Srila Rupa Gosvami in the Nectar of Devotion, Sri Krishna is 100% Bhagavan; he lists 64 qualities (NOD 2.1.33-34).

Sri Maha Visnu is 94% Bhagavan.

If trillions upon trillions of living entities fall away to the material world after seeing Mahavisnu and becoming envious of Him then if Krishna is 6% more Bhagavan then also trillions upon trillions can turn away from Goloka.

2) Rp dasa: "souls originally expand from Mahavisnu, awaken from sleep (susupti) and see Mahavisnu and wish to be independent enjoyers."

C) This is MEF: Mahavisnu-envy-fall-vada. A soul emanates out of Mahavisnu, sees Mahavisnu who is in slumber with eyes half closed, becomes envious of and rebellious to His sleeping mode, and desires to become one of the bears or hibernating species, or in general desires tamo-guna, or sleep(?). So is this version of tatastha-patita-vada.

Accepting this dogma, it is more likely to become envious of Radha-Krishna's lila because it is more attractive than Maha-Visnu's lila. As a thief rather goes to a billionaire rich person to steal than to a millionaire. Therefore, GEF should make more sense than MEF.

3) "Balarama and Ananta give nitya-siddha servants for the spiritual world, Mahavisnu gives souls for flying/ swimming/glancing in the tatastha area."

C.1. In this idea, there is no free will for the nitya-siddha servants. We are amsas of Krishna, with similarity in qualities. These souls do not have this quality of freedom as Krishna has in great quantity. They cannot get away from service. They are forced to be in the spiritual world. They can never become Brahma or Indra.

Srila Prabhupada explains that this freedom to fall is like a rich man always eating opulent food but sometimes likes a simple meal, puffed rice.

Yogesvara: But if our love for Krishna originally is perfect why should we have left?

Prabhupada: Just like somebody is daily eating puris and halava, and he wants to eat puffed rice. So that tendency is there. That is also a side of enjoyment. "I am eating daily this, let me eat this." What is the difficulty? That tendency is there. That is also enjoyment. After all, we are hankering after enjoyment, anandamayo 'bhyasat (Vedanta-sutra 1.1.12). So different taste we desire, that "Let me taste this, let me taste that, let me taste that." (Srila Prabhupada's lecture in New Mayapur on Bg 15.15)

Or: "Because in the spiritual world, Krishna is supreme, but if you cannot tolerate Krishna... Even here there are so many: "Why there should be God? I am God.... They will never agree to abide by God...for these last, lowest class of men, there is the external energy. (Lecture — Hawaii, March 5, 1969)

Another: "Prabhupada: We are accepting the Krishna's society, or Krishna's association.

Krishna has got His society in Vrndavana. We are going to become one of the members of that society. But you are avoiding it. So you are renouncing. Our mission is back to home, back to Godhead, to enter into the society of associates of God—but you are avoiding it. You do not want. You want this temporary so-called society, friendship and love, which will be finished within some years. That is your ignorance. This society will not stay. How long you shall remain American? You will not remain for many days. Then where is your position? You will be kicked out. However you may try to remain in this so-called society, friendship and love, you will not be allowed to stay. You will be forced to renounce. We are trying to enter into the society of Krishna, where everything is eternal.

yad gatva na nivartante
tad dhama paramam mama

Krishna is param brahma param dhama pavitram (BG 10.12)—pavitra means pure—so impure cannot approach Him. That is not possible. If you want to enter fire, you must be fire. And if you are not fire, then you will burn. So first of all we have to revive, because Krishna.. The example is given that Krishna is the big fire and we are sparks of fire. We are also fire, very small. The sparks of fire can play, can remain within fire, and it is beautiful: "phat! phat!" There is spark, you have seen while fire is going on. It is very beautiful. And as soon as this "phat! phat!" falls down, separate from the..., it is extinguished. No more fire. It is black charcoal, that's all. So if we want happiness, then we have to dance with Krishna. But you cannot dance Krishna if I am not pure. Krishna is pavitram paramam bhavan. Pavitra means the supreme pure. So if you want to take pleasure in the company of Krishna and dance rasa dance, then you have to become pure, purified.... this path is the best way of advancing in our life and go back to home, back to Godhead. (760517SB-HONOLULU - May 17, 1976)

C.2. The companion souls of Mahavisnu have a choice between the spiritual and material world but they have no choice to be not part of Mahavisnu's emanations at all; to be always free.

This is not righteous in comparison to Balarama and Ananta's jiva expansions, who are somehow blessed— in this Rp.dasa fall vada- to never have to come to the suffering in the prison-house of the material world.

4) "Jiva's fly or swim out and rebel to Mahavisnu."

C. This is also not fair. This theory of Rp. dasa, says that one is flying or swimming out of Mahavisnu. Then this soul wakes up, in full flight, above the causal ocean or if the soul is from Maha-visnu's pores below the causal waters, it is shot through the causal water. The soul is still dozy from an eternal sleep (susupti). Then while flying or swimming one has to make a contemplation of Mahavisnu. Who can contemplate Mahavisnu peacefully while flying or swimming? According to Krishna in the Bhagavad-gita ch. 6 verse 11, one has to do meditation in a secluded place, alone. So there is a good chance that one will make a little mistake or rebel. But for that he'll be put in the prison of the maya world at least for one tour of all the 8.400.000 species of prison cells.

"When the material life of a wandering soul has ceased, O Acyuta, he may attain the association of Your devotees. And when he associates with them, there awakens in him devotion unto You, who are the goal of the devotees and the Lord of all causes and their effects". (SB 10.51.53)

My Lord, Your Lordship can easily be approached, but only by those who are materially exhausted. One who is on the path of [material] progress, trying to improve himself with respectable parentage, great opulence, high education and bodily beauty, cannot approach You with sincere feeling. (SB 1.8.26)

In fall from the spiritual planets one gets two times a choice and warning of protection.

5) MEF claims that a soul cannot fall from the perfect world.

C. A perfect kingdom has freedom for the citizens, otherwise, the residents would be robots, machines. There cannot be love from robots who have no personal desire, individuality and free choice.

A perfect kingdom needs a prison. It is a natural part of a perfect kingdom. Even Ramaraja had prisons. Brhad Bhagavatamrta states that there are armies in Vaikuntha. So one does not fall from perfection. One falls within perfection, to another part of the complete perfect whole- the prison house of Durga mata.

“The kingdom of God has spiritual varieties. They are not variety-less. Otherwise, the Lord would not have said that samstha. There is a regular establishment... We are all belonging to that establishment, but being forgetful, we are now in this material world. Just like sometimes some of us become crazy and have to go to the lunatic asylum, similarly, those who become crazy, such spiritual identities, they are put into this lunatic asylum. It is called material world”. (Srla Prabhupada’s lecture on Bg 6.11-21)

om purnam adah purnam idam
purnat purnam udachyate
purnasya purnam adaya
purnam evavashishyate

The Personality of Godhead is perfect and complete. And because He is completely perfect, all emanations from Him, such as this phenomenal world, are perfectly equipped as a complete whole. Whatever is produced of the complete whole is also complete by itself. And because He is the Complete Whole, even though so many complete units emanate from Him, He remains the complete balance. (Isopanisad invocation)

From the viewpoint of the prisoner, the prison is imperfect. But, from the viewpoint of the government and the righteous citizens, the prison house is a perfect necessity.

6) MEF’s claim that Krishna in His form of Mahavisnu wants to have a pastime He cannot have in the spiritual world. To be the saving hero of suffering souls.

C. If their Sri Mahavisnu, as they conceive Him, wants to have the sadistic, egoistic, narcissistic fun of being the savior of souls and therefore has to create the stage of maya and needs playmates, let Him create a fantasy with fantasy living entities as maya doubles, and leave us real souls out of it.

Let all souls be in bliss in the spiritual world. In MEF there is no real need of the material world for anyone. If everyone had been extended as nitya-parsada of Balarama or Sankarsana, and no one from their Maha-Visnu, then no one can fall down.

Soul falling originally from Brahmajyoti is rejected by Srila Prabhupada

Because impersonal Brahman effulgence (jyoti-spiritual light) is already a fallen condition (Srila Prabhupada letter 13-06-1970). It is not the original position.

”Because he falls down from brahma-sayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krishna... in His lila or sport.” (SPL, 1973)

When loving parents make babies they don't put them in an orphanage, borstal institution, boarding school or prison (comparable to the realm of Durga-devi, the material world as in nitya-patita-vada: the soul is eternally in the material world).

Nor will they store the baby in ice to hibernate in peace (comparable to existence in the brahmajyoti as SRMBG proposes, the theory of Brahman-tatastha fall vada) and then later, if the kid screams to get out, float the newborn in the ocean to be able to freely choose a shore in life (in this theory the soul has its first activity after an eternity in the Brahma-jyoti, in the karana or causal ocean).

Thus, why would loving Sri Sri Radha Krishna have designated their eternal extensions or expansions, their parts and parcels, the souls, in the Brahmajyoti, Karana ocean or Durga's cosmic prison. Better keep them home, the best place, in Krishnaloka.

Here is the letter, that Brahman is not the original source of the souls: “The next question, about the living entities falling down in this material world are not from the impersonal Brahman. Existence in the impersonal Brahman is also within the category of non-Krishna consciousness. Those who are in the Brahman effulgence they are also in the fallen condition, so there is no question of falling down from a fallen condition. When fall takes place, it means falling down from the non-fallen condition.

The non-fallen condition is Krishna consciousness. So long one can maintain pure Krishna consciousness he is not fallen down. As soon as he becomes out of Krishna consciousness immediately he is fallen down. It does not matter where a living entity stays. In the material world also there are different stages of living conditions, and to remain in the Brahman effulgence is also another phase of that fallen condition. Just like in the Bhagavad-gita it is stated that conditioned souls by their pious activities are elevated to the higher planetary system, but as soon as the stock of pious activities is finished he again comes down on the earthly planet. Similarly those who are elevated beyond the planetary system to the Brahman effulgence, they are also prone to fall down as much as a living entity from the higher planetary system”.

So, SRMBG's Brahmajyoti-kaka-fall-vada is wrong.

(brahmajyoti-kaka-fall-vada=the soul falls from the Brahman effulgence originally, then to Karanadakasayi Visnu who is lying in the Karana ocean and then falls to the samsara- cycle of birth and death.)

- SRMBG wrote: “If Srila Prabhupada writes of fall down he means fall from brahmajyoti and karana-samudra.” This is wrong. To the contrary, Srila Prabhupada explains, for example, in this Srimad Bhagavatam lecture:

“The instruction of Srimad Bhagavatam is, "Just try to revive your lost relationship with God, or Krishna." That relationship is never extinguished, but sometimes it is covered. Just like a crazy boy forgets his father and mother and home, goes away. But the relationship between the son and the parents cannot be lost. As soon as the son comes back, the parents receive

him very nicely. Similarly, we are all sons of the Supreme Lord. We have forgotten our father, we have forgotten our relationship, and we are loitering in this material world as helpless, and if we revive our consciousness, our Krishna consciousness we go back.

We have got eternal relationship with Him and He is the richest, the most opulent. As a rich man's son has no scarcity, no want, everything is supplied amply... Just like the Western countries, the young men, they belong to a rich nation, so practically they have no want. But still why they are becoming hopeless and confused?" (Bhag. lecture, Montreal, August 17, 1968)

- SRMBG: "We fall down from Vaikuntha (brahmajyoti), yes. Not from the planets of Vaikuntha".

Again, you don't know Srila Prabhupada's teachings. He writes in a letter (69-10-27) "Constitutionally every living entity, even if he is in the Vaikuntha-loka (=planets), has chance of falling down".

"We were are all in a Vaikuntha planet. Now, we wanted to enjoy this material world. We have fallen down. Now we are trying to go back again. Therefore we say, "Go back to home, back to Godhead." (Bhag. lecture, Melbourne, May 22, 1975)

"He is fallen already from a Vaikuntha planet. He is fallen in this material world, and he is again trying to make progress". (Bhag. lecture, Los Angeles, June 15, 1972)

"Now we are under the control of this external energy, material energy. We have become controlled, just like we become controlled by the prison authorities when we are criminals. Ordinarily we are free. Those who are not within the walls of prison house, they are free. They are acting freely, wherever they like they are going, but within the law. Similarly we have got freedom. There are living entities, their number is greater. Nitya-mukta, ever liberated. They live in the spiritual world, Vaikuntha planets...And we are nitya-baddha-ever conditioned, eternally conditioned... Then we, again, become nitya-mukta. We revive our original condition of life.

We cannot be eternally conditioned, because we are part and parcel of Krishna. Our natural position is ever liberated, eternally liberated. But because we wanted to imitate Krishna, we wanted to become Krishna...Krishna is the supreme proprietor. Therefore He is the supreme enjoyer". (Bhag. lecture, Mayapur, June 20, 1973)

Our comment: We were nitya muktas on the Vaikuntha planets and became nitya baddha. We, again, can become nitya-mukta.

Note, that the word nitya (eternal) is not absolute, as in our language, the word eternal can be also figurative.

Other examples:

- The demigods are amara immortal.

- Lord Brahma, the anadir beginningless one.

The conditioned souls are nitya-baddha. But this is also not nitya, everlasting. All souls are spiritual and will, at one time, have had all the material enjoyments in the material world and go back to Godhead.

- SRMBG: "Krishna cannot bear the idea that His devotee can perish...the jiva is falling down to maya after awakening from susupti...in the karana samudra (ocean)."

Our comment: Then why can loving Sri Maha-Visnu and Sri Laksmi bear that the soul goes to the ocean of maya and nearly perish, for long.

Because you say: “the soul gets freedom, is in the presence of Laksmi-Narayana, somehow, somewhere, while being in the causal ocean and goes away” than this is fall down from perfection-God and His Goddess- which is our point.

- SRMBG: “The devotee knows he can never give up Krishna. No one wants to fall away from transcendental bliss...”

Our comment: Please study the commentary of Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura (VCT) on Kuyogi’s falling from love:

evam harau bhagavati pratilabdha-bhavo
bhaktya dravad-dhridaya utpulkah pramodat
autkanthya-bashpa-kalaya muhur ardyamanas
tac capi citta-badisam sanakair viyunkte (SB 3.28.34)

“The unfortunate yogi who has developed love for the Lord, full of all sweet qualities, whose heart is somewhat soft because of devotion, whose body hairs stand on end in ecstasy, who is constantly overcome with intense tears of joy, gradually withdraws his hook-like mind from the Lord's form”.

Commentary by VCT: This yogi has attained bhāva for the Supreme Lord, Bhagavān, full of the nectar of all sweetness and powers, since the Lord is most attractive (harau), possessing the six bhagas (bhagavati). Though he received bhāva for the sweet form of the Lord, though his heart melted, though his hairs stood on end, and though he was constantly afflicted with streams of tears caused by longing, he withdraws the hook of his mind from that form (tad api). It is forbidden to give up bhakti, for it has just been said in the previous verse "One should not desire to see anything except the Visnu who is present in one's heart with a mind steeped in mature devotion." Therefore, the yogi gives up that sweet form only by his own foolish decision. This means that the heart which was inundated with the sweetness of the Lord then begins to negate that eagerness for sweetness of the Lord, in order to distance itself from eagerness for rasa for material objects. He does so gradually, because it is difficult to withdraw, since the heart has directly experienced that sweetness. Even if he has no direct experience of the sweetness, he can only withdraw his mind by repeated effort, two times, three times, four times, five times, seven or eight times.

Our comment: This is inconceivable. The yogi is with God. Then to go back to the inferior dream land he has to pull 8 times because the attraction and attachment to the param dristva, higher experience (see Bg 2.59) is so great. So the more inconceivable – as described in the rest of the purport – falling away from a more developed loving relation with Krishna, also happens but this is more rare.

See also for the same principle Brs 1.3.54: By an offense against the dearest devotee of the Lord even real bhava will be destroyed.

This Srimad Bhagavatam 3.28.34 quotation is from the translation of His Holiness Bhanu Swami, who translates according to the commentary on that verse, of Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura’s commentary, on the Srimad Bhagavatam.

There can be two different views on the same verse. It can mean that the yogi withdraws from the material activity. And Sri Visvanatha wishes to take the verse in another dimension to describe the fall from love of a ku-yogi.

Srila Prabhupada also states this possibility in SB 4.20.25 purport “everyone of us is kuyogi because we have engaged in the service of the material world forgetting our eternal relationship with the Lord as suyogi’s perfect mystics”.

Quotes. This time, as S.R.M.B.G. recommends, some “submissive, sincere, clear open heart aural reception (these were his words)” from Srimad Bhagavatam and commentaries.

-- 1.2.24 Commentary of Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura: “The jiva is only a particle of cit having very little ability of knowledge...has very little power, loses his knowledge of his real nature and takes birth in this world by contacting the gunas where the gunas act upon him”.

-- The illusory maya attracts the jiva who subsequently loses all spiritual qualities. (2.9.34 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura)

-- As one forgets one has a jewel locket hanging over one's chest, and laments that one has lost it, one associated with avidya forgets his knowledge and bliss. (3.7.9 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura)

-- The soul loses his powers of knowledge, bliss by association with ignorance. The brilliant luster of gold and silver is not lost by darkness, but is only covered. The soul has no actual misfortune. (3.7.9 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura)

-- The 4 Kumaras offered ten beautiful, personal, prayers. They didn't know of the fighting rasa between the Lord and Jaya and Vijaya's expansions (the 2 Hiranyas, Ravana and Kumbhakarna, Sisupala and Dantavakra, Jagai and Madhai). They thought: "Even the greatest devotees can fall from Vaikuntha because of great offense! What then to speak of where we, who are just dull reflections of sādhakas, can fall from this earth planet!" (3.16.26 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura)

Our comment: I.o.w it is common knowledge that devotees fall from Vaikuntha-loka.

-- Divided into varieties by her threefold modes, material nature creates the forms of the living entities, and the living entities, seeing this, are illusioned by the knowledge—covering feature of the illusory energy. (3.26.5)

-- Because of his forgetfulness, the transcendental living entity accepts the influence of material energy as his field of activities, and thus actuated, he wrongly applies the activities to himself. (3.26.6)

--Maitreya said: This maya which cannot be understood by logic, belonging to the Supreme Lord but not his svarūpa, is the cause of deprivation and ignorance for the jiva who has the possibility of realizing the form, knowledge and bliss of the Lord. (SB 3.7.9)

Comment shrila Visvanatha Cakravarti thakura. Though the jiva has the capacity (ishvarasya) for realising his form of knowledge and bliss, and thus can be called free of contamination (vimuktasya), he is in a condition of deprivation (karpnyam) or durbhagatvam. Thus the jiva is in a state of bondage. This is because of maya, which here means avidya or ignorance, a function of maya. These two, ignorance and bondage are mentioned as the cause.

The meaning is this. You have asked how the jiva loses knowledge because of maya. If it is true that there is actual destruction of knowledge by maya, then maya, the Lord's energy, should be punished by the Lord. But this is not the case. One may forget that one has a jewel locket hanging over one's chest, and lament that one has lost the jewel. Or perhaps it is like this: I get accused of theft by mistake, though it is not my fault and get punished by the state officials. Because of jiva's association with beginningless ignorance, the jiva forgets his knowledge and bliss, identifies with the body and the body's qualities, and thus becomes durbhagatvam. If he suffers, whose fault is that? Losing his powers by the association of ignorance, he wanders around, like a man with a bad wife.

Our comment: The soul had its own original spiritual form in full, eternally. Then maya came. It was not eternally in susupti, deep sleep, unmanifest state, in the brahmajyoti, where there is no variegated display of spiritual opulences. Now it has to clean itself from the mud of maya.

(Visvanatha continued) This maya is only the bewildering potency of the Lord. If it did not have the power to bewilder, there would be no question asked (since no one would be bewildered). This is because (yat) it is contrary by its behavior (nitya virudhayte). The contrary conduct is explained. There is a mistake (karpanyam) in thinking that the Paramatma is bewildered, that he is a jiva. The one Paramatma of pure consciousness cannot be bewildered by maya, but the jiva always is.

Our comment. The jiva can be bewildered, if there is something to be changed. Just 'potential' is zero; it needs first to be developed, in order to be clouded. But as we read in the Visnudharma purana 4.55-57: The luster of a gem is not covered by the mud, nor created by the washing off of the dirt.

(Visvanatha) The paramatma and jivatma are like the sun and the sun's ray, which have the same qualities, but are also different. One is conscious and the other is a conscious particle....

yathagneh kshudra visphulinga vyuccarantity evam evatmanah

Just as a small spark from the fire wanders about, the jiva also wanders. (Brihad-aranyaka Upanishad 2.2.20)

Our comment. The sun's particles close to the sun, as the souls in the spiritual world, are always full of light, never fuel still to be lighted.

– “The living entity is in distress regarding his self-identity. He has no factual background, like a man who dreams that he sees his head cut off.” (3.7.10)

Another translation. “Because of maya, the jéva's loss of knowledge and bliss makes its appearance without cause or purpose. The loss is illusory, just the seer of a dream experiencing his head being cut off is illusory.”

Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura comments. The jiva situated behind the Lord with beginningless aversion loses knowledge by beginningless ignorance which is also situated behind the Lord. There is no cause and no purpose for the jiva doing this. This is the nature of tamas that it eclipses the power of the jiva, who has only small power.

Because of maya, the loss of knowledge and bliss (atma-viparyayah) of the jiva (pumsah) appears to be without cause or goal (arthena). Medini says that artha means object of the senses, wealth, cause, thing, meaning of a word, prevention and goal. An example is given.

The seer of a dream (drashtuh), near himself (upa), sees his head is cut off. Though his head is intact, in the dream state he experiences that his head is gone. Though the jiva does not actually have a destruction of knowledge and bliss, in a state of ignorance he perceives this destruction. The brilliant luster of gold and silver is not lost by darkness, but is only covered. Just as a very brilliant ruby destroys even darkness, the life of the devotee destroys even ignorance.

Jiva Goswami comments:

Although he is eternal, always existing in the three phases of time (past, present, and future), the individual soul does not know this truth about himself. Here the word atma-viparyayah indicates that the conditioned soul has forgotten his true identity.

In truth the head is not really cut off. Indeed, it is not possible for anyone to sit in one place and see his own head being cut off in another place. The sight of this is only an illusion created by the Lord's maya potency. This is described in the following words of the Vedanta-sutra (3.2.3):

“It is like a dream created by the maya potency.” Now the soul has forgotten atma. In this way the pure soul (suddhasya) misidentifies with the material body.

Our comment: The pure spiritual body, his true identity, sat-cit-ananda-vigraha was eternally, completely there, before the forgetfulness.

“No cause and no purpose” means the cause is in the spiritual world. And ‘no purpose’ means what relish can there be in this decaying body, made up of the five decomposable elements and full of putrescence and impurity? Shall we not mind for a moment that this perishable and ever-changing body is liable to wrath, ambition, illusion, fear, grief, envy, hatred; separation from those we hold most dear, and association with those we hate? What relish can there be for material enjoyments when we are exposed to hunger, thirst, disease, decrepitude, emaciation, growth, decline, and death? The universe is tending to decay, – grass, trees, animals spring up and die. Mighty men are gone leaving their joys and glories. Beings still greater than these have passed away – vast oceans have dried, mountains have been thrown down, the polar star displaced, the cords that bind the planets rent asunder, the whole earth deluged with flood – in such a world what relish can there be for fleeting enjoyments? Living in such a world are we not like frogs jumping in a dried-up well?

-The qualities belonging to the subtle body do not belong to the ätmä but appear to be so, just as the trembling quality in the water imposed on the reflection of the moon is not trembling of the moon, though it appears to be so. (SB 3.7.11)

Commentary Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura. “The knowledge and bliss of the jiva may be covered, but how does the jiva obtain qualities such as attachment, hatred, lamentation, illusion and lust?”

The qualities such as lamentation and illusion belong to the antahkarana (anatmanah). They do not belong (asan) to the jiva (atmanah, the seer. though they appear to be so. The appearance takes place by imposition of the subtle body. An example is given to show how imposition of illusion takes place. The trembling imposed on the moon's image in the water appears to be trembling of the moon, though actually the moon is not trembling but the water.

Our comment. The moon remains as it is. So the soul was complete. Not in the Brahmajyoti.

-- This conditional life is due to the soul's forgetfulness (nasta-smrtih) of his relationship with the Supreme Personality of Godhead. Therefore, without the Lord's mercy, how can he again (punah) engage in the transcendental loving service to the Lord? (3.31.15)

Sridhara Swami gives the following commentary on this verse:

"By whose maya this living entity, his memory being lost, wanders on the path of samsara, with the suffering caused by that condition. Without the mercy of Him alone, of the Lord, by what means can the soul again fully accept his own constitutional position?"

-- "...Cheated of his nature of knowledge and bliss (sarva-prakrti) coming under the control of another (klaibyāt – caused by weakness), assuming a different nature..."(4.25.62 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura)

-- "The jiva gives up proper intelligence by the influence of tamas and then regains it." (4.26.1 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura)

-- The friend from previous time is the Lord, in the spiritual world, your friend, with whom you moved about previously (vicara means consulted, wandering about). You wandered with me before the creation (agre). This means "You remained along with me experiencing happiness in my association. Giving me up, desiring a place, you became engaged in material enjoyment". (4.28.52-53 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura)

Our comment: This friend was not Maha-Visnu; one doesn't wander about with him in friendship before the creation in between Mahapralaya and the next Mahakalpa or sarga-creation. The soul was during the period, between Mahapralaya and the next Mahakalpa, within Maha-Visnu, and in a dreamless-sleeping state, as Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura describes. Thus, this states the pastimes between the Lord and the soul on the spiritual planets.

Srimad Bhagavatam continues:

"You should see our natures as two pure entities". (4.28.61)

"Thus the living entity regained his memory (punah smrtim) which was lost (nastAm) by aversion to the Lord. (nastAm Apa punah smrtim) (4.28.61)

Our comment: Krishna consciousness is now regained. It was lost. The same Krishna consciousness was there before.

-- The living entity by nature has minute independence to choose his own good or bad fortune, but when he forgets his supreme master, the Personality of Godhead, he gives himself up unto the modes of material nature. Being influenced by the modes of material nature, he identifies himself with the body and, for the interest of the body, becomes attached to various activities. Sometimes he is under the influence of the mode of ignorance, sometimes the mode of passion and sometimes the mode of goodness. The living entity thus gets different types of bodies under the modes of material nature. (4.29.26)

yadā na paśyaty ayathā guṇehām
svārthe pramattah sahasā vipaścit
gata-smritir vindati tatra tāpān
āsādyā maithunyam agāram ajnah

yadā—when; na—not; paśyati—sees; ayathā—unnecessary; guṇa-īhām—endeavor to satisfy the senses; sva-arthe—in self-interest; pramattah—mad; sahasā—very soon; vipaścit—even one advanced in knowledge; gata-smritih—being forgetful; vindati—gets; tatra—there; tāpān—material miseries; āsādyā—getting; maithunyam—based on sexual intercourse; agāram—a home; ajnah—being foolish.

Even though one may be very learned and wise, he is mad if he does not understand that the endeavor for sense gratification is a useless waste of time. Being forgetful of his own interest, he tries to be happy in the material world, centering his interests around his home, which is based on sexual intercourse and which brings him all kinds of material miseries. In this way one is no better than a foolish animal. (SB 5.5.7)

Another translation: When the wise man does not see that desire for sense objects is useless, he becomes a fool and, forgetting his true nature, he attains a house meant for sexual pleasure, and experiences extreme suffering.

Comment. “gata-smritih—being forgetful”. The soul knew Krishna and his own nature, but lost that Krishna consciousness.

Srila Prabhupada lecturing on this verse says: “If we forget Krsna, if we make our own plan to satisfy myself, community, society, nation, this is forgetfulness and the result will be, gata-smrtir vindati tatra tapan. You get simply trouble. That is being done, actually. The whole world is forgetfulness of Krsna, or God. Krsna, forgetfulness, and they are making so many plans to become happy but the result is vindati tapan, simply suffering, simply suffering. It will never be successful...jivera svarupa haya nitya-krsna-dasa [Cc. Madhya 20.108-109]. Our real position is that I am eternal servant of Krsna. So gata-smrtih, I have forgotten that. And therefore, bhuliya tomare samsare asiya peye nana-vidha byatha. Bhaktivinoda Thakura's song, "My Lord, forgetting You I came in this material world. I am simply suffering." Peya nana-vidha byatha. These... The same thing is there in the Vedic literature, the same thing is instructed by the advanced, enlightened, liberated devotee. The same thing. This forgetfulness. We have forgotten what is our position...Yan maithunadi-grhamedhi-sukham hi tuccham kanduyanena karayor iva dukkha-dukkham [SB 7.9.45]. That is the only happiness, there is no secrecy. The people are working so hard, simply maithunyam agaram. It is a prison house, agaram. Agaram means packed up, shackled with iron chains, and the only happiness is maithunyam agaram. And this is only abominable, tuccham. Yan maithunadi-grhamedhi-sukham hi tuccham. So how he has accepted this lowest class of happiness as the aim of life? Ajnah, rascal.”

-- O my Lord, O Supreme Personality of Godhead, will I again be able to be a servant of Your eternal servants who find shelter only at Your lotus feet? O Lord of my life, may I again become their servant so that my mind may always think of Your transcendental attributes, my words always glorify those attributes, and my body always engage in the loving service of Your Lordship? (6.11.24)

Commentary of Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura: I will again become the servant of the servants who take shelter only of your lotus feet.

Our comment: Vrtrasura was Citraketu; a mukta-purusa. To teach us this lila was put up. He was before, in his ‘conditioned’ life not in the company of pure servants of the pure servants of Krishna. He was in the company of hedonists in the bhoga-loka, heaven.

-- If the living being forgets this nature of Mine, then My nature becomes separated from him. At that time he undergoes material existence. From one body to another body, from death to death. (6.16.57)

-- One who wants to be free of material entanglement should take to the service of the Supreme Personality of Godhead and give up the contamination of ignorance, involving pious and impious activities. Thus one regains his original identity, just as a block of gold or silver sheds all dirt and becomes purified when treated with fire. (8.24.48)

-- A materialistic so-called guru instructs his materialistic disciples about economic development and sense gratification, and because of such instructions the foolish disciples continue in the materialistic existence of ignorance. But Your Lordship gives knowledge that is eternal, and the intelligent person receiving such knowledge is quickly situated in his original constitutional position. (8.24.51)

Note: nija padam means his own position.

-- The pastime potency is divided into knowledge and ignorance potencies. The ignorance potency, which makes one forget the Supreme Lord's powers and opulences, brought the bliss of ecstatic love to Krishna's mother (Yasoda). In the same way, it also bewildered the gopis, as is described in the Gopala-tapani Upanisad. This will be described in detail at the proper time. The material ignorance potency makes the conditioned souls in the material world forget the Supreme Personality of Godhead. It covers their true knowledge. (10.39.55. Jiva Goswami)

-- The senses of one whose consciousness is bewildered by illusion perceive only the names and forms of material objects. Thus such a person loses his memory and cannot know You. (10.84.25)

-- The srutis said: Victory, victory to You, O unconquerable one! By Your very nature You are perfectly full in all opulences; therefore please defeat the eternal power of illusion, who assumes control over the modes of nature to create difficulties for conditioned souls. O You who awaken all the energies of the moving and nonmoving embodied beings, sometimes the Vedas can recognize You as You sport with Your material and spiritual potencies. (10.87.14)

Comment of Jiva Goswami: dosa here refers to the fault of ignorance, which makes the jiva forget the Supreme Personality of Godhead (atma vismrti).

Our comment: Forgetting means that the knowledge of the Lord was once there.

-- The illusory material nature attracts the minute living entity to embrace her, and as a result he assumes forms composed of her qualities. Subsequently, he loses all his spiritual qualities and must undergo repeated deaths. You, however, avoid the material energy in the same way that a snake abandons its old skin. Glorious in Your possession of eight mystic perfections, You enjoy unlimited opulences. (10.87.38)

-- Fear arises when a living entity misidentifies himself as the material body because of absorption in the external, illusory energy of the Lord. When the living entity thus turns away from the Supreme Lord, he also forgets his own constitutional position as a servant of the

Lord. This bewildering, fearful condition is effected by the potency for illusion, called maya. Therefore, an intelligent person should engage unflinchingly in the unalloyed devotional service of the Lord, under the guidance of a bona fide spiritual master, whom he should accept as his worshipable deity and as his very life and soul. (11.2.37)

-- The intelligence of the living entity is stolen away (musiteksanam) by activities of sense gratification, and thus he falls into the dark well of material existence (samsAra-kupe patitam). Within that well he is then seized by the deadly serpent of time. Who else but the Supreme Personality of Godhead could save the poor living entity from such a hopeless condition? (11.8.41)

-- Just as gold, when smelted in fire, gives up its impurities and returns to its pure brilliant state, similarly, the spirit soul, absorbed in the fire of bhakti-yoga, is purified of all contamination caused by previous fruitive activities and returns to its original position of serving Me in the spiritual world. (11.14.25)

Jiva Goswami comments: "This verse means: 'With love shaking away (vidhuya) past karma, the devotee attains his original pure spiritual form and then engages in serving (bhajati) Me (mam).'" The words Jiva Goswami uses for "attains his original pure spiritual form" are suddha svarupam ca prapya.

-- The conditioned souls forget their constitutional position. The omniscient Lord can revive their original nature by imparting knowledge. (SB 11.22.10)

-- When the material contamination is removed, the object displays its original purity. The soul regains his natural and healthy state of serving the Supreme Lord. (11.28.34 commentary by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati)

-- Although a cloud is a product of the sun and is also made visible by the sun, it nevertheless creates darkness for the viewing eye, which is another partial expansion of the sun. Similarly, material false ego, a particular product of the Absolute Truth made visible by the Absolute Truth, obstructs the individual soul, another partial expansion of the Absolute Truth, from realizing the Absolute Truth. (12.4.32)

Our comment: The normal condition is that the sun is visible, but sometimes it is covered by the cloud. So, normally the soul sees Krishna but now this vision is blocked by ahankara.

-- When the cloud originally produced from the sun is torn apart, the eye can see the actual form of the sun. Similarly, when the spirit soul destroys his material covering of false ego by inquiring into the transcendental science, he regains his original spiritual awareness. (anusmaret one gains his proper remembrance) (12.4.33)

-- Just as when a pot is broken the sky [within the pot] would continue to be sky as before, similarly when the body is dead the jiva again attains to the absolute status. (12.5.5)

Our comment: Here we have the words yathA purA... evam... punah: "as before... so again." The pot took some sky. When the pot breaks the same sky remains. So, the soul, once existing in a pure state, becomes covered by a material body and then returns to the same pure state as before. The words yathA purA, "just as before," are significant, for if one wishes to claim that the soul originally comes from the brahmajyoti or some other surrogate pure

status that is not the abode of the Lord, then the soul will return to the same state. But the Srimad Bhagavatam doesn't wish the soul to go to the brahmajyoti. The soul should go to Vaikuntha – or Krishna-loka. Therefore, that is the place where it came from.

Margin is always in contact with matter and spirit

D. dasa wrongly analyzes Bg 18.78 purport: the marginal energy “situated between” the spiritual and material energy, to mean the marginal energy or soul falls from an area between the material world and the spiritual world. And that the soul was there eternally.

To conclude this he changes Srila Prabhupada’s “situated between” to “the soul is in the position between matter and spirit” or the material world and the spiritual world.

What Srila Prabhupada means with “situated between,” Srila Prabhupada explains in the sentence before. Because Srila Prabhupada says “in other words.”

“Situated between” is a general philosophical statement that the souls has “a tendency to be in contact either with the material energy or with the spiritual energy.”

In a letter 13-06-1970 Srila Prabhupada explains that fall down is from pure Krishna consciousness not from Brahmajyoti (and everything below it, including causal ocean) because these are fallen conditions already.

“The next question, about the living entities falling down in this material world are not from the impersonal brahman. Existence in the impersonal brahma is also within the category of non-Krishna consciousness. Those who are in the brahman effulgence they are also in the fallen condition, so there is no question of falling down from a fallen condition. When fall takes place, it means falling down from the non-fallen condition.

The non-fallen condition is Krishna consciousness. So long one can maintain pure Krishna consciousness he is not fallen down. As soon as he becomes out of Krishna consciousness immediately he is fallen down. It does not matter where a living entity stays. In the material world also there are different stages of living conditions, and to remain in the brahman effulgence is also another phase of that fallen condition.”

In a letter 6-6-72 Srila Prabhupada says that before these fallen states the soul was with Krishna:

“Because he falls down from brahmasayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krishna...Formerly we were with Krishna in His lila or sport.”

Further, Srila Prabhupada has already before Bg 18.78 written in Bg 3.36-37 purports that the soul’s original eternal pure love of God is transformed in lust.

The living entities are part and parcels of Krishna’s bliss. But their service attitude is transformed by misuse of their independence.

This is also in Bg 5.15 ajnAnena Avritam jnAnam – ignorance covers the real knowledge of the embodied beings.

And in the purport: A living entity is, by superior nature, full of knowledge. Nevertheless, he is prone to be influenced by ignorance due to his limited power... although he is constitutionally eternal, blissful and cognizant, due to the littleness of his existence he forgets his constitutional position of service to the Lord and is thus entrapped by nescience.

Our comment: This tatastha-origin-vada argues that this forgetfulness has taken place on the border between matter and spirit, after waking up from eternal sleep and seeing Maha-Visnu and envying Him.

However, Maha-Visnu is 100% Narayana of Vaikuntha-loka and 94% Krishna. (See Nectar of Devotion 2.1.39-40) The choice at the border must have been by a soul fully awake. Otherwise, God would have been responsible for our choice for Maha-Visnu and the spiritual world or maya. If the soul fully awake, chooses to hate the association and service of Maha-Visnu and falls, that is the same as fall from Vaikuntha-loka or Krishna-loka.

And Krishna has said before: “O scion of Bharata, O conqueror of the foe, all living entities are born into delusion, bewildered by dualities arisen from desire and hate.” (Bg 7.27)

On this verse Srila Prabhupada writes in SB 4.28.53-54: “This verse (Bg 7.27) is an explanation of how the living entity falls down into this material world. In the spiritual world there is no duality, nor is there hate. The Supreme Personality of Godhead expands Himself into many. In order to enjoy bliss more and more, the Supreme Lord expands Himself in different categories. As mentioned in the Varaha purana, He expands Himself in visnu-tattva (the svamsa expansion) and in His marginal potency (the vibhinnamsa, or the living entity). These expanded living entities are innumerable, just as the minute molecules of sunshine are innumerable expansions of the sun. The vibhinnamsa expansions, the marginal potencies of the Lord, are the living entities. When the living entities desire to enjoy themselves, they develop a consciousness of duality and come to hate the service of the Lord. In this way the living entities fall into the material world. In the prema-vivarta it is said:

Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga-vancha kare
nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare

The natural position of the living entity is to serve the Lord in a transcendental loving attitude. When the living entity wants to become Krishna Himself or imitate Krishna, he falls down into the material world. Since Krishna is the supreme father, His affection for the living entity is eternal. When the living entity falls down into the material world, the Supreme Lord, through His svamsa expansion (Paramatma), keeps company with the living entity. In this way the living entity may some day return home, back to Godhead.

By misusing his independence, the living entity falls down from the service of the Lord and takes a position in this material world as an enjoyer. That is to say, the living entity takes his position within a material body. Wanting to take a very exalted position, the living entity instead becomes entangled in a repetition of birth and death...

The original home of the living entity and the Supreme Personality of Godhead is the spiritual world. In the spiritual world both the Lord and the living entities live together very peacefully. Since the living entity remains engaged in the service of the Lord, they both share a blissful life in the spiritual world. However, when the living entity wants to enjoy himself, he falls down into the material world.”

And in the Bg 15.7 Srila Prabhupada purports that the living entity has forgotten the transcendental loving service of the Lord and that he has to revive his original spiritual body.

Revive means the soul was completely developed, then the spiritual body shrunk or contracted.

Before Bg 18.78, Srila Prabhupada in His Bhaktivedanta purports to Bhagavad-gita, uses 'back to home' – 6 times, 'back to Godhead' – 20 times, 'back home' – 10 times and 'back home, back to Godhead' – 9 times. Home, where the living entity was as per Bg 3.37, Bg 7.27 and Bg 15.7 purports, purely loving Krishna.

Here are these quotes:

... the misguided student of Bhagavad-gita will certainly be bewildered on the path of spiritual guidance and will not be able to go back to home, back to Godhead. (Bg preface)

The material creation by the Lord of creatures (Visnu) is a chance offered to the conditioned souls to come back home—back to Godhead. All living entities within the material creation are conditioned by material nature because of their forgetfulness of their relationship to Visnu, or Krishna, the Supreme Personality of Godhead. (Bg 3.10 p)

Our comment: Back to home where they were not forgetting, but fully aware of their relationship to Krishna.

After creating or impregnating the conditioned souls into the womb of material nature, He gave His directions in the Vedic wisdom as to how such conditioned souls can return home, back to Godhead. (Bg 3.15 p)

A liberated person no longer desires external material happiness. This state is called brahma-bhuta [SB 4.30.20], attaining which one is assured of going back to Godhead, back to home. (Bg 5.24 p)

There are many devotees who assume themselves to be in Krishna consciousness and devotional service but at heart do not accept the Supreme Personality of Godhead, Krishna, as the Absolute Truth. For them, the fruit of devotional service—going back to Godhead—will never be tasted. (Bg 9.12 p)

The Krishna consciousness movement is therefore distributing sublime information to the entire human society to the effect that by simply chanting the Hare Krishna mantra one can become perfect in this life and go back home, back to Godhead. (Bg 9.25 p)

It is clearly mentioned here: mam upaisyasi, "he comes to Me," back home, back to Godhead. There are five different stages of liberation, and here it is specified that the devotee who has always lived his lifetime here under the direction of the Supreme Lord, as stated, has evolved to the point where he can, after quitting this body, go back to Godhead and engage directly in the association of the Supreme Lord... A person who is thus always engaged in the service of the Lord or is always thinking and planning how to serve the Lord is to be considered completely liberated at present, and in the future his going back home, back to Godhead, is guaranteed. (Bg 9.28 p)

Take to My devotional service and come quickly back to Godhead, back home. (Bg 9.33 p)

A person in Krishna consciousness has no fear because by his activities he is sure to go back to the spiritual sky, back home, back to Godhead. (Bg 10.4-5 p)

When one tries to go back home, back to Godhead, and takes fully to Krishna consciousness in devotional service, his action is called buddhi yoga. (Bg 10.10 p)

Our comment: Back home where the soul was fully Krishna conscious in devotional service.

This cosmic manifestation is a chance for the conditioned souls to go back to Godhead, back to home. (Bg 11.33 p)

The Bhagavad-gita is meant to show how one can understand his spiritual existence and his eternal relationship with the supreme spiritual personality and to teach one how to go back home, back to Godhead. (Bg 11.55 p)

Although the common man is often not as capable as so-called philosophers, faithful hearing from an authoritative person will help one transcend this material existence and go back to Godhead, back to home. (Bg 13.26 p)

The living entities are essentially the parts and parcels of the Supreme Lord, and He is giving herewith the hint how they can come back to Godhead, back to home. (Bg 15.12 p)

The Vedas give the right direction to people so that they can properly mold their lives and come back to Godhead, back to home. (Bg 15.15 p)

For a sannyasi or anyone who is aspiring to get out of the clutches of material nature and trying to elevate himself to the spiritual nature and go back home, back to Godhead, for him, looking toward material possessions and women for sense gratification—not even enjoying them, but just looking toward them with such a propensity—is so condemned that he had better commit suicide before experiencing such illicit desires. (Bg 16.1-3 p)

Krishna consciousness is a scientific execution of transcendental activities which enables one to return home, back to Godhead. (Bg 17.23 p)

Acts should be performed for the ultimate gain of being transferred to the spiritual kingdom, back to home, back to Godhead. (Bg 17.25 p)

Anyone, however, who tries sincerely to present Bhagavad-gita as it is will advance in devotional activities and reach the pure devotional state of life. As a result of such pure devotion, he is sure to go back home, back to Godhead. (BG 18.68 p)

Our comment: Back to Godhead, home where there is the pure devotional state of life.

In all of Srila Prabhupada's teachings we find the statements

back to Goloka – 5 times

back to the rasa-dance– 5 times

back to Godhead – 2921 times

back to home – 1137 times

back to home back to godhead – 970 times

back home – 691 times

back home back to godhead – 528 times

back to Krishna – 97 times

back to the spiritual world – 21 times

back to the kingdom of God – 16 times

back to Krishna – 9 times

back to vaikuntha – 9 times
return to the kingdom of god – 8 times
return to the spiritual world – 8 times
back to the kingdom of Godhead – 5 times
back to the kingdom of Krishna – 1 time
back to the vaikuntha – 1 time

In his purports before Bg 18.78 Srila Prabhupada uses the word “forget” in 6 purports. Here they are:

In the present status of our life, not only have we forgotten the Supreme Lord, but we have forgotten our eternal relationship with the Lord... The forgetful living entities or conditioned souls have forgotten their relationship with the Supreme Lord, and they are engrossed in thinking of material activities. (Bg intro.)

Our comment: The soul had his eternal relation with Krishna but lost it, forgot it. Now he has to revive his memory again.

The forgetful living entities or conditioned souls have forgotten their relationship with the Supreme Lord, and they are engrossed in thinking of material activities. (Bg intro.)

Under the circumstances, it is admitted that Lord Krishna is the Supreme Lord, superior in position to the living entity, Arjuna, who is a forgetful soul deluded by maya. (Bg 2.13 p)

The consciousness of the individual soul is prone to be forgetful. When he is forgetful of his real nature, he obtains education and enlightenment from the superior lessons of Krishna. But Krishna is not like the forgetful soul. If so, Krishna's teachings of Bhagavad-gita would be useless... Arjuna is the atomic soul, forgetful of his real nature; therefore he requires to be enlightened (Bg 2.20 p)

Due to his long misuse of the senses in sense gratification, he is factually bewildered by the false ego, which makes him forget his eternal relationship with Krishna. (Bg 3.27 p)

The living entities, as separate parts and parcels of the Supreme, have a purpose to fulfill. Having forgotten that purpose since time immemorial, they are situated in different bodies, as men, animals, demigods, etc. Such bodily differences arise from forgetfulness of the transcendental service of the Lord... the living entities are deluded by the material energy, imagining themselves to have a separate identity. Thus, under different standards of material identity, they become forgetful of Krishna. (Bg 4.35 p)

Those who have forgotten Krishna must certainly be bewildered, but those who are in Krishna consciousness are not bewildered at all. (Bg 5.16 p)

There are many different kinds of living entities—human beings, demigods, animals, etc.—and each and every one of them is under the influence of material nature, and all of them have forgotten the transcendent Personality of Godhead. (Bg 7.13 p)

The relationship between the living entity and Krishna is fixed eternally; it cannot be forgotten, as we can see from the behavior of Arjuna. Although Arjuna has seen the opulence in the universal form, he cannot forget his friendly relationship with Krishna. (Bg 11.41-42 p)

Srila Prabhupada uses 'reinstate' in Bg 7.28 p:

“Unless one is reinstated in his own constitutional position, it is not possible to understand the Supreme Personality or to be fully engaged in His transcendental loving service with determination.”

Our comment: One is reinstated in full engagement in His transcendental loving service.

Srila Prabhupada uses “revive” in 7 purports:

By the process of devotional service, one can revive that svarupa, and that stage is called svarupa-siddhi—perfection of one's constitutional position... the whole purpose of Bhagavad-gita is to revive our sanatana occupation, or sanatana-dharma, which is the eternal occupation of the living entity. (BG intro.)

Our comment: One's nitya-svarupa was there. Then one fell. Now, one has to revive one's nitya-svarupa.

In the form of a human being, the living entity may revive a little Krishna consciousness, and, if he makes further development, the fire of spiritual life can be kindled in the human form of life. (Bg 3.38 p)

By Krishna consciousness, he can revive his real position and thus come out of his embodiment. (BG 5.13 p)

.....to act to revive this consciousness within the entire human society is the highest welfare work. (Bg 5.25 p)

It is the duty of the guardians of children to revive the divine consciousness dormant in them...the naradhama who is condemned by the Personality of Godhead can again revive his spiritual consciousness only by the mercy of a devotee. (Bg 7.15 p)

Our comment: The divine consciousness has become dormant. Now it has to become awakened.

One's memory of Krishna is revived by chanting the maha-mantra, Hare Krishna. (Bg 8.8 p)

Now the heart has to be purified of the material association, and that dormant, natural love for Krishna has to be revived. That is the whole process. (Bg 12.9 p)

The word 'dormant' is used in 3 purports

Lord Krishna, who is dwelling in everyone's heart, acts as a best-wishing friend and purifies the devotee who constantly engages in hearing of Him. In this way, a devotee naturally develops his dormant transcendental knowledge. (Bg 7.1 p)

It is the duty of the guardians of children to revive the divine consciousness dormant in them. (Bg 7.15 p)

This love of God is now in a dormant state in everyone's heart. And, there, love of God is manifested in different ways, but it is contaminated by material association. Now the heart has to be purified of the material association, and that dormant, natural love for Krishna has to be revived. That is the whole process. (Bg 12.9 p)

The word 'awaken' is used in 3 places:

All the instructions of Bhagavad-gita are intended to awaken this pure consciousness, and therefore we find at the last stage of the Gita's instructions that Krishna is asking Arjuna whether he is now in purified consciousness. (Bg intro.)

The system is that they [the sannyasis] go from door to door to awaken the householders from the slumber of ignorance. (Bg 10.4-5 p)
the sannyasi goes from door to door, not exactly for the purpose of begging, but to see the householders and awaken them to Krishna consciousness. (Bg 16.1-3 p)

The word 'lost' is used in 2 purports:

In each of these processes one has to realize the constitutional position of the living entity, his relationship with God, and the activities whereby he can reestablish the lost link and achieve the highest perfectional stage of Krishna consciousness. (Bg 6.37 p)

Our comment: The souls had its constitutional highest perfect link with Krishna and has to become reestablished in what he lost.

The civilized form of human life is meant for man's reviving the lost consciousness of his eternal relation with the Supreme Truth, the Personality of Godhead (Bg 7.15 p)
(End quotes)

Nor is this 'tatastha origin vada (=theory)' logical.

Eko bahu syama – The souls are meant to enjoy with Krishna. Why keep them in a long slumber (susupti) and then wake them up in a margin state to fall or rise.

Parents create children to enjoy. Immediately the mother carefully eats to nourish the child properly. She conducts herself to protect her womb. The father works to secure a happy home and future. The parents meditate on the future pastimes.

If a king starts a kingdom, he doesn't lock some citizens away to participate later in the good life. Sarve sukhino bhavantu – let everyone always enjoy.

D. dasa questions "How can mundane envy enter Goloka?"

Mundane envy doesn't enter the Visnu- and Sakti-tattvas in Goloka– the sandini, samvit, hladini- but it can enter the tatastha jiva (soul) in Goloka, who is strictly speaking not part of Goloka, because the anu-atma is always marginal. Tatastha is the line between matter and spirit, always close to both.

On Bg 18.78, Srila Prabhupada writes that:

The soul is pure spirit in his original position...the soul is marginal energy (i.o.w. a subcategory of the spiritual energy). The marginal energy (which is always marginal) has a tendency to be in contact either with material energy or with the spiritual energy (always)."

Mundane envy can enter the ever marginal soul as the margin (tatastha) at the beach is always in contact with the sea and the land. As Srila Prabhupada writes in a letter 6-6-72:

“Just like at the edge of the beach, sometimes the water covers, sometimes there is dry sand, coming and going. Our position is like that, sometimes covered, sometimes free, just like at the edge of the tide. As soon as we forget, immediately the illusion is there...even with Krishna [in His lila or sport] there is a dormant attitude for forgetting Krishna and creating an atmosphere for enjoying independently.”

Srila Prabhupada had also said this in the purport to Bg 6.3:

“The living entity (jivatma) takes different positions--sometimes he merges into the dark material nature and identifies himself with matter and sometimes he identifies himself with the superior spiritual nature. Therefore he is called the Supreme Lord's marginal energy.

In his lectures on the Bhagavad-gita, His Divine Grace states these same conclusions. We'll give these quotes of his lectures on the first two chapters.

If one keeps his position rightly, he does not fall...Fallen means when the living entities are under the clutches of this material energy. That is called fallen. Just like a man, when he is under police custody, it is to be understood that he is a criminal, he is fallen. He has fallen down from good citizenship. (on Bg 1.21)

My Lord, I forgot my service. From this day, I become again Your servant. Please give me protection... Now, simply by chanting harer nama, the holy name of Lord Krishna, you become again situated in the original position... And he becomes so purified that he becomes fit to go back to home, back to Godhead. (on Bg 1.37-39)

When I desire to lord it over the material nature and forget my service to Krishna...(on Bg 1.42)

Krishna is ready, He is sitting with you as a friend. Simply looking for the opportunity when you'll come back to Him. But we are not willing to go back to home, back to Godhead. (on Bg 2.11)

Again you revive your consciousness, Krishna consciousness. (on Bg 2.12)

Regain your original spiritual life...So, spiritual rejuvenation [is] required. (on Bg 2.13)

At the present moment we have lost our spiritual constitutional position; therefore we are in this material world. Just like a man is generally healthy, but sometimes he falls sick, so at the present moment our condition is sick. It is called bhava-roga. Bhava-roga. Bhava means to become, and roga means disease. We have to cure this disease and come to our healthy standard of life...revive the healthy condition of eternal spiritual life. (on Bg 2.17)

And if they come back to Me they can live so nicely, as My friend, as My lover, as My father, as My mother, in Vrndavana. So I come to claim them again, call them. (on Bg 2.19)

The living entities, they are compared with the sparks, and the Supreme Lord to the big fire. Sometimes the sparks fall down from the big fire. That is our fall down. Fall down means we come into the material world. Why? Just to enjoy, to imitate Krishna. (on Bg 2.20)

So the whole Krishna consciousness process is again transferring the loving propensity from maya to Krishna... when we forget to serve Krishna, that is our asanatana... We have forgotten [our] real position... (on Bg 2.25)

Unless we come to that platform of bhakti-yoga and become re-related, again revive our Krishna consciousness... (on Bg 2.26)

Just to induce you again to love Krishna... You have fallen in this condition because you have forgotten Krishna... the cause of fall down [is] Krishna bahirmukha haiya bhoga vancha kare nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare: "As soon as one becomes inimical to Krishna and desires sense gratification, he is immediately struck down by the illusory energy of the Lord." (Jagadananda-pandit, Prema-vivarta) (on Bg 2.39)

If anyone is reestablished in his original constitutional position as part and parcel of the Supreme and engages his energy in that way, he is liberated... any person, any living entity, who is not engaged in Krishna consciousness activities... has to (be) reestablished... in his original constitutional position as part and parcel of the Supreme. (on Bg 2.40-45)

Just like a man in a feverish condition or in feverish delirium, speaking something. That is not his normal speaking... Similarly, our, the present life is diseased condition, so if we want to cure this disease of repeated birth and death, then we have to restrict our bodily enjoyment (to become healthy again)... We are actually hankering after happiness because the soul's constitution is happiness... who is brought up in a very nice family with all comfortable conditions, as he feels distress in a different condition, similarly, the soul is the part and parcel of the Supreme Being sac-cid-ananda-vigraha, therefore our hankering is always to live eternally. Our hankering is always to get full knowledge... The knowledge which you had in your previous lives is now forgotten. Therefore we are seeking eternal knowledge... You give a piece of sugar candy [to a jaundice patient] and ask him to take. He will say, "It is bitter." He won't taste its sweetness. Because his condition is diseased, therefore, he actually cannot enjoy the sweetness of sugar candy. But when he is cured, a man in healthy state, if you give him sugar candy, oh, he will say, he will appreciate, "Oh, it is very sweet, very nice." The same sugar candy, according to our condition of life, is tasted differently. So unless we cure from this disease of wrong conception of life, we cannot have any taste. (on Bg 2.44-45, 58)

Lord Jesus Christ comes on this earth to reclaim these conditioned soul to back to Godhead, back to the kingdom of Godhead... Every reformer or every great religious leader or God Himself, He comes on this earth to reclaim these conditioned soul back to Godhead, back to the kingdom of Godhead... people, by material contact they forget their relation, their relationship with the Supreme Lord. (on Bg 2.46-47)

He has forgotten his eternal relationship with God. So we have to revive it. (on Bg 2.48-49)

These senses are given just like a boy is given some plaything by the father; similarly, we wanted to enjoy this material world. Therefore our material senses are awarded: "All right, you enjoy. You just have experience of this material world, and when you get experience that 'I am not happy,' then you shall come back again to Me." (on Bg 2.55-58)

Reinstate myself in the pure spiritual life (on Bg 2.59-69)

[We] have forgotten completely that I am not this body, I am spirit soul, aham brahmasmi; I am part and parcel of the Supreme Brahman...

Devotee: How did we fall?

Prabhupada: [The] potency of falling down is always there... Everyone is prone to fall diseased. Similarly, we are in the material condition of life. Just go on treating it, and as soon as you are cured, be careful not to fall down again. But there is chance of falling down, again becoming diseased. Not that because you once become cured, there is no chance of becoming diseased again. There is chance... because we are part and parcel of God and because we are now in the material world, it is to be understood that we have fallen down. (on Bg 2.62-72)

From Radha-Syama to Maya-devi dhama

Sings Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura in Baul Sangit:

“Leaving the company of Radha-Syama in Vraja-Dhama (ChAdi’rAdhA-syAme braja-dhAme) you have come to this material world and suffered a host of painful miseries (bhugcho hethA nAnA-klesa).

You are actually composed of pure spiritual knowledge and bliss (tumi suddha cidAnanda) whose only happiness is found in service to Krishna (Krishna-sevA tA’r Ananda). Alas, you have fallen into the hands of the material elements (panca-bhUter hAte pode’ hAy) trapped within the prison-house of Maya-devi (mAyA-devir kArAgAre).

S.R.M in his article “Misquotations for false conclusions” supports Brahmajyoti-Karanodakasayi-Visnu-karana-samudra-fall-vada: The mistaken idea that the soul was originally eternally asleep (susupti) in the brahmajyoti; then is transferred to Karanodakasayi-Visnu then into the karana-samudra or causal ocean; then falls or rises.

The complete picture in the light of this “Baul Sangit” is: fall from Radha-Syama in the spiritual world. A stopover at the border of the material and spiritual world where the soul gets another chance. This is not in Maha-Visnu, but close to Him. From Maha-visnu come all the conditioned souls, who entered Him after the last maha-pralaya.

Srila Prabhupada writes in SB 3.12.3: “The Lord first of all tries to protect him from the trap, but when the living entity persists on gliding down to hell, the Lord helps him to forget his real position to give the chance to see if he is happy by misusing his independence.”

In the Jaiva dharma there is no mention of a flying or swimming out of Maha-Visnu at the time of creation and in the flight or while swimming seeing both the material and spiritual worlds and choosing then for maya or Krishna.

The living entities coming out of Maha-Visnu at that time are on the way to a material body directed by the Lord’s kala-sakti, time energy and the soul’s previous karma (activities before they were inhaled into Maha-Visnu).

They are beamed within and as the effulgence (=Sambhu or Siva-linga) of Maha-Visnu, bypassing higher-dimensionally the causal waters, stored in the material universes, along with the Garbhodakasayi Visnu expansions. They wake up from susupti in the universe (SB 3.20.15), 2000 years of the demigods later. They do not wake up in the causal ocean.

The consciousness of these souls, once they enter a material body, is the same as at the time they left their last body, before inhalation into the Maha-Visnu (see B.g 8.5-6); they are mostly in tama- and raja-guna.

The souls who had become Krishna conscious in the last mahakalpa have already long before the new creation gone Back to Godhead.

Thus, there are no omniscient souls emanating out of Maha-Visnu; souls who can and deserve to see the material and spiritual worlds.

And, most importantly, these souls are still in coma-susupti-, and, there is no material world yet (!) for souls to see, become attracted to and embedded in.

Before the kala-sakti and the souls enter the prakrti (material nature), she is in her pradhana (lit. first, chief) feature, meaning un-manifested matter; the guna’s, the material qualities are in equilibrium.

Jiva always tatastha

The Jaiva dharma chapter 15 states that Maha-Visnu generates or expands jivas. Balarama, through His expansions, has jiva parsadas (associates, servants) for Krishna lila, Vaikuntha lila and srsti-lila.

This doesn't describe the creation of the jivas from Maha-Visnu at the beginning of the Maha kalpa.

It neither describes creation of associates for Vaikuntha or Krishna-loka because these associates are not created. They are eternal extensions or dependents of Krishna or Krishna's expansions, and are associates of Balarama or His expansions for services to Krishna and His expansions.

Thus, the nitya-baddhas, described in this chapter 15-16, are parsadas of Maha-Visnu in the srsti-lila (creation of the material world).

Or as Srila Prabhupada purports in the SB 3.9.15. that Garbhodakasayi Visnu is engaged in rasa enjoyment with His external potency by which He creates, maintains and destroys to reform the nitya-baddhas for the lila beyond mahat-tattva.

Then Jaiva dharma describes the qualities of these jiva parsadas, nitya-baddhas, in the material energy.

Already it was stated that Balarama presides over the jiva-saktis. Directly, in Krishna-loka. Through Sankarsana in Vaikuntha. Through Maha-Visnu in the maya-sakti realm. All the jivas of Balarama and His expansions are apurna incomplete and tatastha borderline, not only those of Maha-Visnu. They all (!) have the freedom to be in maha-maya or yoga-maya.

The text says "when presiding over the jiva-sakti, Krishna expands as Balarama." And not that "presiding over jiva-sakti is Maha-Visnu only."

The question or topic was on the jiva's captivated by maya. They can become sadhana siddhas and experience the same bliss etc. as the svarupa sakti tattvas but they remain jiva-tatastha-tattva.

After describing the svarupa sakti embodiment Srimati Radharani, and Her kAya-vyuha, personal expansions, the description comes of the jivas: "on the other hand, the jivas are produced by the jiva-sakti of Sri Krishna also known as the tatastha-sakti." The jivas are not directly part of the svarupa-sakti; they are expansions of svarupa-sakti.

Then it says, later, "Maha-Visnu generates the tatastha-sakti jivas who are susceptible to the influence of maya."

Just before this Bhaktivinoda Thakura writes on the jiva sakti parsadas generated from Balarama and Sri Sankarsana. They are not susceptible to maya because there is no maya in the spiritual world. They can fall down by their own free will, their intrinsic spiritual quality, not dependent on the action of an external force as maya. Their free will is exhibited not as a choice between spirit and matter but to serve or not to serve.

But aren't the jiva sakti expansions of Sri Balarama and Sri Sankarsana described as nitya siddhas? Yes. But the jiva sakti expansions of Maha-Visnu are also described as nitya baddha. But that baddha stage will end. So the nitya siddha stage is also not an absolute; it can end.

The text continues "as long as the tatastha jiva parsadas of Maha-Visnu don't receive the shelter of the hladini-sakti they are always prone to maya's subjugation." This is a general description of the status quo of the soul in the material world.

To summarize: Krishna presides over svarupa sakti.

Balarama presides over all the jivas,

In Krishnaloka directly.

In Vaikuntha through Sankarsana.

In the material world through Maha-Visnu and His expansions.

All these jivas are tatastha: they can go to matter or spirit. This is described in Brhad-aranyaka upanisad 4.3.9/18

This point is repeated in the 16th chapter of Jaiva dharma: “In Goloka, Sri Balarama manifests unlimited jiva category parsadas for Krishna’s service. Sankarsana similarly has jiva parsadas for the service to Narayana. Also, countless jivas emanate from Maha-Visnu”. These Maha-Visnu’s jivas are neighbors of maya, since they are in maya. They can look at both the material world and spiritual world. To the spiritual world through sadhu, sastra, guru and the spiritual senses, by the mercy of cit-bala, the strength of spiritual potency.

The introductory slokas to chapter 15 are thus explained:

Brihad-aranyaka upanisad 2.2.20 stated the philosophical principle that innumerable souls are eternal extensions or dependents of Sri Krishna. There is nothing here on brahmajyoti-kaka-fall-vada.

Brihad-aranyaka upanisad 4.3.9 describes the second choice after becoming envious of Sri Sri Radha-Syama.

The second chance at the border line of the material and spiritual worlds.

The soul is in svapna-sthana (dream state). Forgetfulness of Krishna is in a dreamlike state.

Alternatively, the verse describes the constitutional nature of the tatastha apurna jiva in the material world. He is in a dreamlike state and has the option of maya or Krishna. The choice for Krishna is by the mercy of Krishna and guru.

On Brihad-aranyaka upanisad 4.3.18

We don’t know how your translation gives you: “jiva situated within the causal ocean waters.”

Two other gaudiya math translations say...”so the jiva also moves to either side, namely between a dream state and wakefulness”.

We have seven more translations of this sloka, which all say:

“As a large fish moves between both banks, the nearer and the farther, so this person moves between both realms, the realm of dream and the realm where one is awake”.

Here is the sanskrit:

tad yathA mahA matsya ubhe kule’ / nusancarati pUrvam ca param caivam

evAyam purusha etAv ubhAv antAv / anusancarati svapnAntam ca buddhAntam ca

The word karana samudra is not there, nor is the concept, that the soul is swimming in the causal ocean or Viraja river, anywhere in the following texts of chapters 15 and 16. This ocean or river is surrounding all the universes. It is sometimes described as a river, sometimes as ocean because it looks as a delta of a river: land (the universes) surrounded by or cut through by river branches or ocean.

Srimad Bhagavatam 10.89.52 describes this as a real ocean: “...a body of water resplendent with huge waves being churned by a mighty wind.”

One commentator describes: “huge billows lashed up by powerful tempestuous gales”.

The material universes develop by contacting the causal ocean (Brahma samhita 13, Matsya purana 1.2). Then they are as foam-like clusters, massive foam, in the ocean.

Some universes are under the water or only partially, and some are blown out of the waters by the powerful winds. What a scene to make an important decision; the Bra-kaka-fall-theorists speculate that some jivas float in space gazing towards maya’s and Krishna’s attractions and some are emanated into and swimming in the causal waters, also pondering where to go. The ocean is fully only spiritual. There is no matter yet, so these souls have

spiritual bodies– their nitya-svarupa. If they would be contracted spiritual sparks, as in the Brahmajyoti, how could they see the material – and spiritual worlds. These souls are higher dimensionally aloof and not in the ocean really, just like ghosts or aliens move in our human dimension without being part of it? Or, these souls must have transcendental spiritual powerful bodies so they can fly above, swim in or under such an ocean. They all have spiritual bodies in, on or above a spiritual ocean.

They fly above the ocean with spiritual siddhis. That means their spiritual identity is fully blossomed. That can only be if they are Krishna-conscious. Then they can still fall prey to maya? This is like the falling from the spiritual planets.

Then on the souls in the causal ocean; how do they breathe if they are under the water? They have a spiritual snorkel, or do they have a spiritual oxygen tank on the back? They have swimming suits– they must be dressed?

In some branches of Brahman-fall-theorists there is no developed nitya-svarupa for some souls– so they say. That form will be given to some, when luckily having gazed at the spiritual world. If not, but unfortunately – without any reason, just by its created constitution by Krishna, whose fault it is, in this version– the soul gazes at maya, he'll get maya, without having ever known the spiritual world. The jiva is only a potential servitor, and remains in seed-form. Still with its baby-like eyes it can gaze at maya?! They are neutrally dressed, in the beginning, just after coming out of Maha-Visnu. If they say, these are sparks of spirit, no need of a dress, we must say sparks have a form. Babies must be dressed; they are not monkeys. The causal water may be cold. This problem will not be avoided for those souls who see the spiritual world immediately after coming out of Maha-Visnu, because immediately after coming out of Visnu's pores there is already the water, and just after coming out of Maha-Visnu's pores the souls are baby-souls, but developing their form and clothes as they are looking towards the spiritual world, growing up quickly, if they are designed like that by Krishna.

And who dresses them? They are seed-form. Babies can't dress themselves. Where are the suits coming from?

Then those who develop their nitya-svarupa, they get a different dress. For all this Yoga-maya becomes the wardrobe mistress.

Both classes of souls– those turning to maya and those turning to Krishna– just came from the Brahmajyoti. These can't be sparks any more, as they were in the Brahmajyoti, since they must be developed persons because they must have capable, fully functioning senses to become enticed by the spiritual or material forms. And they must have male or female senses to be able to be drawn towards some particular maya form or charmed by some particular rasa with Krishna. Thus, even the souls who, so-called, never have seen Krishna, must have their spiritual body fully developed. Their spiritual body is developed, but there is no Krishna, Radha or other eternal personality to be developed to? This is another incongruity. And, when the causal waters, the universes and the souls are in huge billows (waves) lashed up by powerful tempestuous gales, the souls only seeing maya, must have very powerful eyes to be able to fix their senses on maya's forms looking through such waters and through the huge shells around the universe. They can do that, being baby-souls with the spiritual senses contracted?

These problems have to be solved also for the Brahman-patita-vadis with the philosophy that the souls falling from the brahmajyoti, “bloop” directly into the causal ocean, or fall directly into some tatastha area; that the souls don't come into and through Maha-Visnu.

And are their senses material or spiritual? Spiritual senses cannot become attracted to material sense objects. And the material senses are not yet there, because the souls get a

material body only from Brahma and the prajapatis, once they are placed in a particular brahmanda or material universe, 2000 years of the demigods later.

If these souls have such developed body and senses, then they are qualified like the Vaikuntha planet residents. How far they can gaze, all the infinity of Vaikuntha, up to Krishna-loka? They must see all of the spiritual world to have been given a free choice, and then they still fall? If they can see Krishna, completely and fall, how this differs from Vaikuntha residents seeing Krishna and turning away from Him.

That is for this alternative version of Brahman fall-vada; falling from Brahman not at the sarga-creation- process, but when the creation is already manifest and falling not in nor touching the causal ocean. This same question is for all versions of Brahman-kaka-fall-vada. These souls see something of the spiritual world. Whatever something they see clearly, even not everything, but enough for a bona fide, fair judgment- seeing Krishna and maya and fully free choosing for one of them-. Just as a criminal is only punished if he has in good consciousness, not being child, mentally sick etc, done a crime. Their seeing is on the absolute platform; this is as experiencing spirit and being there. If then they choose for maya, this is like falling from the spiritual world. How Brahman-kaka-fall-vada differs here from the spiritual planets-fall-vada?

But is it so easy? Some souls see for a moment the spiritual world and get it for eternity. And other souls have to suffer with religious rituals for many many births, then only they can go to the spiritual world. That Lord and His set up would not be righteous. Thus this idea is wrong.

Nor are the material universes yet developed before the souls and the kala-sakti in the form of the glance of Maha-Visnu enter the womb-chamber of maya. Besides, Srimad Bhagavatam 3.20.15 says that “the universe lay for a little more then 1000 celestial years in the causal ocean without life because the mass of jivas had not woken up”. Then lord Brahma meditates another 1000 celestial years before he starts creating.

The waking up from deep sleep doesn't happen in the causal ocean as S.R.M proposes: “the awakening from susupti and subsequent choice of spiritual or material life at the margin of matter and spirit in the causal ocean.”

The real situation is that all the souls are transported in coma, situated within Garbhodakasayi Visnu, to the particular Brahmada-egg of Brahma. This whole story of the Brahman-kaka-fall-vada is an illusion. It never happened.

Thus, bra-kaka-fall-vada doesn't make sense nor is it supported by scripture, nor by Srila Prabhupada.

Brahman is already fallen

We already quoted Srila Prabhupada's letter 13-6-1970 where he rejects the Brahman-kaka-fall-vada:

"The next question, about the living entities falling down in this material world are not from the impersonal Brahman. Existence in the impersonal Brahman is also within the category of non-Krishna consciousness. Those who are in the Brahman effulgence they are also in the fallen condition, so there is no question of falling down from a fallen condition. When fall takes place, it means falling down from the non-fallen condition".

Srila Prabhupada rejects the theory of the souls originally falling from the brahmajyoti. We wrote this already and now again (!?) S.R.M presents it, although he claims it is Srila Prabhupada's view also. Srila Prabhupada says it is wrong so we hope we don't have to repeat this for a third time in our next reply if he brings it up again. Though this is the standard in Kali-yuga; things have to be repeated 3 times before kali-yuga souls understand, as Srila Prabhupada comments on the sloka harer nAma harer nAma harer nAmaiva kevalam kalau nAsty eva nAsty eva nAsty eva gatih anyathA. "In this age of Kali there is no other religion than glorifying the Lord by utterance of His holy name, and that is the injunction of all the revealed scriptures. There is no other way, there is no other way, there is no other way."

Perfection in Krishna lila fall-vada

In fall-vada from the spiritual planets, there are no such complexities. The envious soul is simply slapped down by maya; japatiya dhare.

Srila Prabhupada in SB 9.24.58 writes that the living entity when put into the material world begins his life as demigod Lord Brahma.

Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura explains the same in his book "Vaisnava and Brahmana". The hari-jana-khanda of that book describes what happens at the border. Our comments are in between brackets, based on Jaiva Dharma- Bhaktivinoda Thakura. We may improve on the texts we get from the God-brothers of Srila Prabhupada since Srila Prabhupada also said that after 1936 some of their texts have to be scrutinized.

"Before acquiring material designations, the jiva is supremely pure. He is not serving the Supreme Lord (anymore). He is in santa-rasa and its tatastha-bava is constitutional. He has no taste for serving the Lord due to lack of knowledge (which he lost).

The propensity for serving the Supreme Lord is dormant. The propensity for material enjoyment is not there but indifference to the service of Hari and the seed of material enjoyment (after that) are present (because he had been serving and has become indifferent since later he writes: the jiva revives remembering the lotus feet of Sri Krishna,his lost Krishna consciousness is revived...forgets his ancient memory...re-established as the servant of the Lord).

The jiva cannot remain indifferent forever by subduing devotional and non-devotional propensities. He therefore contemplates unconstitutional activities from his marginal position. He is infected by impersonalism but due to neglecting the eternal service of the Lord and thereby developing the quality of aversion to the Lord, he cannot remain fixed in that position. In this way aversion to the Lord breaks his concentration of mind and establishes him as the master of this world of enjoyment.

Maya, the external energy of the Supreme Lord, then induces the marginal living entity to enjoy this world through her covering and throwing potencies and thus shows the living entity the reality of being averse to the Lord's service. At that time the living entity considers himself the king of enjoyers, and being situated in the mode passion he takes the position of Brahma and creates progeny.... Pride, illusion, greed, anger, and lust and induces the living entities to dance frantically in aversion to the Lord.

And on the platform of progress, if a living entity cultivates transcendental sound vibration and revives the process of remembering the lotus feet of Shri Krishna, he then achieves scientific spiritual knowledge. By this process, all anarthas are destroyed and he becomes situated in a supremely auspicious position. Due to forgetfulness of Krishna there is perverted temporary and adverse movement of the senses. When they are properly employed in eternal

subjects their disease of transience is destroyed and they give up the desire to embrace such transient objects.

Although the eternal living entity is constitutionally favorably inclined towards the Supreme Lord, due to his indifference towards the eternal service of the Lord he is eligible for being controlled by maya. He is eligible for achieving transcendental knowledge- this ancient memory he also often forgets.

By the mercy of a great liberated personality, who is pure, eternally engaged in service, self-realized, and the only shelter for the living entities, his lost Krishna consciousness is revived. Thereafter he desires freedom from Maya's covering and throwing potencies and searches after his own auspiciousness. As a result of this, he attains transcendental knowledge. The desire for achieving transcendental knowledge induces him to cultivate favorable service to Lord Vishnu. This cultivation begins with endeavoring for self-realization, reviving his lost propensity of service, and, ultimately, being re-established as the servant of the Lord. Then he is no longer considered a non-devotee, averse to the Lord.”

On “from Vaikuntha none falls”

S.R.M thinks that scripture says that no one can fall from the eternal Vaikuntha planets. He will have to learn some hermeneutics here because Srila Prabhupada explains: (This time we will quote His Divine Grace’s lectures, letters and conversations).

- The first punishment is that we have got this material body.

krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare
pasate maya tare japatiya dhare

The first criminal action is that when we forget Krishna and our relationship with Him Our relationship with Krishna is that Krishna is the enjoyer; we are eternal servant. Just like a big man, rich man: he is the enjoyer and he has got many servants. That we practically see. The capitalist, he starts some business, big factory. Ten thousand men are working, but the capitalist is not working. It is our practical experience. He is aloof from the factory. In a nice place, in a nice bungalow, garden house, he is enjoying. Similarly, God, Krishna, He is the enjoyer. You will find, therefore, Krishna here in this temple, He is enjoying. He is standing with His elder brother, enjoying in the forest, sporting with His cowherd boy friends, His cows, calves—enjoying in the forest. ... Every living entity is part and parcel of Krishna. He belongs to the Krishna's family. This is our original position. Vrindavana means whole, all of them are Krishna's family. Even the birds, beast, trees, plants, water—all belong to the Krishna's family...So Krishna, out of His causeless mercy, He comes. At a certain interval during one day of Brahma, He comes. He exhibits His lila, that "Anyone who desires to go back to home, back to Godhead, they can enjoy with Me like this." This is Krishna's mission. "Come on. Why you are playing here and suffering this maya's play? Come to the real play." We are part and parcel of God, just like sons are part and parcel of father. If the father is rich man, all-powerful, he does not like to see that his sons are loitering in the street without any food, without any shelter. Father entreats, "My dear son, why you are rotting in this way? Come home. You'll be comfortable. You'll be happy. Come back to home, back to Godhead.. ...to forget Krishna and to become subjected to the condition of material nature, that is called material life. Material life means to give up the idea of going back to home, back to Godhead, but making plan here to be happy...the conclusion is that anyone who is in this material world, he is a sinful man. Otherwise he would not have gotten this material body. Just like anyone who is in the prison house, you can conclude that he is a sinful, criminal man. You do

not require to study one after another. Because he is in the prison house you can conclude that "Here is a criminal." Similarly, anyone who is in the material world, he is a criminal. But not the superintendent of jail. You cannot conclude, "Because everyone is in the jail, criminal, therefore the superintendent of jail, he is also criminal." Those who are conducting these sinful men to take them back to home, back to Godhead, he is not criminal. His business is how to release this rascal from this prison house and take him back to home, back to Godhead.... If you become enlightened, then you must know that this material world is not for our habitation. We must go back to home, back to Godhead. Therefore this Krishna consciousness movement is preaching that "This is not your home. Don't try to be happy here."... real happiness is to go back to home, back to Godhead. Na te viduh svartha-gatim hi vishnum [SB 7.5.31]. They do not know that. So this is very important movement, that we are giving them hint and education how to go back to home, back to Godhead. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 6.2.16—Vrindavana, September 19, 1975)

- Bg lecture 27-6-1974 Melbourne:

A boy is very rich man's son. But still, he thinks, "Why shall I live under the rules and regulations of my father? Let me go out. I shall enjoy life freely." You are already rich man's son. You can enjoy the property of your very, very rich powerful father, and what in independence you will enjoy? We are sons of God, part and parcels of God, and God means almighty. So we have got almighty father, and leaving His place, I have come to this material world to enjoy independently.

Our comment: We originally fell from a fully developed relationship with Krishna, we were part of Krishna's family, and functioning in that. We do not originate from the Brahman effulgence.

- February 21, 1969, Los Angeles:

Devotee: Why are you teaching Radha-Krishna consciousness.

Prabhupada: Because you have forgotten. That is your natural position. You have forgotten the service of Radha and Krishna, therefore you have become the servant of maya.

Our comment: We fell originally from Radha-Krishna.

- Srimad-Bhagavatam lecture, London, July 30, 1971:

As soon as the spirit soul wants to enjoy for himself... Just like many boys give up the association of the parents and want to enjoy this material world in their own way, without the sanction of the father and mother. He has got the right. Similarly, although we are all sons of God, or Krishna, we have got the independence to give up His company and enjoy this material world.

- Bhagavad-gita lecture, Mexico City, February 15, 1975:

Being fallen in this material condition, we have lost our godly qualities. We can cure that, just like a diseased man lost his appetite, but by treatment he can again awaken his appetite and eat properly. So we, being very small—we may say, "a small god"—therefore we fall under the clutches of maya, illusion, but it can be cured. We can again revive our original position.

- Caitanya-caritamrta lecture, San Francisco, February 18, 1967:

Bhaktijana: The souls that were never conditioned at all... do they also have the independence?

Prabhupada: Yes, but they have not misused. They know that “I am meant for Krishna’s service,” and they are happy in Krishna’s service.

Bhaktijana: Could they ever misuse it?

Prabhupada: Yes, they can misuse it also. That power is there.

Our comment: “The souls that were never conditioned at all” are nitya-muktas. They can fall.

- Conversation, Mayapur, February 19, 1976:

Guru-krpa: . . . They say that in the spiritual everything is peaceful, there is no birth and death, there is no material conditions, so why if the conditions in the spiritual world are so nice and everything spiritual, how is it that one can become envious of Krishna in such conditions?

Acyutananda: The original sin.

Guru-krpa: How is it that, if everything is free from envy, free from bad material elements . . .

Prabhupada: That is independence. In spite of all these things, because you have got little independence, you can violate.

Sudama: It is very hard to understand.

Prabhupada: No, it is not difficult. It is not difficult. Because you are part and parcel of God, God has got full independence, but you have got little independence, proportionately, because you are part and parcel.

Acyutananda: But in the Gita, it says, “Once coming there, he never returns.”

Prabhupada: But if he likes, he can return. That independence has to be accepted, little independence. We can misuse that. Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare. That misuse is the cause of our falldown.

Acyutananda: In Krishna book it says that there were some color fighting in Dvaraka. They were throwing color. And some men became lusty seeing the women. Will that be the first part of their falldown, to be in Vaikuntha and think of personal lust with Krishna’s associates?

Prabhupada: Yes.

- Conversation, Teheran, August 10, 1976:

Atreya Rsi: In the beginning how does the spirit become ignorant, falls into ignorance?

Prabhupada: Anyone can become criminal, any moment. At any moment you can begin. You are honest gentleman, very good. You are working in a nice spot. At any time, any moment, you can become a criminal and go to the prison house....You are prone to... As soon as you misuse your little independence, you become a criminal. Daivi hy esa gunamayi mama maya duratyaya. You cannot cheat material nature. Immediately she captures. Krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare pasate maya tare japati ‘dhare.

Ali: I’m amazed that... When someone tastes something, a nice fruit, something pleasant, he remembers, appreciates that, even in material world. How could someone see God and come from a source as powerful and lovable as that and then forget? How could he forget so easily and become so badly attached to this materialism? Why is it that we are so far?

Prabhupada: Because we are very small fragment of spiritual identity, that tendency is there. The example is given, just like fire and spark of the fire. The sparks sometimes fall down from the original fire. Then it is no more fire. It is fire, but it’s extinguished. The illumination is over. So we are small particles of God. God is big fire; we are small particles of God. So we are playing with the big fire very nice, but there is chance of falling down. The big fire does not fall. The big fire is always blazing. But the small fire, although it is possessing the same quality of fire, it may fall down. So we are small particle, very, very small, atomic

portion God. Therefore we have got the tendency to be separated from the big fire, and then we begin our material body. Just like another crude example, just like a very rich man's son, he's enjoying life. Sometimes he thinks, "Why not independently live? Why dependent on father?" He was living very comfortably, rich man's son, but he left the house of his father and became a hippie. Why does he do so? I have seen in Allahabad one big lawyer, Ferolal Bannerji. He had two sons. One son became a good barrister like him, and another son became a car-wala, driving a car. The reason was that this son, a car-wala, he fell in love with a low-class woman, and he preferred to remain a car-wala, a low-class woman. So she was living in a cottage, hut. So out of love he also preferred that "I shall live with her, and I shall drive a car." So that is independence. That discrimination preference is there always. You can prefer a low-grade life out of your discretion. Nobody can check you.

- Bhagavad-gita lecture, Los Angeles, December 19, 1968:

Our potency of falling down is always there. And because we are part and parcel of God and because we are now in the material world, it is to be understood that we have fallen down. Our position is marginal. At any moment, we can fall down. That tendency is there. Therefore we are called marginal. Just like everyone is prone to fall diseased. Make your treatment. Similarly, we are in the material condition of life. Just go on treating it, and as soon as you are cured, be careful not to fall down again. But there is chance of falling down, again becoming diseased. Not that once you become cured, there is no chance of becoming diseased again.

- Conversation, Los Angeles, December 6, 1973:

Hridayananda: "If God were actually all, all-good and all-perfect, then when He created us, we would also be all-good..."

Prabhupada: Yes. But you are contaminated. You are all-good. Because you are part and parcel of God, you cannot be bad.

Hridayananda: Well, they say that "Even, even if I have the potential... Even to say that I have..."

Prabhupada: You have got the potential. That's it.

Hridayananda: If I'm originally in the spiritual world, even the potential to fall down is an imperfection in the creation.

Prabhupada: No, potential does not [mean] fall down. Just like a child has got the potency to pass the M.A. examination. So he has to be educated. If you don't educate him, he'll remain a foolish child. So we are educating to develop that potentiality.

nitya-siddha Krishna-prema sadhya kabhu naya
sravanadi-suddha-citte karaye udaya

That potentiality is eternal. God is eternal. We are eternal. Our relationship, eternal. Everything is eternal. But because we are small, minute fragments, sometimes we fall down.

Hridayananda: They say, "God should have, God should have created us so that we..."

Prabhupada: Why you should dictate God? God has created perfectly. He has given you independence. You fall down. It is your fault. God has made you perfect, given you independence. But if you misuse your independence, you fall down. Just like government gives everyone opportunity. Why do you become criminal and go to the jail? That is your fault.

Hridayananda: They say that God should have created us so that we...

Prabhupada: Why "Should have created"? He has created already perfect. Because you are perfect, therefore you have got the independence to misuse. You are not a dead stone. That is

perfection. Ye yatha mam prapadyante. You can go anywhere, sarva-ga. You can go to the Vaikuntha. Yanti deva-vrata devan. You can go to the higher planets. You can go to the hell. When you go to the hell, it is your choice. God has given you all perfection. Purnam idam purnam adah purnat purnam udacyate, everything is complete, perfect, and because you are perfect, you have got the independence. But misusing that independence, you are imperfect. Again, reviving.... you can become perfect, although you are imperfect now. Krishna has made you perfect. There is no doubt about it. Just like some of our students. All of a sudden, they deviate, go away. So what is that? Our movement is imperfect, or he's imperfect?

Hridayananda: He's imperfect.

Prabhupada: He's imperfect. Our movement is perfect. But he becomes imperfect by his misuse of independence. He thinks that "This is nice," and goes to hell. What can be done? That independence is there. That is perfectness.

Hridayananda: So in other words, the people that argue like that, they actually are lazy. They don't want to surrender to God. Then they blame God.

Prabhupada: Yes. Because they have become imperfect, therefore they are blaming God. "God is good;" they forget this. That is their imperfectness. One side, they say, "God is good." Still, they're blaming God. What is this nonsense? If He's God, God is good, how can you blame Him? God is good; in all circumstances, He's good. That is the meaning of good. Good does not mean that one time you are good and next time you are bad... . Umapati: If God is so powerful, why does He let me fall. Why doesn't He save me, save me from my own foolishness.

Prabhupada: Yes, He's saving you, but you don't carry His order. Just like I say, "Chant sixteen rounds." If you do not do it. What can I do? That is your fault.

Satsvarupa: If God were to force us, there'd be no love.

Prabhupada: No, no. Force is not good.

- Morning walk conversation, Denver, July 3, 1975

Devotee (3): I was just wondering if the spirit soul being in the spiritual world is eternally liberated, how can he return. By desire?

Prabhupada: Yes. If he desires, he can come again. That option is always there. Just like I remained in India. I came here. And if I had liked to, I may have not come. It is my option.

- Bhagavad-gita lecture, Honolulu, July 4, 1974,

The living entity falls down from the spiritual world. There is possibility, if you do not stick to the spiritual principle, even if you are in Vaikuntha, you will fall down, what to speak of this material world? Because in the Vaikuntha or in the spiritual world, no contaminated soul can stay there. He will fall down.

- Bhagavad-gita lecture, Atlanta, March 2, 1975,

Devotee III: If one is fortunate enough to revive his natural position in the spiritual sky, how can he keep from falling down again? ...

Prabhupada: How your president Nixon is dragged down? He was in the exalted post, and why he was dragged down?

Devotee IV: They dragged him down.

Prabhupada: Yes. He was forced to come down. Why?

Tamal Krishna: He broke the rules.

Prabhupada: Anyone, even in this world or spiritual world, he has got the potency of coming down by misusing his little independence. It is nothing like that, that if you become president, you are secure. If you are not perfect, then you will be dragged down. The formula is that in the spiritual world everyone is engaged in the service of the Lord. There is no other

conception as in this material world everyone is engaged to serve his senses. He likes something, and he is engaged for that purpose. That service is there, but it is service to himself, his senses. But in the spiritual world there is no such thing as giving service to the senses.

- Conversation, Los Angeles, May 13, 1973:

Prabhupada: As soon as we try, “Oh, this material world is very nice,”—”Yes,” Krishna says, “yes, you go.” Every living entity has got a little free will. And Krishna is so kind, he gives him opportunity, “All right, you enjoy like this.” Just like some of our students, Krishna conscious, sometimes go away, again come back. It is free will, not stereotyped. Just like one goes to the prison house, not that government welcomes, “Come on. We have got prison house. Come here, come here.” He goes out of his free will; again comes out, again goes. Like that. Krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare, pasate maya tare japatiya dhara. The police is there. Just like the police car was there. We have nothing to do with it. But if you do anything criminal, immediately you will be arrested. Maya captures him who is not a devotee of Krishna.

Our comment: As the Upanisads teach: “as it is here, so it is there in the spiritual world”. Therefore, Vedic logic or syllogism always has an example. Srila Prabhupada accordingly gives an example. The police and the jail are there to protect the citizens from harm. Similarly, Yogamaya and Her expansion, Mahamaya act analogous as the criminal department of a state. They both act here and there. The argument was given that there is no Mahamaya in the spiritual world; in general not, but as the police can enter the palace of a king to capture a criminal, so Yogamaya expands Mahamaya for these functions with the marginal energy. The distinction Yoga- Mahamaya is not always that rigid; in Bg 7.25 it says: “I am never manifest to the foolish and unintelligent. For them I am covered by My internal potency yogamaya, and therefore they do not know that I am unborn and infallible”. SB 8.5.43: “All learned men say that the five elements, eternal time, fruitive activity, the three modes of material nature, and the varieties produced by these modes are all creations of yogamaya. This material world is therefore extremely difficult to understand, but those who are highly learned have rejected it. May the Supreme Personality of Godhead, who is the controller of everything, be pleased with us”. Thus, yogamaya creates this universe.

- Bg lecture 13.22-24, Melbourne, Australia, on June 25, 1974:

Devotee: When we are in the spiritual sky and serving Krishna, we have a perfect relationship with Krishna, what causes us to fall down in the material world, because we are already serving Krishna?

Prabhupada: Because you desire to fall down. Here it is explained that “Don’t fall down.” And as soon as you associate with the material nature, then you fall down.

Devotee: Srila Prabhupada, I can’t understand why we should have an impure desire when we are already serving...

Prabhupada: Because you have got a little freedom. Why one is not coming here and going to the liquor shop? It is his desire.

- Venezuela, on February 21, 1975.

if you do not get this material body—you remain in your spiritual body...anandamayah abhyasat. “By nature the spirit soul is joyful.”

Our endeavor should be how to get again our original spiritual body. Spiritual body is there already. It is covered by the material body... How your body is covered in a different dress when you go to the prison house? When one goes to the prison, he has to keep his dress

separately and take the prison dress. So anyone who comes into this material world, he has to take a material body. This is the law. Unless you have got this material body, how you can feel pleasure in material sense enjoyment? Just like on a stage, if you are going to play, you have to take dress according to the play.

- Los Angeles temple on June 8, 1976.

Ramesvara: There is an argument, if we were originally in the spiritual world, why don't we remember that and try to go back to the spiritual world?

Prabhupada: When I am in tour in Europe and India, I completely forget about Los Angeles. I act according to the circumstances there. And again when I come to Los Angeles, I immediately remember. This is natural. Out of sight, out of mind...

Bharadvaja: Srila Prabhupada, we don't have to learn the activities of our spiritual body?

Prabhupada: Yes, when you are revived....Therefore, the Vedic injunction is that now you have got this human form of body, you get up to your original position. Uttisthata jagrata prapta varan nibodhata.

- Columbus, Ohio, on May 14, 1969

Allen Ginsberg: The material shadow. How did we fall into that?

Prabhupada: Because jiva, although para sakti, he has got independence. So when he wants to imitate Krishna... In the spiritual world Krishna is the enjoyer, and all others, they are enjoyed. Predominator and the predominating. The Lord is the predominating, so there is no disagreement. There they know, "The Lord is predominator. We have to serve." When this service attitude is impaired, that "Why serve Krishna? Why not ourself?" that is maya. Then he falls down in the material energy. Just like in the government system, there is no scope of freedom. You have to act according to government state laws. So long you agree, then you are free. If you disagree, then you are placed within the prison house. Similarly, jiva, not fully independent, but they have got. Because part and part of God, therefore that independence quality is there. So when that independence quality is misused, then his place is in the material world. Krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare. When we forget Krishna and try to lord it over something...Krishna is the Supreme Lord. When we try to imitate His lordship, then our place is in the material world. We are given freedom, "All right, you lord it over here." So here every living entity is trying to lord it over, competition. I am trying individualwise, nationwide. Everyone is trying to lord it over. That is material existence. And when he comes to his senses, jnanavan (Bg 7.19), that "I am falsely trying to lord it over. Rather, I am becoming implicated with material energy," when he comes to that, then he surrenders. Then again his liberated life begins.

Our comment: The original position of the soul is clearly as Krishna's direct servant in the spiritual world. As long as the service attitude continues, the soul remains in the liberated position. But as soon as the soul desires to imitate Krishna, to forget his position as servant of Krishna, he is placed in the material world. But when he surrenders, "then again his liberated life begins."

- November 25, 1976, in Vrndavana, India,

We are eternal servant of Krishna, but sometimes the servant thinks, 'Why shall I remain a servant? Let me become master.' That is natural. A master is always in a comfortable situation. Sometimes the servant becomes envious: 'Oh, why this man should always remain in a comfortable position and we shall serve? Why not we become also in a comfortable position? Let me eat as he eats,' or 'Let me sleep now.' These are so-called comforts. So they want to imitate. When the living being imitates the Supreme Personality of Godhead then he

falls down. Krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare, pasate maya tare japatiya dhare. As soon as he forgets his position—he wants to imitate—that is the beginning of maya, falldown.

- October 7, 1975, in Durban

Sometimes the son goes out of home and may be forgetting his father. Similarly, we are out of home. We have come from the spiritual world in this material world. We have forgotten our father. So we have to revive this relationship with our father, or God, or Krishna. That is the main business of human life. In other species of life lower than the human being it is not possible to revive our old relationship with God.

- December 6, 1973, in Los Angeles

A son may go out for years together, but as soon as he comes back home he sees his father, mother, that original intimacy immediately revives. So when we come to that position to understand our intimate relationship with God, or Krishna, that is called svarupa-siddhi. Svarupa-siddhi means realization of perfection. So here Suta Gosvami says sauhardena gadhena, santa. If an old friend meets another old friend, they become very much delighted. Similarly, if the father meets the lost child, he becomes very delighted and the child also becomes delighted. The husband, wife separated, again they meet. So they become very delighted. It is quite natural. The master and servant after many, many years, if they again meet, they become very delighted.

So in this way we are related with Krishna. In veneration, in servitude, as friend, as paternal affection, or as conjugal lover.... So we have to revive that. And as soon as you revive any one of them, intimacy, then we become happy, because that is eternal. The same example... The finger, so long is separated, it is not happy. As soon as it is joined it is happy. Similarly, we have got our eternal relationship with Krishna. Now we are separated, but as soon as we join with him again we become yenatma suprasidati. Therefore Krishna consciousness movement is beneficial for everyone just to try to revive your original consciousness. That is already there, nitya-siddha Krishna-bhakti. Our Krishna consciousness is eternally a fact.

- Bhagavad-gita lecture, April 15, 1966, New York

Just like a boy is given some plaything by the father, similarly, we wanted to enjoy this material world. Therefore our material senses are awarded: "All right, you enjoy. You just have experience of this material world, and when you get experience that 'I am not happy,' then you shall come back again to Me."

- October 27, 1969, in a letter

Constitutionally every living entity even if he is in the Vaikuntha Loka, has chance of falling down...

- November 17, 1970, in a letter

We are all originally situated on the platform of Krishna consciousness in our eternal personal relationship of love of Krishna... So naturally everything about Krishna is originally known to us all and as soon as we begin to associate with the devotees of the Lord and chant His Holy Name, this memory gradually becomes stronger as we remember our constitutional position of always serving Krishna in different ways.

- September 28, 1972, Srimad-Bhagavatam lecture

We are sparks of fire. As soon as the spark falls down from the fire, it becomes extinguished. So our material condition is like that. We have given up the company of Krishna, and we wanted to be happy in this material world; therefore we are suffering. So same spark, particle

of carbon, if you put again to the fire, it will again become red hot and fire. So this is Krishna consciousness movement, that we are trying the sparks, which by chance has fallen down from the fire, to pick it up again and put it in the fire. That is real happiness.

- March 31, 1974, Conversation

Prabhupada: Krishna is enjoyer. Just like a big businessman, and his secretary is working under him. So he sometimes thinks, "Why shall I work under him? Why not become another Birla like him?" That is the fall down. He's happy there, becoming secretary of a big man, but he gives up the job and tries himself and becomes a vagabond.

Dr. Patel: Iccha-dvesa-samutthena dvandva-mohena...Because they are illusioned by the dvandvas. If they understand that there is unity and nothing else but Krishna, then they are released from the maya's condition.

Prabhupada: If anyone knows that "Wherever I go, Krishna's supremacy is there. Krishna's supreme is there." But he is perplexed, dvandva-mohena, that "If I leave Krishna, I become more happy." That is dvandva-mohah. He's making duality that "Krishna's interest and my interest, different."

- November 28, 1972, lecture on the Bhagavad-gita

I am servant. I am not master. But I have given up service of Krishna. Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare. "Why shall I become servant? I shall become Krishna." All right, you become Krishna. You become enjoyer. That is material world. Everyone is trying to become Krishna, enjoyer.

- May 20, 1972, lecture on Srimad-Bhagavatam in Los Angeles

Beginning from Brahma down to the ant. Material life means a desire for sense gratification. They're fallen because they wanted to gratify their senses. They cannot remain in the Vaikuntha world. In the Vaikuntha world, only the one, the Supreme Lord, His senses should be satisfied not anyone's else.

- June 27, 1974, Melbourne

You forced Krishna to allow you to come. Just like sometimes a child forces his father. Father says, "My dear son, do not do this. Do not go there." But he insists. "Oh, I must go. I must go." "All right, you go at your risk. That's all. And you suffer. What can be done?" Because you are son of God—God has got independence, full independence, almighty—therefore you have acquired the quality of your father. You have got little independence. So God does not interfere with your little independence. If you persist that "I must go and enjoy independently," so God says, "All right, you can go." This is the position. You have to take sanction. That is a fact. But when you persist, God sanctions. And you come and enjoy."

- July 18, 1966, lecture on the Bhagavad-gita in New York,

This birth and death is due to my, this material body. So as soon as we get our original spiritual body and get out of the contamination of this material body, then we shall be as good as Krishna...by the process of Krishna consciousness we shall revive our original spiritual body.

The conclusion of all (!) Srila Prabhupada's teachings is that generally no one falls from the Vaikuntha planets. Some have fallen as we see around us in the material world. But these are only a few compared to the unlimited souls in the Vaikuntha planets.

"No one falls" is the general rule. That one may fall down is a specific exception to the general rule. In mathematics a probability less than 10^{-50} is zero.

Fall from any rasa, from any place, from any Deity

S.R.M quotes Srila Prabhupada's letter to: Jagadisa Los Angeles 25 April, 1970

Regarding your questions about how and from where did the conditioned souls fall, your first question if someone has a relationship with Lord Krishna on Krishnaloka, does he ever fall down? The souls are endowed with minute independence as part of their nature and this minute independence may be utilized rightly or wrongly at any time, so there is always the chance of falling down by misuse of one's independence. But those who are firmly fixed up in devotional service to Krishna are making proper use of their independence and so they do not fall down.

S.R.M concludes that "prema-bhava-jivas in Goloka Vrindavana can be those that don't fall down". This is right. It can or could be that they don't fall. This refutes his "no one falls-vada".

If S.R.M means that prema-bhava-jivas don't fall, that is totally wrong. Srila Prabhupada refutes that in a 2-months earlier letter to the same Jagadisa dasa:

"Regarding your questions concerning the spirit souls falling into Maya's influence, it is not that those who have developed a passive relationship with Krishna are more likely to fall into nescient activities. Usually anyone who has developed his relationship with Krishna does not fall down in any circumstance, but because the independence is always there, the soul may fall down from any position or any relationship by misusing his independence. But his relationship with Krishna is never lost, simply it is forgotten by the influence of Maya, so it may be regained or revived by the process of hearing the Holy Name of Krishna and then the devotee engages himself in the service of the Lord which is his original or constitutional position. The relationship of the living entity with Krishna is eternal as both Krishna and the living entity are eternal; the process is one of revival only, nothing new". (27-2-1970 LA)

This conclusion is already in the 25-4-1970 letter where Srila Prabhupada states:

Your first question if someone has a relationship with Lord Krishna on Krishnaloka, does he ever fall down? The souls are endowed with minute independence as part of their nature and this minute independence may be utilized rightly or wrongly at any time, so there is always the chance of falling down by misuse of one's independence.

In other words from any relationship with Krishna there is a chance of falling and if in any of these relationships one is firmly fixed up he doesn't fall down whatever prema-bhava-jiva one is, in Krishna-loka, Narayana-loka or material-loka.

**Servant of the Lord cannot fall from Vaikuntha...
Only those who become envious and lusty**

****“The marginal karana-samudra is pradhana, the direct emanation of Sri Maha-Visnu.”****

Pradhana means the chief or first type of material energy. It is not the same as the karana ocean, which is spiritual. Pradhana is matter. This is described in the SB 3.26.10:

“The Supreme Personality of Godhead said: The unmanifested eternal combination of the three modes is the cause of the manifest state and is called pradhana. It is called prakriti when in the manifested stage of existence.

Purport: The Lord points out material nature in its subtle stage, which is called pradhana, and He analyzes this pradhana. The explanation of pradhana and prakriti is that pradhana is the subtle, undifferentiated sum total of all material elements. Although they are undifferentiated, one can understand that the total material elements are contained therein. When the total material elements are manifested by the interaction of the three modes of material nature, the manifestation is called prakriti. Impersonalists say that Brahman is without variegatedness and without differentiation. One may say that pradhana is the Brahman stage, but actually the Brahman stage is not pradhana. pradhana is distinct from Brahman because in Brahman there is no existence of the material modes of nature. One may argue that the mahat-tattva is also different from pradhana because in the mahat-tattva there are manifestations. The actual explanation of pradhana, however, is given here: when the cause and effect are not clearly manifested (avyakta), the reaction of the total elements does not take place, and that stage of material nature is called pradhana.”

****“In Karana samudra, tatastha-jiva awakens from creational susupti, unconscious state and subsequently chooses either matter or spirit.”****

This karana samudra is described in SB 10.89.52 as having huge waves being churned by a mighty wind.

Will one be peaceful enough to make a right decision at such an important moment? A little mistake and one is for millions of mahakalpas suffering in the hell of matter.

P. dasa wrongfully describes that the jiva awakening from this unconscious state is “living there quite peacefully.” How one can be peaceful when there are huge waves from mighty winds.

Another mistake in this theory is the following:

P.dasa states that when tatastha-jivas awaken while coming out of Maha-Visnu, at the time of creation, he has the option to choose for maya or spirit. But at that time there is no maya to get attracted to. The universes (golden eggs) in an undeveloped form, lay on the causal ocean for 1000 divine years (or 360.000 solar years). This is in SB 3.20.15. Then Garbhodakasayi Visnu enters the universe. Brahma takes place on the lotus whorl of the lotus from this Visnu’s navel and needs to meditate for another 1000 divine years (or 360.000 solar years) before being able to create. This is in SB 2.9.8. Only then he starts creating the content of the universe, the area within the universal shells. Only then there is something of maya to be

attracted to. (Brahma meditates 100 divine years at the beginning of each of his next days, after an anda-pralaya).

**"We fall from Vaikuntha margin not the planets of Vaikuntha....Many statements of Srila Prabhupada describe "falling from Vaikuntha, which means causal ocean" yet no unequivocal statements or descriptions of jiva falling from Goloka or the Vaikuntha planets are there!*"

We typed "back to planets" etc. in the "search" in the Vedabase. See:

"yad gatva na nivartante tad dhama paramam mama [Bg. 15.6]. "You have to go back to My planet, My kingdom. That will make you perfect." (Lecture on Bg 4.14-19, New York, 1966)

"So the Mayavadi philosopher, their spiritual life means to merge into the Brahman effulgence, and the Vaisnava philosopher to go back to Goloka Vrndavana, Vaikuntha, where God is situated, and become His associate person." (Philosophy, discussions with Hayagriva, Arthur Schopenhauer)

"Here is clear proof of how a living entity coming originally from Vaikunthaloka (=planets) is encaged in material elements." (SB. 3.16.35)

"One who continues to serve the Lord even in reverse conditions is assured that he will go back to Godhead, back to the Vaikuntha planets." (SB 3.16.37 purport)

"The real mission of life [is] how to go back to Krishna, how to go back to Vaikuntha-loka. (Lecture, Bg 9.2, Calcutta)

"...intelligent man, should consider that "If I have to prepare myself for going, for being elevated to the higher planetary system, but we have to come back again, ksine punye martya-loka, why not endeavor for going back to Krishnaloka?" That is intelligence." (Lecture, Bg 2.23-24, London)

"Prabhupada: Just see this girl, little girl, is aiming for going back to Krishnaloka. Just see. (laughter) I am giving an example. They don't care for this material senses. They are always thinking "When I shall go there, home, back to home, back to Godhead?" (Lecture, SB 7.6.3)

Guru-krpa: . . . They say that in the spiritual everything is peaceful, there is no birth and death, there is no material conditions, so why if the conditions in the spiritual world are so nice and everything spiritual, how is it that one can become envious of Krishna in such conditions?

Acyutananda: The original sin.

Guru-krpa: How is it that, if everything is free from envy, free from bad material elements . . .

Prabhupada: That is independence. In spite of all these things, because you have got little independence, you can violate.

Sudama: It is very hard to understand.

Prabhupada: No, it is not difficult. It is not difficult. Because you are part and parcel of God, God has got full independence, but you have got little independence, proportionately, because you are part and parcel.

Acyutananda: But in the Gita, it says, "Once coming there, he never returns."

Prabhupada: But if he likes, he can return. That independence has to be accepted, little independence. We can misuse that. Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare. That misuse is the cause of our falldown.

Acyutananda: In Krishna book it says that there were some color fighting in Dvaraka. They were throwing color. And some men became lusty seeing the women. Will that be the first part of their falldown, to be in Vaikuntha and think of personal lust with Krishna's associates?

Prabhupada: Yes. (Conversation, Mayapur, February 19, 1976)

In a letter (69-10-27) Srila Prabhupada writes:

“Constitutionally every living entity, even if he is in the Vaikuntha-loka (=planets), has chance of falling down”.

“We were are all in a Vaikuntha planet. Now, we wanted to enjoy this material world. We have fallen down. Now we are trying to go back again. Therefore we say, "Go back to home, back to Godhead." (Bhag. lecture, Melbourne, May 22, 1975)

“He is fallen already from a Vaikuntha planet. He is fallen in this material world, and he is again trying to make progress”. (Bhag. lecture, Los Angeles, June 15, 1972)

fall-vada degrades Goloka as a place of envy and rebellion

This is like calling Ramarajya or Adiraja Prithu's kingdom a place of envy, lust and criminality because sometimes they imprison or excommunicate a rebel, thief or sociopath. Or put a mad man in a lunatic asylum.

SB 4.28.54 purport describes the causal ocean.

Here is SB 4.28.54 and the purport:

“My dear gentle friend, both you and I are exactly like two swans. We live together in the same heart, which is just like the Manasa Lake. Although we have been living together for many thousands of years, we are still far away from our original home.

PURPORT

The original home of the living entity and the Supreme Personality of Godhead is the spiritual world. In the spiritual world both the Lord and the living entities live together very peacefully. Since the living entity remains engaged in the service of the Lord, they both share a blissful life in the spiritual world. However, when the living entity wants to enjoy himself, he falls down into the material world. Even while he is in that position, the Lord remains with him as the Supersoul, his intimate friend. Because of his forgetfulness, the living entity does not know that the Supreme Lord is accompanying him as the Supersoul. In this way the living entity remains conditioned in each and every millennium. Although the Lord follows him as a friend, the living entity, because of forgetful material existence, does not recognize Him.”

The causal ocean has huge waves from mighty winds. How can the Lord and the jiva live there “very peacefully”. Elsewhere P. dasa says “quite peacefully.” How can the jiva “blissfully serve the Lord” within huge waves and mighty winds. How can such a place be called the original home of the living entity.

Nor is the causal ocean the spiritual world. It is the border of the spiritual and material world. A border is no one's land. P. dasa wishes to call it the spiritual world, he could as well call it the material world.

The purport of the Brahma samhita (Bs) 5.10 states that the causal ocean is the boundary between the spiritual and material world. Bs 5.7 purport says "Maha Visnu, lying in the causal ocean, the plenary portion of Maha Sankarsana, who has His seat in Maha-Vaikuntha, casts His glance towards maya." Thus the causal ocean is not Maha Vaikuntha; Maha Visnu is in the causal ocean but His cause, Maha Sankarsana, has His seat in Maha Vaikuntha.

To use the tatastha-vadi's argument: "Vaikuntha is a place of no anxiety, one cannot have the anxiety that one can fall down from there.": If Maha-Vaikuntha includes the Viraja river or causal ocean, as P. dasa proposes, and from the Viraja river one can fall down, if one makes the wrong choice at this border as per tatastha-vada, then how this is a place of no anxiety or Vaikuntha. This area can't have that name Vaikuntha.

Two points more on this from the same section of this fourth canto:

SB 4.29.75. Srila Prabhupada purports: "Originally the soul was as good as the Supreme Personality of Godhead in his pure spiritual existence...drops into the material condition...by the process of Krishna consciousness one can revert to his original spiritual existence..."

One comes from an originally spiritual, pure existence, Krishna's home. And one will revert to this same. For Gaudiya Vaisnavas this is Krishna.

This can't be Brahman or the causal ocean. By the process of Brahman consciousness one will revert to that spiritual existence.

SB 4.26.23 purport: "King Puranjana begged his Queen to return to her original beauty. He tried to revive her just as a living entity tries to revive his original consciousness, Krishna consciousness, which is very beautiful. All the beautiful features of the Queen could be compared to the beautiful features of Krishna consciousness. When one returns to his original Krishna consciousness, he actually becomes steady, and his life becomes successful."

The original very beautiful consciousness is Krishna consciousness. It doesn't describe Brahman consciousness. These are one but also different. Acintya-bheda-abheda-tattva.

"initially, the jiva was situated on the borderline between the material and spiritual worlds" (Jaiva dharma ch. 7)

Another translation is: "The jiva's first location is on the boundary line between the material and the spiritual worlds."

This means that when the jiva leaves the spiritual world, he gets another choice or chance at the border of the spiritual world.

"First location" means after he leaves his home, the first location or stopover outside home is the border.

This is so because the spiritual master has already stated earlier the original position of the jiva:

"There are two conditions of the jiva. Either liberated or entangled..."

One who has turned away from Krishna and denied relationship with Him falls into the clutches of maya....In his pure state, the self-cognition of the jiva is “I am eternal servant of Krishna.” However, upon entering the mundane plane each jiva adopts false identities.”

“In his pure state” does not refer to the jiva’s future eternal residence on Goloka. Because after this he states “However, upon entering the mundane plane he falsely identifies...”

If it would mean, ‘in the future entering the spiritual world’, this “entering” then would mean after going back to Godhead he enters again Maya. This rarely happens. “Once burnt, twice shy.” Nor is it often discussed.

Nor can it refer to the existence in the brahmajyoti because this is a stunted existence. This is not “pure” liberation but semi-liberation, because there is no Krishna consciousness. (CC. Madhya 6.269; SB 10.2.32 avisuddha buddhaya – impure intelligence and vimukta manina, they think they are liberated.)

Nor can it refer to an eternal dormant potential of Krishna consciousness because this is not pure. If it would be pure or perfect and complete, without covering, the soul would be Krishna conscious.

Another translation of this last quote makes this time sequence and cause and effect relation clear.

“When the jiva enters material existence, he takes on a new type of egoism. In the pure state of existence the jiva has the egoism of being a servant of Krishna but in the conditioned state, many different types of egoism arise.”

In the answer to the next question the spiritual master explains the pure state.

The question is “in the conditioned state me and mine are prominent. Do they remain in the liberated state?”

Answer: “when in transcendence, the jiva identifies himself with his pure self, which is the constitutional nature bestowed upon him by Sri Krishna.”

Then after this line (“jiva’s first location is on boundary line”) the spiritual master says “from this location, those jivas who did not forget their relationship to Sri Krishna become fortified with the cit sakti and were attracted into the spiritual realm.”

This “did not forget their relationship with Krishna” means that they had their relationship with Krishna in the spiritual world. There is no divine ecstasy or loving dealings or relationship with Krishna in the brahmajyoti or causal ocean. There is only the susupti (sleep) state; the relationship with Radha-Krishna is potential, nascent, not developed.

Nor can it refer to the so-called “flash vision of the spiritual and material world, the soul had flying out of Maha-Visnu, and from that making the choice for maya or spirit” (as per the Brahman kaka fall down version). Because the spiritual master states “not forget their relationship with Krishna”, and says: nitya krishne dekhi—krishne karena adara, meaning, The jivas *always* see Krishna— *nitya* Krsne dekhi— and love Him. As long as the jivas focus their attention on Krishna, they maintain reverence for Him—Krsne karena Adara. However, when they turn their attention— bahirmukha—turn their face, they desire bhoga—material enjoyment, and maya standing nearby—nikata—stha catches him, binds him in her embrace. A short glimpse of Krishna cannot be said to be a nitya-eternal-, solid, loving relation with Krishna, the soul has developed and doesn’t want to forget any more. The text continues “Since the moment of entrance into maya, the jiva has lost his true spiritual identity.” Before this passage the guru had stated the same “Having entered into the world, the jiva has taken upon himself a new sense of ego; when he was in his pure state, his only one egoism was that he is the servitor of Krishna.” He speaks of ‘having been eternally in a pure state as servant of Krishna’, one turned away from. That can only refer to a rasa of the spiritual world. One can’t say ‘eternally’ established in a relationship with Krishna is the

gazing rasa while flying in the sky or swimming in the causal ocean, being emanated out of Maha-Visnu.

By the way, if there was any rasa with Krishna, and one turned away from this, then this can also happen with the rasa in the spiritual planets, something these non-fall-vadi's claim can never happen.

Besides, we already noted, that the souls coming from Maha-Visnu have their eyes closed; they open them 2000 divine years later, after having received a body from the creator Lord Brahma.

So they come from the spiritual world. Changed their mind at the border and went back to Godhead.

Alternatively, this whole description is giving basic, general, philosophical statements on the issue of the jiva-tattva; the principles are discussed: "The jiva is tatastha constitutionally and in forgetfulness he exists in the cosmic prison-house of Durga etc." The guru was speaking the ABC's to a new man, as the beginning of the chapter states.

No creational susupti: Krishna is complete

The next question, continuing Jaiva dharma, is:

"Why we fail to awaken our real original identity? Why we do not get back our true nature, though we try our utmost?"

The real original identity had been awake. Has become dormant.

One cannot interpret that the real original identity was eternally asleep— in the Brahman effulgence. Why would Krishna be so unable as to not have all souls eternally in always expanding ecstatic bliss. Why He needed to evolve and increase His associates gradually. Does He start with zero devotees and then expands, as a king in this world gradually builds up his kingdom?

This is apasiddhanta. As the Upanishads teach:

om purnam adah purnam idam
purnat purnam udacyate
purnasya purnam adaya
purnam evavasisyate

"The Complete Whole is perfect."

There is, as stated in Bhakti rasamrta sindhu, a perfect, more perfect, most perfect (NOD 2.1.221). This is not an increase in substance because the infinity is full. There is no void in the kingdom of God (Srila Prabhupada writes in Bg 6.15) which can be filled up.

There is no void or sleeping field to be cultivated or activated. The Absolute Complete Perfect Whole has no imperfections.

There is a brahmajyoti with dormant souls and Durga-devi-dhama, the prison house of the material world. But that is for those who voluntarily chose to go from perfect to imperfect.

In the spiritual world or Absolute truth there is only one principle: love.

In this material world we see that friendships break.

urdhva-mulam adhah-sakham
asvattham prahur avyayam

chandamsi yasya parnaniyas
tam veda sa veda-vit

“The Supreme Personality of Godhead said: It is said that there is an imperishable banyan tree that has its roots upward and its branches down and whose leaves are the Vedic hymns. One who knows this tree is the knower of the Vedas.”

So in the original tree or the spiritual world loving bonds can break.

To continue on Chapter 7, Jaiva dharma:

“Our material entanglement has begun from our offense to the Lord.”

The questioner speaks: “This I have learned: the jivas were originally pure but by forgetting Krishna we have fallen into maya’s clutches as prisoners.”

Another translation:” We are pure souls; forgetting Krishna we have fallen into the clutches of maya”.

Guru: very true.

He confirms that the soul had a permanent original pristine state and fell away, by quoting chapter 6, verses 1-13, from “Prema Vivarta” of Jagadananda Pandita. Here are a few:

cit-kana—jiva, krishna—cin-maya bhaskara

nitya krishne dekhi—krishne karena adara

“The living entities are infinitesimal parts of the Supreme Absolute Truth, and Sri Krishna is that Supreme Absolute Personality, transcendental and effulgent. When the living entities realize that Sri Krishna is the eternal and absolute controller, they engage in His loving devotional service.’

krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga-vancha kare
nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare

“When the living entity desires to enjoy separately from Kãñëa and turns away from Him, the illusory potency of the Lord, maya, immediately takes the soul in her clutches.”

Here the summary of two other translations: “The jiva is cit-kana. Krishna is the transcendental sun. The jivas *always* see Krishna– *nitya* Krsne dekhi– and love Him. As long as the jivas focus their attention on Krishna, they maintain reverence for Him– karena adara. However, when they turn their attention– bahirmukha-turn their face, they desire bhoga– material enjoyment, and maya standing nearby-nikata-stha catches him.”

The soul is a nitya, eternal, lover, but then wishes to turn away. This is not a description of a quick love and divorce at the border.

Summary of the next verses: “The jiva soul having forgotten his constitutional position as the eternal perfect and pure servant of Krishna, remains maya’s slave while going from one body to the next... Ever since I left the shelter of your lotus feet, my life has been completely devastated.”

The soul had its constitutional position as the *eternal* perfect– siddha- and pure servant of Krishna. This is not some temporary love at the border.

“I left the shelter of Your feet”. If the soul having had the shelter of Krishna’s lotus feet was at the border and then left this is the same as what happened in Goloka. Shelter means home. The place where one is protected and kept safe. Brahman-kaka-fall vadi’s cant say that at the border the soul was sheltered at Krishna’s lotus feet, had a long-time safe residing. There was a good eternal relationship. Then as an earlier verse of the same book states:

Krishna-bahirmukhe hana bhoga vancha kare

nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare

"As soon as one becomes inimical to Krishna and desires sense gratification, he is immediately struck down by the illusory energy of the Lord."

Why P. dasa objects the fall from Goloka? He describes the same fall here, from Narayana or Krishna. One is fully with Krishna, at the border, but then neglects spirit and takes to matter.

Then the answer continues:

"The only way to liberate ourselves from this fallen condition is to remove this initial offense and try to invoke the mercy of the Lord.

In this way we can be released from our illusion and earn our pure original spiritual identity." Our pure spiritual original identity is and was lover of Radha Krishna. By appropriate sadhana we earn this back. The love at the border can't be named "our *original* identity". According to the Brahman fall theorists, the soul was eternally in the Brahman effulgence and only a second in love of Krishna. The original identity in that idea was a spark in the effulgent beams of the spiritual world.

This refutes P. dasa's creational susupti fall vada. It is not parampara. In logic it is called andha parampara nyaya (The maxim of the blind following the blind) or kuta-tamrika-parampara (disciplic succession of cheaters)

****Bg 8.21 means one has never fallen from My abode.****

avyakto 'kshara ity uktas
tam ahuh paramam gatim
yam prapya na nivartante
tad dhama paramam mama

That which the Vedantists describe as unmanifest and infallible, that which is known as the supreme destination, that place from which, having attained it, one never returns—that is My supreme abode. Bg 8.21

"Having attained...never returns" means having come from the material world, one will not go there again. It doesn't mean that because this soul, from now on, will be eternally there, that no one else can ever come from there, or that he didn't come from there. And even on this 'never return', Srila Prabhupada explained on several occasions that there can be exceptions to this general rule, just like if a criminal comes out of jail, he can do crimes and go again back to jail.

****"Vaikuntha is that place from which no one ever falls down...on this we all agree"*****

He forgets the sentence "...the living entity belongs to Lord Krishna's marginal potency (tatastha-sakti)"

This is an important statement to understand how a soul in the spiritual world can fall into matter. Tatastha means free to go, down and up and down and up.

Marginal means as the line (=tatstha or margin) at the beach between the water and the land.

It is always in contact with the water and the land. Similarly, the tatastha or marginal energy, the soul, even if he is in the spiritual world, he is always in contact with the material energy, meaning it can always fall under kAma (lust), lobha (greed), krodha (anger), mada

(madness), moha (illusion), matsarya (envy). And if the soul is in the material world, he can always contact the spiritual world.

This is confirmed in SB 7.1.38 where the kumaras curse Jaya and Vijaya: “You two foolish doorkeepers, being agitated by the material qualities of passion and ignorance, you are unfit to live at the shelter of Madhudvisa’s lotus feet, which are free from such modes. It would be better for you to go immediately to the material world and take your birth in a family of most sinful asuras.”

In the spiritual world one is very close to the material modes of passion and ignorance and can become agitated by these and fall down.

“The Lord of the mundane world, Maha-Visnu, possesses thousands of thousands of heads, eyes, hands. He is the source of thousands of thousands of avatars in His thousands of thousands of subjective portions. He is the creator of thousands of thousands of universes and souls.” (Brahma samhita 5.11)

This is a description of the jivas coming out of Maha-Visnu having entered after the mahapralaya: that is in Brahma samhita 5.20 and purport.

“At that time those jivas who had lain dormant during the cataclysm were awakened.”

Purport: Those jivas that were merged in Hari at the end of the life of Brahma in the great cataclysm during the preceding great age of the universe, reappeared in this world in accordance with their former fruitive desires.”

There is no mentioning here of any jivas being dormant for eternity in the brahmajyoti and moving into Maha-Visnu and coming out of Him at the beginning of the maha-kalpa.

It is not stated anywhere in the Brahma samhita nor in the commentary of Srila Jiva Goswami that there are 2 classes of jivas coming out of Maha-Visnu; one class from the last life of Brahma (maha-kalpa) who didn’t want liberation and one class from the brahmajyoti.

To the contrary, in Srila Bhaktisiddhanta's purport to text 44 of Brahma-samhita we read:

"When jivas begotten of the marginal potency (tatastha-sakti) forget the service of Krishna, they are confined in the mundane prison house, the citadel of Durga... When, luckily, the forgetfulness of Govinda on the part of the imprisoned jivas is remarked by them by coming in contact with self-realized souls and their natural aptitude for the loving service of Krishna is aroused, Durga herself then becomes the agency of their deliverance by the will of Govinda... Jiva is a spiritual atomic part of Krishna. When he forgets his service of Krishna he is at once deflected by the attracting power of maya in this world, who throws him into the whirlpool of mundane fruitive activity (karma) by confining him in a gross body constituted by the five material elements..."

Also, Brahma samhita text 21, purport describes how the soul falls from the pure spiritual world.

“This potency has another name, viz., tatastha or marginal potency being located on the line demarcating the spheres of the spiritual and mundane potencies. He is susceptible to the influence of the material energy owing to his small magnitude. But so long as he remains submissive to Krishna, the Lord of Maya, he is not liable to the influence of Maya. The worldly afflictions, births and rebirths are the concomitants of the fettered condition of souls fallen into the clutches of the deluding potency from a time that has no beginning.”

If this describes Brahman-tatastha-fall, then “As long as he remains submissive to Krishna, he will not be caught by maya” would mean to remain hanging in space, in submission to Krishna and not flying or swimming on, after having been emanated from Maha-Visnu. So it would mean: if the soul remains hanging in space and remains submissive to Krishna, he will not be dragged by maya, into maya. Or, with an alternative Brahman-fall theory, that the soul goes to the border of matter and spirit, not into the causal ocean, the soul ‘remains in submission’ at the border? This is a faulty theory.

It also cannot describe a journey back to Godhead, because in Vaikuntha there is no influence of maya— again following the tatastha-fall axioms. There would be no need to describe that “he is not liable to the influence of maya;” this Brahma Samhita purport “as long as he remains submissive to Krishna, the Lord of Maya, he is not liable to the influence of Maya,” cannot mean this tatastha-vada, being that the soul at the border chose for Krishna-seva and went to Vaikuntha never to fall. Because the text reads “if the soul remains submissive, he will not be influenced by maya.” This, “becoming influenced by maya” can never be an option for a soul who has once chosen for Krishna-seva. According to tatastha-vada one will always remain submissive to Krishna and never be liable to the influence of maya.

The conclusion is that this purport describes the soul in the spiritual planets, and if he remains submissive to Krishna he will not fall. Nowhere in this purport we see the tatastha or brahmajyoti as the eternal original position.

“The tatastha-jiva is located on the line demarcating the spheres of the spiritual and material potencies.”

The Bengali text can also be read as “another name of the jiva-potency is tatastha-sakti, being that he is located on the line demarcation between the plane of maya and Divinity.”

This is a general philosophical statement on the nature of the tatastha-jiva: the jiva is always marginal: close to or able to go to maya or Krishna. As the line (=tatastha) at the beach between the sea and the land is always between the sea and the land, and the place that is at one time under the water, can become uncovered, and covered over again.

The jiva is permanently (located) in between the spiritual and material energy and neither the svarupa-sakti nor maya-sakti.

This can be the only meaning because the purport next reads – as we have discussed: “he is susceptible to the influence of material energy owing to his smallness (this is his eternal free nature— ed.) but (he is in the spiritual planets, thus-ed.) so long as he remains submissive to Krishna he is not liable to the influence of the deluding potency.”

The only other place where tatastha is discussed is in text 16 and purport. “When the innumerable jivas – who are sparks of cit emanating from the cit-rays of the paramatma - identify themselves in the (pure) ego of exclusive servitors of the Lord, their relationship with the mayik world no longer endures; they become members of the Vaikuntha world.”

This passage is on the conditioned souls regularly coming in and out of Maha Visnu. They come from Maha-Visnu, are put into maya’s thralldom and can become liberated.

The innumerable jivas means the jiva mentioned at the end purport to text 20:

“Those jivas that were merged in Hari at the end of the life of Brahma in the great cataclysm during the preceding great age of the universe, reappeared in this world in accordance with their former fruitive desires.”

There is no introduction to or description of another class of jiva’s emanating from Maha-Visnu. Nowhere in scripture; we always read of innumerable jivas, who were asleep for 4.32 trillion years, after the maha-pralaya at the end of the reign of the previous Brahmas, are

emanated by Visnu, into matter. The same is, for example, in SB 3.5.26 commentary of Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura:

“Maha Visnu placed the jiva-sakti (viryam), in maya who was enjoyed from a distance by His glance... This viryam means the mass of jivas or the seed of all jivas who were merged in Me at pralaya and merged in ignorance, lust and karma.”

The same in the commentary of Srila Jiva Goswami on Brahma Samhita text 13:

“The jivas in combination with prakrti had been resting within the hair holes of Sankarsana (Maha-visnu). They then take the form of golden eggs, the primitive forms of universes, covered with the five great elements before they combine.”

Purport: First being in a subtle state, this combination of jivas then becomes situated within the hair holes of Sankarsana. Then they take the form of golden eggs covered by the five gross elements in an uncombined (subtle) state.”

And in the commentary of Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura:

The spiritual seeds of Sankarshana existing in the pores of skin of Maha-Vishnu, are born as so many golden sperms (haimani—golden; andani—eggs or sperms). These sperms are covered with five great elements (maha-bhuta—by the five great elements; avritani—covered).

Purport: The prime divine avatara lying in the spiritual Causal Ocean is such a great affair that in the pores of His divine form spring up myriads of seeds of the universes. Those series of universes are the perverted reflections of the infinite transcendental region. As long as they remain embedded in His divine form they embody the principle of spiritual reflection having the form of golden eggs. Nevertheless by the creative desire of Maha-Vishnu the minute particles of the great elements, which are constituents of the mundane efficient and material causal principles, envelop them. When those golden sperms, coming out with the exhalation of Maha-Vishnu, enter into the unlimited accommodating chamber of the limited potency (Maya) they become enlarged by the nonconglomerate great elements.”

In this way, the living entities come from Maha-Visnu’s glance and skin pores. But there is no mention that they are just down from the Brahmajyoti. Nor that they fly in space after coming out from His eyes or swimming out of His pores and see maya and Krishna and get a choice.

Just the opposite, according to Brahma samhita T.20 the jivas awoke 1000 demigod years after Garbhodakasayi Visnu entered the universe. And Srila Jiva Goswami comments: “prabudhyate means that the jivas woke up from the sleep which started at the last destruction of the universe.”

And Bhaktivinoda in Bs 23 comments:

“All jivas get their nature conformably to their impressions of previous births and accordingly their activity can have a beginning. It is called "the unseen" or the result of one's previous deeds.”

The innumerable jivas coming out of Maha-Visnu are the souls of the 8.400.000 species of life of the last maha-kalpa. Mostly (8 million) the dull animal and plant species. And 300.000 primitive, uncivilized human forms.

Does P. dasa want to say that all these get the mercy and enlightenment to see Krishna (and all of maya) in the flight or while swimming?

Then more tatastha knowledge is in Brahma samhita 5.16 purport:

“When the innumerable jivas identify themselves in the pure ego of exclusive servitors of the Supreme Lord, their relationship with the mayic world no longer endures; they become members of the Vaikuntha world.

But when they desire to lord it over Maya, forgetting their real identity, the egotistic principle Sambhu entering into their entities makes them identify themselves as separated enjoyers of mundane entities. Hence Sambhu is the primary principle of the egotistic mundane universe and of perverted egotism in jivas that identifies itself with their limited material bodies. (Brahma samhita 5.16)”

I.o.w. when the marginal energy forgets the Lord they will get ahankara, false ego. This can't mean the Brahman-tatastha-vada scenario: the soul sees matter and spirit while coming out of Maha-Visnu, because there is no matter to lord it over and enjoy; how they can “desire to lord it over maya” and “enjoy mundane entities.”

For the branch of Brahman-tatastha-fall-vada of falling to the border when the creation is already there, we read in Brahma-samhita 5.21

“sa nityo nitya-sambandhah
prakritis ca paraiva sa

sah—that (jiva); nityah—eternal; nitya-sambandhah—possessing an eternal relationship; prakritih—potency; ca—and; para—spiritual; eva—certainly; sa—that.

The same jiva is eternal and is for eternity and without a beginning joined to the Supreme Lord by the tie of an eternal kinship. He is transcendental spiritual potency.”

The jiva has a nitya-sambandhah— an eternal relationship— with Krishna, which is according to the purport.

“That eternal relationship consists in this that the Supreme Lord is the eternal master and jivas are His eternal servants.”

And also “Just as the sun is eternally associated with his rays so the transcendental Supreme Lord is eternally joined with the jivas. The jivas are the infinitesimal particles of His spiritual effulgence and are, therefore, not perishable like mundane things. Jivas, being particles of Godhead's effulgent rays, exhibit on a minute scale the qualities of the Divinity. Hence jivas are identical with the principles of knowledge, knower, egoism, enjoyer, meditator and doer.” Comment: The jiva is always in His shine, meaning support, embrace and shelter. Even when the jiva is back on the spiritual planets, he is not literally in the Brahman effulgence, but he is still in Krishna's radiance or energy and love.

Nitya-sambandha means always-nitya- active in Krishna's service. Thus, before becoming ” fallen into the clutches of the deluding potency” the soul was on the spiritual planets, since the santa-rasa of Brahman, sayujya-mukti, is as Brahma-samhita elsewhere describes, joyless neutrality and “Self-annihilation has its excellence in Brahma-dhama...kaivalya or merging into the Brahman constitutes the line of demarcation between the world of limitation and the transcendental world..... These conditions are the simple absence of misery arising from mundane affinity but are not real happiness or felicity. If the absence of misery be called a bit of pleasure then also that bit is very small and of no consequence. It is not sufficient to destroy the condition of materiality.” Bs 5.34

This cannot be the original position, Krishna has designated some souls to for unending nonbeginning time. It was the self-choice of the soul. Nitya-covered is not nitya-sambandha. The original position was Krishna-nitya-dasa, the nitya-sambandha. Brahman-sayujya is

temporary nirvana; invisible, inaudible, untouchable, nonfragrant, unperceivable, indistinguishable, formless, indolent, lax, void.

Another possible translation of this passage, Brahma Samhita 5.16, according to the literal dictionary meanings (which we looked into) is: (We have put an etymological meaning in square brackets. Parentheses indicate words not in the original. Curly brackets indicate that a single word of the original is being translated into that phrase.)

“If the endless {collection of [living] organisms}, the {particles of consciousness [wellness]} risen from (the) {rays of consciousness [wellness]} of the transcendent [final self], (hold a) (self-)opinion (for) themselves as '{only servants of God [one with prosperity]}', then they keep no relation with the {illusion-full world [that which moves]}; they become {gone to Vaikuntha}. Forgetting that [(self-) opinion], when they want to be consumers [eaters] of illusion, (it is) then (that) that Sambhu's {pride [I-ness] principle [true state]}, entering their substance [true existent], gives them {separate consumer principle [true state]}. Therefore, (it is) Sambhu (that) is the {root principle [true state]} of the {illusion-full body-self-conceit [(erroneously) high (self-)opinion]} of the {pride[I-ness]-at-core [self]} world [everything] and (living) organism.”

The meaning is clear. The souls have come from Maha-Visnu after having entered 311.040 trillion years ago (they entered after the maha-pralaya). They are put in different material bodies, by Lord Brahma and the prjapati's, according to the karma still there from the previous maha-kalpa's. If they come to know themselves as servants of God then they keep no relation with maya (which they had). They will leave for Vaikuntha. In forgetfulness they want to consume maya (dust, matter).

“They keep no relation with the illusion-full world (jagat – that which moves)” cannot mean the material energy at the beginning of the creation from Maha-Visnu. There is no material world yet. Only the spiritual seeds, covered with five great elements, of Sankarshana, existing in the pores of skin of Maha-Vishnu. These golden seeds are empty(!) universes. Thus the two translations we have, can't be stretched to mean that our original position is Brahmajyoti, then we go to Maha-Visnu and choose for the spiritual world or the clouds of maya.

Also, this passage speaks of innumerable jivas emanating from Maha-Visnu. This can't be souls descending from the brahmajyoti. Because only a few souls get liberated during a maha-kalpa (lifetime of Brahma)

manushyanam sahasreshu
kascid yatati siddhaye
yatatam api siddhanam
kascin mam vetti tattvatah

“Out of many thousands among men, one may endeavor for perfection, and of those who have achieved perfection, hardly one knows Me in truth.” (Bg 7.3)

If in every new mahakalpa innumerable souls get emanated into maya's madhouse, then this illusory dreamland would have become infinite. The material world is a quantitatively very small affair. Else how can it be a cloud in a small corner of the spiritual sky.

“The mahat-tattva, is only an insignificant portion of the whole spiritual sky, and within this mahat-tattva there are innumerable universes.” (SB 1.3.1 p)

Thus, the material creation is surrounded on all sides by the spiritual world and every 311.040 trillion years Maha-Visnu takes this insignificant portion of material energy and the tatastha energies back into Himself.

If the maya and tatastha energies would be infinite how these can be wound up into Maha-Visnu. Krishna also can embrace or have in Himself all the worlds as He showed in SB 10.8.

****Once the jiva has attained His Supreme abode he can't fall.****

A criminal is freed, but if he again commits criminal..., criminality, then again he's put into the jail. Like that. [indistinct] ...his freedom, now make your choice. But if you misuse it, then again go. Mam aprapya nivartante mrityuh samsara vartmani [Bg. 9.3]. [break] ...go home back to Godhead. But if we do not take the chance, and misuse it, like animals, then again we go down. The process is to go back to home, back to Godhead, eternal life, blissful life. And other process is the cycle of birth and death in different species of life. So this human form of body is to make choice whether he wants to continue the cycle of birth and death in different species of life, or he wants to go home, back to Godhead. [break] ...mad-yajino 'pi yanti mam [Bg. 9.25]. He's Krishna conscious when he goes back to home, back to Godhead. [indistinct] species of life, according to karma, they're going to be fish. From fish, by nature's way, leads to the plants, then insect. In this way... Then birds, then beasts, again human being. Again another birth. In this way they are... Bahunam janmanam ante [Bg. 7.19]. Similarly, after many, many births, when he comes to his senses that "I have enjoyed very much. Now let me go back home..." Vasudevah sarvam iti...Mam prapadyante. [Bg. 7.14]: "Krishna save me, take me." 760528MW-HONOLULU - May 28, 1976

****Srla Prahbupada Letter to Jagadish dasa LA 25 April 1970:**

Regarding your second question, have the conditioned soul ever seen Krishna? Were they with the Lord before being conditioned by the desire to lord it over material nature? Yes, the conditioned souls are parts and parcels of the Lord and thus they were with Krishna before being conditioned. Just as the child must have seen his father because the father places the child in the womb of the mother, similarly each soul has seen Krishna or the Supreme Father. But at that time the conditioned souls are resting in the condition called susupti which is exactly deep sleep without dream, or anesthetized state, therefore they do not remember being with Krishna when they wake up in the material world and become engaged in material affairs.**

This is supposed to proof that our original position is susupti, sleep.

Somehow, the paragraph before this part of the letter is not studied and only half the truth is given. Here it is:

“Regarding your questions about how and from where did the conditioned souls fall, your first question if someone has a relationship with Lord Krishna on Krishnaloka, does he ever fall down? The souls are endowed with minute independence as part of their nature and this minute independence may be utilized rightly or wrongly at any time, so there is always the chance of falling down by misuse of one's independence. But those who are firmly fixed up in devotional service to Krishna are making proper use of their independence and so they do not fall down.”

This refutes P. dasa's susupti fall-vada. Since, "By misuse of one's independence one can fall down from Krishna-loka (= planet)."

The next paragraph of this letter, is on the conditioned soul going in and out of Maha-Visnu, after the soul has fallen from Krishna-loka. In Maha-Visnu they are in susupti, deep sleep without dream.

They wake up in the material world and become engaged in material activities. This is described in Brahma samhita text 20 and purport:

"By conglomerating all those separate entities He (Maha-Visnu) manifested the innumerable mundane universes and Himself entered into the inmost recess of every extended conglomerate [virad-vigraha] (as Garbhodakasayi Visnu). At that time those jivas who had lain dormant during the cataclysm were awakened.

Purport: Those jivas that were merged in Hari at the end of the life of Brahma in the great cataclysm during the preceding great age of the universe, reappeared in this world in accordance with their former fruitive desires."

That waking up in the material world, described in this Brahma-samhita text is 2000 divine years (720.000 solar years), after the souls come out of Maha-Visnu. This "waking up in the material world" can't refer to the Brahman-tatastha-vadi's "seeing Krishna and maya while emanating out of Maha-Visnu at the beginning of creation" because there is no material world and its material affairs yet.

There is only the spiritual karana ocean, some golden eggs or universes (only the shells) and the invisible, unorganized matter, pradhana. We cannot call the pradhana, "the material world." It is an amorphous blob of paramanus without sabda, sparsa, rasa, rupa, gandha. I.o.w. there are no objects of hearing, touch, taste, form, smell.

Chant Hare Krishna and go back to Sri Sri Radha Krishna's loka.

Goloka Fall-down is confirmed by Srila Prabhupada

His Divine Grace Srila Prabhupada saktyavesa-avatara, savior of the whole world says this:

"So the Mayavadi philosopher, their spiritual life means to merge into the Brahman effulgence, and the Vaisnava philosopher to go back to Goloka Vrndavana, Vaikuntha, where God is situated, and become His associate person." (Philosophy, discussions with Hayagriva, Arthur Schopenhauer)

We come from Goloka since we go back to Goloka. With this quote, the discussion with S.dasa is closed. He states in his "threshold of sambandha..." that Goloka-patana-vada (Goloka-fall-down) is not in Srila Prabhupada's books or lectures, etc.

One cannot distinguish between what Srila Prabhupada wrote with his lotus hand or what he spoke with his lotus mouth. And Srila Prabhupada's purports were also spoken from his lotus mouth, through a dictaphone.

We will give 2 more quotes, since 3 times is for stress and is necessary in this age of Kali. This is on 'back to Krishna-loka', since S. dasa said specifically that Krishna-loka is Goloka. "...They say, "Why did Krishna create evil?" Then there is a very peculiar question that comes sometimes: "If Krishna knows that we were going to fall down, why didn't He save us?" or something like that.

Prabhupada: He's saving you...He's saving. He's asking that "I'll save you. You surrender to Me."

Acyutananda: But that means He knows everything in advance.

Prabhupada: He knows. He knows that you are a rascal, you'll fall. Therefore He says that "Do this. You'll not fall."

Acyutananda: And they don't seem to take that answer, and they're very...

Sudama: No, they become very embittered: "Why He permits us...? If He is all-loving God, why He permits us to suffer?"

Prabhupada: No, He's not permit... He forbids, but you...

Acyutananda: You insist.

Prabhupada: ...that you have to understand that you have got little independence. That...

Actually they do not understand that.

Sudama: No. They're not satisfied.

Acyutananda: They don't...

Sudama: Then they say, "Why He give us independence, then?"

Prabhupada: Then... That is the distinction between you and the stone. Otherwise you would have remained as stone. Because you are moving, therefore He has given you the independence.

Yasodanandana: There is also a question in that same line. They say that in the spiritual world we say that everything is peaceful, there is no birth and death, there is no material conditions. So if the conditions in the spiritual world are so nice and everything is spiritually..., everything is spiritual, how is it that one can become envious of Krishna in such conditions? This is a very...

Acyutananda: The original sin.

Sudama: Why we are envious,

Yasodanandana: How is it that, if everything is free from envy, free from bad material elements...

Prabhupada: Yes.

Yasodanandana: How is it that...

Prabhupada: That is independence. That is independence. In spite of all these things, because you have got little independence, you can violate.

Sudama: It is very hard thing to understand.

Prabhupada: No, it is not difficult. It is not difficult.

Acyutananda: It is not difficult. They don't want to understand.

Prabhupada: Because you are part and parcel of God, God has got full independence, but you have got little independence, proportionately, because you are part and parcel.

Acyutananda: No, their idea is that they want to blame God for their predicament. Like a bad child, you know, says, "Well, you made me do it."

Prabhupada: Yes.

Sudama: "What can I do?"

Prabhupada: No, they say, "Why you gave me birth?" They say like that.

Sudama: Cursing almost. Almost.

Yasodanandana: Also, the atheistic people sometimes argue, "What does your Krishna do for the suffering people?"

Prabhupada: Hmm?

Yasodanandana: "What does He do? Why doesn't He come down and help the poor people? They are suffering."

Acyutananda: I tell them there's...

Yasodanandana: "Why doesn't He come and help them?"

Acyutananda: In Andhra, I said, "There's so much land where they're growing tobacco. You could grow food." But in the Gita it says, "Once coming there, he never returns."

Prabhupada: But if he likes, he can return.

Acyutananda: He can return.

Prabhupada: That independence has to be accepted—little independence. We can misuse that. Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare [Prema-vivarta]. That misuse is the cause of our fall down.

Acyutananda: In Krishna book it says that there was some color fighting in Dvaraka. They were throwing color. And some men became lusty seeing the women. So is... Will that be the first part of their fall down, to be in Vaikuntha and think of personal lust with Krishna's associates?

Prabhupada: Yes. (760219MW-MAYAPUR - February 19, 1976)

"...intelligent man, should consider that "If I have to prepare myself for going, for being elevated to the higher planetary system, but we have to come back again, ksine punye martya-loka, why not endeavor for going back to Krishnaloka?" That is intelligence." (Lecture, Bg 2.23-24, London)

A few more as extra nails on the coffin to bury or burn the "only bhauma-vraja-patanavada" theories.

"The real mission of life [is] how to go back to Krishna, how to go back to Vaikunthaloka...(Lecture, Bg 9.2, Calcutta)

"Prabhupada: Just see this girl, little girl, is aiming for going back to Krishnaloka. Just see. (laughter) I am giving an example. They don't care for this material senses. They are always thinking "When I shall go there, home, back to home, back to Godhead?" (Lecture, SB 7.6.3, June 16, 1968)

"yad gatva na nivartante tad dhama paramam mama [Bg. 15.6]. "You have to go back to My planet, My kingdom. That will make you perfect." (Lecture on Bg 4.14-19, New York, 1966)

In a letter (69-10-27) Srila Prabhupada writes: "Constitutionally every living entity, even if he is in the Vaikuntha-loka (=planets), has chance of falling down".

"We were all in a Vaikuntha planet. Now, we wanted to enjoy this material world. We have fallen down. Now we are trying to go back again. Therefore we say, "Go back to home, back to Godhead." (Bhag. lecture, Melbourne, May 22, 1975)

"Here is clear proof of how a living entity coming originally from Vaikunthaloka (=planets) is engaged in material elements." (SB. 3.16.35) "One who continues to serve the Lord even in reverse conditions is assured that he will go back to Godhead, back to the Vaikuntha planets." (SB 3.16.37 purport)

"He is fallen already from a Vaikuntha planet. He is fallen in this material world, and he is again trying to make progress". (Lecture, SB 2.3.19, Los Angeles, June 15, 1972)

We can stop here discussing this and continue with some footnotes; some more points of S.dasa and our comments.

****fall from Goloka is apasiddhanta one falls from bhauma-Vrindavana****

These realms are not different in the display or manifestation of opulence. The conditioned soul sees Gokula or Bhauma vrndavana, covered by the veil of maya, and will not see all the magic and spiritual infinity Krishna displays. Krishna and His abode are both fully spiritual. If it is admitted that one falls from bhauma-Vrindavana's loving relations then it is in the same way one can fall from Goloka. Because these realms are both on the absolute platform and bhauma-Vrindavana is completely spiritual and not materially contaminated.

In rasa or prema, the surroundings, paraphernalia, opulences (aisvarya) and other externals are secondary. Love is heart to heart exchange, independent of whether the souls or Super-souls are on the stage of bhauma or Goloka Vrindavana.

And, in fact, Srila Prabhupada says we fall from Krishna-loka (see the above quotes)

In his writings, lectures, conversations etc. Srila Prabhupada uses the words 'back to home,' 'back to Godhead,' 'back to Krishna' some 5983 times:

back to Godhead – 2921 times
back to home – 1137 times
back to home back to godhead – 970 times
back home – 691 times
back home back to godhead – 528 times
back to Krishna – 97 times
back to the spiritual world – 21 times
back to the kingdom of God – 16 times
back to Krishna – 9 times
back to vaikuntha – 9 times

return to the kingdom of god – 8 times
return to the spiritual world – 8 times
back to the kingdom of Godhead – 5 times
back to the kingdom of Krishna – 1 time
back to the vaikuntha – 1 time
Go back to Goloka Vrindavana – 5 times
Back to the rasa-lila – 5 times
Go back to my planet – 1

Home means the spiritual planets, as the next quotes also prove and describe.

"Somehow or other the son leaves home and forgets his father. The father, of course, never forgets his son. He thinks, "Oh, my son has left. If he would only come back!" Krishna thinks in this way. We are all sons of Krishna, and Krishna is more anxious to get us back home, back to Godhead, than we are to go." (TLK 8, Bhakti yoga)

See up the quote from the lecture SB 7.6.3; back to home, back to Godhead means back to Krishna-loka. Or the SB lecture on 22-5-1975; back to Godhead means a Vaikuntha planet. Or SB 3.16.37 purport, "go back to Godhead, back to the Vaikuntha Planets."

Srila Prabhupada never uses the words back to home in relation with the causal ocean or the brahmajyoti as the ultimate destination or home. Therefore this was not the place of origin.

"If a rich man's son forgets his father, leaves home and becomes mad, he may lie on the street to go to sleep, or he may beg money for food, but all of this is due to his forgetfulness. If someone, however, gives him information that he is simply suffering because he has left his father's home and that his father, a very wealthy man and owner of vast property, is anxious to have him return—the person is a great benefactor." (OWK 4, The roads of the foolish and the wise)

"So everyone is related with the Supreme Personality of Godhead, just like father and son is always related. That relation cannot be broken (child crying, taken out) at any stage, but sometimes it happens that the son, out of his own independence, he goes out of his home and forgets the affectionate relationship with father. In your country, it is not very extraordinary thing. So many sons go out of father's affectionate home. That is very ordinary experience. So everyone has got independence. Similarly, we are all sons of God, but we are, at the same time, independent... So, in order to get out of these conditions of life, if we revive our bhagavata consciousness, or Krishna consciousness... or our original consciousness...originally, because you are spirit soul, originally you were free to move any way... So we have got immense independence, but we are now conditioned by this body. Therefore in the human form of life it is an opportunity to get back our original independence... Krishna is Bhagavan, the Supreme Personality of Godhead, Bhagavan, and we are part and parcel of Krishna. Just like suppose we have forgotten our home. I left my home since a long time, I've forgotten my father. So if somebody reminds me, "Do you know such gentleman? He is your father. You were playing in such a way, his father was helping you," in this way, if you simply talk of his father, he remembers his home: "Oh, yes." Similarly, we have forgotten our father, our relationship with father. If we simply hear about Him, then we remember. A simple process." (General lecture, August 31, 1972, New Vrindaban)

"The instruction of Bhagavata is, "Just try to revive your lost relationship with God, or Krishna." That relationship is never extinguished, but sometimes it is covered. Just like a crazy boy forgets his father and mother and home, goes away. But the relationship between

the son and the parents cannot be lost. As soon as the son comes back, the parents receives him very nicely. Similarly, we are all sons of the Supreme Lord. We have forgotten our father, we have forgotten our relationship, and we are loitering in this material world helplessly...

"If you want to awaken your dormant love for Krishna... There is, because we are part and parcel. Just like father and son. There is natural love. But somehow or other, son is out of home and forgotten. Father, of course, thinks, "My such-and-such son has gone out. If he comes back..." So Krishna thinks like that. Because we are sons of Krishna, Krishna is more anxious to get us back to home, back to Godhead." (Lecture, SB 3.25.15, Bombay)

"Just as in the same family some of the sons have forgotten father and some of them remember, but both of them member of the same family. Because he has forgotten his father does not mean that he is not son. He still remains. So actually, everyone is a member of God's family. That is our vision. Not only human being, but animals also. We therefore consider animals also brothers. We don't support animal killing." (Room conversation, August 14, 1971, London)

"Krishna is always finding out the opportunity how you can be taken back home, back to Godhead. Just like affectionate father. Rascal son left his father, loitering in the street and have no shelter, no food, suffering so much. The father is more anxious to take the boy home. Similarly, Krishna is the supreme father." (Lecture, SB 1.8.21, New York)

"The Lord and the living entity are intimately related like father and son. Unfortunately, because of material contact, the living entity forgets this and wants to enjoy the material world independently, according to his own plan. This illusion (maya) is very difficult to surmount. Maya covers the living entity because of his willingness to forget the Supreme Personality of Godhead and make his own plan to enjoy this material world." (SB 8.3.29 p)

"Because God has created us in so many individual living entities, we are all parts and parcel. Just like father and son or mother and son. Sons are the parts of the body of the mother." (Lecture, Bg 2.12, March, New York)

"Because we are part and parcel of the Supreme Lord, there cannot be disconnection. Just like father and son. The son may go out of home, forget his father and mother for many years, but the connection between the son and the father and the mother is never disconnected. That is not possible." (Lecture, Bg 7.1 Calcutta)

"Just like father and son. They are intimately related. It may be the son has gone out of home for many years, but as soon as he meets his father, again the same love between father and son revives. It does not mean because the son was out of home for many, many years, there is no need of awakening the love of father and son...in the Caitanya-caritamrita it is said, nitya-siddha krishna-bhakti. The love between Krishna and ourself... It doesn't matter where we are. All living entities, especially the human being, especially the civilized human being, those who have got sense, they can revive Krishna consciousness very easily by chanting this Hare Krishna mantra." (Lecture, Bg 16.6, Hawaii)

"When you understand God, Krishna, and you understand that you are part and parcel of God, or Krishna, then you can understand your position: "Oh, we are part and parcel of God." Krishna is the Supreme Person, sad-aisvarya-purnam, full of all opulences. Just like a mad

son loitering in the street, when he understands with good brain that "My father is so rich, so powerful, and why I am loitering in the street like a madman? I have no food, no shelter. I am going from this door to door and begging," then he comes to his consciousness. That is called brahma-bhuta [SB 4.30.20] stage. "Oh, I am, I am not this matter. I am spirit soul, part and parcel of God. Oh." That is consciousness. This consciousness we are trying to arouse. This is the best welfare service to the people, to awaken his lost consciousness. He is foolishly thinking that "I am of the material product, and I have to adjust my things in this material world." This is the foolishness. Actual intelligence is that is Brahma-bhuta, aham brahmasmi. Bhagavata.: "I am part and parcel of God. God is supreme Brahman. I am, being part and parcel..." Just like part and parcel of the gold, gold mine, it may be small earring, it is also gold. Similarly, the small particle of sea water is also the same quality, salty. Similarly, we, being part and parcel of God, we have got the same qualities. Qualitatively, we are one. Why we are hankering after loving? Because there is love in Krishna. We are worshiping here Radha-Krishna... Anandamayo 'bhyasat. This is the sutra, in the Brahma-sutra, that "God is anandamaya, always jolly, always cheerful." So you can become also cheerful when you go back to home, back to Godhead. That is our problem." (Lecture, SB 2.1.5 November 8, 1973, Delhi)

"If you want actually peace, then your intelligence should be utilized for searching out the Supreme and your relation with Him. As soon as you find out... Just like you have lost your father, if you find out your father, immediately your relationship with father is revived. "Here's my father." And father says, "Here is my son." Because the relationship is very intimate. Son may go out for years together, but as soon as he comes back home he sees his father, mother, and that original intimacy immediately revived.

So we have got that intimate relation. So when we come to that position to understand our intimate relationship with God, or Krishna, that is called svarupa-siddhi, svarupa-siddhi. Svarupa-siddhi means realization of perfection, svarupa-siddhi. So here Suta Gosvami says sauhardena gadhena, santa. If an old friend meets another old friend, they become very much delighted. Similarly, if the father meets the lost child, he becomes very delighted and the child also becomes delighted. The husband, wife separated, again they meet. So they become very delighted. It is quite natural. The master and servant after many, many years, if they again meet, they become very delighted. So we have got our relationship with Krishna in so many ways, santa, dasya, sakhya, vatsalya, madhurya... In veneration, in servitude, as friend, as paternal affection, or as conjugal lover You see. So we have to revive that. And as soon as you revive any one of them, intimacy, then we become happy, because that is eternal. The same example... The finger, so long is separated, it is not happy. As soon as it is joined it is happy. Similarly, we have got our eternal relationship with Krishna. Now we are separated, but as soon as we join with him again we become yenatma suprasidati.

Therefore Krishna consciousness movement is beneficial for everyone just to try to revive your original consciousness. That is already there, nitya-siddha krishna-bhakti. Our Krishna consciousness is eternally a fact... So here it is said that sauhardena ati-gadhena. Very deep. There are different types of sauharga, friendship, but there is very intimate, deep friendship. So as soon we revive our Krishna consciousness, our deep relationship with Krishna as servant, as friend, as paternal relationship or conjugal love." (Lecture SB 1.15.28, December 6, 1973, Los Angeles)

Our comment: This didn't happen at the border. Suppose one's svarupa is manjari, a young gopi, one is nitya brahmacarini, kinkari (dasi) of Srimati Radharani, as nearly all our

sampradaya acaryas since Sri Caitanya Mahaprabhu. This one got flying or swimming out of Maha-Visnu, or just landing at the border and gazing? One could look all the way to Goloka Vrindavana and got fixed up in this, in a few seconds? Then one rejected that. Now in the material world one has to revive this manjari svarupa. A highly speculative scenario. It is nowhere in the scripture.

"So this sort of civilization, simply making nice arrangement for eating and sleeping and mating and defending, that is not practically human civilization. The human civilization is meant for searching out God. Na te viduh. They do not know, unfortunately. They have forgotten. But by good association, they can remember. Therefore this meeting of Krishna Consciousness Society's meeting is just to give people chance to associate with the Society and invoke their lost relationship with God. That is the missionary activities of this Society.

So that is the highest gift to the human society. There are so many welfare activities in the human society. People open hospitals, schools, colleges, charitable institution. They are nice. But the best contribution to the human society is to revive his lost relationship with God. Just like a rich man's son. Someway or other he has left his father's home and he's loitering here and there. Somebody finds him: "Oh, you are Mr. such and such. You are the son of such and such gentleman. He's very rich man. Why you are suffering? Come, come with me. I shall take to your father." So this is one kind of welfare activity. And another welfare activity, the same person who is loitering in the street, somebody says, "Oh, you are hungry. All right, come on. I shall give you some bread." That is also welfare activity, but this welfare activity, to get the lost son to his father, rich father, not ordinary father, that is the best service. Similarly, all living entities... As Krishna claims in the Bhagavad-gita... Krishna claims,

sarva-yonishu kaunteya
murtayah sambhavanti yah
tasam brahma mahad yonir
aham bija-pradah pita [Bg. 14.4]

In many places in the Bhagavad-gita Krishna claims all living entities as His sons, parts and parcels. Just like your children, they are part and parcel of your body. They are not different from you. The same blood is running in his body. Similarly, our constitutional position is that the same blood of God is running in our body. We are not different in that way from God...Anu and vibhu. Vibhu means unlimited, and anu means limited. So we have got opulence, fame, beauty, strength, influence, knowledge, all good qualities that God has. But God has got in full, we have got in minute quantity...Qualitatively, we are one with God. Therefore our business is how to again unite with God qualitatively. That is the highest perfection of human life. And this chance of realization, how we can unite again with God or Krishna, is given only in the human form of life... The devotional service, love of Godhead is there, but to invoke it. This devotional service is not artificial. In every one of you there is dormant devotional service, as I have already explained, but they are exhibited in a different way. Instead of loving God, that devotional service is diverted in loving a dog. But the love is there. Love is there. Nitya-siddha Krishna-bhakti sadhya kabhu naya." (Lecture, SB 2.2.5 December 2, 1968, Los Angeles)

Lecture on SB 3.26.9; 21.12.1974. Quotes from Bhakti rasamrta sindhu: sea fishes never come to the river. River fishes sometime go to the sea. So living entities in the spiritual world never come to the material world.

From Wikipedia: European eel. The catadromous fishes are fishes that live in freshwater and migrate to the sea only to spawn. Few examples are the North American eel and the European eel. The European eel, *Anguilla anguilla* are generally believed to spawn in the Sargasso Sea (this is the vast area of the North Atlantic from the West Indies to the Azores that is dense with gulfweed), after which the adult eels die. The larvae (*Leptocephalus*) drift towards Europe in a three-hundred-day migration. When approaching the European coast the larvae metamorphose into a transparent larval stage called "glass eel", and enter estuaries (the wide part of a river where it nears the sea and the fresh and salt water mix) and start migrating upstream. After entering fresh water, the glass eels metamorphose into elvers, miniature versions of the adult eels. As the eel grows it becomes known as a "yellow eel" due to the brownish-yellow color of their sides and belly. After 5 - 20 years in freshwater the eels become sexually mature, their eyes grow larger, their flanks become silver and belly white in color. In this stage the eels are known as "silver eels", and they begin their migration back to the Sargasso sea to spawn.

Sometimes some fishes come to the river, similarly some souls, very few compared to the unlimited souls in the spiritual world, come down to the baked or condensed air, maya, illusion. The trillions souls fallen here compared to the unlimited souls in the spiritual world is only a few; thus such an event as falling out that has just one chance in 10^{50} is regarded by mathematicians as never happening. So practically no one falls.

Srila Prabhupada refers in this lecture to BRS 1.1.4. The comment by Srila Jiva Gosvami on this verse is:

"Devotees disregard the fear arising from time, which causes a succession of miseries through the bondage of birth and death, just as fish swimming in the deep ocean are free from the fear of the fisherman's nets."

This analogy can be taken in two ways:

- We can compare the fishes to the marginal living entities. If some of these fishes come up they can be caught and pulled out of the ocean. If the *tatastha jiva* remains deeply immersed in the ocean of love of God they will not fall but if they become envious or make offenses they fall.

- It can be taken that "the fish swimming in the deep ocean" are compared to the *Visnu* - and *sakti tattvas* who never come up into or close to *maya*. There is an eternal difference between and necessity of masters and servants. (CC *Adi-lila* 7.117 purport)

The fishes always close to the ocean surface can be caught by the fisherman. These then refer to the *tatastha jivas* who are always close to *maya* constitutionally. *Tatastha* means as the line at the beach between the water and the land; the soul is always close to *maya* and can fall into *maya*.

CC *Madhya* 20.108-109 purport: "There are two worlds...you are situated between...you have a relationship with both worlds."

This is simply an explanation of *tatastha* or margin. As the beach line is always between the water and the land, so the *tatastha sakti* is always between the material and spiritual world. "You are between the water and land" means that *tatastha jiva* is always in relation with the

spiritual and material energy as the tatastha line at the sea beach is always in contact with water and land. The sea is one world – the sea world. The land is the other world.

Jaiva dharma chapter 15 says "between the spiritual realm and material realm is the field of tatastha sakti."

Another translation of this passage is: "The cit sakti emanates (from the spiritual realm) the jiva sakti... in the marginal region between the spiritual and the material worlds, it manifests innumerable jivas."

I.o.w. the jiva sakti is the marginal world, the jiva is not matter nor spirit. The svarupa-sakti or sakti-tattva and Visnu-tattva are for example, spirit or cit, only. The jiva sakti, souls have their own realm or field and its qualities. This is also because in the chapter 13 (p. 203) the same speaker says: "Mahavisnu's glance manifests the material nature and is personified in the form of Garbhodakasayi Visnu. The entire mass of conditioned jivas are produced by His transcendental glance, Garbhodakasayi Visnu."

This means that the jiva sakti coming out of Maha-Visnu has no independence to, for example, see matter and spirit and choose one of them. The entire mass of souls is glanced into the brahmandas as and in Garbhodakasayi Visnu.

The created brahmanda's, universes, at that time of the creation only hollow shells, are in an inactive state for 1,000 years of the demigods (360.000 solar years) (SB 3.20.15)

Then Brahma is created on the top of the lotus flower growing from Garbhodakasayi Visnu. Brahma meditates for 1000 years of the demigods before he creates the bodies of the living entities. Then, for the first time, "those jivas who had lain dormant during the cataclysm (after the mahapralaya) were awakened." Brahma Samhita 5.20. The purport to this sloka is: The word "pratibudhyate" means "He awakened them from the sleep that begun with the destruction of the universe."

There is no description of another class of jivas, descending from the Brahman effulgence, entering Maha-Visnu and choosing matter or spirit. There are impersonalists falling from the brahmajyoti after having ascended there from the material worlds. They go directly down into the immobile species as trees, stones, diamonds (so they can still shine). Or they return to the human form they came from. They do not stopover at the border between matter and spirit.

The same for similar passages spoken by the same speaker in Jaiva dharma 12-16:

"The jiva sakti is situated or located at the borderline between the spiritual energy and material energy."

"At one side one finds the spiritual universe and at the other the phenomenal world...hence by nature the jiva is marginal."

This describes the nature or categories of realities just as in Tattva-Viveka:

"It should be understood that the jiva soul is neither produced of this material world, nor created in the transcendental world. They are originated from the marginal line between the transcendental and mundane spheres. (TV 2.5 by Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura, page 55)"

Here we have a translation saying "the souls are not manifested from the material world" not using the word 'created.' Then stating "souls are not manifested from the spiritual world but are manifested from the marginal energy".

This style of language we read often; it simply means that the souls are not spiritual energy (svarupa sakti), nor material energy, but tatastha sakti, which is a sub-category of the spiritual energy. 'Manifested' is not in terms of cause and effect; that the soul is created as clay is formed into a doll or pot. It means the soul is tatastha category. That is clear from TV 2.2 "Bhagavan's spiritual potencies manifest His spiritual abode, pastimes, paraphernalia... spiritual potency transforms into abode lila etc." His abode, lila, paraphernalia are eternal extensions. These are not created. The text 2.5 goes on: "from jiva-sakti the jivas manifest." Text 4 reads: "the souls are like particles of light that come from the Bhagavan sun." The conclusion is that souls are not manifested in the sense of created, but that they are eternal extensions. And they 'come from' or are marginal energy.

Now see the context to understand the origin of the soul appearing at the border. Also text 5, states "... souls who have turned their faces away from Bhagavan: (bhagavad-bahirmukha)." If this means the soul saw Bhagavan at the tatastha, and didn't see Bhagavan perfectly ("the weak position of santa-rasa") then he didn't get a fair choice; the soul falls with incomplete knowledge; Bhagavan is to be blamed for our fall-down. If the soul experienced Bhagavan fully and falls, then this is similar to the fall from the spiritual planets. So, one can't say that the origin of the soul is only tatastha or jyoti. One also should see the context of the rest of the chapter. In TV 2.1 it is written: "soul has spiritual knowledge as one of its natural features.....falls into the material world.....his original spiritual senses now deprived of their powers " i.o.w. the soul was developed, that was not in jyoti or karana ocean. This translation speaks of the original spiritual senses. "Original: means, according to the dictionary: "existing from the beginning, first, earliest." In the brahmayjoti the senses were not active. Later in TV 2.1 we read:..."when the soul becomes self-realized and his original nature is revived ...[he] can again perform all these activities with his original spiritual senses, [he] has again his original spiritual reasoning power." TV 2.8 "As he becomes purified, the soul realizes his original nature" TV 2.11 "...the soul is spiritual by nature, now it has forgotten its own nature".

The *original* nature in the Brahmayjoti fall theory is the spark-like contracted soul. That is the original form the soul had for eternity in the Brahman effulgence, so they think. They can't say the original form was the 'brief awakening of Krishna consciousness at the border' decree; that was only a second; "original" is the eternity before that time. According to this book, the original nature is Krishna consciousness.

That the origin is not the tatastha, but the spiritual planets is described in TV 2.12: "Why do the individual souls reside in this worthless place? The answer to this question is that the material world is an ancient prison for the individual souls who have turned their faces away from the Supreme Lord. Only the souls who have faces their away from the Supreme Lord enter the material world. The souls who do not turn their faces away from the Supreme Lord remain always free from the prison of matter. They do not enter the material world. They stay always in the spiritual world."

There is no border-fall here. Some souls who don't turn away, they stay in the spiritual world, but some turn away from residence in the spiritual world.

Text 2.12 ends with this same conclusion: "when they fall under Maya's spell, the individual souls think they themselves are the products of the material modes. Then they try to enjoy the pathetic pleasures the three material modes offer. That is the condition of the souls who have turned their faces away from the Supreme Lord. The other spirit souls, the souls who remain in the spiritual world, do not turn their faces away from the Supreme Lord. Only the souls who turn their faces away from the Supreme Lord leave the spiritual world and go to the world of matter." Thus, some souls don't go, but remain in the spiritual world and some leave the spiritual world.

It doesn't say they leave the border.

The same point about the original life of the soul in the spiritual world are in the following quotes.

In TV 1.3 we read : "the soul's original qualities are withdrawn and the specific mixture of qualities and an identity offered by maya are accepted by the soul."

TV 1.18 "Pure logic is present in the spirit soul in his original, pure nature. When the spirit soul is imprisoned in matter and his activities are mixed with material conceptions, then he possesses what I call mixed logic (misra-yukti)"

TV 1.20 "Pure spiritual logic is the natural endowment of the soul. Still, when he is imprisoned in the world of matter, the soul, always meditating on matter, thinks mixed logic is better...Arguing for a great variety of philosophies, as speaking in many different ways, mixed logic did not become happy. Then material logic began to hate itself...Talking and talking, material logic wept and lamented. It said, Alas! For how long have I labored in this external material world? I have fallen very far away from the soul, my eternal companion. I have rejected my own true nature."

TV 1.22 "Pure logic which takes shelter of the soul's natural knowledge is the proper tool to describe the Supreme Truth. Here someone may ask, "What is this natural knowledge of which you speak?" The answer is: "The soul is spiritual, and therefore naturally full of spiritual knowledge. That original knowledge possessed by the soul is called here natural knowledge. That natural knowledge is eternally present in the soul. It is not created by perceiving the contents of the material world. The activities of that natural knowledge are called pure logic. That natural knowledge was known by the soul before the soul ever had any knowledge of the material world."

This last point again rejects the border-fall-vada which believes that at the border the soul came to know for the first time material and spiritual knowledge. Because here Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura writes that the original spiritual eternal knowledge was long before that already with the soul. That means that the soul was on the spiritual planets, full of eternal knowledge and bliss.

Conclusion: This statement under discussion ('souls are not manifested from the material world. Neither are they manifested from the spiritual world. They are manifested from the border that separates those two worlds') states a philosophical principle; that there are 3 energies, and the souls are tatastha energy. In the whole book there is no statement that the

souls were eternally in the brahmayjoti as their original position, descend to the causal ocean and choose for Krishna or sense gratification.

Bonafide study rests the case- we fell from love

Srila Prabhupada said in his Srimad Bhagavatam 3. 16.26 purport that "no one falls from the spiritual world."

No one means no devotees descend. But "sometimes, as the Lord desires, devotees come into the material world as preachers (Lord Buddha) or atheists (like Jaya and Vijaya). Of course, the fools and crazies who disturb the society, friendship and love of Vaikuntha are to fall and will be imprisoned in the lunatic asylum of the material world. The context of this statement and purport should be studied. That rebels are expelled, Srila Prabhupada will state in SB. 3.16.35: "Here is clear proof of how a living entity coming originally from Vaikunthaloka (=planets) is engaged in material elements."

And in SB 3.16.37...will go back to Godhead, back to the Vaikuntha planets.

In the Vedabase we find this concept 6483 times.

back to Goloka Vrndavana – 11 times
back to Krishnaloka – 7 times
back to Krishna's loka, back to home – 1 time
go back to my planet – 6 time
back to the rasa dance – 9 times
go back to Jagannatha – 1
back to the Vaikuntha planets – 17 times
back to Krishna – 97 times
back to Krishna – 9 times
back to the kingdom of Krishna – 1 time
back to our eternal home in the kingdom of Krishna – 1 time
return to the kingdom of God – 8 times
back to the kingdom of God – 16 times
back to the kingdom of Godhead – 5 times
back to Godhead – 2921 times
back to home back to godhead – 970 times
return to the spiritual world – 8 times
back home – 691 times
back home back to godhead – 528 times
all spirit souls are coming from Vaikuntha – 1
back to home – 1137 times
back to our permanent home – 1 time
back to our original home, back to God – 2 time
back to our original home, back to Godhead – 1 time
back to the spiritual world – 21 times
back to Vaikuntha – 9 times
back to the Vaikuntha – 1 time

Srila Prabhupada uses these different terms but describes in these ways the same concept. For example, in the philosophy discussion on Schopenhauer Srila Prabhupada says:

"There are two kinds of sects: this Mayavadi and the Vaishnava. So both of them know that this material world is flickering, and sometimes they say it is false, unreal. So there is another

life; that is spiritual world. So the Mayavadi philosopher, their spiritual life means to merge into the Brahman effulgence, and the Vaishnava philosopher to go back to Goloka Vrindavana, Vaikuntha, where God is situated, and become His associate person. So both the ideas, spiritual ideas, that is attained after death.”

Back to Goloka Vrindavana where we came from.

In the same discussion he also says three times back to home, back to Godhead. Back to Godhead is thus very specific Krishna’s planet, Goloka Vrindavana. Not the outskirts of the brahmajyoti. See, the quotes from this discussion:

“If you simply try to have full knowledge about Krishna, then his willing, this material willing is purified, and after giving up this body he goes back to home, back to Godhead.”

“If I meet death in sound health, then I can think of my next life, go back to home, back to Godhead, and I achieve it. Because at the time of death my thinking will be taken into consideration. So if by thinking of Jagannatha if I die, then I go back to Jagannatha.

Hayagriva: Yes.

Prabhupada: That is not suicide. That is voluntarily accepting death so that immediately he can return back to the spiritual world.”

“Go back to Jagannatha” means we have fallen down from Jagannatha, we have not come originally from brahmajyoti.

“Return back to the spiritual world” means thus that we come originally from Narayana’s or Krishna’s loka (=planet) not from the brahmajyoti. Srila Prabhupada uses this word “returning” to our original position 3 times; “return back to the spiritual world” 2 times and “original position” 205 times.

In all his writings and speeches Srila Prabhupada uses the following list of words to describe the fall of the soul from the spiritual planets 12,557 times.

Forget Krishna or Krishna consciousness – 637; Forgotten – 674; Forgetful – 119; Forgetfulness – 315; Reclaim – 81; Regain – 89; Revival – 46; Revive – 407; Reinstate – 10; Renovate – 20; Averse – 73; Misuse his independence – 57; Reestablished – 20; Lost – 322; Paradise lost – 19; Dormant – 428; Disagreed – 6; Sleep – 58; Sleeping – 62; Awakened – 297; Imprisoned – 26; Prison – 88; Condemned – 86; Unfettered – 1; Regain – 89; falls down – 86; original Krishna consciousness – 581; original consciousness – 149; original position – 207; come down – 57; return – 171; recover – 25; revert – 15; reunion – 6; again (to Krishna or Krishna consciousness) – 68; fallen conditioned – 65; fallen souls – 465; Back to Krishna consciousness – 7; Back to Krishna – 99; Rebel – 11; Rebellious – 32; back to Goloka Vrindavana – 11; back to Krishna loka – 7; back to the rasa-lila – 9; go back to Jagannatha – 1; go back to my planet – 6; back to the Vaikuntha planets – 17; back to Krishna – 9 times; back to the kingdom of Krishna – 1 time; back to our eternal home in the kingdom of Krishna – 1 time; return to the kingdom of God – 8 times; back to the kingdom of God – 16 times; back to the kingdom of Godhead – 5 times; back to Godhead – 2921 times; back to home back to godhead – 970 times; return to the spiritual world – 8 times; back home – 691 times; back home back to godhead – 528 times; all spirit souls are coming from Vaikuntha – 1; back to home – 1137 times; back to our permanent home – 1 time; back to our original home, back to God – 2 time; back to our original home, back to Godhead – 1 time; back to the spiritual world – 21 times; back to Vaikuntha – 9 times; back to the Vaikuntha – 1 time.

In this SB 3.16.26 purport Srila Prabhupada discusses the descent or fall of devotees. The text translation makes this clear immediately.

Krishna speaks: “O Kumaras, know that the punishment inflicted on these two gatekeepers was originally ordained by Me and therefore these two (devotees, for pastimes) will “fall” to a birth in a demoniac family...”

Then the whole of the purport is explaining that the Lord wanted to sport, mock fight and to exercise the muscles. Srila Prabhupada jokingly explains to keep the body fit, to work out the muscles on a devotee taking the role of a demon. No one but a devotee can be a proper opponent; they have similar powers (see Brihad Bhagavamrta 2.4.200-201 / 1.3.45, 57)

Then Srila Prabhupada writes “that a devotee should come into an atheist family is surprising“ because “no one (of the devotees) falls from the Vaikuntha planets” but “sometimes, as the Lord desires devotees come into the material world...”

All the chapters and commentaries on this lila, explain fall-vada from the spiritual planets.

In SB 3.16.26 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti writes on the 4 Kumaras who offered 10 beautiful, prayers. They didn't know of the fighting rasa between the Lord and Jaya and Vijaya's expansions (the 2 Hiranyas, Ravana and Kumbhakarna, Sisupala and Dantavakra, Jagai and Madhai). But they know the philosophy of Krishna consciousness.

They thought: "Even the greatest devotees can fall from Vaikuntha because of great offense! What then to speak of where we, who are just dull reflections of sadhakas, can fall from this earth planet!"

Our comment: I.o.w it is common knowledge that devotees becoming demoniac fall from Vaikuntha-loka. As we here in our worlds know that if we do crime or break the law we get jail or a fine.

Srila Prabhupada in the purport to SB 3.15.33 writes:

“Just as there are different departments in each state in this material world—the civil department and the criminal department—so, in God's creation, there are two departments of existence. All living entities who are residents of the material universes are considered to be more or less criminals because they do not wish to abide by the order of the Lord or they are against the harmonious activities of God's will. The principle of creation is that the Supreme Lord, the Personality of Godhead, is by nature joyful, and He becomes many in order to enhance His transcendental joy. The living entities like ourselves, being part and parcel of the Supreme Lord, are meant to satisfy the senses of the Lord. Thus, whenever there is a discrepancy in that harmony, immediately the living entity is entrapped by maya, or illusion.”

“Discrepancy in that harmony of satisfaction and transcendental joy.”

This cannot refer to the causal ocean, as Brahmajyoti fall-vadis try to insert, because huge waves and mighty winds give no joyful harmonious home. The causal ocean is especially in a turmoil at the time of creation; millions of universes and souls come from Maha-Visnu's pores.

The subtle forms of all these souls and universes (golden cosmic eggs) enter the womb chamber of maya or causal ocean to be clothed or enveloped with the eight mundane elements (see Brahma-samhita text 13).

The conclusion is we left the civil department of God's kingdom for the criminal department, God's secondary kingdom.

“No one (of the devotees) falls from Vaikuntha”

The conclusion is that no one falls from Vaikuntha, we also read in SB 7.1.35 purport.

The chapter's subject is on Yudhisthira's cousins Sisupala and Dantavakra, who were formerly associates of Lord Visnu, falling from Vaikuntha to the material world, due to a curse by the Kumaras.

Then Yudhisthira inquires in text 34, how can devotees fall to this material world.

“Maharaja Yudhishtira inquired: What kind of great curse could affect even liberated vishnu-bhaktas, and what sort of person could curse even the Lord's associates? For unflinching devotees of the Lord to fall again to this material world is impossible. I cannot believe this.” (34)

“The bodies of the inhabitants of Vaikuntha are completely spiritual, having nothing to do with the material body, senses or life air. Therefore, kindly explain how associates of the Personality of Godhead were cursed to descend in material bodies like ordinary persons.” (35)

The conclusion is that it is impossible that unflinching ekantika devotees fall. Only rebels fall. Also, devotees cannot be cursed. Nor are there demons in the spiritual world who curse. No evil can happen to devotees. Only if they turn rebel, but then they are not unflinching devotees. For pastimes, as in the case of Jaya and Vijaya, can devotees come down.

One cannot take text 35 “the bodies of the Vaikuntha inhabitants are spiritual how they were cursed to descend in material bodies” to mean that spiritual bodies can't fall into material bodies.

Other translations of this verse also don't give this understanding.

Yudhisthira said: What kind of and whose curse was it that prevailed (even) against the servants of Lord Sri Hari? The incarnation of those exclusively devoted to Sri Hari appears as something incredible. (33)

Be pleased to narrate the episode connected with the corporeal existence of the denizens of Vaikunthapura (the abode of Lord Visnu), devoid (as they are) of a (material) body, indriyas and life-breath. (34) (SB by Gitapress)

33. It appears certainly incredible that those who are exclusively devoted to Hari, were compelled to be born again. Therefore (please tell us) whose curse it was and what was the nature of the imprecation which overpowered the servants of Hari.

34. The residents of the city or region called Vaikuntha are of pure sattvic form and are devoid of material body, senses and the like. You should narrate to us how it led to the assumption of corporeal existence (in the case of such residents of Vaikuntha). (Bhagavata Purana, Motilal edition by board of translators)

Sri Yudhishtira said: Who pronounced the curse against them which was so powerful that it could affect the downfall of the devotees of Lord Vishnu and what was the nature of that curse as it appears unthinkable? Be gracious to enlighten us in this matter that how those dwellers in Vaikuntha, who had no physical bodies and physical organs of sense and action, came to be saddled with corporeal bodies. 34-35 (SB by Bhakti Prajnana Yati)

The auspicious Yudhishtira asked:—Who was he that imprecated the said curse, and what was its nature that it was able to overpower even the servants of Lord Sri Hari? That even those worshippers of Lord Sri Hari, who adored Him with a singleness of purpose, were compelled to be born, seems un-worthy of belief. Thou ought to relate to us all, as to how they, the dwellers of excellent Vaikuntha and devoid of the material body, senses and life, became possessed of bodies. (SB by Sanyal)

Spiritual bodies can fall because even in Brahmajyoti-fall-vada the eternally folded up or contracted spiritual body is said to descend (sometimes, if the soul chooses for maya at the viraja-river) into a material body. This theory says the wrong choice at the border means the contracted body develops, sees Krishna, but then the soul prefers maya and becomes shrunk and dormant again.

And even those who developed their spiritual body (their nitya svarupa) dwell in (spiritualized) material bodies. So those with a spiritual body in Vaikuntha can descend in material bodies.

Thus the inquiry is on how spirit can be incorporated into matter and on how devotees can fall for the material world. The conclusion is that devotees don't fall, rebels fall. That rebels in the spiritual world are imprisoned in the prison house (=Durga) of the material world is already understood from previous purports.

In SB 7.1.25 purport Srila Prabhupada says:

“...takes the conditioned soul back home, back to Godhead and...Vritrasura was taken back to Godhead.

...and a demon or conditioned soul becomes completely pure, the Lord takes him back to Godhead.”

SB 7.1.26 purport:

“...Jaya Vijaya...then returned home, back to Godhead. They came from the Vaikuntha planets and they returned home, back to Godhead.”

Similarly the conditioned souls, described in the purport before 7.1.25 came from that home, the spiritual planets and went back to their home.

Later in 7.1.26 purport again he says about conditioned souls:

“...desire to return home, back to Godhead.”

And in 7.1.33 purport he writes:

“...Sisupal and Dantavakre were formerly personal associates of Lord Visnu. They apparently fell to this material world, but actually they came to assist Krishna in His pastimes.”

“Apparently they fell to this material world.” This is ABCD.

As all souls we find in this world have fallen down; from above down; because renegades are send off or out to the penal colony of the material world. But no, not these ones, they came to assist Krishna in His pastimes.

And in the previous verse to 7.1.33, in 7.1.32 he translates:

“for unflinching devotees of the Lord to fall again to this material world I can't believe.”

“Fall again” means they already once had fallen down. They had returned. To fall again is unbelievable. I.o.w the soul can fall away one time, easily or generally from the spiritual world. But once burnt twice shy. Who would go again into the nightmare of the material world.

Then in the purport he repeats this point:

“...he was surprised that a pure devotee could return to this material world.”

“...one purified returns home, back to Godhead.”

And in this 7.1.35:

“Associates of Lord Visnu who descend from Vaikuntha do not actually fall” as associates who became rebels actually fall.

It is understood from this sentence phrased like this that fall does take place but associates of Lord Visnu, who remain servants, do not fall.

In the purport to 7.1.35 Srila Prabhupada writes that “associates of the Lord Visnu who descend from Vaikuntha don’t actually fall. They come with the purpose of fulfilling the desires of the Lord...When Jaya and Vijaya descend, there was something to be done for Krishna. Otherwise it is a fact that no one (of the Lord’s associates, who don’t become envious, – ed.) falls from Vaikuntha.” How can it be otherwise. Srila Prabhupada explains the fall of the soul 1000’s of times.

This “otherwise it is a fact that no one falls from Vaikuntha,” Srila Prabhupada faithfully repeats from the verse - loyal associates don’t fall -. He again repeats this at the end of the purport to SB 7.1.35.

“...Jaya and Vijaya descended to the material world to serve the Lord by fulfilling His desire to fight. Otherwise that an unflinching servant of the Lord could fall from Vaikuntha seems unbelievable, as Maharaja Yudhishtira says, asraddheya ivabhati harer ekantinam.” Because ekantika unflinching servants don’t fall. But, of course, demons are exiled, rascals are kicked out.

So, this verse means ekantika one-minded unflinching devotees don’t fall. Those who don’t want to surrender any longer to ekala isvara Krishna the only Lord Krishna, fall from grace.

Yuddhistira knows that spiritual bodies get contracted and in this way the spiritual bodies, 1/10000 part of the tip of the hair (kesagra-sata-bhagasya), as a small spiritual atom get into a material body. Of course, the soul is spiritual and of another dimension; it fits everywhere in matter. Yuddhistira asks this question to Narada Muni on behalf of the common, ignorant man, to be published and broadcasted in the Bhagavatam. How spiritually developed big bodies get into small baby bodies.

Back to Godhead means back to the Head God, Krishna.

So says His Divine Grace Srila Prabhupada, savior of the whole world, in a lecture on SB 1.5.29 in Vrindavana (10-8-74).

Here is the context:

“So we are atma, and Krishna is also atma. But He is Paramatma. We are isvara. Krishna is also isvara. But He's Paramesvara. Therefore we have named "Godhead" purposefully, not "God." We don't say "Back to God." We say, "Back to Godhead." "Head" means the chief. Everyone can claim that "I am God," because everyone has got some power, little power. But not the supreme power. That is Krishna.”

Thus when Srila Prabhupada uses the terms
back to the kingdom of Godhead – 5 times
back to Godhead – 2921 times
back to home back to Godhead – 970 times
back home back to Godhead – 528 times
back to our original home, back to Godhead – 1 time
return back to Godhead 7 times,
return to Godhead 37 times,
back to the Brahmajyoti – 0 time
back to Brahman – 0 time
all together 4469 times in the Vedabase he means back to Krishna, the Head or Chief God.

The head or chief God is Krishna, not Maha-Vishnu, nor Krishna's energies, nor Krishna's effulgence, the brahmajyoti.

This lecture is about Krishna, the adi-purusam. He speaks about Krishna in Vrindavana. “When Krishna is in the Battlefield of Kurukshetra, He's Vasudeva. Krishna does not go away from Vrindavana. But when He has got other business to do, He does it as Vasudeva. Vasudeva is in Mathura. Vasudeva is in Dvaraka. But original Krishna is in Vrindavana.”

Then he quotes:

diparcir eva hi dasantaram abhyupetya
...
govindam adi-purusham tam aham bhajami

advaitam acyutam anadim ananta-rupam
..
govindam adi-purusham tam aham bhajami

isvarah paramah krishnah
sac-cid-ananda-vigraha
anadir adir govindah
sarva-karana-karanam

Then he says, we don't say “back to God” we say “back to Godhead,” “Head” means the chiefthat is Krishna.”

Then he quotes

mattah parataram nanyat

param brahma param dhama

Thus when Srila Prabhupada says 4469 times that the souls have to go back to Godhead, he means we have fallen down from Krishna, Govinda, adi-purusam on Krishna's planet and have to go back to Krishna's lila on Krishna loka, Goloka Vrindavana.

Srila Prabhupada explains the same in other places.

He uses the term "The Godhead" 206 times, meaning Krishna.

"Why the government is spending so much money, maintaining so many building? Simply queen's palace, that Buckingham, that is sufficient? No. There must be departments. So these are departments, this brahmana, this kshatriya, the vaisyas, the sudras. Just like in your body there are departments. This department, brain, head. Therefore it is called head, head office, head office. Why do you refer to the head office? It has come from this head. Why Godhead? The Supreme Godhead, the Supreme. Therefore we say, "Godhead. That is described in the Bhagavad-gita. Mattah parataram nanyat kincid asti dhananjaya: [Bg. 7.7] "There is no more superior person than Me." (Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.10.4, London, November 25, 1973)

The Godhead is Krishna. Nowhere he ever said "back to the brahmajyoti."

One challenge was that 'Godhead' means anywhere in Transcendence, thus Back to Godhead can mean we come from Brahman, and we go to Krishna, back home.

In the following conversation Srila Prabhupada states that the Brahmajyoti is full of impersonalists, who " have become liberated" from the material world. It is not a reservoir of 'new' souls who from there for the first time go to matter or Krishna.

Revatinandana: You very clearly explained to me once in a letter that if the spirit soul then goes into the brahma-jyotir, he is considered still fallen. Still fallen. Does that means the whole brahma-jyotir is composed of fallen souls? You see my question? If I go there, I'm a jiva soul, and I go to the brahma-jyotir I'm still fallen.

Prabhupada: Yes.

Revatinandana: That means all jiva souls there are also fallen souls.

Prabhupada: Yes.

...

Revatinandana: The thing that was bothering me when I thought of this, that the brahma-jyotir, if it is jivas, that they're all fallen souls, then I thought...

Prabhupada: Fallen anywhere. When Krishna is forgotten, that is fallen.

Revatinandana: Yes. But what I thought was just like in a room there is so many particles of light. Already inconceivable. And, then the whole brahma-jyotir is all fallen souls, and they become so inconceivable...

Prabhupada: Not so fallen as they are in the matter.

Syamasundara: Yes. Separated.

Revatinandana: But not in their constitutional position.

Prabhupada: They're not as fallen as those who are in this material.

Revatinandana: That's right. But still if they go there, they will sometimes come back here again.

Prabhupada: Yes. They are not pure. They are not pure. That is stated in the Bhagavata. Avisuddha-buddhayah [SB 10.2.32]. Avisuddha. Avisuddha means not purified.

Revatinandana: Are they less fallen because they are doing some service by lighting it up?

Prabhupada: It is clearly stated: avisuddha-buddhayah. Avisuddha. Buddhi means intelligence, avisuddha means unclean, contaminated.

Revatinandana: Unclean intelligence. So they realize...

Prabhupada: They think that they have become liberated, but sastra says "No, it is not yet liberated." Avisuddha-buddhayah. Still there is contamination.

Revatinandana: I see. It was just making my head spin to think of so many fallen souls. If there they also, to some extent they also fall. Here there are so many fallen souls. Then...

Prabhupada: Ananta. You cannot say how many. Ananta. Anantaya kalpate. Ananta means unlimited number. There is no question of counting.

Syamasundara: Our brain is so tiny.

Revatinandana: Yes.

Prabhupada: Therefore acintya. Therefore acintya, inconceivable.

(Room Conversation—August 17, 1971, London)

Our comment: Time is eternal, the material world is eternal - eternally coming and going-, thus, according to one reasoning, we can say, there is time enough to fill up the infinite brahmayjoti with impersonalists.

Alternatively, this is eternally the best possible world.; the perfect set up of the infinity.

In the next quote he confirms: "...those who are outside the localized aspect and personal aspect of Krishna, those who are in the sunshine portion, or in the effulgent portion... Effulgence means minute particles of the soul assemble together, just like the sunshine is the combination of molecular shining parts. Similarly, we spiritual sparks, when we simply congregate one place, that is called brahmayjoti. In that portion, because they have no information about the personality of Godhead, they are envious. Therefore, because the spirit soul by nature wants pleasure...Just like if you remain... Suppose you go with your sputnik or aeroplane very high in the sky. If you don't get a shelter in another platform or another planet, you come down again. You cannot remain there. Similarly, in our impersonal feature we cannot remain. And why we remain in the impersonal nature? Because we have no information of the Supreme Personality. So this is the position. So because they cannot remain in that impersonal feature they come down again to these material varieties of life. That is called envious. Enviousness means because they have no knowledge they say, "No. The Supreme Absolute Truth cannot be person." That is enviousness. That is enviousness. Why the Supreme Personality should be impersonal? No. He is person, but we have no sufficient information of Him; therefore we are envious. Defying. Impersonalist is the person who is defying personalism. The impersonalist, they will never agree that this Absolute Truth is person. That is enviousness. Therefore they fall down. aruhya kricchrena param padam tatah patanty adho [SB 10.2.32] Patanty adho—falls down, because he is impersonal. Just like in the sky, in the outer space you cannot build anything. If you want to construct anything—nice house, nice garden—you have to come to this planet. Similarly those who are impersonalists, they cannot have varieties of enjoyment; therefore they come down again on this material platform and they use their intellect for philanthropic or humanitarian work. Again they become entrapped by philosophy and knowledge and so on. Actually the sum and substance is those who are impersonalist, they are envious. Impersonalists are on the spiritual platform, but because they are envious of the Supreme Person, they fall down to the material world. (760506LE-HONOLULU - May 06, 1976)

Comment. Brahman is full of envious souls. It is not the original position. Why would Parabrahman have expanded an unlimited realm of demons. Still, the Vaikuntha planets are bigger: "Madhudvisa: ...comprised of spirit souls, unlimited amounts of shining spirit souls?"

Prabhupada: Yes. Combination.

Madhudvisa: Combination. Of something else besides...?

Prabhupada: Impersonalists, they do not accept personal feature. Means they fall down again.

Madhudvisa: That means there must be a lot of impersonalists.

Prabhupada: Hmm?

Madhudvisa: It seems there would be a lot of impersonalists.

Prabhupada: No. More than them, there are personalists. They are in Vaikunthaloka.

Back to the back to Godhead subject. The next quote confirms that Godhead means Krishna:

“Guest: How do you feel about self-expression, art, as a path back to Godhead?”

Prabhupada: Back to Godhead means God is a person, a person like you and me. Just like your father is a person. That is a practical knowledge. Your father's father is also a person. His father is also a person. His father is also a person...Therefore the supreme father must be a person. .. God is called supreme father...But because here we are in this material world, material world means where God is forgotten. That is called material world. In this temple we are not in the material world. We are not in New York. We are in Vaikuntha. Because we have not forgotten Krishna. Yes. That is the definition given by the Vedic literature. Transcendental. Anyone who's living within this temple... I'll give you one example. Just like if a ship comes from foreign country, that ship may be within the border of your country, or within your country—that ship is not within the law of your country. The ambassadors, the embassies, they are not within the law of USA. I give you some practical example. Similarly, anyone who is engaged in Krishna's service, anyplace it may be, that spot is not within the material world. That is transcendently situated. So for practical going back to Godhead, you come to our temple. That's all. You'll never forget Krishna. You'll be engaged in the service of Krishna. Therefore you'll live in Vaikuntha or Vrindavana. This is the easiest process of going back to Godhead. And then, after death, surely you're going to Vaikuntha or Krishnaloka. Hare Krishna. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 6.1.11, New York, July 25, 1971)

The phrase ‘love of Godhead’ is used by Srila Prabhupada, see the vedabase, 1005 times. Love of Godhead, of course, means love of Krishna not love of the brahmayjoti. Thus when Srila Prabhupada says ‘back home, back to Godhead’ he means back to the life of love of Krishna, on Krishna’s planet.

“One who is thus drawn to the Krishna consciousness movement and tries to keep himself in constant touch with such consciousness certainly gets the supreme salvation, going back to Krishna in Goloka Vrindavana.” (Krishna book ch 90)

Also Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura says so, for example

“Sri Caitanya Candra is Krishna Himself. He is the Godhead.

The whole ecstatic centre is in Godhead” (The Constitutional Function Of The Soul Lecture 2nd Kartik, 1928, Friday Afternoon)

“Question: I cannot understand this world.

Answer: It is camp life. This world is not our original abode. It is meant for certain purposes. After that we are to proceed to our original home. This world is not a desirable place. It is not good to be enticed to stay here for a long time, forgetting our original abode. We stay there with Godhead. We are the eternal servants of Godhead. But the real truth is that we are to serve Godhead in the five different capacities. It is only when we deem it fit to come down to this world to lord it over other finite entities for our enjoyment that our real position happens to be forgot to some extent. This contingency arises when we want to deprive our Lord.” (Forgetfulness of the Humanists, an article originally published in The Harmonist on Sept 19th, 1934 - Vol XXI No.2)

Comment: We were originally in our original home or abode, with the Godhead. This is our real eternal position. Then we wanted to deprive our Lord and deemed it fit to come down to this world. We don't come originally from the Brahman effulgence.

Also for Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura Godhead is Krishna, not the Brahmajyoti:

“We make no objection if the reader does not believe His miracles, as miracles alone never represent the Godhead.” (BhT, Sri Caitanya – His Life & Precepts, The Life of Sri Caitanya Mahaprabhu)

“Sankara’s teachings are explained in different ways. Some say that the world and the jiva have emanated from God, and others establish that the jiva and the world are but developments of the Godhead. Sankara, in order to avoid brahma-parinama (transformation of the Godhead into the world) theorizes that Srila Vyasadeva teaches us vivartavada (that God undergoes no change whatsoever, but it is maya that covers a part of the Supreme, just as a pot encloses a part of the sky); or that God is reflected on avidya or ignorance, while in fact nothing other than God has yet come into existence. (BhT, Sri Caitanya – His Life & Precepts, His Precepts)

And they also use the term ‘love of Godhead’ all the time.

Silly, so foolish, insane, mad, proud devils, rebels, criminals, rascals fall.

One challenge was that how we can say the mukta can become mad, fool, rascal and so on. Here we will explain.

Srila Prabhupada uses the analogy of the material world as the prison-house for the condemned soul often, and describes the same; as the police puts a criminal in prison, so the soul is imprisoned.

See the BhaktiVedantavedabase. The relevant quotes are

Imprisoned – 26

Prison – 88

Rebel – 11

Rebellious – 32

prison-house - 190

jail - 200

“Dr. John Mize: The question that bothers me in part is then why would the soul... Because I understand your conception that the soul is part of the spiritual sky originally or part of God, and it somehow falls out of this blissful condition due to pride, much like the Christian thesis

that the devil fell out of heaven due to pride. And it seems puzzling why the soul would be so silly, so foolish, so insane, as to do such a thing.

Prabhupada: That is his independence.... A son's duty is to obey the father. But he may not obey. That is his madness. So when the soul, misusing the independence, becomes mad, he is sent in this material world.

Dr. John Mize: It is puzzling to me that one would be so foolish.

Prabhupada: Because by independence you can become foolish. if you say, "Why the soul should become so foolish?" So that is misuse of independence. Intelligent father has got intelligent son, but sometimes he becomes a fool. So what is the reason? He is the part and parcel of the father. He should have become exactly like the father. But he does not become like the father. I have seen. In Allahabad was a big lawyer, barrister, Mr. Bannerjee. His eldest son was also barrister and his youngest son, on account of bad association, he became a ekala wala. Ekala means... In India there is a carriage drawn by one horse. So he liked to be an ekala. That means he fell in love, a low class of woman, and by her association, he became an ekala. There are many instances. The Ajamila upakhyana. He was a brahmana and then he fell down very low. So this misuse of independence is always there....

Bahulasva: Srila Prabhupada, in our material contaminated state when we act in a foolishly or mad, then we call that tamas, or our ignorance, but in the spiritual sky when the living entity is in his pure state of consciousness, what acts... Does something act upon him to make him illusioned at that point also?

Prabhupada: Yes. Just like Jaya-Vijaya. They committed offense. They did not allow the four Kumaras to enter. That was their fault. And the Kumaras became very sorry. Then they cursed him that "You are not fit to remain in this place." So we sometimes commit mistake. That is also misuse of independence. Or we are prone to fall down because we are small. Just like small fragment of fire. Although it is fire, it is prone to be extinguished. The big fire does not extinguish. So Krishna is the big fire, and we are part and parcel, sparks, very small. So within the fire there are sparks, "Fut, Fut!" There are so many. But if the sparks fall down, then it is extinguished. ...

Dr. John Mize: Did all the souls that were in the spiritual sky fall out of the spiritual sky at once or at different times, or are there any souls that are always good, they're not foolish, they don't fall down?

Prabhupada:... Just like in the prison house, there are some population, but they are not majority. The majority of the population, they are outside the prison house. Similarly, majority of living being, part and parcel of God, they are in the spiritual world. Only a few falls down.

Dr. John Mize: Are more souls falling all the time?

Prabhupada: Not all the time. But there is the tendency of fall down, not for all, but because there is independence... Everyone is not liking to misuse the independence. The same example: Just like a government constructing a city and constructs also prison house because the government knows that somebody will be criminal. So their shelter must be also constructed. It is very easy to understand. Not that cent percent population will be criminal, but government knows that some of them will be. Otherwise why they construct prison house also? One may say, "Where is the criminal? You are constructing..." Government knows, there will be criminal. So if the ordinary government can know, why God cannot know? Because there is tendency.

Dr. John Mize: The origin of that tendency is...?

Prabhupada: Yes.

Dr. John Mize: From where does that tendency come?

Prabhupada: Tendency means the independence. So everyone can know that independence means one can use it properly, one can misuse it. That is independence. If you make it one way only, that you cannot become fall down, that is not independence. That is force. Therefore Krishna says, yathēcchasi tatha kuru. "Now you do whatever you like." (Conversation, Los Angeles, June 23, 1975)

Our comment: as the devil fell out of heaven due to pride, we fell out of heaven. We became silly, foolish, insane, mad.

“A boy is very rich man's son. But still, he thinks "Why shall I live under the rules and regulations of my father? Let me go out. I shall enjoy life freely." Freely, what freedom? You are already rich man's son. You can enjoy the property of your very, very rich powerful father, and what independence you will enjoy? This is criminality. This is criminality. We are sons of God, part and parcels of God, and God means almighty. So we have got almighty father, and leaving His place, I have come to this material world to enjoy independently. That is criminality. And we are suffering. That is explained here: prakṛiti-stha, "being placed in this material world," puruṣha, bhunkte prakṛiti-jaṅ gūna, "He is enjoying, but enjoying the quality of the modes of material nature." (Bg. lecture, Melbourne, June 27, 1974)

Our comment: we become criminals; we fall.

“...the instruction of Bhagavata is, "Just try to revive your lost relationship with God, or Krishna." That relationship is never extinguished, but sometimes it is covered. Just like a crazy boy forgets his father and mother and home, goes away. But the relationship between the son and the parents cannot be lost. As soon as the son comes back, the parents receive him very nicely. Similarly, we are all sons of the Supreme Lord. We have forgotten our father, we have forgotten our relationship, and we are loitering in this material world as helpless, and if we revive our consciousness, our Krishna consciousness, that "My home is in the spiritual world. I am a foreigner in this material world..." Just like a foreigner is traveling from one place to another, similarly, I am also changing my body from one body to another, one planet to another. But there is no permanent settlement anywhere in this material world. This is our condition.

So Krishna consciousness means to be rightly situated in the original consciousness that we are all sons of God, Krishna. We have got eternal relationship with Him and He is the richest, the most opulent. As a rich man's son has no scarcity, no want, everything is supplied amply... Just like the Americans, they are... American or many other Western countries, the young men, they belong to a rich nation, so practically they have no want. But still why they are becoming hopeless and confused? Because this material want is not all. There is spiritual want. Unless that spiritual want is fulfilled, unless that spiritual relationship is reestablished, nobody can be happy. So in order to make us happy, Krishna says that "Begin with little flower, little water, or little fruit, and try to offer Me." (Bhag. lecture, Montreal, August 17, 1968)

Our comment: we became crazy and had to go.

“The soul, part and parcel of God, wanted to imitate God's supremacy, and they wanted to enjoy. But in the spiritual world there cannot be second enjoyer. The only enjoyer is Krishna. Bhoktaram sarva-loka, bhoktaram sarva-yajnanam sarva-loka... He is the supreme proprietor, supreme being. In the dictionary you will find, "the supreme being." "Supreme being" means nobody can be equal to Him, nobody can be greater than Him. That is, means supreme. So

how one can become an imitator of Krishna? That is not possible. That imitation is possible here in this material world, because they are all rascals. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.16.19, Los Angeles, July 9, 1974)

Arnold Weiss: In the beginning, when we were first part of God.. our souls are also part of God, as a drop of water is part of that ocean...Is there any knowledge or information of how we incurred this first separation from God?

Prabhupada: Separation... Generally, when we want to become God, there is separation.

Arnold Weiss: A rebellion.

Prabhupada: You cannot... There is one God, and if you want to become God, you are immediately driven away: "Just become God in the material world. Go there and try to become God."

Dr. Wolfe: Prabhupada? There is a parallel in the Bible that Lucifer broke away from God because He wanted to be God.

Prabhupada: That's it. (laughs) This rascaldom... This rascaldom makes him a dog. Instead of God, he become a dog. (Conversation—June 9, 1976, Los Angeles)

Our comment: rascals, dogs are driven out of the spiritual world.

“We are put into this prison house, all these rebelled souls, this prison house, this material world.. Just like in the jail, the population in the jail is very small in comparison to the population of the city.

Similarly, within this material world, all the living entities, they are all conditioned, very limited number. The unlimited number are there in the spiritual world.

Now we are under the control of this external energy, material energy. We have become controlled, just like we become controlled by the prison authorities when we are criminals...

We are jivera svarupa haya nitya-Krishna-dasa [Cc. Madhya 20.108-109], eternally servant of Krishna. So as soon as we accept it and engage ourself in the service of the Lord, that is our liberated position. Then we, again, we become nitya-mukta. We revive our original condition of life. Original condition means ever liberated. Ordinarily we are free. Those who are not within the walls of prison house, they are free. They are acting freely, wherever they like they are going, but within the law. Similarly we have got freedom. There are living entities, their number is greater. They live in the spiritual world, Vaikuntha planets...And we are nitya-baddha-ever conditioned, eternally conditioned...

We cannot be eternally conditioned, because we are part and parcel of Krishna. .. But because we wanted to imitate Krishna, we wanted to become Krishna...Krishna is the supreme proprietor. Therefore He is the supreme enjoyer”. (Bhag. lecture, Mayapur, June 20, 1973)

Our comment: Rebels and criminals are put in the prison.

One quarter prison

The question was asked: “the material world, the prison, is 25 %, so many are in jail?”

This ‘one quarter’ is maya, is a quantitative idea of ekapada - tripada vibhuti. The qualitative meaning is given in Laghu Bhagavatamrta, that the Lord has 4 divisions of vibhuti or excellences: the spiritual energy of the spiritual world – the svarupa-sakti, the Brahmajyoti, the marginal energy and the material world. Or also we read 1. His original form, 2. the forms of His direct expansions, 3. the individual spirit souls, and 4. the world of matter.

tripad-vibhuter dhamatvat tripadbhutam tu tat padam
vibhutih mayiki sarva prokta padatmikayatah

Vaikuntha is called tripad-bhutam because it is the abode which possess three portions of power. All the powers of the material realm are called only one portion.

Commentary – Sri Baladeva vidyabhusana

When Vaikuntha is described as tripad-bhutam it means that the material powers of the material realm consisting of one pad or segment, do not exist in Vaikuntha. (Rupa Gosvami–Laghu Bhagavatamrta 5.286)

Why leave perfection

From the viewpoint of the prisoner the prison is imperfect. But from the viewpoint of the government and the righteous citizens this is perfect.

“The kingdom of God has spiritual varieties. They are not variety-less. Otherwise, the Lord would not have said that samstha. There is a regular establishment...We are all belonging to that establishment, but being forgetful, we are now in this material world. Just like sometimes some of us become crazy and have to go to the lunatic asylum, similarly, those who become crazy, such spiritual identities, they are put into this lunatic asylum. It is called material world”. (Srila Prabhupada’s lecture on Bg 6.11-21)

This world is the reflection of the spiritual world. “As here so there.” Here monarchy is the best political system.

A perfect kingdom has freedom for the citizens. Else the residents would be robots, machines. There cannot be love from robots who have no personal desire, individuality and free choice.

A perfect kingdom needs a prison. It is a natural part of a perfect kingdom. Even Ramaraja had prisons. In Sri Brihad Bhagavatamrta we see that there are armies and army commanders in the spiritual world. They can put a criminal into the Durga or prison of the material world:

Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.1.18: "The many kinds of Vaikuntha perfection... being posted as commander of the Lord's army"

Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.4.29: "These Vaikuntha residents whom Gopa-kumara saw entering the gateway last were army commanders and other important authorities, returning late because they had been busy with various responsibilities outside."

So one does not fall from perfection. One falls within perfection, to another part of the complete perfect whole- the prison house of Durga mata.

If yogamaya can be active in the material world (as mahamaya), why can't mahamaya be active in the spiritual world (and take the rebel jiva out). After all, mahamaya is an eternal associate and amsa of yogamaya. Yogamaya is the almighty Lord's energy. She can call her servants or amsa mahamaya or another amsa into action at any time, as the police can enter the king's palace to seize an envious servant.

The question may come: “Why we choose to leave perfection”. The spiritual world is perfect but we are not perfect because we are not part of the spiritual world. We are eternally marginal energy, tatastha sakti. The spiritual saktis or sakti tattvas of Krishna never fall, nor the Visnu tattvas.

In the words of Bhaktivinoda Thakura the jiva is apurna sakti, not perfect or complete. (purna=complete)

The soul is tatastha-sakti, marginal.

Marginal means as the line (=tatastha or margin) at the beach between the water and the land, which is always in contact with the water and the land. Similarly, the tatastha or marginal energy, the soul in the spiritual world is potentially always in contact with the material energy, meaning it can always fall under kAma (lust), lobha (greed), krodha (anger), mada (madness), moha (illusion), matsarya (envy).

Politics

On 'tricky preaching' of our acarya's that 'the soul falls from Goloka'.

Srila Prabhupada, Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura and Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura never said clearly somewhere in their books and lectures that they used "preaching tactics" and "false children stories", when writing about the origin of the soul. Studying their works we can see they only spoke fall of the soul from the spiritual planets, and never this Brahman-patita-vada.

Thus according to this 'preaching tactic' theory they only spoke "preaching tactic" and 'false baby stories'. This theory is only some childish prattle.

On books higher than lectures, letters, conversations.

Did Srila Prabhupada say somewhere explicitly that "when I speak in the dictaphone (from his lotus mouth) in the morning hours, my Bhaktivedanta purports that is higher than when I speak (from his same lotus mouth) later in the morning the Bhagavatam lecture and higher than when I speak (from his same lotus mouth) my letters to my secretary and higher than when I speak with visitors in the afternoon (conversations) (from his same lotus mouth).

When he spoke the following letter to Revatinanda dasa, he knew that Revatinanda would speak it in lectures. And the letters of Srila Prabhupada were already at that time circulating all over the ISKCON society.

"The next question, about the living entities falling down in this material world are not from the impersonal brahman. Existence in the impersonal brahman is also within the category of non-Krishna consciousness. Those who are in the brahman effulgence they are also in the fallen condition, so there is no question of falling down from a fallen condition. When fall takes place, it means falling down from the non-fallen condition. The non-fallen condition is Krishna consciousness. So long one can maintain pure Krishna consciousness he is not fallen down. As soon as he becomes out of Krishna consciousness immediately he is fallen down." (Srila Prabhupada Letter, June 13, 1970)

Hare Krishna.

Lost paradise football

In the Srimad Bhagavatam lecture 1.7.16, Vrndavana, Srila Prabhupada explains that some fell down from playing football in Krishna-loka.

"....so long the spark is within the fire, it has got the same quality, illumination and burning quality. But as soon as he falls down- he is extinguished, no more illumination, no more burning power. So our position is like that. Although we are part and parcel of God, mamaivamso [Bg. 15.7], because we have cyuta, fallen down from our spiritual atmosphere...Just like spiritual atmosphere, Krishna's friends, cowherd boys, they're playing with Krishna. That is also playing. And here in this material world the boys they also play football play. But these two plays are different. One is spiritual and another is material...There are three chances. One chance is the spark falls down on dry grass-then there is fire. As soon as the spark falls down on the dry grass there is fire for some time. And when the spark falls down on the ground, it is extinguished. And when the fire, spark, falls down on the water, then it is not only extinguished; it becomes no more inflammable. Very difficult to inflame. Similarly, when we fall down from the fire, spiritual world, we associate with three qualities."

In Srimad Bhagavatam 10.11.39 it says

“Sometimes Krishna and Balarama would play on Their flutes, sometimes They would throw ropes and stones devised for getting fruits from the trees, sometimes They would throw only stones, and sometimes, Their ankle bells tinkling, They would play football with fruits like bael and amalaki. Sometimes They would cover Themselves with blankets and imitate cows and bulls and fight with one another, roaring loudly, and sometimes They would imitate the voices of the animals. In this way They enjoyed sporting, exactly like two ordinary human children.”

(Myrobalans = amalaki; woodapples = bael)

These lilas are in unlimited varieties because these lilas are the cause of the wide variety of sports here in the material world.

“Urdhvam mulam” (Bg 15.1), the original fruit tree has the fruit not the reflection in the water; the sports in the spiritual world are superior to the ones in the material world.

In SB 10.18.16 it says: “In this way Krishna and Balarama played all sorts of well-known games as They wandered among the rivers, hills, valleys, bushes, trees and lakes of Vrindavana.”

Next Srila Prabhupada explains how a devil player gets a red card, and is immediately driven away from the game. He missed the goal of the game: to please Krishna.

Arnold Weiss: In the beginning, when we were first part of God.. our souls are also part of God, as a drop of water is part of that ocean...Is there any knowledge or information of how we incurred this first separation from God?

Prabhupada: Separation... Generally, when we want to become God, there is separation.

Arnold Weiss: A rebellion.

Prabhupada: You cannot... There is one God, and if you want to become God, you are immediately driven away: "Just become God in the material world. Go there and try to become God."

Dr. Wolfe: Prabhupada? There is a parallel in the Bible that Lucifer broke away from God because He wanted to be God.

Prabhupada: That's it. (laughs) This rascaldom... This rascaldom makes him a dog. Instead of God, he become a dog. ..Nobody can become God; God is one. Ekam brahma dvitiam nasti. So how we can become God? But that endeavor is going on.

Arnold Weiss: Isn't it within the nature of our souls to have...

Prabhupada: That is the nature, little independence. That is the nature. You can properly use independence, and you can improperly use. That is the meaning of independence. That you can use it improperly. Then you suffer. That is the meaning of independence. If it is that I have got independence and - I cannot use it otherwise - that is not independence. (Conversation—June 9, 1976, Los Angeles)

One may wonder how is it I don't remember these ecstatic sports.

Here is the answer:

"Just like in Los Angeles. When I am in tour in other places I forget about Los Angeles, but as soon as I come here, I know where is my bedroom, where is my sitting room, where is my garden, immediately. I haven't got to be taught that "Here is your sitting room, here is your sleeping room." Immediately, I remember.

Ramesvara: But then there is an argument, if we were originally in the spiritual world, why don't we remember that and try to go back to the spiritual world?

Prabhupada: That I have already said, that when I am in tour in Europe and India, I completely forget about Los Angeles. I act according to the circumstances there. And again when I come to Los Angeles, I immediately remember. This is natural. Out of sight, out of mind." (Conversation, June 8, 1976, Los Angeles)

In the philosophy discussions on Plotinus, Srila Prabhupada confirms that we souls played false, lost paradise and fell out to Maha-Visnu's srsti-lila to play fool in different prison suits labeled Brazil, UK, Germany, etc. zebra, dog etc.

The living of a miserable life in the material world by dint of the soul's choice is nicely illustrated by Milton in Paradise Lost. Similarly, by choice the soul can regain paradise and return home, back to Godhead. (CC Adi-lila 5.21)

Actually we are all spirit souls and are intended to associate with God in the spiritual sky where there are innumerable spiritual planets and innumerable spiritual living entities. However, those who are not fit to live in that spiritual world are sent to this material world. This very idea is expressed by Milton in Paradise Lost. (Elevation to Krishna Consciousness, Ch 1. Choosing Human and Animal Lives)

Plotinus lived from 204-269 A.D

... Prabhupada: ..Just like in the fire there are so many sparks, but one or two may fall down from the fire. Others remains in the fire... for their deliverance that One, Supreme Personality, comes, descends, sends His incarnation, sends His devotee to call him back to home, back to Godhead. Those who are fortunate, they take to Krishna consciousness and go back to home, back to Godhead, .. the intelligent living entity, if he is fortunate, he takes to

Krishna consciousness and again he goes back to home, back to Godhead.... if he likes, he can surrender to the Supreme Lord and go back to home, back to Godhead,

Hayagriva: Plotinus saw the individual souls returning to God or the One through three stages...

Prabhupada: ..bhakti-yoga makes him completely fit for going back to home, back to Godhead.

Hayagriva: Concerning evil, Plotinus feels that matter is evil in the sense that it imprisons the soul, but the visible cosmos...

Prabhupada: This Plotinus is practically ninety percent our conception.

Hayagriva: But the visible cosmos is beautiful, and the evil does not arise from the creator.

Prabhupada: Yes. That the individual soul, being attracted by this illusory energy, he comes here for sense gratification. It is not by the desire of the Supreme One. By his personal desire. So God gives him freedom. So he begins the life from a very exalted position in this material world—sometimes like Brahma. .. When he comes to understand that "This kind of degradation and elevation going on perpetually, this is my suffering," then at that time he becomes fortunate. Then he seeks after the Supreme One, Krishna, and by the grace of Krishna he gets bona fide spiritual master. So by the mercy of both the spiritual master and Krishna, he gets the chance of being engaged in devotional service, and little effort and sincerity makes him perfect, and he goes back to home back to Godhead.

Hayagriva: He writes: "Let us flee then to the beloved fatherland. Here is sound council. But what is this flight? How are we to gain the open sea? The fatherland for us is there whence we have come. There is the father...If the souls remain in the intelligible or spiritual realm with the Soul, or Supersoul, they are beyond harm and share in the soul's governance. They are like kings who live with the high King and govern with Him and like Him do not come down from the palace. But if they wish to be independent, if they are tired, you may say, of living with someone else..."

Hayagriva: So when the individual soul decides to withdraw, he becomes fragmented, isolated and weak, when he decides to withdraw from the, what he calls the palace of the King.

.. from the spiritual realm, from the governance of the high King.

Prabhupada: Yes. That is his falldown. When he decides to give up the spiritual life, he falls down in the material life.. he is prone to fall down because he is very minute quantity, he is small, so there is tendency of falldown. The same example: the small spark of the fire, because it is very small, sometimes it falls down from the fire. So we become, being very small, minute particle of God, we become entangled by this material, external energy. Just like the example: a less intelligent person, in ignorance, commits criminal activities and he goes to jail. He is not supposed to go to the jail, but on account of his little intelligence or ignorance, he commits something which is criminal. This criminality is done by less intelligent class of men. Similarly, persons who are coming into this material world, they are less intelligent. Krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare. They think that they will be able to enjoy life independently, without Krishna. This is less intelligence. Just like a very rich man's son, if he thinks that "If I live independently, without being dependent on father," that is his foolishness. How he can become happy independently, living aside from the father? The supreme father is all-opulent, full of everything, and I am minute only. So if I live under the care of the father, naturally I will live very comfortably, like rich man's son. But if I prefer that I shall live independently, that is my foolishness. So only the fools and rascals they try to remain independent of Krishna, and they suffer. That is the consequence. And those who are intelligent, even in the, this material life, by association of devotee and spiritual opportunities, when he comes to this understanding, that "I am son of Krishna. He claims, aham bija-pradah pita [Bg. 14.4], 'I am the father,' so I am the son of Krishna, and

why I am rotting in this way? Let me go back to my father," that is back to home, back to Godhead—that is intelligence... just like it is the father's duty if the son goes astray, in wrong way, the father is always affectionate. He tries to bring him back again home by, either by punishing or some way or some means.

Hayagriva: He uses this following metaphor. He says, "We are like a chorus grouped about a conductor who allow their attention to be distracted by the audience. If, however, they"—that is we, the individual souls—"were to turn toward their conductor, they would sing as they should and would really be with him. We are always around the One. If we were not, we would dissolve and cease to exist. Yet our gaze does not remain fixed upon the One. When we look at it, we then attain the end of our desires and find rest. Then it is that all discord passes. We dance an inspired dance around it. In this dance the soul looks upon the source of life, the source of the intelligence, the root of being, the cause of the good, the root of the soul"

Prabhupada: Yes. There is good sense, that God is individual and the soul is individual. As he has given the metaphor or analogy that the conductor and a chorus of a concert party,

they are singing in the tune, sometimes attention diverted by the audience, it becomes out of the tune. Similarly we, when we divert our attention to the illusory energy, then we fall down

Hayagriva: "Once having tasted the pleasures of independence, they use their freedom to go any direction that leads away from their origin, and when they have gone a great distance, they even forget that they came from it."

Prabhupada: ..the human form of life is a chance to understand that how he has fallen. And if he takes to Krishna consciousness, then from this life he goes again back to Krishna.

We advise humanity to read about all the plays (lila's) with the Supreme Personality of Godhead, Krishna in the 'Krishna Book', and chant the Hare Krishna maha-mantra, to see the original football play on the transcendental television of the heart, just as Sanjaya saw the Bhagavad-gita, Krishna speaking with Arjuna (SB 2.9.35). Then after death we will return back to home, back to Godhead to participate in Krishna's divine sports and pastimes or activities of amusement and bliss, where the losers equally enjoy as the winners.

Hare Krishna Hare Krishna / Krishna Krishna Hare Hare
Hare Rama Hare Rama / Rama Rama Hare Hare

We fell from the rasa-lila

Go back to the rasa-lila to dance with Krishna told Srila Prabhupada to the Beatles, Harrison and Lennon. They understood him and later the Beatles sung: "Get back, get back, get back to where you once belonged."

Here is the complete quote:

"mam upetya kaunteya duhkhalayam asasvatam [Bg. 8.15] , "he does not come back again to this miserable condition." And asasvatam, temporary. Why? Samsiddhim paramam gatah. Oh, he has attained the highest perfection, to go back to Krishna, mad-yajino 'pi mam, "one who comes to Me." So this is the greatest benediction to the human society, to train them to go back to Krishna and dance there with Krishna in rasa-lila." (Room Conversation with John Lennon, Yoko Ono, and George Harrison)

Here a few more on leaving the rasa dance:

"Those who have got little brain, they are satisfied with temporary, and those who are advanced, yogis, they are not satisfied with temporary happiness. They must be seeking for unlimited happiness. That can be achieved when you [go] back to home, back to Krishna. Krishna is eternal, His pastimes are eternal. Just join with Krishna, His rasa dance, His play with cowherd boys, His dealing with His father and mother in Vrindavana. So our, this movement is to join Krishna's pastimes." (Arrival lecture, Los Angeles, 1973.4.13)

"Because we are now detached from Krishna, therefore our position is manah shashtanindriyani prakriti-sthani karshati [Bg. 15.7]. Detached from Krishna, we are in this prakriti, material nature, and our business is struggle for existence for the same pleasure, which is never obtainable in this material world. Therefore the intelligence is that we should again go back to home, go back to Krishna, and dance with Him in His rasa dance." (Lecture, SB 3.26.19)

"The Lord wanted to create the cosmic manifestation to give another chance to the conditioned souls who were dormant in forgetfulness. The cosmic manifestation gives the conditioned souls a chance to go back home, back to Godhead, and that is its main purpose. The Lord is so kind that in the absence of such a manifestation He feels something wanting, and thus the creation takes place. Although the creation of the internal potency was manifested, the other potency appeared to be sleeping, and the Lord wanted to awaken her to activity, just as a husband wants to awaken his wife from the sleeping state for enjoyment. It is the compassion of the Lord for the sleeping energy that He wants to see her awaken for enjoyment like the other wives who are awake. The whole process is to enliven the sleeping conditioned souls to the real life of spiritual consciousness so that they may thus become as perfect as the ever-liberated souls in the Vaikunthalokas. Since the Lord is sac-cid-ananda-vigraha [Bs. 5.1], He likes every part and parcel of His different potencies to take part in the blissful rasa because participation with the Lord in His eternal rasa-lila is the highest living condition, perfect in spiritual bliss and eternal knowledge." (SB 3.25.4 purport)

Back to home, back to Godhead where there is the rasa-lila. Back to means we return from where we came.

The description of the Lord with many wives, has also the same conclusion; the souls originate from Radha-Krishna's lila; other wives are awake. One wife (or many conditioned souls) is sleeping. She is of course not eternally sleeping, or since birth. She was awake before, had fallen asleep and becomes reawakened.

Go back home, back to Godhead and be cheerful in Vrndavana, dancing in rasa-lila or join Krishna dancing with the cowherd-boys. 'Back to' means we came from there.

"You have to go back to home, go back to Krishna, and there is your real life. Krishna comes therefore. He displays His rasa dance in Vrindavana to attract these fallen souls, that "If you want enjoyment, why not come back to Me? Here is the enjoyment. Here is the enjoyment, eternal enjoyment. Why you are rotting in this material world and becoming implicated, sometimes as Brahma and sometime as the worm in the stool? Enjoyment, varieties of enjoyment. Why? Why you are so become fool?" (Hyderabad, April 23, 1974, Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.2.9)

To summarize, Krishna says come back to my rasa dance in Vrndavana. We have been there. Then we wanted to enjoy this rotting matter.

"The intelligence is that we should again go back to home, go back to Krishna, and dance with Him in His rasa dance." (Bombay, December 28, 1974, Srimad-Bhagavatam 3.26.19)

Just like a mad son loitering in the street, when he understands with good brain that "My father is so rich, so powerful, and why I am loitering in the street like a madman? I have no food, no shelter. I am going from this door to door and begging," then he comes to his consciousness. That is called brahma-bhuta [SB 4.30.20] stage. "Oh, I am, I am not this matter. I am spirit soul, part and parcel of God. Oh." That is consciousness.

This consciousness we are trying to arouse. This is the best welfare service to the people, to awaken his lost consciousness. He is foolishly thinking that "I am of the material product, and I have to adjust my things in this material world." This is the foolishness. Actual intelligence is that is Brahma-bhuta, aham brahmasmi. Bhagavata.: "I am part and parcel of God. God is supreme Brahman. I am, being part and parcel..." Just like part and parcel of the gold, gold mine, it may be small earring, it is also gold. Similarly, the small particle of sea water is also the same quality, salty. Similarly, we, being part and parcel of God, we have got the same qualities. Qualitatively, we are one. Why we are hankering after loving? Because there is love in Krishna. We are worshiping here Radha-Krishna. Originally there is love. Therefore we, being part and parcel of God, we are also trying to love. A man is trying to love another woman, woman is trying to love another man. This is natural. This is not artificial. But it is perverted in the material covering. That is the defect. When we are free from this material covering, then we are qualitatively anandamayo 'bhyasat (Vedanta-sutra 1.1.12), as jolly... As Krishna is dancing always... Krishna you will never find... You have seen the picture of Krishna. He is fighting with the Kaliya serpent. He is dancing. He is not afraid of the serpent. He is dancing. As He is dancing with the gopis in rasa-lila, similarly, He is dancing with the snake. Because He is anandamayo 'bhyasat. He is anandamaya, always jolly. Always. You will see Krishna... Krishna... Just like in Kurukshetra the fighting is going on. Krishna is jolly. Arjuna is morose because he is living entity, but He is not morose. He is jolly. That is the nature of God. Anandamayo 'bhyasat. This is the sutra, in the Brahma-sutra, that "God is anandamaya, always jolly, always cheerful." So you can become also cheerful when you go back to home, back to Godhead. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 2.1.5, Delhi, November 8, 1973)

I. dasa wrote that 'Lord Krishna also said in the Bhagavad-gita Chapter fifteen that His abode is the supreme abode that having once being, one never returns.'

He probably means Bg. 15.6 but that is another subject; not the first coming here.

Then I. dasa wrote that ‘the Kingdom of God or the spiritual world is a place of never-ending perfection where there can be no possibility of defects that will warrant one becoming envious of Krishna and then falling into the material world.’

So yes, the spiritual world is perfect but we are not perfect because we are not part of the spiritual world. We are eternally marginal energy, tatastha sakti. The spiritual saktis or sakti tattvas of Krishna never fall, nor the Visnu tattvas.

In the words of Bhaktivinoda Thakura the jiva is apurna sakti not perfect or complete. (purna=complete)

Marginal means as the beach; sometimes covered by water and sometimes being land.

I. dasa wrote that: ‘If we assume that the jivas do indeed fall from the spiritual world, then what is the meaning of "having once gone, one never returns"? If we fell from there before, it means we can fall from there again, as some maintain that since souls have independence, they can always misuse that independence, then become envious of Krishna in trying to enjoy like Him. Now, if we can perpetually go to the spiritual world to be in the association of Krishna and can always fall from that real...’

To answer this Srila Prabhupada explains:

Usually anyone who has developed his relationship with Krishna does not fall down in any circumstance, but because the independence is always there, the soul may fall down from any position or any relationship by misusing his independence. (70-02-27)

He also explains the same in the following conversation:

Prabhupada: There is return, that is voluntary. Return there is.

Paramahansa: If we want.

Prabhupada: Yes.

Paramahansa: So we can come to the spiritual world and return?

Prabhupada: Yes.

Paramahansa: Fall down?

Prabhupada: Yes. As soon as we try, "Oh, this material world is very nice," "Yes," Krishna says, "yes, you go."

Paramahansa: Fall down?

Prabhupada: Yes. As soon as we try, "Oh, this material world is very nice," "Yes," Krishna says, "yes, you go." Just like nobody is interested in Krishna consciousness. Do you think everyone is interested? So. They want to enjoy this material world. Otherwise what is the meaning of free will? Every living entity has got a little free will. And Krishna is so kind, He gives him opportunity, "All right, you enjoy like this." Just like some of our students, Krishna conscious, sometimes go away, again come back. It is free will, not stereotyped. Just like one goes to the prisonhouse, not that government welcomes, "Come on. We have got prisonhouse. Come here, come here." He goes out of his free will; again comes out, again goes. Like that. Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare, nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare (Prema-vivarta). The police is there. Just like the police car was there. We have nothing to do with it. But if you do anything criminal, immediately you will be arrested, under police custody. The maya may be there, but maya captures him who is not a devotee of Krishna. (Morning Walk, At Cheviot Hills Golf Course, May 13, 1973, Los Angeles)

I. dasa remarks “It is really crazy!”

Yes, it is really crazy to have come here. It is unbelievably really crazy to think of how this could have happened to me who is so clever. In our Caitanya's acintya bheda-abheda tattva sampradaya there is acintya inconceivability on all levels. This acintya distinguishes us from all other 3 sampradayas. So there is also acintya on the part of the jiva, who is part and parcel of the Supreme acintya, incredible, inconceivable Krishna who is unbelievably mad with love for Srimati Radharani. So we can also do the inconceivable and become inconceivably foolish to freely choose not Krishna, become inconceivably crazy with lust and turn away from the inconceivably attractive Krishna.

To conclude, here are some more quotes on falling from the spiritual planets.

Darsan. July 6, 1976

Devotee (4): I can't seem to get a grasp on this at all. If we in our original constitutional position as part and parcel of Krishna, and in that position, that original position of full knowledge and full bliss and being in our eternal nature...

Prabhupada: Whatever it may be, the falldown is there. So because we are living entities, we are not as powerful as Krishna, therefore we may fall down from Vaikuntha at any moment. Iccha-dvesha samutthena sarge yanti parantapa. Find out this verse.

Pushta Krishna:

iccha-dvesha samutthena
dvandva-mohena bharata
sarva-bhutani sammoham
sarge yanti parantapa

"O scion of Bharata [Arjuna], O conqueror of the foe, all living entities are born into delusion, overcome by the dualities of desire and hate." [Bg. 7.27]

Prabhupada: So even in the Vaikuntha, if I desire that "Why shall I serve Krishna? Why not become Krishna?" I immediately fall down. That is natural. A servant is serving the master, sometimes he may think that "If I could become the master." They are thinking like that, they are trying to become God. That is delusion. You cannot become God. That is not possible. But he's wrongly thinking.

Vipina: Why doesn't He save me from thinking like that?

Prabhupada: That means you lose your independence.

Prabhupada: That is force. [indistinct] prema. In Bengali it is said "If you catch one girl or boy, 'You love me, you love me, you love me.' " Is it love? [laughter] "You love me, otherwise I will kill you." [laughter] Is that love? So Krishna does not want to become a lover like that, on the point of revolver, "You love me, otherwise I shall kill you." That is not love, that is threatening. Love is reciprocal, voluntary, good exchange of feeling, then there is love, not by force.

Vipina: We also say that Krishna is fulfilling the desires of every living entity. So if we want to enjoy independent of Krishna, why doesn't He let us really enjoy independent of Him?

Prabhupada: That is not possible. That is maya it is called. You are not enjoyer, you are servant. Because you are willing to become enjoyer, you suffer, that's all. You are not enjoyer.

Vipina: Then He's not fulfilling the desire.

Prabhupada: No, you wanted to enjoy-enjoy at your risk. Sometimes you'll become the king of heaven, and sometimes you become the germs in the stool. (Bg 17.1-3 lecture, July 4, 1974, Honolulu)

If you do not stick to the spiritual principle, even if you are in Vaikuntha, you will fall down, what to speak of this material world? Because in the Vaikuntha or in the spiritual world, no contaminated soul can stay there...Just like Jaya-Vijaya. Jaya and Vijaya became asuras. They fell down from Vaikuntha. But they became asuras under the circumstances...That is mentioned we were reading Bhagavata the Kasyapa Rishi, his wife Diti. (SB 3.16.6 p)

"Similarly, there was no necessity to create this material world for the sufferings of the conditioned souls, but at the same time there are certain living entities, known as nitya-baddha, who are eternally conditioned. We say that they have been conditioned from time immemorial because no one can trace out when the living entity, the part and parcel of the Supreme Lord, became rebellious against the supremacy of the Lord. It is a fact that there are two classes of men... Without tracing out the beginning of the existence of these two classes, we can take it for granted that some of the living entities revolted against the laws of the Lord. Such entities are called conditioned souls... Covered by the material body, the spiritual identity is lost, and therefore the word mumuhe is used here, indicating that they have forgotten their own spiritual identity." (Bhag. 3.26.5, purport)

Like a person who thinks of becoming a king without possessing the necessary qualification, when the living entity desires to become the Lord Himself, he is put in a condition of dreaming that he is a king. Therefore the first sinful will of the living entity is to become the Lord, and the consequent will of the Lord is that the living entity forget his factual life and thus dream of the land of utopia where he may become one like the Lord. The child cries to have the moon from the mother, and the mother gives the child a mirror to satisfy the crying and disturbing child with the reflection of the moon. Similarly, the crying child of the Lord is given over to the reflection, the material world, to lord it over as karmi and to give this up in frustration to become one with the Lord. (SB 2.9.1 p)

It is the misfortune of the living entity, certainly not without reason, that the influence of the material energy acts on his pure consciousness and eternal bliss. (SB 3.7.9 p)

Actually there is no bondage or misery for the living entity, nor does he ever lose his pure knowledge...a living entity is eternally subordinate to the Supreme Lord, and he has this knowledge with him... (SB 3.7.10 p)

Because the application of devotional service to Lord Vasudeva invites pure knowledge, it quickly detaches one from the material conception of life and thus revives one's normal condition of spiritual existence, (SB 3.7.12 p)

The Lord is the eternal predominator, and the living entities are eternally predominated. Real knowledge of this relationship entails reviving the lost consciousness to this standard, and the process for such revival is devotional service to the Lord. (SB 3.7.15 p)

...conditioned living entities, who are unfit for the spiritual kingdom, are strewn within the material world to enjoy matter to the fullest extent. (SB 1.2.31 p)

...the actual knowledge of the conditioned soul is now covered by nescience...the living entity has his own way of thinking in his original unconditional state also...The Lord does not desire that a living being be illusioned by external energy. The external energy is aware of this fact, but still she accepts a thankless task of keeping the forgotten soul under illusion by her bewildering influence...performances of the illusory energy are also necessary for reformation of the conditioned soul...An affectionate father does not like his children to be chastised by another agent, yet he puts his disobedient children under the custody of a severe man just to bring them to order...the living entity is also required to revive his natural love and affection for the Lord, (SB 1.7.5 p)

...revival of one's eternal relation with Him, now forgotten under the spell of maya...Our intimate relation with Krishna can be confidentially revived by our talking of, hearing of, or remembering Him. (SB 1.10.13-14 p)

But the living beings, who are constitutionally part and parcel of the Lord and are forgetful of the sweet relation, are given a chance again (SB 1.10.22 p)

Liberation means renovation of this stage of svarupa. (SB 1.10.28 p)

This is the original state of the living entities and can be attained by reviving our natural and constitutional state of life. (SB 1.11.8 p)

„the sun rays and the sun cannot be separated. The separation by the cloud is temporary and artificial, and as soon as the cloud is cleared, the sun rays again display their natural effulgence in the presence of the sun. Similarly, the living entities, who are molecular parts of the whole spirit, are separated from the Lord by the artificial covering of maya, illusory energy. This illusory energy, or the curtain of maya, has to be removed, and when it is so done, the living entity can see the Lord face to face (SB 1.11.10 p)

First you become a thief; then police is there, not that police comes and arrest you unnecessary. No. As soon as you become criminal, then police comes and arrest you. maya comes next. If you give up your natural attraction for Krishna, if you are attracted by this material enjoyment, then maya is there. (Conversation, November 12, 1975)

Father Tanner: Can there be opposition in the spirit world?

Prabhupada: Yes.

Father Tanner: Conflict in the spirit world?

Prabhupada: Yes. Yes, yes. Just like father has got ten sons. Some of them are opposition to the father. And some of them are very obedient.

Father Tanner: But the... I'm not saying of the spirit in man. I'm saying of spirits in themselves.

Prabhupada: Yes. Spirit in themselves, they are not opposition.

Father Tanner: Can they be in opposition?

Prabhupada: No. When they are in opposition, they have to accept this material body. (Conversation, London, July 11, 1973)

Is it government's fault that you go to the jail? Therefore government has fault? Why this nonsense question...It is a common sense affair. (Conversation, August 11, 1973)

Because you are perfect, therefore you have got the independence to misuse. You are not a dead stone. That is perfection.

Just like some of our students. All of a sudden, they deviate, go away. So what is that? Our movement is imperfect, or he's imperfect?.....

"This is nice," and goes to hell. What can be done? That independence is there. That is perfectness.

Umapati: Well, the argument is that if God is so all-powerful, why does He even let me fall?

Prabhupada: Eh?

Umapati: If God is so powerful, why does He let me fall. Why doesn't He save me, save me from my own foolishness.

Prabhupada: Yes, He's saving you, but you don't carry His order.

Prabhupada: Yes. Just like I say, "Chant sixteen rounds." If you do not do it. What can I do? (Morning Walk, December 6, 1973)

...we are also fire, in quality...we sometimes desire to imitate Krishna. Because we have got these qualities in minute quantity, so we think that "I am God, I have become." But we do not know the quantitative difference. That we forget. We can say we are God, but teeny God, Lecture, (SB 2.3.13-14)

A complete progressive march on the return path home, back to Godhead...(SB 2.3.25 p)

In your Bible also it is said that the Adam and Eve, the forbidden apple... That means He made some rules and regulations, "Do this; do not this." And if you do this, what is not sanctioned, then you suffer. God forbade not to eat the apple—I do not know actually—but by the request of Eve, Adam ate it, and he became conditioned. Similarly—it may be story—but the fact is that God created this world. That's a fact. And He created the rules and regulation also. That is called Vedic knowledge. And in the Vedic knowledge there are injunctions: "You do this; you do not do this." If you follow the Vedic knowledge, then you have come to this world for enjoyment, so your regulated enjoyment will satisfy your senses; at the same time, you will be able to go back to home, back to Godhead, again. (Lecture, April 14, 1972)

We left our home and father, and we are in this fallen material world, and we are suffering too much. (Lecture, Mexico City, February 18, 1975)

...to pray Krishna, "Please pick me up very soon and let me go back to Your place." (Morning Walk at Stow Lake, March 23, 1968, San Francisco)

If one keeps his position rightly, he does not fall...a criminal, he is fallen. He has fallen down from good citizenship. (Bhagavad-gita 1.21-22, London, July 18, 1973)

...reinstate myself in the pure spiritual life. (Bhagavad-gita 2.59-69, New York, April 29, 1966)

...go back to the kingdom of God (Bhagavad-gita 3.11-19, Los Angeles, December 27, 1968)

...return back to the kingdom of God (Bhagavad-gita 3.16-17, New York, May 25, 1966)

We have no taste for spiritual upliftment. That taste we have lost...That is the stage of our present existence—forgetfulness. (Bhagavad-gita 3.17-20, New York, May 27, 1966)

That relationship is there, eternal. And that is congenial, and that is my real happiness. We have forgotten that.

We have, by chance, fallen into this material contamination and we have made our relationship with so many material things, so that we have forgotten Krishna. (Bhagavad-gita 3.17-20, New York, May 27, 1966)

Forgetting our father, forgetting our God, we are criminal within this material world. Therefore our only business is how to get out of this prison house and go back to home, back to Godhead.

...you are part and parcel of Krishna, or God, you being separated, I have already explained, you are suffering in this material world. So you back to your father, go back to your father and be happy.

You forced Krishna to allow you to come. Just like sometimes a child forces his father. Father says, "My dear son, do not do this. Do not go there." But he insists, "Oh, I must go. I must go." "All right, you go at your risk. That's all. (Bhagavad-gita 3.2, Melbourne, June 27, 1974)

Water is taken from the ocean, derived from the ocean. It goes to the sky, again turns into water, falls down, and in river goes down again to the ocean. Similarly, we have derived our energy from Krishna. Now again if we glide down towards Krishna, that is perfection. (Bhagavad-gita 3.31-43, Los Angeles, January 1, 1969)

Then your dormant relationship with God and Krishna will be revived. (Bhagavad-gita 4.1-2, Columbus, May 9, 1969)

The aim of life is to go back to home, back to Godhead. That is the aim of life. We are fallen in this material conditional life.

You are My part and parcel." This is an eternal relationship. It cannot be broken, but you have forgotten. You have forgotten your relationship with Krishna

...by forgetting God, forgetting Krishna, we are busy with the problems...(Bhagavad-gita 4.3, Bombay, March 23, 1974)

...revive our original spiritual body, sac-cid-ananda-vigraha...The sons may forget the father, but the father cannot forget. (Bhagavad-gita 4.3-6, New York, July 18, 1966)

Mahapurusha: If the living entity is in the material world and he's an expansion of the marginal energy, then he's... And he can purify himself and become eligible to enter into the spiritual world and Krishna, but can he still fall as an expansion of the marginal energy?

Prabhupada: Yes. Marginal energy. Just like the sunshine is always there. Sometimes it is covered by cloud. When the cloud is cleared, then it is directly touching sunshine. Similarly, we are always marginal potency. (Bhagavad-gita 4.5, Montreal, June 10, 1968)

...revive our original spiritual body. That spiritual body is within...(Bhagavad-gita 16.10, Hawaii, February 6, 1975)

They do not know even what is God, and what the question of going back to Him, back to home, back to Godhead? They do not know everything, anything. There is God, there is home of God. (The Nectar of Devotion, Bombay, January 11, 1973)

The thinking, feeling, and willing... This thinking, feeling, and willing now polluted on account of material coverings. Therefore we have to revert to the thinking, feeling, and willing by Krishna consciousness. (The Nectar of Devotion, Vrindavana, October 29, 1972)

...as soon as I forget Krishna, that is the beginning of my misfortune. So in order to be, in order to become again fortunate, I have to become Krishna conscious.

...So here in this material world, we have disagreed to serve Krishna. Therefore the whole proposal is again agree to serve Krishna. Sarva-dharman parityajya mam ekam saranam vraja [Bg. 18.66]. This is real philosophy. We disagreed; therefore we came into this material world...(The Nectar of Devotion, Vrindavana, October 31, 1972)

When this service attitude is impaired, that "Why serve Krishna? Why not myself?" that is maya. Then he falls down in the material energy. (Room Conversation with Allen Ginsberg, May 14, 1969, Columbus, Ohio)

The point has no length, no breadth
Essay on sakhalAnAm: no unsteadiness

This 'sakhalAnAm' states Srila Jiva Gosvami in Bhagavat Sandarbha.
Srila Prabhupada also says that sometimes.

For example, he said: "Nitya-siddha means there are living entities, every living entity is part and parcel of Krishna. So one who does not fall down, he is called nitya-siddha. One who does not fall down. Just like in this material world there are millions and millions of living entities, but they have fallen down. But there are multi-millions and millions of living entities in the vaikuntha-loka, they never fall down. They are called nitya-siddha. They never come here. So we have no information. This is only one-fourth manifestation of God's creation, and the three-fourths creation of God is there. Not creation; it is everlasting. Just like in the prison house, if you go to the prison house, it does not mean that the whole state is there. It is only insignificant part of the state, and only the criminals they are put together.... And sadhana-siddha means those who are put into this material world, by the association of maha-bhagavata, if he tries, follows, then he can also become maha-bhagavata or nitya-siddha, because originally everyone is nitya-siddha...maha-bhagavata, they know always; they never forget this position. And those who are fallen souls, conditioned souls, they do not know it, so they have to be raised to that stage. That stage how? So he is also nitya-siddha. Nitya-siddha Krishna-bhakti. Krishna-bhakti, as soon as one becomes Krishna conscious fully, he becomes nitya-siddha again. So either you come by sadhana-bhakti or naturally, the... When you come to the ultimate stage, everyone is nitya-siddha. So nitya-siddha, those who come from Vaikuntha, they are never fallen, never forgets Krishna, that is nitya-siddha, and by the teachings of nitya-siddha maha-bhagavata, if one follows and then becomes by sadhana-siddha, by regulative principle, they also become nitya-siddha, later on. And when one becomes nitya-siddha again, there is no difference between this living entity and that living entity."(760211SB-MAYAPUR - February 11, 1976)

Also for this bhagavat sandarbha text we should study the context.
Sri Jiva Gosvami writes in Anuccheda 1:

"Having described In the previous (Tattva) Sandarbha in a general way the truth as advaya-jnana (vadanti tat tattva-vidas, tattvam yad jnanam advayam), the speaker describes more particularly the unique manifestation of that truth according to the particular qualification of the worshipper. The Absolute is known in three features, called Brahman, Paramatma and Bhagavan.

This is his introduction.

Anuccheda 60 is about the Bhagavan's Ornaments and Paraphernalia.

Anucchedas 61-78 The Spiritual World, Vaikuntha.

Anuccheda 79 The Four Kumaras See Lord Narayana.

In anuccheda 63 and again in 64 we read 'sakhalAnAm' which means 'without falling down', 'no unsteadiness', 'which the devotee never leaves', 'not slipping or shaking'.

All the verses in this section are glorification of the spiritual world, Vaikuntha (nothing is stated there about the original fall down.)

Finally, only:

sa vai manah krishna-padaravindayor
vacamsi vaikuntha-gunanuvarnane

sah—he (Maharaja Ambarisha); vai—indeed; manah—his mind; krishna-pada-aravindayoh—(fixed) upon the two lotus feet of Lord Krishna; vacamsi—his words; vaikuntha-guna-anuvarnane—describing the glories of Krishna or Vaikuntha

Maharaja Ambarisha always engaged his mind in meditating upon the lotus feet of Krishna, his words in describing the glories of the Lord or Vaikuntha. (SB 9.4.18)

Sri Jiva Gosvami will in this section take us to Vaikuntha, and will not discuss, the mudhas, hogs-, dogs-, camels-, asses-like-men down there. These are driven out from Vaikuntha, that we all know. As we here in our worlds know that if we do crime or break the law we get jail or a fine.

Now only vaikuntha-gunaAnuvarnane.

As when in a book or magazine the king and his palace is glorified, there is no description of the jail house. Everyone knows that silly, foolish, insane, mad, proud devils, rebels, criminals, rascals are driven out from Vaikuntha.

As we read in Bhagavad-gita 7.27:

iccha-dvesha-samutthena
dvandva-mohena bharata
sarva-bhutani sammoham
sarge yanti parantapa

iccha—desire; dvesha—and hate; samutthena—arisen from; dvandva—of duality; mohena—by the illusion; bharata—O scion of Bharata; sarva—all; bhutani—living entities; sammoham—into delusion; sarge—while taking birth; yanti—go; parantapa—O conqueror of enemies.

O scion of Bharata, O conqueror of the foe, all living entities are born into delusion, bewildered by dualities arisen from desire and hate.

Purport: The real constitutional position of the living entity is that of subordination to the Supreme Lord, who is pure knowledge. When one is deluded into separation from this pure knowledge, he becomes controlled by the illusory energy and cannot understand the Supreme Personality of Godhead. The illusory energy is manifested in the duality of desire and hate. Due to desire and hate, the ignorant person wants to become one with the Supreme Lord and envies Krishna as the Supreme Personality of Godhead.

And in 13.21:

karya-karana-kartritve
hetuh prakritir ucyate
purushah sukha-dukhhanam
bhoktritve hetur ucyate

karya—of effect; karana—and cause; kartritve—in the matter of creation; hetuh—the instrument; prakritih—material nature; ucyate—is said to be; purushah—the living entity; sukha—of happiness; dukhanam—and distress; bhoktritve—in enjoyment; hetuh—the instrument; ucyate—is said to be.

Nature is said to be the cause of all material causes and effects, whereas the living entity is the cause of the various sufferings and enjoyments in this world.

Purport: In his original state there is no doubt of enjoyment; therefore that is his real state. Because of the desire to lord it over material nature, he is in the material world. In the spiritual world there is no such thing. The spiritual world is pure, but in the material world everyone is struggling hard to acquire different kinds of pleasures for the body.... The fact is that every individual living entity is eternally part and parcel of the Supreme Lord, and both of them are very intimately related as friends. But the living entity has the tendency to reject the sanction of the Supreme Lord and act independently in an attempt to dominate nature, and because he has this tendency he is called the marginal energy of the Supreme Lord. The living entity can be situated either in the material energy or in the spiritual energy. As long as he is conditioned by the material energy, the Supreme Lord, as his friend, the Supersoul, stays with him just to get him to return to the spiritual energy. The Lord is always eager to take him back to the spiritual energy, but due to his minute independence the individual entity is continually rejecting the association of spiritual light.... fallen into this material existence.... revert to spiritual consciousness or Kāñēa consciousness.... go back to Godhead, back to home.

Comment. The soul is marginal energy and should return back to the enjoyment of the spiritual world, where he came from.

These verses on ‘no fall’ are in the context of discussing that devotees are not after enjoying in or falling for the material heavenly planets, and the falling of the soul from the material heavenly planets. The soul doesn’t fall from Vaikuntha like that; a forced fall, as described in the Govinda-bhasya to Vedanta-sutra 3.1.23 :

“The astral body (Soma-rāja) assumed by the soul in the Chandra loka was taken for the sake of enjoying the pleasures of that world : that astral body (literally, the body of water) melts away like ice under the rays of the burning sun; and when the karma is exhausted, that body is evaporated by the fire of grief, at the prospect of impending fall; and thus the soul becomes disembodied like ether and then it comes under the control of air, and then it becomes united with smoke and the rest.” Then the soul lands in a human body on the earth planet.

That souls do fall down originally from Vaikuntha, Sri Jiva Gosvami describes in other sections of his sandarbhas.

We will cite now.

“sa tvahi hi nitya-vijitātma-gunah sva-dhāmnā kālovaśī-kṛta-visṛjya-visarga-śaktih cakre visrstam ajayeśvara sodaśāre nispīdyamānam upakarsa vibho prapannam

O Lord! O supreme power! You conquer the material gunas contained in the jīva’s intelligence at all times by your svarūpa- śakti. You are time which agitates the gunas. You destroy ignorance in the subtle body. Please bring near you that person who has been thrown in the wheel in the wheel of sixteen spokes by ignorance and is being squeezed like a piece of sugar cane. (SB 7.9.22)” (ANUCCHEDA 19 bhagavat sandarbha)

Comment. Thrown in jail, from outside of the jail.

In text 1 of Anuccheda 22 of Sri Bhagavat-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami cites SB 10.87.38

sa yad ajaya tv ajam anusayita gunams ca jushan
bhajati sarupatam tad anu mrityum apeta-bhagah
tvam uta jahasi tam ahir iva tvacam atta-bhago
mahasi mahiyase 'shta-gunite 'parimeya-bhagah

sah—he (the individual living entity); yat—because; ajaya—by the influence of the material energy; tu—but; ajam—that material energy; anusayita—lies down next to; gunan—her qualities; ca—and; jushan—assuming; bhajati—he takes on; sa-rupatam—forms resembling (the qualities of nature); tat-anu—following that; mrityum—death; apeta—deprived; bhagah—of his assets; tvam—You; uta—on the other hand; jahasi—leave aside; tam—her (the material energy); ahir—a snake; iva—as if; tvacam—its (old, discarded) skin; atta-bhagah—endowed with all assets; mahasi—in Your spiritual powers; mahiyase—You are glorified; ashta-gunite—eightfold; aparimeya—unlimited; bhagah—whose greatness.

The illusory material nature attracts the minute living entity to embrace her, and as a result he assumes forms composed of her qualities. Subsequently, he loses all his spiritual qualities and must undergo repeated deaths. You, however, avoid the material energy in the same way that a snake abandons its old skin. Glorious in Your possession of eight mystic perfections, You enjoy unlimited opulences. (Sarva-samvadini of Sri Jiva Gosvami)

Comment. According to the dictionary:

apeta adj. having retired from
apeta adj. free from
apeta adj. escaped
apeta adj. departed
apeta adj. gone.

The commentary of Sridhara Swami (partly):

In this verse the word sah means “the individual spirit soul.” Yat means “because.” ajaya means “by the material energy maya,” ajam means “ignorance,” anusayita means “embraces,” gunams ca means “the material body and senses,” jusan means “serving, or considering the material body as the self,” svarupatam jusan apeta-bhagah means “absorbed in the material energy, the individual soul becomes bereft of his natural spiritual opulences, such as bliss and knowledge,” mrityum means “the material realm of birth and death,” [and] bhajati means “attains.”

Another translation:

Because ([yat = yasmAt]) he, the [jIva,] however (in spite of the fact that the material world is unreal), by the influence of MAyA ([ajayA = mAyayA]), embraces ([anusayIta = A`linget]) ignorance ([ajAm = avidyAm]), thus he comes to serve ([juSan = sevamAnam]) her qualities, namely the body and senses, presumes them to be his own self ([A`tmatayAdhyasan]), subsequently ([tad anu = „tad-anantaram]) also assumes similarity to them, the acquirement of their nature ([sa-rUpatAm = tad-dharma-yogam]), becomes such that his qualities of happiness and so on are covered over, and obtains ([bhajati = prApnoti]) death. This, the implication is, is the subject matter of the [karma-kANDa]. You, on the other hand ([tvam uta = tvaM tu]), leave aside that MAyA ([ajAm = mAyAm]).

Another translation of this commentary – extended:

Because (yat) the jiva embraces avidya (ajam) through maya, he serves the gunas, body and senses and mistakes them for himself. After that (anu) he takes on similar qualities

(sarupatam) and, with qualities like bliss covered (apeta-bhagah), attains samsara (mrtyum). You however reject that maya. Maya is situated in me. How do I give it up? Just as a snake does not think its skin to be himself just by thinking of its good qualities, so you give up maya, because you do not identify it as yourself. Your profusion of continuous bliss and knowledge is not produced by maya. You are indifferent to it, because you have your eternal powers (atta-bhagah). You are glorious with your eight mystic powers. The powers are immeasurable (aparimeya-bhagah). Your eight qualities of power are not limited by time and place like the powers of others. They are unlimited because they are related to your complete svarupa.

Commentary of Sri Visvanatha: Although the jiva is pure spirit, qualitatively equal with God, he becomes degraded under the power of material illusion, maya.

Entranced by the allurements of Māyā, the pure jiva soul becomes covered by ignorance and the qualities of material nature. Thus tainted by material designations, he accepts (bhajati) bodies...

Subsequently (tad anu), his qualities like bliss become covered, and he undergoes repeated birth and death (mrtyum) in this world.

Lord Narayana said, "But since I, the Supreme Soul, share the same spiritual nature as the individual spiritual soul (jiva), do I also get covered by ignorance?"

Srutis: "No, this can never happen! The jiva is an infinitesimal particle of consciousness, whereas You are the vast repository of consciousness. Smoke may engulf the glow of a small molten sphere of gold, brass or copper, but it can never cover the vast light of the sun."

Commentary BBT: Although the jiva is pure spirit, qualitatively equal with the Supreme Lord, he is prone to being degraded by embracing the ignorance of material illusion. When he becomes entranced by the allurements of Maya, he accepts bodies and senses that are designed to let him indulge in forgetfulness.

Our commentary: Visvanatha makes Lord Narayana fearfully ask: "I can also fall." The srutis reassure "no Lord, only jivas fall down, You can not and will not at any time become fallen in the future." The distinction between You and the conditioned soul is that You maintain Your natural opulences, known as sad-aisvarya, asta-siddhi, and asta-guna, But the soul loses all his spiritual qualities. The original position was not Brahman, since in Brahman all qualities are contracted. The soul had its spiritual consciousness, qualities etc. but lost its sat cit ananda vigraha etc. 50 qualities (see: Nectar of devotion 2.1.23-29). These qualities are not manifest in Brahman. No Brahman-fall here, since this only came from a misunderstanding of Bhaktivinoda's Jaiva Dharma. This book describes the regular emanation of souls from Maha-Visnu, every 622.080 trillion years. A second chance for the soul, falling from Krishna lila, at the border of matter and spirit. The nature of the soul as always marginal; able to go from spirit to matter and matter to spirit. The souls in brahman are originally from Krishna's sports, fell into maya, got elevated by impersonal meditation to the Brahman effulgence and will fall from there into maya again, to surrender to Krishna after many many births. (Bhagavad-Gita 7.19)

This also refutes the anadi or nitya-patita vada, the philosophy that all souls in the material world are since time eternal, without beginning, in the material world. All the other souls are eternally in the spiritual world. These eternally liberated souls will never fall. According to that idea the soul in the material world has been nowhere else ever, can get liberated and then will never return here. But the material world is a limited area, so this world should be empty

of souls by now since liberation is going on since nonbeginning time. They also teach that the souls are in the material world for no reason. The spiritual world alone would be perfect and sufficient. All the souls could be in ecstatic love in the spiritual world, but somehow matter is there eternally and needs some residents. Somehow the mistaken creation of the maya is an eternal fact. Even Krishna doesn't want it, but it is eternally designed like that, so He cannot change the dogma. Neither a jiva nor Bhagavan have done anything for a jiva to be in Vaikuntha, in Brahmajyoti or in the material world. So neither a jiva nor Bhagavan is to be blamed or praised for it. Some things are the way they are.
So they say.

(next quote) “Jīva-māyā is so called because its aim is the jīva (his bewilderment), and its māyā arises from the functions of vidyā and avidyā of the Lord’s nimitta-śakti. Taking support of this jīva-māyā, at the beginning of creation, Brahmā manifested avidyā.

vidyāvidye mama tanū viddhy uddhava śarīrīṇām mokṣa-bandha-kañ ādye may ay ā me vini
rmite

vidyā—knowledge; avidye—and ignorance; mama—My; tanu—manifested energies;
viddhi—please understand; uddhava—O Uddhava; śarīrīṇām—of the embodied living
entities; mokṣa—liberation; bandha—bondage; karī—causing; ādye—original, eternal;
māyayā—by the potency; me—My; vinirmite—produced.

O Uddhava! Understand that vidyā and avidyā are my śaktis. They are created by my māyā, are without beginning, and create liberation and bondage for the living beings. (SB 11.11.3)”
(ANUCCHEDA 16 Bhagavat sandarbha)

Comment. Create/produce bondage neutralizes without beginning.

“haroti viśva-sthiti-samyamodayam yasyepsitam nepsitam īksitur gunaih māyāyathāyo
bhramate tad-āśrayam grāvno namas te guna-karma-sāksine

By your glance, you carry out creation, maintenance and destruction of the universe by māyā, though it is not desired by you, but only by the jīva....(SB 5.18.38)” (Bhagavat sandarbha ,
ANUCCHEDA 20)

Comment. The jail is for the rebel jivas.

The commentary-Sridhara swami- says, “The Lord does not desire the creation for himself (iksituh), but he desires it for the jīvas. He does not desire it at all, since prakṛti is not suitable object for his glance. He does not desire creation for himself.

Same in Bhagavat Sandarbha, ANUCCHEDA 49:

“By ignorance the jīva produces a false relationship with a body.”

In Sri Bhagavat-sandarbha Anuccheda 71, text 1, Jiva Goswami cites Srimad-Bhagavatam 4.29.48, wherein Narada Muni says:

"They do not know their own or the Lord's abode, where in fact there is God, Janardana. Those who have smoky intelligence say that the Veda facilitates fruitive activities because they do not know that [Veda]."

In his commentary, Sridhara Svami states:

"'They do not know that' means 'they do not know the Veda' because they do not know svam lokam, 'their own abode,' which means their constitutional position, the truth about themselves, which is the real purport that one is to perceive in the Vedas. [And that constitutional position] is where God is."

Those who speak only of parts of the Veda that advocate karma do not know his (te) planet which is the Lord's svarupa (sva). They know only Svarga. In that planet (yatra) the Lord reside.

In text 2 of Anuccheda 71 of Sri Bhagavat-sandarbha Jiva Goswami says on this verse:

In this verse Narada Muni says, "Those who are less intelligent (dhumra-dhiyah) accept (ahuh) the Vedic ritualistic ceremonies (veda sa-karmakam) as all in all. They know of Svargaloka and the other planets in the material universe, but they do not know that the purpose of the Vedas is to understand one's own home (svam lokam) where (yatra) the Supreme Personality of Godhead (janardanah) lives.

Another translation: Those who speak only of parts of the Veda that advocate karma do not know his (te) planet which is the Lord's svarupa (sva). They know only Svarga. In that planet (yatra) the Lord reside

Bhaktivedanta purport: "...their interest of life – to return home, back to Godhead."

"...their real home in the spiritual world... there are many Vaikuntha planets, and the topmost planet is Krishnaloka, Goloka Vrindavana."

Our comment: the Brahman effulgence is also in the spiritual world, but that part is worse than hell, so that is not considered home. "The pure devotee would rather go to hell than merge into the effulgence of the Lord." (CC Madhya 6.268-269 p.) Returning to one's real home thus means Goloka. One came from the Vaikuntha planets, not from Brahman.

'return home, back to Godhead' 2x

'return to Godhead...the spiritual Vaikuntha planets, and in particular the planet known as Goloka Vrindavana.'

'One can go to the supreme planet (param vrajet) simply by chanting the Hare Krishna mantra...return home, back to Godhead.'

Our comment: Conclusion of this 4.29.48: Go back home, Svam lokam, meaning one's own and Krishna's home, the Vaikuntha planets or Goloka Vrindavana.

In text 6 of Anuccheda 100 of Sri Bhagavat-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami cites Srimad-Bhagavatam 10.87.14, which is one of the prayers of the personified Vedas.

jaya jaya jahy ajam ajita dosa-grbhita-gunam
tvam asi yad atmana samavaruddha-samasta-bhagah

aga-jagad-okasam akhila-sakty-avabodhaka te
kvacid ajayatmana ca carato 'nucaren nigamah

sri-srutayah ucuh—the Vedas said; jayajaya—victory to You, victory to You; jahi—please defeat; ajam—the eternal illusory potency of Maya; ajita—O unconquerable one; dosha—to create discrepancies; gribhita—who has assumed; gunam—the qualities of matter; tvam—You; asi—are; yat—because; atmana—in Your original status; samavaruddha—complete; samasta—in all; bhagah—opulences; aga—nonmoving; jagat—and moving; okasam—of those who possess material bodies; akhila—of all; sakti—the energies; avabodhaka—O You who awaken; te—You; kvacit—sometimes; ajaya—with Your material energy; atmana—and with Your internal, spiritual energy; ca—also; caratah—engaging; anucaret—can appreciate; nigamah—the Vedas.

The srutis said: Victory, victory to You, O unconquerable one! By Your very nature You are perfectly full in all opulences; therefore please defeat the eternal power of illusion, who assumes control over the modes of nature to create difficulties for conditioned souls. O You who awaken all the energies of the moving and nonmoving embodied beings, sometimes the Vedas can recognize You as You sport with Your material and spiritual potencies.

Comment: dosa-grbhita-guna, dosha—to create discrepancies; gribhita—who has assumed; gunam—the qualities of matter;

Jiva Goswami says: "Dosa here is the fault of ignorance, which makes the living entity forget the Supreme Personality of Godhead [atma-vismrti]."

Our comment: Forgetting implies that the knowledge of the Supreme Lord was once there. One may try to interpret vismrti in this statement to mean that the jiva has always been forgetting Krishna; that it is "an unchanging state of forgetfulness", but then other words should be used, eg simply stating "the soul is eternally without the vision -darsana- of Krishna", since according to the Oxford dictionary to forget means: "fail to remember or recall, lose the memory of, neglect stop thinking about, put out of one's mind." This is clearly describing going from 'knowing' to 'ignorance'.

More from this anuccheda.

The Lord asks; "By what action will I show my excellence?"

Srutis: You show it by destroying maya and giving bhakti: conquer maya (ajam jahi)

Lord: " Maya is a sakti with the functions of vidya and avidya. By destroying maya I will destroy vidya also." Srutis: Maya has accepted the quality of vidya, a cause of remembering you, with the fault of avidya, the cause of jiva forgetting atma. By her covering, maya creates the fault of avidya and sometimes, somewhere, somehow, maya leaves some jiva. There is thus fault in maya's quality of vidya whose nature is making maya leave the jiva (since maya has covered the jiva in the first place.) Thus, better to uproot maya completely and give the jivas bhakti to your lotus feet.

In text 6 of Anuccheda 103 of Sri Bhagavat-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami discusses the potencies of the Supreme Lord, as they are listed in Srimad-Bhagavatam 10.39.55.

sri-srutaya ucuh
jaya jaya jahy ajam ajita dosha-gribhita-gunam
tvam asi yad atmana samavaruddha-samasta-bhagah

aga-jagad-okasam akhila-sakty-avabodhaka te
kvacid aجاتmana ca carato 'nucaren nigamah

sunanda-nanda-pramukhaih—headed by Sunanda and Nanda; parshadaiih—by His personal attendants; sanaka-adibhih—by Sanaka Kumara and his brothers; sura-isaiih—by the chief demigods; brahma-rudra-adyaiih—headed by Brahma and Rudra; navabhih—nine; ca—and; dvija-uttamaiih—by the chief brahmanas (headed by Marici); prahrada-narada-vasu-pramukhaiih—headed by Prahlada, Narada and Uparicara Vasu; bhagavata-uttamaiih—by the most exalted devotees; stuyamanam—being praised; prithak-bhavaiih—by each in a different loving attitude; vacobhih—with words; amala-atmabhih—sanctified; sriya pushtya gira kantya kirtya tushtya ilaya urjaya—by His internal potencies Sri, Pushti, Gir, Kanti, Kirti, Tushti, Ila and Irja; vidyaya avidyaya—by His potencies of knowledge and ignorance; saktya—by His internal pleasure potency; mayaya—by His material creative potency; ca—and; nishevitam—being served.

Encircling the Lord and worshiping Him were Nanda, Sunanda and His other personal attendants; Sanaka and the other Kumaras; Brahma, Rudra and other chief demigods; the nine chief brahmanas; and the best of the saintly devotees, headed by Prahlada, Narada and Uparicara Vasu. Each of these great personalities was worshiping the Lord by chanting sanctified words of praise in his own unique mood. Also in attendance were the Lord's principal internal potencies—Sri, Pushti, Gir, Kanti, Kirti, Tushti, Ila and Irja—as were His material potencies Vidya, Avidya and Maya, and His internal pleasure potency, Sakti.

Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti explains the Lord's potencies mentioned in these verses: "Sri is the potency of wealth; Pushti that of strength; Gir, knowledge; Kanti, beauty; Kirti, fame; and Tushti, renunciation. These are the Lord's six opulences. Ila is His bhu-sakti, also known as sandhini, the internal potency of whom the element earth is an expansion. Irja is His internal potency for performing pastimes; she expands as the tulasi plant in this world. Vidya and Avidya [knowledge and ignorance] are external potencies who cause the living entities' liberation and bondage, respectively. Sakti is His internal pleasure potency, hladini, and Maya is an internal potency who is the basis of Vidya and Avidya. The word ca implies the presence of the Lord's marginal energy, the jiva-sakti, who is subordinate to Maya. Lord Vishnu was being served by all these personified potencies."

Jiva Goswami comments: sah bhedah samsarinam sva-svarupa-vismrty-adi-hetur avaranatmaka-vrtti-visesa.... meaning:

“The pastime potency is divided into knowledge and ignorance potencies. The ignorance potency, which makes one forget the Supreme Lord’s powers and opulences, brought the bliss of ecstatic love to Krishna’s mother (Yasoda). In the same way, it also bewildered the gopis, as is described in the Gopala-tapani Upanisad. This will be described in detail at the proper time. The material ignorance potency makes the conditioned souls in the material world forget the Supreme Personality of Godhead. It covers their true knowledge.“

Another translation: “Vidya of the first type (internal) causes realization of the Lord. This is a special function of the samvit-sakti. Vidya of the second, material type is the door to revelation of the first type of vidya. Avidya of the first type is the cause of forgetting the Lords' powers. It is a function of the bliss of prema of his mother and others. Gopi-janavidya-kala-prerakah: the Lord inspires the gopis with prema filled with ignorance of his powers. (Gopala-tapani Upanisad) This will be discussed in its proper place. The second type

of avidya is the cause of jiva's forgetting the Lord's svarupa, with the special function of covering the jiva....Samvit is the jnana and ajnana saktis (causing awareness of the Lord, and forgetting his powers).

Our comment: Again the word vismrti, forgetfulness, which means that there is some original knowledge that has been forgotten, due to the avidya-sakti. This ignorance potency covers the true knowledge of the soul.

In text 5 of Anuccheda 22, Jiva Goswami cites Srimad-Bhagavatam 3.26.5, which says that the conditioned souls are "illusioned by the knowledge-covering feature of the illusory energy."

gunair vicitrah srijatim
sa-rupah prakritim prajah
vilokya mumuhe sadyah
sa iha jnana-guhaya

gunaih—by the threefold modes; vicitrah—variegated; srijatim—creating; sa-rupah—with forms; prakritim—material nature; prajah—living entities; vilokya—having seen; mumuhe—was illusioned; sadyah—at once; sah—the living entity; iha—in this world; jnana-guhaya—by the knowledge-covering feature.

Divided into varieties by her threefold modes, material nature creates the forms of the living entities, and the living entities, seeing this, are illusioned by the knowledge—covering feature of the illusory energy.

Purport: It is stated in the previous verse that the material energy was accepted by the Supreme Personality of Godhead in order that He might exhibit pastimes for the living entities who wanted to enjoy and lord it over the material energy. (The Lord accepts the material energy for His material pastimes in creation, maintenance and dissolution. SB 3.26.4 p.) This world was created through the material energy of the Lord for the so-called enjoyment of such living entities. Why this material world was created for the sufferings of the conditioned souls is a very intricate question. There is a hint in the previous verse in the word lilaya, which means "for the pastimes of the Lord." The Lord wants to rectify the enjoying temperament of the conditioned souls. It is stated in Bhagavad-gita that no one is the enjoyer but the Supreme Personality of Godhead. This material energy is created, therefore, for anyone who pretends to enjoy. An example can be cited here that there is no necessity for the government's creation of a separate police department, but because it is a fact that some of the citizens will not accept the state laws, a department to deal with criminals is necessary. There is no necessity, but at the same time there is a necessity. Similarly, there was no necessity to create this material world...We say that they have been conditioned from time immemorial because no one can trace out when the living entity, the part and parcel of the Supreme Lord, became rebellious against the supremacy of the Lord.

It is a fact that there are two classes of men—those who are obedient to the laws of the Supreme Lord and those who are atheists or agnostics, who do not accept the existence of God and who want to create their own laws. They want to establish that everyone can create his own laws or his own religious path. Without tracing out the beginning of the existence of these two classes, we can take it for granted that some of the living entities revolted against the laws of the Lord...Covered by the material body, the spiritual identity is lost, and therefore the word mumuhe is used here, indicating that they have forgotten their own

spiritual identity. This forgetfulness of spiritual identity is present in the jivas, or souls, who are conditioned, being subject to be covered by the energy of material nature. Jnana-guhaya is another word used. Guha means "covering." Because the knowledge of the minute conditioned souls is covered, they are exhibited in so many species of life. Because they are forgetful of their spiritual identities, they think the material bodies to be themselves. To the conditioned soul, "me" means the material body. This is called moha, or bewilderment.

In text 7, Jiva Goswami cites Bhagavad-gita 5.15: "Embodied beings are bewildered, however, because of the ignorance that covers their true knowledge."

Bhagavad-gita 5.15-16.

nadatte kasyacit papam / na caiva sukrtam vibhuh
ajnanenavrtam jnanam / tena muhyanti jantavah
jnanena tu tad ajnanam / yesam nasitam atmanah
tesam aditya-vaj jnanam / prakasayati tat param

"Nor does the Supreme Lord assume anyone's sinful or pious activities. Embodied beings, however, are bewildered because of the ignorance which covers their real knowledge. When, however, one is enlightened with the knowledge by which nescience is destroyed, then his knowledge reveals everything, as the sun lights up everything in the daytime."

Sri Ramanuja's commentary: "The atma is transcendental to material nature...How then is it that the atma is thus shrouded by this vasana. Lord Krishna reveals that it is because of ignorance. It is ignorance which shrouds and obscures spiritual knowledge. Ignorance and nescience is that which is opposed to spiritual knowledge and wisdom. By the shrouding of ignorance ...the consciousness of the atma becomes obscured and the intelligence compromised, allowing the living entity to enter the perilous predicament of believing they are the enjoyer..

Although the intelligence may be shrouded by the veil of ignorance still it has been seen that there are those whose consciousness becomes awakened upon receiving Vedic knowledge."

Our comment on this: knowledge of Krishna was present, became shrouded, compromised, obscured and clouded, then becomes uncovered and awakened.

Kumara Vaisnava Sampradaya: Nimbadiya - Kesava Kasmiri comments: "The living entity's knowledge is obscured into a lesser quality like the light of a lamp is lessened when covered by a shaded glass although it does not change its nature. Contrarily when one has achieved atma tattva then in the state of moksa or liberation the destruction of the physical and subtle bodies reveals the knowledge of the atmas quality as the light of a lamp is more illuminating when the shaded glass cover is removed.... As the removal of the impurities obscuring a jewel allows its radiance to be seen; in the same way when the impurity of undesirable mundane qualities like lust and fruitiveness are removed and abandoned then the transcendental qualities of wisdom, renunciation and compassion reveal themselves in all their splendor. These qualities are always present without being created because they are eternally manifested as qualities of the atma."

Our comment on this: The metaphor is very enlightening. The soul was eternally effulgent with knowledge and bliss in the presence of Krishna. Just as the lamp shines by the energy of the powerhouse. Then these became 'obscured into a lesser quality'. Wisdom, renunciation and compassion were manifest in all their splendor, as a jewel has its radiance. Then

impurities obscured these. Then became again visible. In the brahmajyoti there is only sat (eternality), no cit (knowledge) and ananda (bliss). See CC. Adi 2.5. , thus is not the previous state of the soul.

Rudra Vaisnava Sampradaya: Visnuswami - Sridhara Swami's commentary: "Here Lord Krishna is emphasizing that persons whose spiritual knowledge has become awakened do not become deluded in the material existence."

Our comment: "awakened" means Krishna-consciousness was present, then became dormant, and then returned.

Madhvacarya: "On account of the power of understanding being obstructed by nescience, the jiva's do not know or see Him."

Comment: the soul's powers are obstructed. Eternal dormant knowledge is already rejected; Brahman has only brahma-vadis who will fall to maya; it is not a fountain of 'new' souls, for the first time aroused into activities after eternal coma. Nor are the souls eternally in the material world; why have the material world at all? Thus the soul was fully active, then obstructed and punished by maya.

Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura: "One of the associates, His sakti called ignorance, covers the inherent knowledge of the jiva.

Baladeva Vidyabhusana: "The knowledge of the jiva, though eternal, disappears from view (avrtam)."

Bhaktivedanta purport: A living entity is, by superior nature, full of knowledge. Nevertheless, he is prone to be influenced by ignorance due to his limited power. The Lord is omnipotent, but the living entity is not. The Lord is vibhu, or omniscient, but the living entity is anu, or atomic. Because he is a living soul, he has the capacity to desire by his free will. Such desire is fulfilled only by the omnipotent Lord. And so, when the living entity is bewildered in his desires, the Lord allows him to fulfill those desires... the embodied soul, by his immemorial desire to avoid Krishna consciousness, causes his own bewilderment. Consequently, although he is constitutionally eternal, blissful and cognizant, due to the littleness of his existence he forgets his constitutional position of service to the Lord and is thus entrapped by nescience.... Those who have forgotten Krishna must certainly be bewildered.

Anuccheda 37 of Sri Paramatma-sandarbhā: "Thus, though jiva is a sakti, it is different from the material sakti, since it is called tatastha. It is called tatastha because it cannot be classed as maya since it surpasses maya-sakti (being conscious). And it cannot be classed as Paramatma since Paramatma is not subject to jiva's fault of being overcome by ignorance. Though it is the sakti of Paramatma, Paramatma is not tinged by jiva's faults just as the sun is not covered though one ray of the sun can be covered by shadow. Narada-pancaratra describes the tatastha position: yat tatastham tu cid-rupam sva-samvedyad vinirgatam ranjitam guna-ragena sa jiva iti kathyate The jiva is called tatastha because it is a conscious form which, leaving its knowledge of itself, becomes tinged by the attraction to material gunas."

Another translation: "The marginal potency, spiritual by nature, who emanates from My [saMvit] energy, and who becomes tainted by his attachment to the material modes, is called the jIva."

Jiva Gosvami continues: Although the jIva is thus the Lord's marginal potency, he is equivalent to an aMsa, as stated in the Supreme Lord's own words, mamaivAMso jIva-loke jIva-bhUtaH sanAtanaH (Bg 15.7), and also in the words of the MahA-varAha PurANa,

svAMsas cAtha vibhinnAMsa iti dvidhA sa iSyate aMsino yat
tu sAmarthyaM yat-svarUpaM yathA sthitiH
tad eva nANu-mAtro 'pi bhedaM svAMsAMsinoH kvacit
vibhinnAMso 'lpa-saktiH syAt kincit sAmarthya-mAtra-yuk

"The Lord is described in two ways, in terms of His plenary expansions and His separated expansions. Between the plenary expansion and His source of expansion there is never the slightest difference, according to Their capabilities, form or environment. The separated expansion possesses only minute potency, being endowed only to a small extent with the Lord's capabilities."

Comment: the minute potency, being endowed only to a small extent with the Lord's capabilities becomes tainted by his attachment to the material modes. This is not nitya-patita, eternally fallen.

Text 19 of Anuccheda 37 of Sri Paramatma-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami says:

When he becomes free from ignorance and situated in his original constitutional position, the soul is said to be liberated. In this liberated condition his spiritual nature is like that of the Lord Himself.

The Sanskrit is:

At evavidya vimoksa purvaka svarupavasthiti laksanayam muktau tal linasya tat
sadharmyapattir bhavati

The word meanings are: ata eva—therefore; avidya—ignorance; vimoksa—liberation; purvaka—before; svarupa—own form; avasthiti—situation; laksanayam—in the nature; muktau—liberated; tal-linasya—merged into Him; tat-sadharmyapattih—attainment of His nature; bhavati—is.

The words purvaka-svarupavasthiti indicate that the original constitutional position was in fact experienced in the past, before the soul entered the conditioned state. The soul's state after liberation is thus the same as the soul's state before the soul became conditioned. This state is described as being of the same nature as that of the Lord, who displays various opulences. We can therefore conclude that the soul, before it became conditioned, was displaying opulences, just as it will after final liberation.

Text 1 of Anuccheda 47 of Sri Paramatma-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami says:

Thus the Lord's marginal potencies, who are called the individual spirit souls, are limitless in number. Still, they may be divided into two groups: 1. the souls who, from time immemorial, are favorable to the Lord (anadita eva bhagavad-unmukhah), and 2. the rebellious souls who, from time immemorial, are averse to the Supreme Lord (anadita eva bhagavat-paranmukhah).

This is because one group is aware of the Lord's glories and the other group is not aware of them.

In text 3 of Anuccheda 47 of Sri Paramatma-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami says, after having described the eternally liberated souls in text 2:

aparas tu tat-paranmukhatva-dosena labdha-chidraya mayaya paribhutah samsari.

In this part of text 3, aparas tu means "but others." Tat-paranmukhatva-dosena means "with the defect of being averse to the Supreme Personality of Godhead." Labdha-chidraya is "faulty." Or Labdha "get" or "obtain." Chidra means "fault," and chidraya is the instrumental case. So labdha-chidraya means "by having obtained the state of being faulty." Labdha is generally used when one obtains something that one did not previously have. This indicates the original state of the soul is "not faulty." But by becoming averse to Krishna, the soul becomes faulty. Then what happens? Mayaya paribhutah samsari. Such souls, says Jiva Goswami, "become conquered (paribhutah) by the illusory potency maya and must live in the material world (samsari)."

Another translation: "The other type, overcome by maya which has gained access to the jiva because of jiva's aversion to the Lord, is born repeatedly in the material world."

There is no anadi-patita vada here. The jiva 'became' overcome by maya. Maya gained access to the jiva. The jiva did not originally come from Brahman.

"Because he falls down from brahma-sayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krishna... in His lila or sport." (SPL, 1973)

Thus, a nitya-mukta became averse, then maya captured him.

Text 4 of Anuccheda 47 of Sri Paramatma-sandarbha. There Jiva Goswami cites Srimad-Bhagavatam 11.2.37,

bhayam dvitiyabhinivesatah syad
isad apetasya viparyayo 'smritih

bhayam—fear; dvitiya—in something seeming to be other than the Lord; abhinivesatah—because of absorption; syat—it will arise; isat—from the Supreme Lord; apetasya—for one who has turned away; viparyayah—misidentification; asmritih—forgetfulness; tat—of the Lord; mayaya—by the illusory energy

"Fear arises when a living entity misidentifies himself as the material body because of absorption in the external, illusory energy of the Lord. When the living entity thus turns away from the Supreme Lord, he also forgets his own constitutional position as a servant of the Lord. This bewildering, fearful condition is effected by the potency for illusion, called maya."

Another translation: "For the jiva averse to the Lord, there will be samsara consisting of identity with body and lack of identity with the soul, because of his absorption in the material coverings on the soul, arising from the Lord's maya.

Another: “When the living entity is attracted by the material energy, which is separate from Krishna, he is overpowered by fear. Because he is separated from the Supreme Personality of Godhead by the material energy, his conception of life is reversed. In other words, instead of being the eternal servant of Krishna, he becomes Krishna’s competitor. This is called viparyayo ’smrtih.”

Another: “The first result of contact with maya (ignorance) was mistaken identity concerning the jiva’s true form. Forgetting his spiritual form, the jiva took on a material form, and through his self-identity fell into deep forgetfulness of his role as servant of the Lord. Maya bestowed two coverings--the gross and subtle bodies- over the spiritual form.”

In Bhakti-sandarbhā Anuccheda 1, Text 9, Jiva Goswami then gives Sridhara Swami’s commentary on this Bhagavatam verse:

Sridhara Swami comments: “The fear here is created by the Lord’s material energy. Budhah means ‘an intelligent person,’ and abhajat means ‘should worship.’ Fear is created by absorption (abhinivesatah) in material things, beginning with the material body. It is created by the false ego of identifying with the material body and other material things. It is created because the original spiritual form of the living entity is not manifest. Why does the material energy (maya) do this? Because the living entity has turned away from the Supreme Lord (isad apetasya), the material energy makes him forget (asmrtih), and thus his own original spiritual form is no longer manifested. From this comes the misidentification (viparyayah) of thinking ‘I am this body.’ Thus, from being absorbed in something other than the Supreme Lord (dvitiyabhinivesatah) fear (bhayam) is created.”

Comment: Again this word asmrtih. Maya induces forgetfulness.

The words “instead of being the eternal servant of Krishna” indicate that the original position is servant of Krishna. Instead of remaining in this position, the soul “becomes Krishna’s competitor.” “Becoming” indicates that the original position was something else, and that original position has already been described as “being the eternal servant of Krishna.” If one wants to propose that originally the soul was in a neutral or undefined position or somewhere outside of Krishna-lila, then the proper expression would have been “instead of becoming the eternal servant of Krishna, he becomes Krishna’s competitor.” But then the expression “his conception of life is reversed” makes no sense. Reversal means the original position has to be servant of Krishna. And again this word asmrtih. Maya induces forgetfulness. The soul knew Krishna, and then “fail to remember or recall, lose the memory of, neglect stop thinking about, put out of one’s mind.”

In the brahma-jyotir, the souls are not aware of Krishna. One of the functions of the brahma-jyotir is to veil Krishna and His pastimes. Neither are original spiritual forms manifest by the souls in the brahma-jyotir, who are described as atomic in form. Here it is also stated that we have forgotten our original form and relationship with Krishna. But if we are eternally fallen in the brahma-jyotir, there is no question of forgetting this. There would be nothing to forget.

Text 2 of Anuccheda 72 of Sri Paramatma-sandarbhā, Jiva Goswami cites Srimad-Bhagavatam 12.5.5:

"Just as when a pot is broken the sky [within the pot] would continue to be sky as before, similarly when the body is dead the jiva again attains to the absolute status."

Srila Sridhara Svami explains this verse as follows:

"Just as before (yatha pura) means just as before the designation of 'pot' [i.e. before the sky in the pot became designated by the shape and covering of the pot as 'the air in the pot'], so again when the pot is broken the sky that was within that pot would be sky alone [without the designation 'pot']. So as that is the case, similarly when the body is dead, that is when by knowledge of the truth the body is merged [back into matter]."

There is nothing in the commentaries of Vamsidhara, Viraraghava, Vijayadhvaja Tirtha, Sri Jiva Gosvami, Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura or the other commentators that in any way changes or even gives an indirect additional sense for what is obviously being stated here in Srimad-Bhagavatam: that the soul, once existing in a pure state, becomes covered by a material body and then returns to the same pure state as before. The words yatha pura, "just as before," are significant, for if one wishes to claim that the soul originally comes from the brahma-jyotir or some other surrogate pure status that is not the abode of the Lord, then the soul will return to the same state.

In text 2 of Anuccheda 83 of Sri Paramatma-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami cites Srimad-Bhagavatam 12.4.33 ghano yadarka-prabhavo vidiryate

caksuh svarupam ravim iksate tada
yada hy ahankara upadhir atmano
jjinasaya nasyati tarhy anusmaret

The translation of SB 12.4.32 as introduction and 12.4.33 is:

Although a cloud is a product of the sun and is also made visible by the sun, it nevertheless creates darkness for the viewing eye, which is another partial expansion of the sun. Similarly, material false ego, a particular product of the Absolute Truth made visible by the Absolute Truth, obstructs the individual soul, another partial expansion of the Absolute Truth, from realizing the Absolute Truth. brahma-amsakasya—of the partial expansion of the Absolute Truth; atmanah—of the jiva soul When the cloud originally produced from the sun is torn apart, the eye can see the actual form of the sun. Similarly, when the spirit soul destroys his material covering of false ego by inquiring into the transcendental science, he regains his original spiritual awareness. (anusmaret—one gains his proper remembrance)

Comment: he regains his original spiritual awareness. (anusmaret—one gains his proper remembrance)

Text 2 of Anuccheda 91 gives the Srimad-Bhagavatam 3.7.10 text:

yad arthena vinamusya
pumsa atma-viparyayah
pratiyata upadrastuh
sva-siras-chedanadibhih

“The living entity is in distress regarding his self-identity. He has no factual background, like a man who dreams that he sees his head cut off.”

Jiva comments: Because of maya (yat), though it is without purpose in past, present and future (arthena vina api), the jiva forgets his identity and thinks he is something else (atma-viparyayah). Because of maya, the jiva's loss of knowledge and bliss makes its appearance. This is the meaning. In a dream it is perceived by the jiva (upadrastuh) that his head is cut

off, which is impossible. His head has not been cut off and no one has seen this take place. But the Lord's maya, accomplishing this, imposes this display on the jiva. Atma-viparyayah indicates that the conditioned soul has forgotten his true identity.

Another translation of this verse. "Because of maya, the jiva's loss of knowledge and bliss makes its appearance without cause or purpose. The loss is illusory, just the seer of a dream experiencing his head being cut off is illusory."

Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura comments. The jiva situated behind the Lord with beginningless aversion loses knowledge by beginningless ignorance which is also situated behind the Lord. There is no cause and no purpose for the jiva doing this. This is the nature of tamas that it eclipses the power of the jiva, who has only small power.

Because of maya, the loss of knowledge and bliss (atma-viparyayah) of the jiva (pumsah) appears to be without cause or goal (arthena). Medini says that artha means object of the senses, wealth, cause, thing, meaning of a word, prevention and goal. An example is given. The seer of a dream (drashtuh), near himself (upa), sees his head is cut off. Though his head is intact, in the dream state he experiences that his head is gone. Though the jiva does not actually have a destruction of knowledge and bliss, in a state of ignorance he perceives this destruction. The brilliant luster of gold and silver is not lost by darkness, but is only covered. Just as a very brilliant ruby destroys even darkness, the life of the devotee destroys even ignorance.

Our comment: The pure spiritual body, his true identity, sat-cit-ananda-vigraha was eternally, completely there, before the forgetfulness.

"no cause" means the cause is in the spiritual world. And 'no purpose' means no substance but shadow.

In text 22 of Anuccheda 111, Bhakti-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami says: "Devotional service to the Supreme Personality of Godhead is eternal." This does not make sense if we say that some souls were originally, eternally, in a state of nondevotional service in the brahma-jyotir. The truth is that the souls are in the jyoti only for very a short time, without service. Eternally, originally the soul was in Krishna lila, then a short time the nightmare of maya and the last snare of maya-Brahman-, then return back to eternal devotional service.

In text 1 of Anuccheda 112 of Sri Bhakti-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami goes on to quote Bhagavatam 11.14.25:

"Just as gold, when smelted in fire, gives up its impurities and returns to its pure brilliant state, similarly, the spirit soul, absorbed in the fire of bhakti-yoga, is purified of all contamination caused by previous fruitive activities and returns to its original position of serving Me in the spiritual world."

Jiva Goswami comments: "This verse means: 'With love shaking away (vidhuya) past karma, the devotee attains his original pure spiritual form and then engages in serving (bhajati) Me (mam).'" The words Jiva Goswami uses for "attains his original pure spiritual form" are suddha svarupam ca prapya.

Commentary BBT: "this verse indicates that the devotee goes back to the spir world and there worships Lord Krishna in his original spiritual body, which is compared to the original pure form of smelted gold."

In Anuccheda 178 of Sri Bhakti-sandarbha, text 1, Jiva Goswami says:

iyam akincanakhya bhaktir eva jivanam svabhavata ucita. svabhavika-tad-asraya hi jivah.

iyam—thus; akincanakhya bhaktih—pure devotional service; eva—indeed; jivanam—of the living entities; svabhavata—by nature; ucita—is said; svabhavika-tad-asraya—taking shelter of their own natures; hi—indeed; jivah—the living entities.

Engagement in pure devotional service is the natural position of all living entities.

Jiva Goswami adds: Thus the individual spirit souls are part and parcel of the Supreme Personality of Godhead. They are His potencies. They naturally take shelter of Him (tad-asrayatvam).

Question and answer:

“We do not begin with any experience of anything at all, intrinsic or extrinsic. If we began with an experience of the intrinsic reality centered on All-Attractive Krishna, we would not be able to explore any interest in anything extrinsic, because the bliss of experiencing Krishna is “sandrananda visesa” – it completely obliterates awareness of any other massively inferior form of happiness or fascination. Therefore the jiva is described as anadi-bhagavad-ajñana (“beginninglessly unaware of the All-Attractive”).

Answer. Another version of nitya-patita-vada; this one that we were not eternally in the material world. We were eternally zero, sunyavadis. Then we got put in the prison, Durga, without having had any experience of the free world, the citizens or the King and Queen. And not having done any criminal act against anyone. (If we would have met anything or anyone of the free world, we would be in the free world, with no chance of ever getting out of it. We would have never been able to end up in the prison.)

The same argument we have with the material scientists; both have no proof from practical life. In Nyaya you need an example for your argument.

All mano-dharma– fantasies.

Displeasing Me, do fall into the mortal world

“For so long (ciram) I have been eager to see you!”

commentary: The Lord stated from the heart that He had been waiting a long time for Gopa-kumara to come to Vaikuntha.

“My dear friend, you have passed many lifetimes (bahuni janmani) without paying any attention to Me at all.”

“For so long, hope had me dancing like a fool, thinking, “Perhaps in this lifetime, or this, or this, or this, he will finally turn his face towards Me.”

Commentary: Even though Gopa-kumara had forgotten his Lord for many lifetimes, the Lord had never forgotten him. The Lord wanted Gopa-kumara to know this, and also to know how eager the Lord had always been to regain the association of His devotee.

(Bṛhad Bhagavatamṛta 2.4.81-82 + Sanatana Gosvami’s commentary)

There were some questions on the details of Krishna-loka-fall-vada (the fall of the soul), and scriptural authority for these.

Many reasons

The reasons and details of the fall of the tatastha-jiva are many, just as in this world if you consult the lawbook of any country, you find long lists of crimes and punishments. We will give what we found in scripture:

- Lust.

Question: “In Krishna book it says that there were some color fighting in Dvaraka. They were throwing color. And some men became lusty seeing the women. So, will that be the first part of their falldown, to be in Vaikuntha and think of personal lust with Krishna’s associates?”

Srila Prabhupada: Yes.” (Srila Prabhupada Conversation, Mayapur, February 19, 1976)

- Foul play.

In the Srimad Bhagavatam lecture 1.7.16, Vrndavana, Srila Prabhupada explains that some fell down from playing football in Krishna-loka.

“...so long the spark is within the fire, it has got the same quality, illumination and burning quality. But as soon as he falls down- he is extinguished, no more illumination, no more burning power. So our position is like that. Although we are part and parcel of God, mamaivamso [Bg. 15.7], because we have cyuta, fallen down from our spiritual atmosphere...Just like spiritual atmosphere, Krishna’s friends, cowherd boys, they’re playing with Krishna. That is also playing. And here in this material world the boys they also play football play. But these two plays are different. One is spiritual and another is material...There are three chances. One chance is the spark falls down on dry grass-then there is fire. As soon as the spark falls down on the dry grass there is fire for some time. And when the spark falls down on the ground, it is extinguished. And when the fire, spark, falls down on the water, then it is not only extinguished; it becomes no more inflammable. Very difficult to inflame. Similarly, when we fall down from the fire, spiritual world, we associate with three qualities.”

In Srimad Bhagavatam 10.11.39 it says

“Sometimes Krishna and Balarama would play on Their flutes, sometimes They would throw ropes and stones devised for getting fruits from the trees, sometimes They would throw only stones, and sometimes, Their ankle bells tinkling, They would play football with fruits like bael and amalaki. Sometimes They would cover Themselves with blankets and imitate cows and bulls and fight with one another, roaring loudly, and sometimes They would imitate the voices of the animals. In this way They enjoyed sporting, exactly like two ordinary human children.”

(Myrobalans = amalaki; woodapples = bael)

Next Srila Prabhupada explains how a devil player gets a red card, and is immediately driven away from the game. He missed the goal of the game: to please Krishna.

Arnold Weiss: In the beginning, when we were first part of God.. our souls are also part of God, as a drop of water is part of that ocean...Is there any knowledge or information of how we incurred this first separation from God?

Prabhupada: Separation... Generally, when we want to become God, there is separation.

Arnold Weiss: A rebellion.

Prabhupada: You cannot... There is one God, and if you want to become God, you are immediately driven away: "Just become God in the material world. Go there and try to become God."

Dr. Wolfe: Prabhupada? There is a parallel in the Bible that Lucifer broke away from God because He wanted to be God.

Prabhupada: That's it. (laughs) This rascaldom... This rascaldom makes him a dog. Instead of God, he become a dog. ..Nobody can become God; God is one. Ekam brahma dvitiam nasti. So how we can become God? But that endeavor is going on.

Arnold Weiss: Isn't it within the nature of our souls to have...

Prabhupada: That is the nature, little independence. That is the nature. You can properly use independence, and you can improperly use. That is the meaning of independence. That you can use it improperly. Then you suffer. That is the meaning of independence. If it is that I have got independence and - I cannot use it otherwise - that is not independence.

(Conversation—June 9, 1976, Los Angeles)

- The desire to enjoy separately awakens, have to enter into the material world under the false conception of being a male (a purusa).

sei to' ananda-lila ja'r nai anta
ataeva Krishna-lila akhanda ananta

There is no end to all of these blissful pastimes; therefore Krishna's pastimes are known for being undisputedly supreme and unlimited.

je-sab jiber 'bhoga-banca upajilo
purusa bhavete ta'ra jade paravesilo

All the souls, in whom the desire to enjoy separately awaken, have to enter into the material world under the false conception of being a male (a purusa).

maya-karya jada maya--nitya-sakti-chaya

Krishna-dasi sei satya, kara-kartri maya

Illusory material activities as well as maya herself are both the shadow reflections of the eternal potency. In reality, maya is the eternal maidservant of Krishna, but her job is to be in charge of operating the prison-house of the material world.

sei maya adarser samasta bisesa
loiya gathilo bisva jahe purna klesa

This illusory energy maya, has created the material universe exactly like an imitation model of the real spiritual variegatedness, but with the added feature of being full of various miseries.

jiba jadi hoilena Krishna-bahimukha
mayadevi tabe ta'r jachilena sukha

If by chance a living entity becomes averse to the Supreme Lord Krishna, then Mayadevi's duty is to voluntarily offer her temptations of material happiness.

maya-sukhe matta jiba sri-Krishna bhulilo
sei se avidya-base asmita janmilo

Intoxicated by maya's illusory happiness, the living entity then forgets Krishna. Under the influence of such ignorance, false egoistic selfishness arises.

ataeva brndavana jiber avasa
asar samsare nitya-tattver prakasa

Therefore Vrndavana is the living entities original eternal home, manifesting its own eternally true nature within the dead material world.” (Kalyana kalpataru, Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura)

- The soul's smallness:

sphulinga riddhagner iva cid-anavo jiva-nicaya
hareh suryasyevaprithag api tad-bheda-vishayah
vashe maya yasya prakriti-patir eveshvara iha
sa jivo mikto 'pi prakriti-vasha-yogyah sva-gunatah

sphulingah—sparks; riddha—large; agneh—of a fire; iva—just like; cit—of spiritual energy; anavah—atoms; jiva--of living entities; nicayah—multitudes; hareh—of Lord Hari; suryasya—of the sun; iva—just like; aprithak—not different; api—and; tat—from that; bheda-vishayah—different; vashe—in the control; maya—illusory potency, maya; yasya—of whom; prakriti—of material energy; patih—the master; eva—certainly; ishvarah—controller; iha—here; sah—He; jivah—the living entity; mukta—liberated; api—although; prakriti—of material nature; vasha—to the control; yogyah—suitable; sva—own; gunatah--because of the quality.

Just as the sparks are to a great fire, and just as the particles of sunlight are to the sun, in the same way, the living entities are simultaneously one and different from Lord Hari. Lord

Hari is always the supreme master of the illusory potency maya, whereas the living entities, even in the liberated condition, are liable to become subject to the influence of maya, because of their smallness.” (T 80 Shri Gauranga-Lila-Smarana-Mangala-Stotram, Auspicious Verses for Remembering Lord Gauranga’s Pastimes)

– To abandon worship Gopinatha and instead worship the samsara

gopinatha, ami to' tomar jana
tomare chadiya, samsar bhajinu,
bhuliya apana-dhana

Oh Gopinatha, I am actually Your eternal devotee, but somehow or other I have abandoned You to worship this useless material world. Thus I have completely forgotten about the supreme treasure which is my birthright. (Song 2.4 – Gopinatha, KrishnaKrishnaKrishnaSong 1 – Sambandha, Relationship with Krishna)

– The soul is vulnerable, thus falls from participation in the Supreme Lord’s pastimes.

“As long as the jiva takes full shelter of the Supreme Lord he remains a resident of the spiritual planets, but when he forgets the innate spiritual knowledge about the Lord he is placed outside the transcendental realm. The jiva is compared to a ray of the sun, but under the cloud of maya, or the illusory energy, his conditioned state is an unconstitutional and hence unnatural term of existence. The jiva exists to support and participate in the Supreme Lord's transcendental pastimes, but his marginal nature makes him vulnerable and can bring him under maya's spell, to suffer the pangs of repeated birth and death. But as soon as the individual spiritual spark awakens to realize his original self, the dark mist of ignorance, or maya, dissipate, and the long suffering of repeated birth and death at last comes to a halt. He regains his true spiritual identity.”

Sri Sanmodana Bhashyam - Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura’ s commentary on Lord Sri Caitanya Mahaprabhu Sri Sikshashtaka (1)

– The soul become obsessed with his own separate so-called happiness

Question: Are all souls of one type, or are there different relative levels?

Answer: There are different relative levels among the jivas.

Question: How many levels are there?

Answer: There are basically two: the level of the jiva's real and eternal form (svarupa), and the level of the jiva's dream of a false material designation (upadhi).

Question: Why don't all souls remain in their true position, free from material designation?

Answer: Those souls who accept nothing other than service as their eternal occupation never lose their transcendental position (svarupa). Their attraction to Krishna is everlasting. But those who become obsessed with their own separate so-called happiness turn away from Krishna and are immediately shackled by maya in the prison of the material world.” (VSM 7: Different Levels of Jivas, Seventh Chapter, Different Levels of Jivas)

Our comment: “remain in their true position” they were in nitya-mukti, but in the spiritual planets “those who become obsessed with their own separate so-called happiness turn away from Krishna and are immediately shackled by maya in the prison of the material world.”

– **Rebellion:**

"The soul's original nature (the nature of the liberated soul) becomes reflected in the mind of the soul imprisoned in the world of matter. When the rebellious soul turns away from the Supreme Lord, the spiritual love that is part of the soul's original nature becomes changed into love for the objects of the material senses." (Prema-pradipa, p. 89) Because of that rebellion, Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura sings in Baul Sangit (12), the soul leaves the company of Radha-Syama in Vraja-Dhama.

“Leaving the company of Radha-Syama in Vraja-Dhama (ChAdi’rAdhA-syAme braja-dhAme) you have come to this material world and suffered a host of painful miseries (bhugcho hethA nAnA-klesa).

You are actually composed of pure spiritual knowledge and bliss (tumi suddha cidAnanda) whose only happiness is found in service to Krishna (Krishna-sevA tA’r Ananda). Alas, you have fallen into the hands of the material elements (panca-bhUter hAte pode’ hAy) trapped within the prison-house of Maya-devi (mAyA-devir kArAgAre).”

– **Forgets his constitutional position as Krishna's servant :**

"If we accept that the jivas (nitya-baddha jivas) are created with material characteristics, then Mayavada creeps in and establishes itself. Jivas are pure spiritual entities. Due to his tatastha nature, he is susceptible to be bound by maya. That happens only when he forgets his constitutional position as Krishna's servant." (Sri Caitanya Sikshamritam, p. 49)

– Misidentification of jiva's own svarupa and oblivion of Krishna's svarupa, then comes aversion to Krishna

"Misidentification of jiva's own svarupa and oblivion of Krishna's svarupa are the two great evils. From these evils arises jiva's aversion to Krishna and on account of this aversion jiva falls into cyclic rotation of karma-marga, created by maya." (Sri Caitanya Sikshamritam, p. 196)

According to Oxford dictionary to forget means ‘fail to remember or recall, lose the memory of, neglect stop thinking about, put out of one’s mind.’ The soul changed from Krishna consciousness to non Krishna consciousness.

– **Apurna, incomplete, due to extremely diminutive size and vulnerability**

The atomic part and parcel of God, jiva's spiritual form, is certainly faultless but incomplete, due to his extremely diminutive size and vulnerability. The only visible weakness in this faultless condition is that in a close encounter with maya-sakti (illusory potency) his spiritual form is capable of becoming eclipsed and concealed. This is how Srimad-Bhagavatam describes it:

ye 'nye 'ravindaksha vimukta-maninas
tvayy asta-bhavad avisuddha-buddhayah
aruhya kricchrena param padam tatah
patanty adho 'nadrita-yushmad-anghrayah
(Bhag. 10.2.32)

"O lotus-eyed one, those who think they are liberated in this life but do not render devotional service to You have impure intelligence. Although they accept severe austerities and

penances and rise to the spiritual position to impersonal Brahman realization, they fall down again because they neglect to worship Your lotus feet."

Thus we see that however elevated a position a liberated soul may attain, his incomplete constitution stays permanently with him-this is the definition of jiva-tattva. (Jaiva Dharma)

- Seeking after their own pleasure, turned away from Krishna

"In his true nature the jiva is the devoted servant of Krishna. The jivas, who have gone astray against that nature of theirs due to their seeking after their own pleasure, turned away from Krishna and as such, became punishable." (Jaiva-dharma, p. 240)

-The individual souls who have turned their faces away from Lord Krishna are attracted to the bewildering variety of Maya's world:

“phalgum nirarthakam viddhi
sarvam jadamayam jagat
bahirmukhasya jivasya
griham eva puratanam

phalgum—false; nirarthakam—useless; viddhi—please know; sarvam—all; jadamayam—material; jagat—universe; bahirmukhasya—who has turned his face away; jivasya—of the soul; griham—home; eva—indeed; puratanam—ancient.

“Please know that the material world is meaningless and illusory. It is an ancient prison house for the souls who have turned their faces from the Supreme Lord.

Commentary by Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura

The material world is meaningless and illusory. It is an ancient prison house for the souls who have turned their faces from the Supreme Lord.

The material world created by Maya is a useless and illusory place for the individual souls, who are small particles of spirit. Why do the individual souls reside in this worthless place? The answer to this question is that the material world is an ancient prison for the individual souls who have turned their faces away from the Supreme Lord. Only the souls who have turned their faces away from the Supreme Lord have entered the material world. The souls who do not turn their faces away from the Supreme Lord remain always free from the prison of matter. They do not enter the material world. They stay always in the spiritual world. The Maya-sakti (potency of material illusion) is always under Lord Krishna's control. As darkness must stay always far away from the shining sun, so the illusory potency Maya must stay always far away from Lord Krishna, far away from the spiritual world. The individual souls who have turned their faces away from Lord Krishna are attracted to the bewildering variety of Maya's world. In this way they fall under Maya's spell. In truth the individual souls are always beyond the modes of material nature. But when they fall under Maya's spell, the individual souls think they themselves are products of the material modes. Then they try to enjoy the pathetic pleasures the three material modes offer. That is the condition of the souls who have turned their faces away from the Supreme Lord. The other spirit souls, the souls who remain in the spiritual world, do not turn their faces away from the Supreme Lord. Only the souls who turn their faces away from the Supreme Lord leave the spiritual world and go to the world of matter.” (Tattva viveka, Dvitiyanubhava, 12)

Our comment : There is no Brahman-border-fall here.

Note: the theory that the soul is originally since nonbeginning time in the Brahman effulgence, then falls out to the border of matter and spirit, gets to gaze at both and chooses for one. Unfortunately for this idea it is not in scripture. It is also not logical and righteous; the idea that a short gaze from the border can give pure love of Godhead, and looking at maya, the hell of the material world for many maha-kalpas. It is another story; conditioned souls must struggle in religious rituals for many many lifetimes and that soul in a few seconds gets the mercy of Krishna-consciousness?

Besides, the souls in Brahman are all impersonalists who had become liberated, but now fall down due to loneliness, emptiness. This we read in Srimad Bhagavatam 10.2.32

ye 'nye 'ravindaksha vimukta-maninas
tvayy asta-bhavad avisuddha-buddhayah
aruhya kricchrena param padam tatah
patanty adho 'nadrita-yushmad-anhrayah

ye anye—anyone, or all others; aravinda-aksha—O lotus-eyed one; vimukta-maninah—falsely considering themselves free from the bondage of material contamination; tvayi—unto You; asta-bhavad—speculating in various ways but not knowing or desiring more information of Your lotus feet; avisuddha-buddhayah—whose intelligence is still not purified and who do not know the goal of life; aruhya—even though achieving; kricchrena—by undergoing severe austerities, penances and hard labor; param padam—the highest position (according to their imagination and speculation); tatah—from that position; patanti—they fall; adha—down into material existence again; anadrita—neglecting devotion to; yushmat—Your; anhrayah—lotus feet.

[Someone may say that aside from devotees, who always seek shelter at the Lord's lotus feet, there are those who are not devotees but who have accepted different processes for attaining salvation. What happens to them? In answer to this question, Lord Brahma and the other demigods said:] O lotus-eyed Lord, although nondevotees who accept severe austerities and penances to achieve the highest position may think themselves liberated, their intelligence is impure. They fall down from their position of imagined superiority because they have no regard for Your lotus feet.

They don't get the darsana of the Lord at the border of matter and spirit, while falling down. They get that

“bahunam janmanam ante
jnanavan mam prapadyate
vasudevah sarvam iti
sa mahatma su-durlabhah

After many births and deaths, he who is actually in knowledge surrenders unto Me, knowing Me to be the cause of all causes and all that is. Such a great soul is very rare.” (Bhagavad-Gita 7.19)

By getting the mercy of guru and Krishna.

Tattva viveka says clearly that some souls who don't turn away, they stay in the spiritual world, but some turn away from residence in the spiritual world. In other words, that the

original position is residence in the spiritual world, with their faces turned towards the Supreme Lord. That is not residence in Brahman.

– **In Krishna-samhita these details are given : 1. residing in Vaikuntha, 2. minute independence, 3. giving up spiritual activities, 4. becoming situated in their own happiness, becoming shelterless, unsteady, 5. compelled to take shelter of Maya, 6. the first knot of nescience, in the form of false ego, entangles them.**

“The constitutional position of a pure living entity is beyond the gross and subtle bodies. The samvit aspect of the external potency is known in the scriptures as nescience. Due to this nescience, the gross and subtle bodies of the living entities are created. When pure living entities reside in Vaikuntha, the first knot of nescience, in the form of false ego, does not entangle them. Pure living entities cannot remain steady after giving up spiritual activities. Therefore as soon as the living entities become situated in their own happiness through the minute independence given by the Lord, they become shelterless and are compelled to take shelter of Maya. On account of this, pure living entities have no shelter other than Vaikuntha. The living entities of Vaikuntha are very insignificant, like fireflies in comparison to the powerful sunlike Lord. As soon as the living entity leaves Vaikuntha, he is simultaneously awarded a subtle body and thrown into the material world, created by Maya.” (Krishna-samhita 2.41)

– More details of the above mentioned steps 3-6; (3. giving up spiritual activities, 4. becoming situated in their own happiness, becoming shelterless, unsteady, 5. compelled to take shelter of Maya, 6. the first knot of nescience, in the form of false ego, entangles them.) are explained by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura in his book “Vaisnava and Brahmana”. The hari-jana-khanda of that book describes what happens at the border of the spiritual and material worlds.

Our comments, based on Jaiva dharma– Bhaktivinoda, are in between brackets:

“The jiva is pure, without material designations. He is not serving the Supreme Lord (anymore). He is in santa-rasa and its tatastha-bava is constitutional. He has no taste for serving the Lord due to lack of knowledge (which he lost).

The propensity for serving the Supreme Lord is dormant. The propensity for material enjoyment is not there but indifference to the service of Hari and the seed of material enjoyment (after that) are present (because he had been serving and has become indifferent since later he writes: the jiva revives remembering the lotus feet of Sri Krishna, not Maha-Visnu...his lost Krishna consciousness is revived...forgets his ancient memory...re-established as the servant of the Lord).

The jiva cannot remain indifferent forever by subduing devotional and non-devotional propensities. He therefore contemplates unconstitutional activities from his marginal position. He is infected by impersonalism but due to neglecting the eternal service of the Lord and thereby developing the quality of aversion to the Lord, he cannot remain fixed in that position. In this way aversion to the Lord breaks his concentration of mind and establishes him as the master of this world of enjoyment.

Maya, the external energy of the Supreme Lord, then induces the marginal living entity to enjoy this world through her covering and throwing potencies and thus shows the living entity the reality of being averse to the Lord's service. At that time the living entity considers himself the king of enjoyers, and being situated in the mode of passion he takes the position of Brahma and creates progeny.... Pride, illusion, greed, anger, and lust and induces the living entities to dance frantically in aversion to the Lord.

And on the platform of progress, if a living entity cultivates transcendental sound vibration and revives the process of remembering the lotus feet of Shri Krishna, he then achieves scientific spiritual knowledge. By this process, all anarthas are destroyed and he becomes situated in a supremely auspicious position.

Due to forgetfulness of Krishna there is perverted temporary and adverse movement of the senses. When they are properly employed in eternal subjects their disease of transience is destroyed and they give up the desire to embrace such transient objects.

Although the eternal living entity is constitutionally favorably inclined towards the Supreme Lord, due to his indifference towards the eternal service of the Lord he is eligible for being controlled by maya. He is eligible for achieving transcendental knowledge-this ancient memory he also often forgets.

By the mercy of a great liberated personality, who is pure, eternally engaged in service, self-realized, and the only shelter for the living entities, his lost Krishna consciousness is revived. Thereafter he desires freedom from Maya's covering and throwing potencies and searches after his own auspiciousness. As a result of this, he attains transcendental knowledge. The desire for achieving transcendental knowledge induces him to cultivate favorable service to Lord Vishnu. This cultivation begins with endeavoring for self-realization, reviving his lost propensity of service, and, ultimately, being re-established as the servant of the Lord. Then he is no longer considered a non-devotee, averse to the Lord.”

– Misuse the partial independence due to ignorance, then persistent to glide down towards nescience

Srila Prabhupada writes in SB 3.12.3 also some details of falling down: “The living entity, as part and parcel of the Lord, is partially independent because he partially possesses all the qualities of the Lord. Anyone who has some independence may sometimes misuse it due to ignorance. When the living entity prefers to misuse his independence and glide down towards nescience, The Lord first of all tries to protect him from the trap, but when the living entity persists on gliding down to hell, the Lord helps him to forget his real position to give the chance to see if he is happy by misusing his independence”.

– Leave the shelter of Vrajendra-nandana, the svayam-rupa tattva:

"Vrajendra-nandana, the non-dual consciousness, is the svayam-rupa tattva. Those who have taken shelter of Him, at the time in which they are situated in their own svarupa (sva-svarupe avasthiti-kale), have no opportunity to invoke any kind of inauspiciousness." (Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura Vivriti on Bhag. 11.2.37)

– Give up the love of Consort Absolute, Child Absolute, friend Absolute, master Absolute

"The Transcendental Sound becomes his sole engagement, he having secured the position of setting himself free from the egoistic exploitations of the phenomenal plane. Such a position would offer him the conception of the Absolute to Whom his only duty would be to offer his eternal services. This stage is known as regaining the true function after the expiry of his term of imprisonment as an enjoyer. Now he is in his proper health to engage himself as the eternal servitor of the Absolute, knowing his own position... The Consort Absolute will wait for the consort servitor. The parent servitor will meet the Child Absolute, the object of his or her only engagement. The eternal friend servitor will regain his position as such." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 193)

– Forget that they are constituents of Sri Radhika, to serve by loyal conscious submission, neutrality or actual opposition

"Sri Radhika is the Source of all individual souls whose function is to be employed in the service of Sri Krishna by the alternative methods [of] loyal conscious submission, neutrality or actual opposition. The individual souls serve Sri Krishna as constituents of Sri Radhika. When they forget that they are constituents of Sri Radhika they forget the nature of their own selves, and engage in the abnormal activities of the mundane plane." He writes three pages later:

"Siva and mahamaya are closely connected with the jiva. The connection of jiva with Siva and mahamaya is established only when he is disassociated from the service of Sri Sri Radha Krishna." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 615)

– We wanted to deprive our Lord of service in the five different capacities:

“Question: I cannot understand this world.

Answer: It is camp life. This world is not our original abode. It is meant for certain purposes. After that we are to proceed to our original home. This world is not a desirable place. It is not good to be enticed to stay here for a long time, forgetting our original abode. We stay there with Godhead. We are the eternal servants of Godhead. When we decide to lord it over the universe we are allowed these facilities for temporary purposes. They do not serve our eternal purposes. It would be better to seek for a place where we can find the real peace. Here we are always liable to be disturbed. By these disturbances Providence wants to teach us that world is not our eternal habitation, but that all real peace is to be found in Him. Being thus troubled we would naturally like to go back to the original place..... But the real truth is that we are to serve Godhead in the five different capacities. It is only when we deem it fit to come down to this world to lord it over other finite entities for our enjoyment that our real position happens to be forgot to some extent. This contingency arises when we want to deprive our Lord. That tendency was innate with us. It led us to prefer this temporal region by our own desire.

(from: Correct Angle of Vision)

– Forgets its own littleness and abjures the guidance of Krishna

“The human soul is a tiny part of the Divine spiritual essence functioning in the realm of the Absolute which is free from limitations but liable to be expelled from the spiritual world if it ever forgets its own littleness and abjures the guidance of Krishna. So long as it chooses to be guided by Krishna it is free from limitations or ignorance.” (Harmonist November 1928, The Supreme Lord Sri Krishna Caitanya)

– Forgetting Krishna:

"Having forgotten Krishna, the conditioned living entity is suffering the misdirection and perversion of his own so-called intelligence. The living entities are fragmental parts of the supreme shelter, Krishna, but have fallen from Krishna's kingdom of spiritual pastimes".

(Srimad Bhagavatam 11.2.38 purport by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakur)

– The moment the attracted souls are distracted, they glance towards maya from Vaikuntha, material enjoyment overcomes their constitutional duties, and makes them averse to Krishna.

"The eternal pastimes that svayam-rupa Krishna performs with His 'attracted' associates in Vraja are meant for removing the misfortune of the living entities, so to engage in service other than the worship of Krishna is most unbecoming. Therefore, understanding yourselves as 'attracted' in your relationship with the Lord, you should try to awaken your constitutional propensities. Attracted living entities have no propensity other than the worship of that Krishna. The moment the attracted souls are distracted, they glance towards maya from Vaikuntha. At that time the universe is created and material enjoyment overcomes the constitutional duties of the living entities belonging to the marginal potency of the Lord and makes them averse to Krishna." (Caitanya Bhagavata chapter 13, text 84 purport of Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati)

– Chooses to set up as master on its own account; wants to play the role of a male, not likes to serve the Absolute, choosing deliberately to act in opposition to the dictates of reason, then the delusion that it is an entity existing independently of Krishna takes firm possession of the soul. Then he is exiled.

"The soul functions freely in the realm of the Absolute where it is conscious of its real relationship with Krishna. Its function is crippled, thwarted and distorted the moment it chooses to set up as master on its own account, that is to say wants to play the role of a male...his perverted activity is stopped on all sides by the resistance of the Absolute Truth. It falls out with everything as soon as it falls out with Krishna. In its attempt to enjoy everything it is punished by those very things which serve to lure them to deeper depths of ignorance by a delusive response to their frantic attempts after sensuous gratification. In the normal state those very objects help them in serving Sri Krishna. To sum up the soul retains its natural condition as long as it serves the Absolute with all the resources of the principle of self-consciousness. But its will is free. It may not like to serve the Absolute. This is the abuse of its free choice in as much as it is an offense against the principle of pure reason which also is part and parcel of its eternal nature. In consequence of its choosing deliberately to act in opposition to the dictates of reason the delusion that it is an entity existing independently of Krishna takes firm possession of it. It now finds itself exiled from the realm of the Absolute and functioning in strict subordination to the delusive or material power of Sri Krishna. In this new world the fallen soul tries to please itself with the help of its reason on which it has deliberately put various limitations. Thus is evolved the principle of the false ego (Ahankara)." (The Harmonist vol. 26)

– To enjoy

"The position of the jiva is a part of the tatastha-sakti [Marginal Potency] that can enjoy, cease to enjoy and go back to his original position." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 101).. "It is the jivas who are the attendants in His [Krishna's] Sports. They become attached to matter having deviated from their own essential nature as the result of their desire for enjoyment. But when again the soul of a jiva, gains true wisdom of the transcendental region of God..., he begins to get back his pure essential nature gradually..." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 323)

– Abuse of our independent, free will, when we show our diffidence to serve the Absolute, the

Over-soul, we think we are to dominate over Nature and Natural Phenomena.

"But as our souls are eternal, we cannot consider that the futile external body as well as the internal temporal body are identical with the soul. They are incorporated later on by abuse of our independent will. When we abuse that free will, or when we show our diffidence to serve the Absolute, the Over-soul, we think we are to dominate over Nature and Natural Phenomena." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 102)

– We have exercised our free will to play on a particular level and we have been abusing our free will to turn kartas [doers].

"But we have got our own position in the intermediate land, that is, the land between cit and acit; and we call that plane tatastha. Some human souls are conditioned and some are liberated. Liberation is nothing but going back to the original position, that is offering our services to the Eternal Being... Why have we come to this place? It is so because we have exercised our free will to play on a particular level and we have been abusing our free will to turn kartas [doers]. In other words, we have taken an initiative to enjoy this world and we have thereby submitted to the trap, or rather to the laws of karma." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 116)

– The soul is part of the blissful spiritual sky originally, and then turned a silly, so foolish, insane, mad, proud devil, rebel, criminal, rascal, and fell out of heaven.

Here the authority:

“Dr. John Mize: The question that bothers me in part is then why would the soul... Because I understand your conception that the soul is part of the spiritual sky originally or part of God, and it somehow falls out of this blissful condition due to pride, much like the Christian thesis that the devil fell out of heaven due to pride. And it seems puzzling why the soul would be so silly, so foolish, so insane, as to do such a thing.

Prabhupada: That is his independence.... A son's duty is to obey the father. But he may not obey. That is his madness. So when the soul, misusing the independence, becomes mad, he is sent in this material world.

Dr. John Mize: It is puzzling to me that one would be so foolish.

Prabhupada: Because by independence you can become foolish. if you say, "Why the soul should become so foolish?" So that is misuse of independence. Intelligent father has got intelligent son, but sometimes he becomes a fool. So what is the reason? He is the part and parcel of the father. He should have become exactly like the father. But he does not become like the father. I have seen. In Allahabad was a big lawyer, barrister, Mr. Bannerjee. His eldest son was also barrister and his youngest son, on account of bad association, he became a ekala wala. Ekala means... In India there is a carriage drawn by one horse. So he liked to be an ekala. That means he fell in love, a low class of woman, and by her association, he became an ekala. There are many instances. The Ajamila upakhyana. He was a brahmana and then he fell down very low. So this misuse of independence is always there....

Bahulasya: Srila Prabhupada, in our material contaminated state when we act in a foolishly or mad, then we call that tamas, or our ignorance, but in the spiritual sky when the living entity is in his pure state of consciousness, what acts... Does something act upon him to make him illusioned at that point also?

Prabhupada: Yes. Just like Jaya-Vijaya. They committed offense. They did not allow the four Kumaras to enter. That was their fault. And the Kumaras became very sorry. Then they cursed him that "You are not fit to remain in this place." So we sometimes commit mistake. That is also misuse of independence. Or we are prone to fall down because we are small. Just

like small fragment of fire. Although it is fire, it is prone to be extinguished. The big fire does not extinguish. So Krishna is the big fire, and we are part and parcel, sparks, very small. So within the fire there are sparks, "Fut, Fut!" There are so many. But if the sparks fall down, then it is extinguished. ...

Dr. John Mize: Did all the souls that were in the spiritual sky fall out of the spiritual sky at once or at different times, or are there any souls that are always good, they're not foolish, they don't fall down?

Prabhupada:... Just like in the prison house, there are some population, but they are not majority. The majority of the population, they are outside the prison house. Similarly, majority of living being, part and parcel of God, they are in the spiritual world. Only a few falls down.

Dr. John Mize: Are more souls falling all the time?

Prabhupada: Not all the time. But there is the tendency of fall down, not for all, but because there is independence... Everyone is not liking to misuse the independence. The same example: Just like a government constructing a city and constructs also prison house because the government knows that somebody will be criminal. So their shelter must be also constructed. It is very easy to understand. Not that cent percent population will be criminal, but government knows that some of them will be. Otherwise why they construct prison house also? One may say, "Where is the criminal? You are constructing..." Government knows, there will be criminal. So if the ordinary government can know, why God cannot know? Because there is tendency.

Dr. John Mize: The origin of that tendency is...?

Prabhupada: Yes.

Dr. John Mize: From where does that tendency come?

Prabhupada: Tendency means the independence. So everyone can know that independence means one can use it properly, one can misuse it. That is independence. If you make it one way only, that you cannot become fall down, that is not independence. That is force. Therefore Krishna says, yathechasi tatha kuru. "Now you do whatever you like." (Conversation, Los Angeles, June 23, 1975)

Our comment: as the devil fell out of heaven due to pride, we fell out of heaven, due to pride. We became silly, foolish, insane, mad.

"a boy is very rich man's son. But still, he thinks "Why shall I live under the rules and regulations of my father? Let me go out. I shall enjoy life freely." Freely, what freedom? You are already rich man's son. You can enjoy the property of your very, very rich powerful father, and what independence you will enjoy? This is criminality. This is criminality. We are sons of God, part and parcels of God, and God means almighty. So we have got almighty father, and leaving His place, I have come to this material world to enjoy independently. That is criminality. And we are suffering. That is explained here: prakriti-stha, "being placed in this material world," purusha, bhunkte prakriti-jan gunan, "He is enjoying, but enjoying the quality of the modes of material nature." (Bg. lecture, Melbourne, June 27, 1974)

Our comment: we become criminals; we fall.

"The yoga processes are simply ways to elevate oneself to enter into that abode. Actually we belong to that abode, but being forgetful, we are put in this material world. Just as a madman becomes crazy and is put into a lunatic asylum, so we, losing sight of our spiritual identity, become crazy and are put into this material world. Thus the material world is a sort of lunatic asylum, and we can easily notice that nothing is done very sanely here. Our real business is to

get out and enter into the kingdom of God.” (The Perfection of Yoga, ch 3, Yoga as Meditation on KRISHNA)

Our comment: we became crazy and had to go.

There is design...The plan of material world is that some rascals, living entities, they wanted to enjoy. So God has given this plan, "All right, you enjoy." This is the plan. And not only enjoy. "You enjoy; again come back." This is the plan. Pravrtti-nivrtti. First of all he is given that "All right, you take all facilities of enjoyment." Therefore Veda is that "You enjoy like this, and after you have fulfilled your enjoyment, come back again." This is God mercy. (Morning Walk—December 16, 1973, Los Angeles)

“The soul, part and parcel of God, wanted to imitate God's supremacy, and they wanted to enjoy. But in the spiritual world there cannot be second enjoyer. The only enjoyer is Krishna. Bhoktaram sarva-loka, bhoktaram sarva-yajnanam sarva-loka... He is the supreme proprietor, supreme being. In the dictionary you will find, "the supreme being." "Supreme being" means nobody can be equal to Him, nobody can be greater than Him. That is, means supreme. So how one can become an imitator of Krishna? That is not possible. That imitation is possible here in this material world, because they are all rascals. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.16.19, Los Angeles, July 9, 1974)

Arnold Weiss: In the beginning, when we were first part of God.. our souls are also part of God, as a drop of water is part of that ocean...Is there any knowledge or information of how we incurred this first separation from God?

Prabhupada: Separation... Generally, when we want to become God, there is separation.

Arnold Weiss: A rebellion.

Prabhupada: You cannot... There is one God, and if you want to become God, you are immediately driven away: "Just become God in the material world. Go there and try to become God."

Dr. Wolfe: Prabhupada? There is a parallel in the Bible that Lucifer broke away from God because He wanted to be God.

Prabhupada: That's it. (laughs) This rascaldom... This rascaldom makes him a dog. Instead of God, he become a dog (Conversation—June 9, 1976, Los Angeles)

Our comment: rascals, dogs are driven out of the spiritual world.

He's already an ass because he's part and parcel of Krishna, and he has come to this material world to enjoy. That is ass mentality. There is no enjoyment. So he's already an ass. And this scientific improvement means he's becoming more attached to this material world to remain better ass. Avidya... anitya samsare, anitya. He cannot stay here. Suppose, working very hard like an ass, he gets a skyscraper building, throughout his whole life, laboring. But he cannot stay there. He'll be kicked out. Is it not ass? Is he not an ass? He cannot stay there. Anitya samsare. Anitya. Because it is not the permanent settlement. You are trying: dum dum. (sound imitation) Very strong foundation. That's all right. But your foundation is nothing. You'll be kicked out. (Morning walk Los Angeles, April 28, 1973)

Comment: you become mudha, gadha, and you'll fall down and become a better ass.

“we are put into this prison house, all these rebelled souls, this prison house, this material world.. Just like in the jail, the population in the jail is very small in comparison to the population of the city.

Similarly, within this material world, all the living entities, they are all conditioned, very limited number. The unlimited number are there in the spiritual world.

Now we are under the control of this external energy, material energy. We have become controlled, just like we become controlled by the prison authorities when we are criminals... We are jivera svarupa haya nitya-Krishna-dasa [Cc. Madhya 20.108-109], eternally servant of Krishna. So as soon as we accept it and engage ourself in the service of the Lord, that is our liberated position. Then we, again, we become nitya-mukta. We revive our original condition of life. Original condition means ever liberated. Ordinarily we are free. Those who are not within the walls of prison house, they are free. They are acting freely, wherever they like they are going, but within the law. Similarly we have got freedom. There are living entities, their number is greater. They live in the spiritual world, Vaikuntha planets...And we are nitya-baddha-ever conditioned, eternally conditioned...

We cannot be eternally conditioned, because we are part and parcel of Krishna...But because we wanted to imitate Krishna, we wanted to become Krishna...Krishna is the supreme proprietor. Therefore He is the supreme enjoyer". (Bhag. lecture, Mayapur, June 20, 1973)

Our comment: Rebels and criminals are put in the prison.

- Envious of Sri Krishna as the Supreme Lord.

Prabhupada: So even in the Vaikuntha, if I desire that "Why shall I serve Krishna? Why not become Krishna?" I immediately fall down. That is natural. A servant is serving the master, sometimes he may think that "If I could become the master." They are thinking like that; they are trying to become God.... Krishna is enjoyer. Just like a big businessman, and his secretary is working under him. So he sometimes thinks, "Why shall I work under him? Why not become another Birla like him?" That is the fall down. He's happy there, becoming secretary of a big man, but he gives up the job and tries himself and becomes a vagabond. (Morning Walk—March 31, 1974, Bombay).

The same in a lecture November 25, 1976, in Vrndavana, India:

We are eternal servant of Krishna, but sometimes the servant thinks, 'Why shall I remain a servant? Let me become master.' That is natural. A master is always in a comfortable situation. Sometimes the servant becomes envious: 'Oh, why this man should always remain in a comfortable position and we shall serve? Why not we become also in a comfortable position? Let me eat as he eats,' or 'Let me sleep now.' These are so-called comforts. So they want to imitate. When the living being imitates the Supreme Personality of Godhead then he falls down. Krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare, pasate maya tare japatiya dhare. As soon as he forgets his position—he wants to imitate—that is the beginning of maya, falldown.

- Imitate Krishna, disagree with the predominator, serve ourself.

Allen Ginsberg: The material shadow. How did we fall into that?

Prabhupada: Because jiva, although para sakti, he has got independence. So when he wants to imitate Krishna... In the spiritual world Krishna is the enjoyer, and all others, they are enjoyed. Predominator and the predominating. The Lord is the predominating, so there is no disagreement. There they know, "The Lord is predominator. We have to serve." When this service attitude is impaired, that "Why serve Krishna? Why not ourself?" that is maya. Then he falls down in the material energy. Just like in the government system, there is no scope of freedom. You have to act according to government state laws. So long you agree, then you are free. If you disagree, then you are placed within the prison house. Similarly, jiva, not fully independent, but they have got. Because part and part of God, therefore that independence

quality is there. So when that independence quality is misused, then his place is in the material world. Krishna bhuliyā jiva bhoga vancha kare. When we forget Krishna and try to lord it over something...Krishna is the Supreme Lord. When we try to imitate His lordship, then our place is in the material world. We are given freedom, "All right, you lord it over here." So here every living entity is trying to lord it over, competition. I am trying individualwise, nationwide. Everyone is trying to lord it over. That is material existence. And when he comes to his senses, jnanavan (Bg 7.19), that "I am falsely trying to lord it over. Rather, I am becoming implicated with material energy," when he comes to that, then he surrenders. Then again his liberated life begins. (Columbus, Ohio, on May 14, 1969)

Our comment: The original position of the soul is as Krishna's direct servant in the spiritual world. As long as the service attitude continues, the soul remains in the liberated position. But as soon as the soul desires to imitate Krishna, to forget his position as servant of Krishna, he is placed in the material. But when he surrenders, "then again his liberated life begins."

– Quarrel in the family.

Why families break up— so many reasons. We originally fell from a fully developed relationship with Krishna, we were part of Krishna's family, and functioning in that. See:

"The first punishment is that we have got this material body.

krishna bhuliyā jiva bhoga vancha kare

pasate maya tare japatiya dhare

The first criminal action is that when we forget Krishna and our relationship with Him Our relationship with Krishna is that Krishna is the enjoyer; we are eternal servant. Just like a big man, rich man: he is the enjoyer and he has got many servants. That we practically see. The capitalist, he starts some business, big factory. Ten thousand men are working, but the capitalist is not working. It is our practical experience. He is aloof from the factory. In a nice place, in a nice bungalow, garden house, he is enjoying. Similarly, God, Krishna, He is the enjoyer. You will find, therefore, Krishna here in this temple, He is enjoying. He is standing with His elder brother, enjoying in the forest, sporting with His cowherd boy friends, His cows, calves—enjoying in the forest. ... Every living entity is part and parcel of Krishna. He belongs to the Krishna's family. This is our original position. Vrindavana means whole, all of them are Krishna's family. Even the birds, beast, trees, plants, water—all belong to the Krishna's family...So Krishna, out of His causeless mercy, He comes. At a certain interval during one day of Brahma, He comes. He exhibits His lila, that "Anyone who desires to go back to home, back to Godhead, they can enjoy with Me like this." This is Krishna's mission. "Come on. Why you are playing here and suffering this maya's play? Come to the real play." We are part and parcel of God, just like sons are part and parcel of father. If the father is rich man, all-powerful, he does not like to see that his sons are loitering in the street without any food, without any shelter. Father entreats, "My dear son, why you are rotting in this way? Come home. You'll be comfortable. You'll be happy. Come back to home, back to Godhead.. ...to forget Krishna and to become subjected to the condition of material nature, that is called material life. Material life means to give up the idea of going back to home, back to Godhead, but making plan here to be happy...the conclusion is that anyone who is in this material world, he is a sinful man. Otherwise he would not have gotten this material body. Just like anyone who is in the prison house, you can conclude that he is a sinful, criminal man. You do not require to study one after another. Because he is in the prison house you can conclude that "Here is a criminal." Similarly, anyone who is in the material world, he is a criminal. But not the superintendent of jail. You cannot conclude, "Because everyone is in the jail, criminal,

therefore the superintendent of jail, he is also criminal." Those who are conducting these sinful men to take them back to home, back to Godhead, he is not criminal. His business is how to release this rascal from this prison house and take him back to home, back to Godhead.... If you become enlightened, then you must know that this material world is not for our habitation. We must go back to home, back to Godhead. Therefore this Krishna consciousness movement is preaching that "This is not your home. Don't try to be happy here."... real happiness is to go back to home, back to Godhead. Na te viduh svartha-gatim hi vishnum [SB 7.5.31]. They do not know that. So this is very important movement, that we are giving them hint and education how to go back to home, back to Godhead. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 6.2.16—Vrindavana, September 19, 1975)

A few examples of separation in the family:

Why depend on the father?

“Atreya Rsi: In the beginning how does the spirit become ignorant, falls into ignorance?

Prabhupada: Anyone can become criminal, any moment. At any moment you can begin. You are honest gentleman, very good. You are working in a nice spot. At any time, any moment, you can become a criminal and go to the prison house....You are prone to... As soon as you misuse your little independence, you become a criminal. Daivi hy esa gunamayi mama maya duratyaya. You cannot cheat material nature. Immediately she captures. Krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare pasate maya tare japati ‘dhare.

Ali: I'm amazed that... When someone tastes something, a nice fruit, something pleasant, he remembers, appreciates that, even in material world. How could someone see God and come from a source as powerful and lovable as that and then forget? How could he forget so easily and become so badly attached to this materialism? Why is it that we are so far?

Prabhupada: Because we are very small fragment of spiritual identity, that tendency is there. we are small particle, very, very small, atomic portion God. Therefore we have got the tendency to be separated from the big fire, and then we begin our material body. Just like another crude example, just like a very rich man's son, he's enjoying life. Sometimes he thinks, “Why not independently live? Why dependent on father?” He was living very comfortably, rich man's son, but he left the house of his father and became a hippie. Why does he do so? I have seen in Allahabad one big lawyer, Ferolal Bannerji. He had two sons. One son became a good barrister like him, and another son became a car-wala, driving a car. The reason was that this son, a car-wala, he fell in love with a low-class woman, and he preferred to remain a car-wala, a low-class woman. So she was living in a cottage, hut. So out of love he also preferred that “I shall live with her, and I shall drive a car.” So that is independence. That discrimination preference is there always. You can prefer a low-grade life out of your discretion. Nobody can check you. (Conversation, Teheran, August 10, 1976)

Forgets his father, leaves home and becomes mad.

"If a rich man's son forgets his father, leaves home and becomes mad, he may lie on the street to go to sleep, or he may beg money for food, but all of this is due to his forgetfulness. If someone, however, gives him information that he is simply suffering because he has left his father's home and that his father, a very wealthy man and owner of vast property, is anxious to have him return—the person is a great benefactor." (OWK 4, The roads of the foolish and the wise)

Son becoming hopeless and confused

“...the instruction of Bhagavata is, "Just try to revive your lost relationship with God, or Krishna." That relationship is never extinguished, but sometimes it is covered. Just like a

crazy boy forgets his father and mother and home, goes away. But the relationship between the son and the parents cannot be lost. As soon as the son comes back, the parents receive him very nicely. Similarly, we are all sons of the Supreme Lord. We have forgotten our father, we have forgotten our relationship, and we are loitering in this material world as helpless, and if we revive our consciousness, our Krishna consciousness, that "My home is in the spiritual world. I am a foreigner in this material world..." Just like a foreigner is traveling from one place to another, similarly, I am also changing my body from one body to another, one planet to another. But there is no permanent settlement anywhere in this material world. This is our condition.

So Krishna consciousness means to be rightly situated in the original consciousness that we are all sons of God, Krishna. We have got eternal relationship with Him and He is the richest, the most opulent. As a rich man's son has no scarcity, no want, everything is supplied amply... Just like the Americans, they are... American or many other Western countries, the young men, they belong to a rich nation, so practically they have no want. But still why they are becoming hopeless and confused? Because this material want is not all. There is spiritual want. Unless that spiritual want is fulfilled, unless that spiritual relationship is reestablished, nobody can be happy. So in order to make us happy, Krishna says that "Begin with little flower, little water, or little fruit, and try to offer Me." (Bhag. lecture, Montreal, August 17, 1968)

Mad son in lunatic asylum only attacks father immediately when he sees him

"Whatever we are doing, we are doing under the spell of material nature. Just like a madman. A madman is insulting his father. Why? Naturally a man is not supposed to insult his father, but being maddened, sometimes we have seen that a mad son insults his father. One friend... I went to the Poona lunatic asylum with the father of the patient. The complaint was that the son who is mad was kept in Poona at the lunatic asylum. He would attack his father immediately when he sees him. His only anger was with his father. So similarly, nature is that the son is respectful to the father. But sometimes, in madness, he is not only disrespectful, but he want to insult actually. As this is happening in our daily experience, similarly, we are sons of the Supreme Personality of Godhead.... defying the authority of God, this is the our main material disease." (SB 3-26-06 BOM 1974-12-18 Atheistic Arrogance)

Rascal boy goes out of home

"Krishna wants all these fallen souls to be delivered because they are Krishna's part and parcel. Just like a rich man, if his son goes out of home, he is suffering. His father knows that rascal boy is suffering. He is very anxious to get him back. "Bring this rascal at home." That is father's concern, naturally. Similarly, Krishna is more eager to take you back. Therefore He comes. He comes. He has got his agent, the guru. He has got His instruction, the Bhagavad-gita. The whole concern is that God is so anxious, Krishna is anxious, to call back these rascals, back to home, back to Godhead. So sometimes He is so eager that He comes Himself. Just like I have sent some my agent to do something. I am seeing that it is being delayed, so I go there: "What you are doing? Why it is so delayed?"

(Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.15.42—December 20, 1973, Los Angeles)

– **Variety is the mother of enjoyment.**

Yogesvara: But if our love for Krishna originally is perfect why should we have left?

Prabhupada: Just like somebody is daily eating puris and halava, and he wants to eat puffed rice. So that tendency is there. That is also a side of enjoyment. "I am eating daily this, let me eat this." What is the difficulty? That tendency is there. That is also enjoyment. After all, we

are hankering after enjoyment, anandamayo 'bhyasat (Vedanta-sutra 1.1.12). So different taste we desire, that "Let me taste this, let me taste that, let me taste that." (Srila Prabhupada's lecture in New Mayapur on Bg 15.15)

– Cannot tolerate Krishna.

“Because in the spiritual world, Krishna is supreme, but if you cannot tolerate Krishna... Even here there are so many: "Why there should be God? I am God.... They will never agree to abide by God...for these last, lowest class of men, there is the external energy.” (Lecture — Hawaii, March 5, 1969)

– We didn't like to serve Krishna

“In Vrindavana, in Goloka Vrindavana, somebody's serving Krishna as His friend, cowherd boy. Somebody's serving Krishna as gopi, as lover. Somebody's serving Krishna as father and mother, Mother Yasoda, Nanda Maharaja. Somebody's Krishna's friend as servant, as tree, as water, as flower, as land, as cow's, as calf. So many ways. This is our business. But somehow or other we did not like to serve Krishna. Therefore we have been put into the service of maya in three modes of nature. Just like criminal.”

– No prema

“That is force. [indistinct] prema. In Bengali it is said "If you catch one girl or boy, 'You love me, you love me, you love me.'" Is it love? "You love me, otherwise I will kill you." Is that love? So Krishna does not want to become a lover like that, on the point of revolver. Love is reciprocal, voluntary, good exchange of feeling.” (Evening Darsana—July 8, 1976, Washington, D.C.)

– Soul, being attracted by this illusory energy, he comes here for sense gratification... we divert our attention to the illusory energy tired of living with the others in the palace of the King.

Hayagriva: Concerning evil, Plotinus feels that matter is evil in the sense that it imprisons the soul, but the visible cosmos is beautiful, and the evil does not arise from the creator.

Prabhupada: Yes. That the individual soul, being attracted by this illusory energy, he comes here for sense gratification.

Hayagriva: Plotinus writes: "Let us flee then to the beloved fatherland. Here is sound council. But what is this flight? How are we to gain the open sea? The fatherland for us is there whence we have come. There is the father...If the souls remain in the intelligible or spiritual realm with the Soul, or Supersoul, they are beyond harm and share in the soul's governance. They are like kings who live with the high King and govern with Him and like Him do not come down from the palace. But if they wish to be independent, if they are tired, you may say, of living with someone else...when the individual soul decides to withdraw, he becomes fragmented, isolated and weak, when he decides to withdraw from the, what he calls the palace of the King... from the spiritual realm, from the governance of the high King.

Prabhupada: Yes. That is his falldown. When he decides to give up the spiritual life, he falls down in the material life.. he is prone to fall down because he is very minute quantity, he is small, so there is tendency of falldown... a less intelligent person, in ignorance, commits criminal activities and he goes to jail. He is not supposed to go to the jail, but on account of his little intelligence or ignorance, he commits something which is criminal.... like a very

rich man's son, if he thinks that "If I live independently, without being dependent on father," that is his foolishness. How he can become happy independently, living aside from the father? The supreme father is all-opulent, full of everything, and I am minute only. So if I live under the care of the father, naturally I will live very comfortably, like rich man's son. But if I prefer that I shall live independently, that is my foolishness. So only the fools and rascals they try to remain independent of Krishna, and they suffer.

Hayagriva: Plotinus uses this following metaphor. He says, "We are like a chorus grouped about a conductor who allow their attention to be distracted by the audience. If, however, the individual souls were to turn toward their conductor, they would sing as they should and would really be with him. We are always around the One. If we were not, we would dissolve and cease to exist. Yet our gaze does not remain fixed upon the One. When we look at it, we then attain the end of our desires and find rest. Then it is that all discord passes. We dance an inspired dance around it. In this dance the soul looks upon the source of life, the source of the intelligence, the root of being, the cause of the good, the root of the soul"

Prabhupada: Yes. There is good sense, that God is individual and the soul is individual. As he has given the metaphor or analogy that the conductor and a chorus of a concert party, they are singing in the tune, sometimes attention diverted by the audience, it becomes out of the tune. Similarly we, when we divert our attention to the illusory energy, then we fall down.

- When we become rebellious, "Ah, what is God? What is Kāñëa...?"

"Because we have rebelled against the principle of universal brotherhood we are all suffering...On account of our rebellious attitude towards the Supreme Personality of Godhead, we are suffering in this material world. Just like any citizen rebellious to the laws of the government, he is put into the prison house. Similarly, we are all sons and subordinate to the Supreme Personality of Godhead, and when we become rebellious, "Ah, what is God? What is Krishna...?" Vimudhan, kartaham iti manyate. Prakriteh kriyamanani gunaih karmani sarvasah, ahankara-vimudhatma [Bg. 3.27]. All these rascals who are godless, they are rebellious. They must suffer. The prakriti is there. Prakrteh kriyamanani gunaih...

krishna bhuliya jiva bhoga vancha kare

pasate maya tare japatiya dhare

[Prema-vivarta]

As soon as you become rebellious to Krishna, immediately maya is there, just like as soon as you become rebellious the government laws, immediately you are under the police custody.

There are two things: government and the police. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 5.5.20—November 8, 1976, Vrindavana)

Other questions

- Can one become envious of anyone else, besides Sri Krishna?

Question: "In Krishna book it says that there were some color fighting in Dvaraka. They were throwing color. And some men became lusty seeing the women. So, will that be the first part of their falldown, to be in Vaikuntha and think of personal lust with Krishna's associates?"

Srila Prabhupada: Yes." (Srila Prabhupada Conversation, Mayapur, February 19, 1976)

"Sri Radhika is the Source of all individual souls whose function is to be employed in the service of Sri Krishna by the alternative methods [of] loyal conscious submission, neutrality or actual opposition. The individual souls serve Sri Krishna as constituents of Sri Radhika. When they forget that they are constituents of Sri Radhika they forget the nature of their own

selves, and engage in the abnormal activities of the mundane plane." He writes three pages later:

"Siva and mahamaya are closely connected with the jiva. The connection of jiva with Siva and mahamaya is established only when he is disassociated from the service of Sri Sri Radha Krishna." (Sri Caitanya's Teachings, p. 615)

– Was the envy, material or spiritual?

Neither material, nor spiritual, but marginal. The envy is only in the marginal energy, called tatastha.

Tatastha is on the beach, the line between the ocean and the land. Tatastha is the line between matter and spirit, always close to both.

As Srila Prabhupada writes in a letter 6-6-72:

“Just like at the edge of the beach, sometimes the water covers, sometimes there is dry sand, coming and going. Our position is like that, sometimes covered, sometimes free, just like at the edge of the tide. As soon as we forget, immediately the illusion is there...even with Krishna [in His lila or sport] there is a dormant attitude for forgetting Krishna and creating an atmosphere for enjoying independently.”

On Bg 18.78, Srila Prabhupada writes that:

“The soul is marginal energy. The marginal energy (which is always marginal) has a tendency to be in contact either with material energy or with the spiritual energy (always).”

Envy can enter the ever marginal soul as the margin (tatastha) at the beach is always in contact with the sea and the land.

Thus, the tatastha or marginal energy, the soul, even if he is in the spiritual world, he is always in contact with the material energy, meaning it can always fall under kAma (lust), lobha (greed), krodha (anger), mada (madness), moha (illusion), matsarya (envy).

And if the soul is in the material world, he can always contact the spiritual world.

– Kindly explain how mundane envy can enter the spiritual realm?

Mundane envy doesn't enter the spiritual realm, the Visnu- and Sakti-tattvas of the spiritual realm, the sandini, samvit, hladini saktis of the spiritual realm, but it can enter the tatastha jiva (soul), who are sometimes in the spiritual realm. The tatastha is strictly speaking, constitutionally, not part of the spiritual realm, because the anu-atma is always marginal. Tatastha is the line between matter and spirit, always close to both. There is a threefold division of the Lord's energies: spiritual, marginal, material. (CC adi 2.96 p), who are always separate: “Although all three potencies—namely internal, external and marginal—are essentially one in the ultimate issue, they are different in action, like electric energy, which can produce both cold and heat under different conditions. The external and marginal potencies are so called under various conditions, but in the original, internal potencies there are no such conditions, nor is it possible for the conditions of the external potency to exist in the marginal, or vice versa.”

The rebellious living entities are not attracted first to maya but to independence. Krishna bhuli' jiva anadi-bahirmukha ("choosing to forget Krishna, the jiva turns away from Him since time immemorial"). Ataeva maya tare deya samsara-duhkha ("therefore maya subsequently introduces him to material suffering").

The police and the jail are there to protect the citizens from harm. Similarly, Yogamaya and Her expansion, Mahamaya act analogous. They both act here and there. The argument was given that there is no Mahamaya in the spiritual world; in general not, but as the police can

enter the palace of a king to capture a criminal, so Yogamaya expands Mahamaya for these functions with the marginal energy. The distinction Yoga- Mahamaya is not always that rigid; in Bg 7.25 it says: "I am never manifest to the foolish and unintelligent. For them I am covered by My internal potency yogamaya, and therefore they do not know that I am unborn and infallible". SB 8.5.43: "All learned men say that the five elements, eternal time, fruitive activity, the three modes of material nature, and the varieties produced by these modes are all creations of yogamaya. This material world is therefore extremely difficult to understand, but those who are highly learned have rejected it. May the Supreme Personality of Godhead, who is the controller of everything, be pleased with us". Thus, yogamaya creates this universe.

– Can the material energy enter the spiritual realm?

You want to say Mahamaya is some type of devi, demigoddess, who is in Maha-maya?
She is a pure amsa of Yogamaya.

If Yogamaya can be active in the material world (as Mahamaya or as Yogamaya; *naham prakasa sarvasya yoga-maya samavrtah*), why can't maya be active in the spiritual world (and take the rebel jiva out). After all, Mahamaya is an eternal associate and amsa of Yogamaya. Yogamaya is the almighty Lord's energy. She can call her servants or amsa, Mahamaya or another of her agents into action at any time, as the police can enter the king's palace to seize an envious servant. True, Maya is generally not in the spiritual world (SB 2.9.10), but there can be exceptions; it is also rare that a soul is to fall down: "The population of the prison house is *nothing* in comparison to the whole population of the state". On this also see Sri Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura on SB 3.15.25 Sarartha Darsini-commentary that even materialists can enter the spiritual world, by the will of the Lord.

"In Puranas and other scriptures, one sometimes hears that there is some momentary appearance of demons in the spiritual world, but this should not be considered actually entrance into the spiritual world, since they lack realization of spiritual happiness. However, an example may be given. Sometimes tigers or bears enter into the jewel-covered palace of the king endowed with various fragrances, since for amusement, the king desires that the populace see those animals. Similarly, the Supreme Lord, for fun, by his will brings material objects, ferocious demons, saintly persons like Bhrgu, or persons beyond the three gunas such as the Kumaras to Vaikuntha, to show to them the inhabitants of the spiritual world, and then quickly takes them away as is suitable for his purpose."

Also in Sri Brihad Bhagavatamrta we see that there are armies and army commanders in the spiritual world. They can put a criminal into the Durga or prison of the material world:

Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.1.18: "The many kinds of Vaikuntha perfection...being posted as commander of the Lord's army"

Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.4.29: "These Vaikuntha residents whom Gopa-kumara saw entering the gateway last were army commanders and other important authorities, returning late because they had been busy with various responsibilities outside."

– Once you have entered the material realm, where is the Krishna-prema? Is it withdrawn within the soul? Is it still fully active? Is it fully active or covered?

Withdrawn, shrunk, contracted.

Lord Caitanya Mahaprabhu says so. Also eg Jiva Goswami, Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura, Saunaka rsi, Sri Ramanujacarya, Sri Madhvacarya, Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana, Srila Prabhupada:

In text 22 of Anuccheda 111, Bhakti-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami says: “Devotional service to the Supreme Personality of Godhead is eternal.” This does not make sense if we say that some souls were originally, eternally, in a state of nondevotional service in the brahma-jyotir. The truth is that the souls are in the jyoti only for very a short time, without service. Eternally, originally the soul was in Krishna lila, then a short time the nightmare of maya and the last snare of maya-Brahman-, then return back to eternal devotional service.

In text 1 of Anuccheda 112 of Sri Bhakti-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami goes on to quote Bhagavatam 11.14.25:

“Just as gold, when smelted in fire, gives up its impurities and returns to its pure brilliant state, similarly, the spirit soul, absorbed in the fire of bhakti-yoga, is purified of all contamination caused by previous fruitive activities and returns to its original position of serving Me in the spiritual world.”

Jiva Goswami comments: “This verse means: ‘With love shaking away (vidhuya) past karma, the devotee attains his original pure spiritual form and then engages in serving (bhajati) Me (mam).’ The words Jiva Goswami uses for “attains his original pure spiritual form” are suddha svarupam ca prapya.

Commentary BBT: “ this verse indicates that the devotee goes back to the spir world and there worships Lord Krishna in his original spiritual body, which is compared to the original pure form of smelted gold.”

In Anuccheda 178 of Sri Bhakti-sandarbha, text 1, Jiva Goswami says:

iyam akincanakhya bhaktir eva jivanam svabhavata ucita. svabhavika-tad-asraya hi jivah.

iyam—thus; akincanakhya bhaktih—pure devotional service; eva—indeed; jivanam—of the living entities; svabhavata—by nature; ucita—is said; svabhavika-tad-asraya—taking shelter of their own natures; hi—indeed; jivah—the living entities.

Engagement in pure devotional service is the natural position of all living entities.

Jiva Goswami adds: Thus the individual spirit souls are part and parcel of the Supreme Personality of Godhead. They are His potencies. They naturally take shelter of Him (tad-asrayatvam).

Saunaka rsi in Visnudharma 4.55-57 states the same:

“Just as the luster of a gem is not created by the washing off of the dirt, so the knowledge of the soul is not created by the removal of faults. Just as water is not created by the digging of a well, only what is already existent is brought to manifestation,— for how can there be the origination of what is non-existent,—so the attributes of knowledge and the rest are manifested, and not created, through the destruction of the evil qualities, for they belong to the soul eternally.”

(Sri Ramanujacarya in His Sri Bhasya 4.4.3 quotes this verse; here his explanation)

(Vedanta sutra. 4.4.1-3) “(1) sampadyavir-bhavah svena sabdat

“Attaining, the appearance with one's own, from sound.”

Ramanuja's Sri Bhasya: "This blessed soul, rising up from the [material] body and approaching the supreme light with his own form achieves [the Absolute].' (Chandogya Upanishad 8.12.2)"

Our comment: The soul's form, sat-cit-ananda-vigraha developed here, that form rises up.

Ramanuja continues: "Does the liberated soul achieve a body that is different from his self, just as the souls of demigods receive demigod bodies?] Or is there the appearance of a svarupa, a constitutional form, which is derived from the very nature [of the soul]. Whether the soul, at liberation, achieves a thoroughly new spiritual body or simply manifests a spiritual form that the soul possessed all along."

Answer: "He attains to a specific situation in the form of the appearance of the [soul's] svarupa, not in the form of [the soul] entering a bodily shape that did not exist before. How so? Because of the word svena, [in the sense of] svena rupena, 'by one's own form.' That is the meaning because of the use of the adjective (sva). Indeed, if we accept that [the spiritual body one acquires at liberation] is agantuka [extrinsic, added on, adventitious] and sadhya [to be gained, produced], then certainly the adjective svena [modifying] rupena would be meaningless ... Being liberated from the connection with karma and from the body, etc., created by it, [the liberated soul] is situated with a form that is of his own nature. Here is stated [from Chandogya Upanishad 8.12.2]:

'With his own form, he attains the Absolute.'

There is cessation of the concealment of the svarupa, which, even though eternally present, was concealed by ignorance in the form of karma.

In his Vedanta-sara ("essence of Vedanta") he comments:

"It is said here that although the precise form of the soul's constitutional form was in fact (eva) previously (prag) known and existed in perfection (siddha) (siddhatve means "in the condition of existing fully or perfectly," or "in the condition of being known or understood,") still (at the time of liberation) there is the appearance of that constitutional form, in expanded form, of the qualities of knowledge, bliss, etc., which due to karma had been shrunk within the soul.

Our comment: The luster of the soul (sat-cit-ananda-vigraha, of its form of eternal knowledge and bliss) was shining, as it is shining at liberation. If the soul is to go to Krishna- or Narayana-loka after leaving the present material body it must have had the same luster and nature before the soul came to the samsara. The svarupa, its own form, is eternal. This is called nitya-svarupa. That means the soul's original position cannot have been the brahmajyoti. Brhad Bhagavatamrta 2.2.215 describes the happiness in the brahmajyoti as monotonous, undeveloped and so vague as to be virtually nonexistent. The brahmajyoti is a shrunken or contracted state for the soul. Brahman is sat, but no cit and ananda (CC Adi 2.5.). Nor this fits the brief love-and-hate/turn away-meeting at the border; according to some Brahman fall vadis, there was only some 'hazy, dizzy' fog like environment. That is different then what is written here : 'eternally manifest essential nature', 'The qualities of intelligence, bliss etc fully in perfection'. Even if the argument is 'complete-vision-love-divorce-at-the-border', here it says that before the bondage the complete nature of the soul was 'eternally manifest'.

Sri Madhvacharya in his Anubhasya of Vedanta Sutra similarly, as all other commentators, quotes Chandogya upanisad 8.3.4:

"Having reached the Supreme Brahman he issues forth with his own form (in his own true appearance) svena rupa."

In 1.3.19 he writes:

“There he goes about, eating, sporting, rejoicing...the released (soul) who has attained to his original state as pure spirit, through the grace of the supreme Lord...having reached whom the soul is restored to its essential nature.”

Comment: Restored means the soul regains its original nature.

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana writes similarly in his Govinda Bhasya 4.4.1: “There is the manifestation of one’s own real original form (svena-rupena) and its glory opulence bliss etc when the soul enters the effulgent spiritual world. This form had existed all along and is not newly attained or an external imposition. The soul’s original form exists but is not openly manifested (during its conditioned state).

Ramanujacarya's discussion of the soul's original form is remarkably similar to Lord Caitanya's statement to Sanatana Gosvami:

"Pure love for Krishna is eternally established in the hearts of living entities. It is not something to be gained from another source. When the heart is purified by hearing and chanting, the living entity naturally awakens." (Cc. Madhya 22.107)

In this verse from Sri Caitanya-caritamrita, Srila Prabhupada translates the word sadhya as "to be gained from another source.”

Ramanujacarya proves that the spiritual form of the soul is eternally present. In his commentary on Vedanta, 4.4.2, he again uses a term (siddha) that is repeated in Lord Caitanya Mahaprabhu's statement to Sanatana Gosvami.

Thus Sri Caitanya Mahaprabhu echoed the words of His devotee, Sripada Ramanujacarya, when He said to Sanatana Gosvami:

nitya-siddha krishna-prema 'sadhya' kabhu naya
sravanadi-suddha-citte karaye udaya

nitya-siddha—eternally established; krishna-prema—love of Krishna; sadhya—to be gained; kabhu—at any time; naya—not; sravana-adi—by hearing, etc.; suddha—purified; citte—in the heart; karaye udaya—awakens.

“Pure love for Krishna is eternally established in the hearts of the living entities. It is not something to be gained from another source. When the heart is purified by hearing and chanting, this love naturally awakens.”

Both statements argue the same point: although the soul appears to acquire or take on a spiritual form at the time of liberation, this form or constitutional position already existed previously in fullness.

**– Does the material energy cover fully-active Krishna-prema?
Which is superior, Krishna-prema or the material energy?**

Neither prema, nor maya is superior, Krishna is the Superior or the Supreme. Krishna controls both, daivy hy esa gunamayi. Crude example: the engineer controls with the same electrical energy both the cooler and the heater, and the consumer uses the energy as he likes.

Bg 7.14

daivi hy esha guna-mayi
mama maya duratyaya

mam eva ye prapadyante
mayam etam taranti te
Audio

daivi—transcendental; hi—certainly; esha—this; guna-mayi—consisting of the three modes of material nature; mama—My; maya—energy; duratyaya—very difficult to overcome; mam—unto Me; eva—certainly; ye—those who; prapadyante—surrender; mayam etam—this illusory energy; taranti—overcome; te—they.

This divine energy of Mine, consisting of the three modes of material nature, is difficult to overcome. But those who have surrendered unto Me can easily cross beyond it.

- When you go back to Goloka, will you have the same service as before, or a new one?

Everything is dynamic, nothing is stale, dogmatic and hackneyed.

There are different possibilities:

- Same svarupa, different service
- Same svarupa, same service
- Other svarupa as gopa kumara.

See this lecture on SB 6.1.1, 21-5-'75, Melbourne:

Madhudvisha: He is asking if they were actually covered in the spiritual world as well.

Prabhupada: Not in the spiritual world. There that is voluntary. Some devotee wants to serve Krishna as flower; they become flower there. If I want that "As a flower I shall lie down at the lotus feet of Krishna," he becomes flower, voluntarily. And he can change his..., from flower to human body. That is spiritual life. There is no restriction. If some devotee wants to serve Krishna as cow, he serves Krishna as cow, as calf, as flower, as plant, as water, as ground, field, or as father, as mother, as friend, as beloved, anything. Ye yatha mam prapadyante tams tathaiva bhajamy aham [Bg. 4.11]. That is Krishna's all-powerfulness, spiritual life.

- While you were in the material world, were you missed in Goloka?

Bṛhad Bhagavatamṛta 2.3.77-91, Ganesha is showing, seeing and describing many parties of Vaikuntha devotees who go down from the spiritual world beyond Siva or Mahesha-dhama (which is just in the spiritual world, so beyond the mahat-tattva or maya) to the many universes in the material world to preach and spread pure devotion.

Ganesa showed this to Gopakumara who was in Mahesha dhama He saw a group of attractive four-armed persons from Vaikuntha arrive. They were adorned with all the opulence's of youth, charm, beauty and good fortune.

They made the Saivites seem invisible by their effulgence and were immersed in the blissful rasa of singing the sublime glories of the lord

Also in Brihad Bhagavatamṛta 1.3.46. we read:

"They travel freely wherever they want, protecting and promoting the cause of the Lord's devotees and the Lord's devotional service."

Commentary: "These eternally liberated Vaikuntha-vasis are always helping others. Acting in the material world, they protect sincere persons from misunderstanding the principles of devotional service and thereby falling down and being punished by the agents of Yama-rajā. The Vaikuntha-vasis encourage the descent of advanced devotees into saintly families, act for the increased prosperity and influence of those devotees, and render unseen help to the devotees' preaching"

"Somehow or other the son leaves home and forgets his father. The father, of course, never forgets his son. He thinks, "Oh, my son has left. If he would only come back!" Krishna thinks in this way. We are all sons of Krishna, and Krishna is more anxious to get us back home, back to Godhead, than we are to go." (TLK 8, Bhakti yoga)

"Krishna is always finding out the opportunity how you can be taken back home, back to Godhead. Just like affectionate father. Rascal son left his father, loitering in the street and have no shelter, no food, suffering so much. The father is more anxious to take the boy home. Similarly, Krishna is the supreme father." (Lecture, SB 1.8.21, New York)

– When you return to Goloka will you remember the material world?

Jaiva dharma ch 16 says: "They do not even know that a potency called maya-sakti exists. Staying in the middle of the circle of the spiritual world, they are very far away from Maya. They always swim in the ocean of pleasure that is worshipping and serving the Lord. They know nothing of suffering, material pleasure or selfish pleasure. They are eternally liberated. Love for the Lord is their entire life. What are grief, death, and fear they do not know."

But see answer on 18; some are ghostyanandi's.

According to Sri Jiva Gosvami in Bhakti Sandarbha, anu 180: "the souls returned again to the spiritual world are the best for going to the material world to save fallen souls, because they have experience of suffering, they can most feelingly bestow their grace sometimes recalling their own previous suffering in the same way as a person recalls a nightmare upon waking...Mercy is the movement of the heart which occurs only when the suffering of another person touches one's heart. But the devotee in the spiritual world ever relishes supreme bliss. Therefore, suffering arising out of ignorance cannot penetrate his heart, just as darkness can never contact the sun...Consequently, there is no possibility of compassion being aroused in that devotee's heart at the plight of such suffering."

– When you return to Goloka is there a chance that you could return to the cycle of birth and death in the material world?

To answer this, Srila Prabhupada explains in his philosophical discussions on Bergson:

Prabhupada: Krishna comes down and instructs us, "But why you are engaged in this foolish activity? Please come to Me, back to home, back to Godhead...So originally the spirit soul has got body, so these physical elements are just like a covering, exactly to the size of the hands, legs, everything...The future is to go back to home, back to Godhead...because he is eternally servant of God, so now he has forgotten. He wants to become master, and the material nature is kicking him, life after life. So one day he'll come to his senses and become again, renovate himself to become servant of God...Just like when a man becomes a prisoner, he'll be a free man at the end of his term, and within this term he is simply kicked by the police, so that he may not come back again to prison house.

Syamasundara: But we can't predict that the process of punishment will have permanent effect, can we? Can we predict that? Many prisoners leave the prison, but some come back.

Prabhupada: No, there is no permanent effect because we have got little independence. There is nothing as permanent. You can misuse your independence at any time.

Syamasundara: And come back.

Prabhupada: Yes. Otherwise there is no meaning of independence. Independence means you can do this, you can do that. "All right. Whatever you like."

Devotee: Then he is so many times falling down, again and again, eventually permanently he will come back.

Prabhupada: No. There is no question of permanent. Because he has got independence, he can misuse his independence, he can fall down. That's why one man is released from the prison house, that does not mean permanently He can come back again.

Prabhupada: This is the general law [to not come back]. But if he likes, he can come back. Because otherwise, what is the meaning of independence? Just like one should become fit in the prison house, naturally he should not go again.

He also explains the same in the following conversation:

Prabhupada: There is return, that is voluntary. Return there is.

Paramahansa: If we want.

Prabhupada: Yes.

Paramahansa: So we can come to the spiritual world and return?

Prabhupada: Yes.

Paramahansa: Fall down?

Prabhupada: Yes. As soon as we try, "Oh, this material world is very nice," "Yes," Krishna says, "yes, you go."

Paramahansa: Fall down?

Prabhupada: Yes. As soon as we try, "Oh, this material world is very nice," "Yes," Krishna says, "yes, you go." Just like nobody is interested in Krishna consciousness. Do you think everyone is interested? So. They want to enjoy this material world. Otherwise what is the meaning of free will? Every living entity has got a little free will. And Krishna is so kind, He gives him opportunity, "All right, you enjoy like this." Just like some of our students, Krishna conscious, sometimes go away, again come back. It is free will, not stereotyped. Just like one goes to the prisonhouse, not that government welcomes, "Come on. We have got prisonhouse. Come here, come here." He goes out of his free will; again comes out, again goes. Like that. Krishna-bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare, nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare (Prema-vivarta). The police is there. Just like the police car was there. We have nothing to do with it. But if you do anything criminal, immediately you will be arrested, under police custody. The maya may be there, but maya captures him who is not a devotee of Krishna. (Morning Walk, At Cheviot Hills Golf Course, May 13, 1973, Los Angeles)

Devotee: If one is fortunate enough to revive his natural position in the spiritual sky, how can he keep from falling down again? ...

Prabhupada: Anyone, even in this world or spiritual world, he has got the potency of coming down by misusing his little independence. It is nothing like that, that if you become president, you are secure. (Lecture, Atlanta, March 2, 1975)

– One foolish question came: In the Brahma-Samhita, 5.56, it is stated: "...where there is eternal existence of transcendental time, who is ever present and without past or future and hence is not subject to the quality of passing away even for the space of half a moment." Therefore, if you are envious in Goloka, that moment will be ever present, so will you not be ever-envious in Goloka?

This is a misunderstanding and mistranslation of Brahma Samhita 5.56 - nimesArdhAkhyo vA vrajati na hi yarapi samayah - "not even a moment of time passes". Samayah na vrajati "time does not proceed for even half a second", means according to Jiva Gosvami's purport that "the inhabitants in Goloka do not know time at all because they are absorbed in Govinda. Or the meaning can be 'the faults of time do not exist there.'"

Also, Bhaktivinoda Thakura's Jaiva Dharma (Chapter Fifteen), cij-jagatera kala akhandarupe nitya-vartamana", is distorted to "every event in the spiritual world is eternal". Yet in fact the Bengali words quoted mean "the time (kala) of the spiritual world is ever-existing in unbroken form." The words "every event" simply do not occur in the Bengali that has been cited. Indeed, this quotation is not even speaking about events.

The text explains this cit-kala: "In the material world time has three phases: past, present and future. In the spiritual world time is not broken in that way. In the spiritual world things do not come into being, nor are destroyed; things are eternal; they remain present and don't move into oblivion.

Srila Prabhupada also says that: "All living entities there are eternally associated without any break... there is no deterioration... the cycle of birth, growth, existence, transformations, deterioration and annihilation—the six material changes—are not existent there. In the spiritual world there is undoubtedly time, but it has no control over activities." (SB 3.11.38 p)

"The residents of these planets are free from all anxieties. For them there is no question of birth, death, old age and diseases, and therefore they are not anxious. In those planets there is no difference between the body and the soul, nor is there any influence of time as we experience it in the material world. And in addition to there being no influence of time, the planets...due to being spiritual, are never annihilated."(SB 3.15.13 p)

"The material world is the perverted reflection of the spiritual world. Here everything is polluted by maya. In the spiritual world, maya and the three modes of material nature do not exist. There everything is impeccable and made of pure goodness including time, place, and all other objects. The pastimes of Krishna are transcendental to material nature, and therefore they are fully spiritual. Krishna's pastimes are nourished by faultless time, place, sky, water, and so on. Within spiritual time, which is unlike material time, the pastimes of Krishna are eightfold. They take place at dawn, morning, pre-noon, noon, afternoon, evening, night, and late at night. In this way Krishna's pastimes are divided into eight, according to the different times of the day and night, and thus they are nourishing the eternal uninterrupted rasa." (Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura – Caitanya-sikshamrita 6/5)

Thus, scriptures and acaya's explain that no time in the spiritual world means that the destructive feature of material time is absent. There is spiritual time. The astakaliya-lila revolves on and on, day after day. Astakaliya means the 8 periods of the day with pastimes at the end of the night, morning pastimes, forenoon pastimes, midday pastimes, afternoon pastimes, dusk pastimes, evening pastimes and midnight pastimes, as described in Krishnahnika Kaumudi, Govinda lila-mrta, Krishna bhavanamrta. There is beginning and end of every period.

But there is no death and old age. And the spiritual forms of the houses and kunja's- forest huts do not get broken down by time. By the arrangement of Sri Krishna's lila-sakti there is

eating, cooking, making of new flower garlands etc. This means blissful changing of services of the souls (= the cintamani's or spiritual atoms, the building blocks of the spiritual world). See Brahma Samhita T 29 purport.

Proof

As we already showed: all souls here come from the spiritual planets.

We can also ask: "Are there examples and descriptions of a soul waking up in the Brahmajyoti, turning over to the border of matter and spirit, falling into maya and rising up to Goloka Vrndavana? We want a case:

'This Radha dasi or that Krishna dasa was covered over eternally, as they say in soccer/football 'sitting eternally on the sub bench'. Radha -Krishna wanted a new soul, the ananda got a little stagnant, so Maha-Visnu gets an order: "Wake up so-and so dasa/dasi". In order that there is not then a message sent back: "My Lord or My Mistress, he/she may choose maya for some zillions of years, we may not be able to deliver this dasa or dasi on time", Maha-Visnu gets regular orders to prepare zillions of years ahead of time, some souls for Sri Sri Radha-Krishna's lila, calculating that they may have to be dragged for zillions of years through the washing machine of Devi-ma.

Give us a puranic history of someone saying: "I was in the brahmajyoti, eternally. I don't know what-fore I deserved that hell (kaivalyam narakayate). Just now I woke up from that, sort of, dreamless sleep. Happy I landed in Sri Krishna Caitanya's sankirtana movement. Why all the other souls in the material universes haven't had that opportunity; this Hare Krishna movement is so much nectar, no one can escape going to Goloka Vrndavana. Why the other souls have to toil with sin and adharma for so many births."

Such is the theory. Radha-Krishna have an eternal infinite reservoir of souls in sleep suffering in the Brahman-hell (kaivalyam narakayate). Why keep back some ecstasy as the saying: "provide against a rainy day" or "hold back an apple in case of thirst". Scripture states: "sarve sukhino bhavantu: "let everyone be in eternal increasing ecstasy". Yes, if someone wants foolishly to be a spoil-sport or kill-joy in the spiritual planets, there is the jail of Durga-ma. But that rarely happens; the material world is an infinitely small area in the infinite spiritual sky.

In SB 1.3.1 Srila Prabhupada comments:

"The mahat-tattva is like the cloud in the clear sky. In the spiritual sky, the effulgence of Brahman is spread all around, and the whole system is dazzling in spiritual light. It is assembled in some corner of the vast, unlimited spiritual sky, and the part which is thus covered by the mahat-tattva is called the material sky. This part of the spiritual sky, called the mahat-tattva, is only an insignificant portion of the whole spiritual sky, and within this mahat-tattva there are innumerable universes."

Clouds are not unlimited, otherwise they would be formless and all-pervading.

Why would the spiritual world need an unlimitedly big prison= Durga, the citadel of Durga, the material world. There are only a few rascals to be kicked out of the spiritual world, to the material world. If the amount of rebellious souls is unlimited, God made a mistake in expanding them; He has caused unlimited suffering; there is need of an unlimitedly big jail-house.

“... We are only simple few, this material world. Just like I have several times told you that the prison house. The population of prison house is nothing in comparison to the whole population.” (Lecture, Sri Caitanya-caritamrita, Adi-lila 7.108, February 18, 1967, San Francisco)

Further questions and answers, comments

One big guru, an advocate of Brahman-patita-vada wrote after two pages on falling from Brahman: “It is a very intricate question – troublesome, intricate and puzzling. The nature of too much discussion may oppose faith. Ultimately, everything is adhoksaja. Krishna, Narayana – that is adhoksaja. We must have some respect for that and it is approachable only through faith – sraddha, and not by intellectual reason or argument. The solution is not within our mental scope. Mahaprabhu says acintya. It is not within the bound of your intellect..... We may try our best to use our experience to know the wholesale character of it, but too much of this will disturb our faith. The possibility is there. We must always keep it in the background of our discussion – that His ways are unknown and unknowable; we cannot bring Him within our fist.”

Our comment: He says I don’t know. Don’t challenge me. Have faith in what I don’t know for sure.

He writes: “Strictly speaking the jiva is marginal and this means that he is in a position to analyze adaptability only. He can go towards the spiritual world and he can come towards the material world. But his ability is minute.”

Comment. “analyze adaptability” means he has seen Krishna and rejected. That is the same as is described of the envy in the spiritual planets, leading to fall down.

Another one wrote similarly, after 1½ page explanation: “This is called srota-pantha, hearing and accepting knowledge through the disciplic succession. Those who struggle with embracing the proper Gaudiya Vaisnava siddhanta regarding to origin of the soul (as described above) are either the victims of a poor fund of faith or they are simply suffering from the reactions of vaisnava-aparadha... When we lack the essential faith to hear from authorities about the knowledge pertaining to even the simplest truth (as the jiva issue)”

Comment. Accept what I say, although it is inconceivable to me since I am not on the Krishna conscious platform. If you don’t accept my little knowledge and writing, what is also for me, not being self realized, puzzling, then you go to hell, you are an offender.

Then he writes: Bhakti Prajnana Kesava Maharaja states as follows:

"When the thoughts of a jiva in the tatastha realm, which is in between the spiritual and material worlds, gravitates towards independence and its accompanying temporal, material pleasures; the immediate result is forced descent to the material universes." (Vaisnava-vijaya)

Our comment. There is more in this chapter of the book. After this ‘When the thoughts of a jiva in the tatastha realm, which is in between the spiritual and material worlds, gravitates towards independence and its accompanying temporal, material pleasures; the immediate result is forced descent to the material universes.’ He writes: “The illusory worlds are not manifested in their entirety and thus they are not able to be completely fathomed by the use

of the mind and the senses. These inadequacies naturally lead to dualities with all their accompanying controversies. Theism and atheism, right and wrong, truth and falsehood, yours and mine and so forth and so on. This ambivalence in judgment prompts the beginning of illusory philosophies.”

Then Bhakti Prajnana Kesava Maharaja quotes Bhagavatam:

bhayam dvittyā-abhini-vesatah syad isad apetasya viparyaya-smrtih

bhayam—fear dvitiya—secondary things, abhini-vesatah—because of absorption, syad—will arise, isad—from the Lord, apetasya—deviated, viparyayah—false identification, smrtih—forgetfulness.

Fear will arise when one indulges in secondary pursuits and this deviation from the Lord results in false identification and loss of vision.

Then: 'bhuli sei jiva anadi bahirmukha this causes one to become extrovert in nature and entrapped by temporal pleasure.

Krishna bahirmukha hana bhoga vancha kare
nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare

Krishna—Lord Krishna, bahirmukha—extrovert, hana—being, bhoga—enjoyment, vancha—cherish, kare—do, nikata-stha—leaving, maya—illusion, tare—him, japatiya—embraces, dhare—catch hold.

Becoming extrovert and leaving Lord Krishna to cherish enjoyment, illusion will catch hold and embrace him. The moment a jiva falls into the clutches of maya, they forget their eternal form and their eternal position as servitor of the Supreme Lord Krishna in their own personal and varieagated way and become a mere enjoyer of temporal pleasures.

Our comment. The same concept and style of writing we already discussed; the eternal form and eternal position was there and became turned away from. If one argues that this happened at the border— one’s eternal form and eternal position got developed and covered over-, we say this is the same what happened originally in the spiritual world, and, this is the same description.

Then he writes: “The Supreme Lord Krishna is extremely pleased to receive services no matter how big or small from His devotee absorbed in bliss as an independent, individual soul. If any human being envies the Lords supreme position and desires to be situated on that pedestal himself; then that unfortunate living entity due to pride and false ego is in complete bondage and a self surrendered slave of maya.”

Our comment. This is not some statement of a quick love-and-divorce-at-some-border. This is the spiritual world; services-plural- were given by a devotee absorbed in bliss. This indicates a long term relationship.

Why this writer was dishonest; leaving out this part of the writing of HH Bhakti Prajnana Kesava Maharaja.

Then he writes: “If one wants to argue that the jiva falls down to this material world from eternal lila with Krishna in the spiritual world, then that is tantamount to Mayavada philosophy because that suggests the fallibility of the Vaikuntha plane. The Vaishnava acharyas never admit to even a remote chance of fallibility in Vaikuntha what to speak of Goloka Vrindavana.”

Comment. Vaikuntha’s antaranga-sakti is not fallible, the soul– who is not antaranga-sakti- is fallible. More of this Bhakta: “The point I am trying to make is that the "lotus", the brahman effulgence, the Vaikuntha planets or any other thing having spiritual existence can not be properly conceived when simply referenced to its mundane counter parts in the material world. Realization is required.

Comment. So tell us. If you are not realized you can’t say anything on the matter of the jivas original position. “Still some jivas are insistent on dragging their mundane mind and intellect to the attempt at understanding Reality. Thus the conditioned jiva is very slow to catch the real idea given in sastra and by pure devotees. To enter into proper understanding of the sastra and revealed truths spoken by pure devotees the jiva has to put aside all mundane considerations and experiences. Only by advancement in pure devotional service are the Pure and Unalloyed Truths regarding the Absolute Reality revealed to a jiva.” Comment. That is an easy way out of discussion. We have a dogma here, don’t challenge us. I can’t say what is the real idea, but I have gambled myself into this camp, so follow me.

Next point on him. See this interpolation: "The jiva-souls are emanated from the jiva-sakti of Sri Krishna and they are spiritual but atomic. In the very self of the jiva-soul or in his constitution practically there remains no maya. As jiva-souls are atomic in size and being emanated from the tatastha-sakti of Sri Krishna (viz. from the intermediary-potency which exists in between cit-jagat and mayika-jagat) jiva-soul is liable to be subjected to maya when he becomes averse to his constitutional right of serving the Lord. Jiva-soul in bondage misconstrues himself as the doer and enjoyer, therefore is affinated to the adopted bodies that are provided by prakrti. A jiva by dint of spiritual virtue may possess steadfast devotion to Sri Krishna and getting rid of worldly affinity goes back to the abode of bliss." (Bhagavat-arka Marici-mala, ch. 7, text 34, purport)

Our comment. This “viz. from the intermediary-potency which exists in between cit-jagat and mayika-jagat” is added on to cloud the issue. Everywhere these type of statements describe the ontological position of the marginal energy. The Brahman-tatastha-patita-vadi read their theory into the text, while it is not there, as they do in this text. Also, because we read later “goes back to the abode of bliss”, where the soul originally came from. Last. He writes: “In the material world we always have the choice between matter and spirit but in the spiritual world there is no matter so one will not and cannot choose matter. In the spiritual world however, the living entity, fully absorbed and overwhelmed with ecstatic love, cannot bear the thought of doing anything averse to the Lord's interest—seeing this as a threat to his continued absorption in pure loving ecstatic devotional service—his very life.”

Comment. So the thought comes– from maya– then “no, this is threat to my prema”. Thus there is maya in the spiritual world. This is so because tatastha means ‘in between’ and can go under maha-maya or yoga-maya, being always close to both, as the margin between water and sand on the beach is ever close to water and land.

Another Brahman-patita believer stated: Because anadi means beginningless, and nitya-

baddha denotes without beginning, some devotees consider that these explanations by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati and Bhaktivinoda Thakura should not be taken literally. Nonetheless, it is interesting to note that all the acaryas regularly use the word “when”, eg: “when the jiva rejected Krishna,” implying that a choice was made at some point in time by the jivas. Another consideration is that the word “when” typically denotes an event that happened within the scope of material time and not an event that happened beyond material time, which is the case with the choice made by the jivas who entered the state of nitya-baddha. This aspect of the analysis is inconceivable, so not much more can be said after examining the available evidence. That being said, one thing is absolutely clear about these explanations, and that is this: the jivas did not make their choice while participating in Krishna’s lila.

Comment. Here he says: “We don’t know what they mean, but anyway we conclude that they mean this.” The solution is simple; the soul is here since time beyond the beginning of the material creation, thus beyond the material time of this sarga-cosmic manifestation. Thus beyond our vision.

Srila Prabhupada explained everything clear: "The whole basis of Krishna consciousness and a relationship with Krishna is the pleasure potency of Krishna Himself. Srimati Radharani, the damsels of Vraja and Krishna's cowherd boyfriends are all expansions of Krishna's pleasure potency. We all have a tendency toward pleasure, because the source from which we emanate is fully potent in pleasure. Impersonalists cannot think in these terms, for they deny the pleasure potency... All relationships with Krishna which aim at satisfying Krishna's senses are manifestations of Krishna's pleasure potency. As far as the individual soul is concerned, it is originally a part and parcel of this pleasure potency, of the reservoir of pleasure Himself." (The Science of Self-Realization, p. 301)

Govinda-bhasya on sutra 2.1.32. “The creation evidently is for the sake of punishing the jivas, and making them suffer the pains of birth and death...create a universe, merely to punish the erring Jivas for their misdeeds.”

Conclusion: Brahman-tatastha-fall-vada is wrong

All the souls coming from Brahman are Brahma-vadis, who had become liberated, but now fall down due to loneliness, emptiness. They don’t get the darsana of the Lord at the border of matter and spirit, while falling down. They get that

bahunam janmanam ante
jnanavan mam prapadyate
vasudevah sarvam iti
sa mahatma su-durlabhah

After many births and deaths, he who is actually in knowledge surrenders unto Me, knowing Me to be the cause of all causes and all that is. Such a great soul is very rare.

By getting the mercy of guru and Krishna.

Chant and dance

Hare Krishna Hare Krishna
Krishna Krishna Hare Hare
Hare Rama Hare Rama

Rama Rama Hare Hare

in Sri Krishna Caitanya's sankirtana movement, and be back in the rasa-lila.

Back to home is the oasis, not the desert

In the spiritual world, Krishna's aura or the aura of the planets is liberated souls, brahmavadis. Srila Sanatana Gosvami's Brhad Bhagavatmrta 2.3.32-41 describes this.

"By the desire of the Lord, I then crossed beyond that vast region of dense ignorance (pradhana or prakrti, the last shell of the universe) and came to a place flooded with a light so brilliant, so unbearably beyond seeing, that it forced me to close my eyes.

Attracted by the beauty of the covering formed of prakrti, Gopa-kumara had no desire to leave, but the Personality of Godhead, wanting him to reach the abode of liberation, inspired Gopa-kumara to journey on.

With utmost devotion I struggled to look ahead. And then I saw the Supreme Lord, effulgent like millions of suns.

Ever increasing the ecstasy of my mind and eyes, that all-powerful Lord, adorned with many ornaments and sweet features and bearing all the signs of an exalted person, revealed Himself as the most wondrous form of the Supreme Truth.

Though always beyond material qualities, in spiritual qualities He is full; though formless, in form attractive to all. Though never directly connected with Prakriti, that infallible Lord appears resplendent in her company as she performs her pastimes under His shelter.

A flood of reverence, fear, and joy overwhelmed me. At that moment I simply didn't know what to do.

That self-manifest Lord is beyond the scope of the senses, but one can see Him directly by the power of His mercy. There is no other way.

I was unable to understand whether I was seeing Him with my eyes, with my mind, or with a power of the soul that transcended both.

Although at one moment I saw Him as formless, I remembered the mercy of the Lord of Niladri, and at the next moment I saw Him again in His personal form, vastly effulgent, and I was full of joy.

The Supreme Lord whom Gopa-kumara was perceiving did not actually become impersonal, but when His effulgence intensified, Gopa-kumara could see nothing but that effulgence. This is one characteristic of the abode of liberation, that individual distinctions tend to become obscured by the all-pervading divine light from the transcendental body of the Lord. In this instance, however, Gopa-kumara remembered Lord Jagannatha, who was similarly effulgent, like a brilliant dark-blue mountain. Remembering Lord Jagannatha's compassion, Gopa-kumara thought that no one else could be as merciful as He. Then, when the Lord's personal form again became visible past His effulgence, Gopa-kumara's ecstasy increased even more. Sometimes I would begin to merge into the Lord's effulgence, but He mercifully saved Me with the touch of the rays from the nails of His lotus feet.

Sometimes my mind felt special pleasure in beholding Him surrounded by the great perfected beings who were His devotees, at once different and nondifferent from Him. They surrounded Him in subtle spiritual forms, like beams of light around the sun.

The Supreme Personality of Godhead always invites His part-and-parcel jivas to share loving reciprocations with Him, even in the abode of liberation. He kindly considers the liberated souls who surround Him there His bhaktas, but actually they are hardly interested in personal service. The only bhakti they offer the Lord is to decorate Him as particles of His effulgence. Although they are eternal, indissolvable individuals, their separate personalities are now dormant and invisible. Like all other jivas, they are both different and nondifferent from the Supreme, like the rays of light shining from the sun. In spiritual substance they are one with the Lord, but they have autonomous identities, with their own consciousness, their own bodies, and their own small capacity to control."

In the material world, His -Maha-Visnu's- aura (brahmajyoti) is conditioned souls.

From a letter of Srila Prabhupada 76-2-52, the 17th of February 1976: "matter originally is spirit and when spirit is not distinctly understood, that is matter. Just like a tree is also a manifestation of spirit soul, but the consciousness is covered. When the tree is cut, it does not protest. But the moving entity has stronger consciousness than the tree. There is consciousness in the tree though. Also consciousness in a dormant state is matter; consciousness in a completely developed state is spirit. Matter is the symbol of undeveloped consciousness."

Then from a Morning Walk in L.A 73-93 on the 5th of December 1973: "Svarupa Damodara: I remember Srila Prabhupada used this "acintya" to differentiate between the life and the non-living.

Prabhupada: Acintya means living.

Svarupa Damodara: No, acintya-sakti. Life, life has acintya...

Prabhupada: Yes.

Svarupa Damodara: Whereas non-life doesn't have.

Prabhupada: Eh?

Svarupa Damodara: Matter, just like a molecule doesn't have this acintya. But they may...

Prabhupada: No, it has, but it is covered too much. Consciousness is covered. Potency, potent. It is potent.

Svarupa Damodara: Molecule has consciousness?

Prabhupada: Yes, everything has consciousness, but it is covered. The degree is of covering."

And from a lecture on Srimad-Bhagavatam 5.5.21-22

November 9, 1976, Vrindavana: "Everything is generated from Krishna, Para-brahman. Aham sarvasya prabhavo [Bg. 10.8]. From Krishna everything is generated. But according to consciousness, they are divided into two energies: the superior energy and the inferior energy. The more the consciousness is developed, one comes to the platform of superior energy."

In a lecture on SB 3.26.5. (Bombay, december 17,1974) Srila Prabhupada says: "Living entities they have knowledge. That is the difference between matter and living entities. Living entities, they have got knowledge. The dull matter still requires to be developed. They are also covered knowledge. There is knowledge, but it is covered."

(Letter from Srutadeva dasa to Srila Prabhupada and Prabhupada's reply, Oct. 30, 1976)
"Question 4) There are some sannyasis and temple presidents who are saying that in the ultimate issue there is no impersonal energy. They say that the brahmajyoti is in actuality innumerable living entities and that the material energy, being a transformation of the brahmajyoti, is also ultimately living souls. In other words, there is no impersonal brahmajyoti or dead matter, only living entities.

However, in the CC Adi 2.96 you refer to Jiva Goswami's Bhagavat-sandarbha "...the Supreme Transcendence, the summum bonum, eternally and simultaneously exists in four transcendental features: His personality, His impersonal effulgence, His potential parts and parcels (the living beings), and the principle cause of all causes." And in Adi 4.62 you state "Therefore the Absolute Truth includes these four principles -- the Supreme Personality of Godhead Himself, His internal energy, His marginal energy, and His external energy."

"My understanding is that there is a difference between the spirit souls and the impersonal brahman and material energy or dead matter. They are one in the sense that they are all Krishna's energy. They are personal in the sense that they all emanate from Krishna. But they are not one and personal in the sense that the three different energies are all ultimately spirit souls. Which is the proper conclusion?"

Srila Prabhupada's answer: "It is correct that the brahmajyoti is comprised of spiritual souls and that ultimately nothing is impersonal. Dead matter means forgetfulness of Krishna."

HH Tamala Krishna Gosvami's Diary: "Svarupa Damodara asked whether he could apply the philosophy of acintya-bhedabheda-tattva to life in matter. Prabhupada said yes, giving the example that within the atom there is life. Svarupa Damodara questioned whether, if life is in the atom, it can be called jiva? Prabhupada confirmed, saying that it is called covered consciousness. Matter is covered consciousness. As a flower bud blooms, so life is developed. If it is destroyed at an early stage, it doesn't develop. Acintya-bhedabheda can be applied, because matter is actually spirit in the form of undeveloped consciousness. That, Svarupa Damodara recalled, was what Kapoor had said, that there is no difference between life and matter. The Mayavadis try to compromise in this way with modern science. Prabhupada replied, "No, there is a difference -- both are coming from the same source, both are spiritual -- but one is superior and one is inferior." Svarupa Damodara reasoned further, "Within any body there are innumerable atoms, therefore innumerable jivas. But among innumerable jivas, one jiva is highly developed in consciousness, and the other jivas are helping." (Srila Prabhupada quoted Bhagavad-gita 13.22, October 31, 1977)

Srila Bhaktivinode Thakura's "Jaiva dharma" chapter 2: "There is no such distinction of classes between chit and jada (mundane) matter, as there are different classes in mundane matter, which the followers of the Nyaya-system of Philosophy call Nitya (permanent). I have already said that it is only chit which is the real thing and jada is its vikara (vitiated state). There are many similarities between a pure thing and its vitiating. The vitiating thing becomes different from the pure thing; yet the similarity lingers in many respects. Ice being a vitiating form of water becomes a different thing from water, but similarity still exists in respect of the properties like coldness, etc. though such similarity does not exist between the cold and the hot water; but they are similar regarding their common property of liquidity. Thus in a vitiating thing there remains some common property or another, of the pure thing. So though the mundane world is the vitiating of the chit world, a chit subject may be deliberated on with the help of an example from a mundane matter, ..."

Chapter 14 of Jaiva Dharma: "Svarupa-sakti, Radharani, has 3 kinds of potency of activity (kriya-sakti). They are known as: cit-sakti, jiva-sakti and maya-sakti. Although svarupa-sakti is one, She acts in these 3 ways. Jiva-sakti is an atomic part of svarupa-sakti of same substance. Maya-sakti is only a name for the distortion (vikara) of Bhagavan's parasakti, in the form of it's shadow (chaya). It is not an independent, separate sakti."

In text 1 of Anuccheda 16 of Sri Bhagavat-sandarbha, Jiva Goswami cites Srimad-Bhagavatam 11.3.37: brahmaiva bhakti sad asac ca tayoh param yat "Brahman, which is the source of all subtle and gross manifestations, is simultaneously transcendental to them, being absolute."

In text 2 of Anuccheda 16, Jiva Goswami gives this further explanation of the word param in the above quoted Bhagavatam text: "param" svarupa-vaibhavam sri-vaikuntha-rupam

tatastah-vaibhavam suddha-jiva rupa ca, anyatha tat-tad-bhavasiddhih. Here Jiva Goswami says that param means "the Lord's personal internal potency, which is the spiritual planets of Vaikuntha, and the pure spirit souls, who are His marginal potencies." He adds, "Any conception that contradicts this is in error." The marginal potency is described as being param and composed of suddha-jivas, or pure spirit souls."

Skanda Purana, Sri Vaisnava-khanda, Sri Vasudeva-mahatmya ch. 17. T3 : The Brahman effulgence is the original cause of matter.

"I create after the Lord's creation by His personal effulgence [known as the brahma-jyoti], just as when the sun manifests its fire, the moon, the firmament, the influential planets and the twinkling stars also manifest their brightness."

Purport ...he creates the universal variegatedness after the potential creation by the glaring effulgence of Lord Sri Krishna. Brahmaji has also separately given this statement in the samhita known as the Brahma-samhita (5.40), where he says:

yasya prabha prabhavato jagad-anda-koti-
kotishv asesha-vasudhadi-vibhuti-bhinnam
tad brahma nishkalam anantam asesha-bhutam
govindam adi-purusham tam aham bhajami

"I serve the Supreme Personality of Godhead Govinda, the primeval Lord, whose transcendental bodily effulgence, known as the brahma-jyoti, which is unlimited, unfathomed and all-pervasive, is the cause of the creation of unlimited numbers of planets, etc., with varieties of climates and specific conditions of life." This brahma-jyoti is all-pervading, and all creation is made possible by its potential power; therefore the Vedic hymns declare that everything that exists is being sustained by the brahma-jyoti (sarvam khalv idam brahma). Therefore the potential seed of all creation is the brahma-jyoti,.... Just as the small seed of a banyan fruit has the potency to create a big banyan tree, the Lord disseminates all varieties of seeds by His potential brahma-jyoti (sva-rocisha), and the seeds are made to develop by the watering process of persons like Brahma.

(SB 2.5.11.)

Vrindavana mahamrta of Srila Prabhodananda Sarasvati, Sataka 17. T 43: "In Vrindavana all living entities and even all things are blissful eternal spiritual and full of knowledge".

Krishna book, chapter 89 - Summary description of Lord Krishna: "The brahma-jyoti is a combination of the minute particles known as spiritual sparks, or the living entities, known as cit-kana."

Nrsimha-uttara-tapaniya Upanisad 7.2: "Someone asks another: Who are you? He answers: aham (I). Similarly, all that exists. Therefore aham is a name for all. Further, all this (this whole world) is Brahman which consists of being, thinking and bliss. For all this consists of being, thinking and bliss. That is, firstly, all this is being; for one says [of all that exist]: That is a being. Further, all this is thinking (spirit, cit) also."

"The divine expanse of Brahman effulgence you have seen is none other than Myself, O best of the Bharatas. It is My own eternal effulgence."

"It comprises My eternal, spiritual energy, both manifest and unmanifest. The foremost yoga experts of this world enter within it and become liberated."

"It is the supreme goal of the followers of Sankhya, O Partha, as well as that of the yogis and ascetics. It is the Supreme Absolute Truth, manifesting the varieties of the entire created cosmos. You should understand this brahma-jyoti, O Bharata, to be My concentrated personal effulgence."

"The divine expanse of Brahman effulgence you have seen is none other than Myself, O best of the Bharatas. It is My own eternal effulgence."

"It comprises My eternal, spiritual energy, both manifest and unmanifest. The foremost yoga experts of this world enter within it and become liberated."

"It is the supreme goal of the followers of Sankhya, O Partha, as well as that of the yogis and ascetics. It is the Supreme Absolute Truth, manifesting the varieties of the entire created cosmos. You should understand this brahma-jyoti, O Bharata, to be My concentrated personal effulgence."

(Hari- vamsa, Visnu-parva 114.9-10)

This we discuss with the most elevated devotees, since in conversations 17-10-71 Srila Prabhupada says: "These questions are not to be discussed in public. These are very higher understanding. For public should be, "This is matter, this is spirit." That's all."

Thus the Isopanisad T16 purport under discussion, namely:

"The all-pervading feature of the Lord—which exists in all circumstances of waking and sleeping as well as in potential states and from which the jiva-sakti (living force) is generated as both conditioned and liberated souls—is known as Brahman. "

means that the all-pervading feature of the Lord is all the souls, liberated-in the spiritual world, brahmavadi's and Vaikuntha-vasi's- and conditioned- in the material world.

Analysis Isopanisad

This purport to mantra 16 cannot mean brahmajyoti-fall-vada because in all the other mantras Srila Prabhupada explains fall from lila.

In the Sri Isopanisad mantra 1 at the end of the purport Srila Prabhupada writes: "if one is sober and knows the laws of nature, without being influenced by unnecessary attachment or abhorrence, he is sure to be recognized again by the Lord and thus become eligible for going back to Godhead, back to the eternal home."

If I leave the temple, my home-base, to go out for book distribution and then later return back home that doesn't mean I have come from the neighboring mayavadi Hindu temple. (True story) Nor will I ever make my home there.

Lecturing on this verse Srila Prabhupada says, translating Bg 4.9 "To come back to Me, that is the highest perfection of life. He does not come to this miserable world." (Sri Isopanisad, Mantra 1, Los Angeles, May 4, 1970)

Mantra 4 purport: "When the part-and-parcel living entity forgets his particular activities under the Lord's will, he is considered to be in maya, illusion."

Thus the jiva had activities with the Lord. A few sentences later Srila Prabhupada writes: "...he can revive his original consciousness, which was lost due to association with maya..."

The soul had Krishna consciousness and activities of bhakti-service- and lost it. If one wants to stretch this and argue that this consciousness and lila was at the border region then this must have been full Krishna consciousness and lila to have a fair, fully conscious choice. If one can fall from that Krishna consciousness one can also fall from the Krishna consciousness of the spiritual planets of Vaikuntha or Krishna's planet. Since Visnu is 94% Krishna (see Nectar of Devotion, The 64 qualities of Krishna) the Maha-Visnu brahmajyoti-fall-vada is 94% Goloka Vrindavana fall-vada and 100% Vaikuntha fall-vada.

Mantra 8 purport: "The fallen condition of the living entities is due entirely to forgetfulness of their relationship with God....those who are captivated by the temporary beauties of the external energy forget the real aim of life, which is to go back to Godhead.... if he wants to go back home, back to Godhead, the Lord helps him."

Srila Prabhupada means with back to Godhead back to the head of the Gods, Krishna.

ete camsa-kalah pumsah
krishnas tu bhagavan svayam
indrari-vyakulam lokam
mridayanti yuge yuge

"All the lists of the incarnations of Godhead submitted herewith are either plenary expansions or parts of the plenary expansions of the Supreme Godhead, but Krishna is the Supreme Personality of Godhead Himself." (SB 1.3.28)

This is the paribhasa-sutra (basic, essential, most important verse) of the Bhagavatam. The Godhead is Krishna, bhagavan svayam. He never said in all his teachings: back to the brahmajyoti, not even once. He did say:

Back to Goloka Vrindavana 4x
Back to Krishnaloka 1x
Back to Krishna's loka, back to home 1x
Back to the Vaikuntha planets 7x
Go back to My planet 2x
Go back to Jagannatha 1x
Back to the rasa-lila dance 5x
Back to Vaikuntha 14x

Later in this purport Srila Prabhupada states: "Real liberation means going back to Godhead. Liberation as conceived of by an impersonalist is a myth..." From this statement it is clear that this Godhead is not the brahmajyoti. Real liberation is the Godhead where the souls came from and should be going back to. We came from real liberation and will go back to real liberation. We didn't come from the brahmajyoti.

Back to (the) Godhead means back to Krishna, Parabrahman.

Srila Prabhupada uses, see vedabase, the phrases

"expansions of Godhead" 7x,

"expansion of Godhead" 5x,

"incarnation of Godhead" 142x

"incarnations of Godhead" 59x

It is Parabrahman-the Godhead- who incarnates or expands not Brahman. Brahman only transforms, controlled by the Parabrahman.
It is not as atheistic science teaches “Nature, chance, spontaneous creation”. There is no proof or experiment of that.

Mantra 9 purport: “...the Supreme Lord is the proprietor of everything... to awaken this God consciousness in the forgetful living being... to bring one back to Godhead... revive the forgetful soul's lost relationship with the Personality of Godhead... the lust (e.g. the attainment of heavenly pleasure for sense gratification) for which causes their material bondage in the first place...”

The soul became lusty and forgot the Godhead the head of (all) the Gods with whom they had a relationship.

“Devotee: In Krishna book it says that there were some color fighting in Dvaraka. They were throwing color. And some men became lusty seeing the women. Will that be the first part of their falldown, to be in Vaikuntha and think of personal lust with Krishna’s associates?
Prabhupada: Yes.” (Conversation, Mayapur, February 19, 1976)

This cannot have happened while swimming or flying out of Maha-Visnu, as the brahman-fall theory teaches, misunderstanding/translating “Jaiva dharma– Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura” chapter 15. There were no material forms to become lusty towards. Brahma starts to create [after] 2000 demigods years after the glancing of Maha-Visnu.

The universes (golden eggs), in an undeveloped form, are laying inactive on the causal ocean for 1000 divine years (or 360.000 solar years). This is in SB 3.20.15. Then Garbhodakasayi Visnu enters the universe. Brahma takes place in the lotus growing from this Visnu’s navel and needs to meditate for another 1000 divine years (or 360.000 solar years). This is in SB 2.9.8. Only then lord Brahma starts creating all the planets within the universal shells. Only then there is something of maya to be attracted to. (Brahma meditates 100 divine years at the beginning of each of his next days, after an anda-pralaya, dissolution within the shells of the universe)

Mantra 9 p. “...find out the means by which one may regain his spiritual identity.”

One had a spiritual identity before one dropped down. In the brahmajyoti one had no spiritual identity. One was only a spiritual spark with one’s spiritual body nascent, sleeping and contracted.

One’s spiritual identity is loving servant of Krishna. If one gained and lost this at the border, having seen the spiritual world and rejecting it, this oscillation, marginal display can occur anywhere even on the Vaikuntha planets.

The following purport tells us also, again that the soul originally was in Vaikuntha, fell down and has to go back there.

Mantra 11 purport: “In order to attain a permanent life, one must be prepared to go back to Godhead. The process by which one goes back to Godhead is a different branch of knowledge... The conditioned living being has forgotten his eternal relationship with God.”

Back to Godhead, the head of Gods, Krishna with whom one had an eternal relationship before and with whom one must develop this relationship again. In the brahmajyoti one

didn't have an eternal intimate, loving relationship. Srila Prahupada says one has to *revive* his intimate loving relationship with Krishna:

"If you want actually peace, then your intelligence should be utilized for searching out the Supreme and your relation with Him. As soon as you find out... Just like you have lost your father, if you find out your father, immediately your relationship with father is revived. There is no question. "Here's my father." And father says, "Here is my son." Because the relationship is very intimate. Son may go out for years together, but as soon as he comes back home he sees his father, mother, and that original intimacy immediately revived... So we have got that intimate relation. So when we come to that position to understand our intimate relationship with God, or Krishna, that is called svarupa-siddhi, svarupa-siddhi. Svarupa-siddhi means realization of perfection, svarupa-siddhi. So here Suta Gosvami says sauhardena gadhena, santa. If an old friend meets another old friend, they become very much delighted. Similarly, if the father meets the lost child, he becomes very delighted and the child also becomes delighted. The husband, wife separated, again they meet. So they become very delighted. It is quite natural. The master and servant after many, many years, if they again meet, they become very delighted. So we have got our relationship with Krishna in so many ways, santa, dasya, sakhya, vatsalya, madhurya. .. here it is said that sauhardena atigadhena. Very deep. There are different types of sauharga, friendship, but there is very intimate, deep friendship. So as soon we revive our Krishna consciousness, our deep relationship with Krishna as servant, as friend, as paternal relationship or conjugal love." (Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.15.28, Los Angeles, December 6, 1973)

Also, the inhabitants of Dvaraka pray when Krishna returns:

"Oh, it is our good luck that we have come again today under Your protection by Your presence. Although Your Lordship is rarely visited even by the denizens of heaven, now it is possible for us to look upon Your smiling face, which is full of affectionate glances. We can now see Your transcendental form, full of all auspiciousness."

Purport

..the inhabitants of Dvaraka, because of their being pure devotees without any tinge of the material contamination of fruitive activities and empiric philosophical speculation, can see Him face to face by the grace of the Lord. This is the original state of the living entities and can be attained by reviving our natural and constitutional state of life, which is discovered by devotional service only. (SB 1.11.8)

To see Krishna face to face is the *original* state of the living entities and can be attained by *reviving* our *natural and constitutional* state of life, which is discovered by devotional service.

Continued, Isopanisad Mantra 11 p. "...remind the forgetful human being that his home is not here in this material world...returning to the spiritual home.... The living being is a spiritual entity, and he can be happy only by returning to his spiritual home."

The brahmajyoti is not one's spiritual home. How can home be, floating in the spiritual light, alone and isolated, so that in boredom one will fall down.

Home is where is Krishna, not the outskirts, the Brahman effulgence. Just as when one's father lives in an oasis in a desert, returning home means back to the oasis not coming in the desert. And returning home means that one left one's father's house. One hasn't grown up in the desert.

“...return to Godhead.” (mantra 11 p) Return to head God. The brahmajyoti is not God but His effulgence. They are not different (brahmeti, paramatmeti, bhagavan iti) but also different. Here he says the head or chief of the Gods. Only impersonalists believe the brahmajyoti to be the head or origin of all the gods.

“...every living being in his original, spiritual form has all the senses... The activities of the material senses are perverted reflections of the activities of the original, spiritual senses... In our pure spiritual form, free from all material contamination, real enjoyment of the senses is possible. A patient must regain his health before he can truly enjoy sense pleasure again...cure the material disease...recover from the disease.” (mantra 11 p)

But in the Brahmajyoti one has no sense activities. One’s senses are withdrawn as a tortoise withdraws all the limbs under the shell.

To say, as in the Brahman effulgence fall theory, that one had at the border one’s spiritual form with fully developed senses, completely healthy but then turned perverted is the same as falling from Vaikuntha planets.

Mantra 12 purport: “We must worship the Absolute Personality of Godhead, Krishna, who is all-attractive and who can bestow upon us complete freedom from material bondage by taking us back home, back to Godhead.”

Mantra 12 purport: “...reestablishing the lost relationship between the living entity and the Supreme Lord.”

Isopanisad mantra 17, purport: “As we have learned from previous mantras, the brahmajyoti is full of spiritual sparks, individual entities with the full sense of existence. Sometimes these living entities want to enjoy their senses and therefore they are placed in the material world to become fake lords under the dictation of the senses.”

He has used the term Brahman as energy of Parabrahman. Because he states here in mantra 17 purport that the living entities before falling down for sense enjoyment have “full sense of existence.” These are the brahmavadis. Thus this purport to text 16 means that all jivas, liberated and conditioned are Brahman. It cannot mean that the brahmajyoti gives souls to the border of matter and spirit where they choose for nitya-mukta, nitya-baddha because the brahmajyoti is only fallen souls, who generally all will fall and are given nitya-mukti after sadhana in the material world. That he states here. “Sometimes they want to enjoy” then the brahmavadi leaves the brahmajyoti. He doesn’t say they go back to Godhead, up, to the source of Brahman.

Brahman as brahmajyoti the light rays have only impersonalists. Their realization is sat, hardly any cit and ananda. The ananda is relief from matter. No positive bliss. They have only “full sense of existence.”

Srila Prabhupada on this clearly states “Existence in the impersonal Brahman is also within the category of non-Krishna consciousness. Those who are in the Brahman effulgence they are also in the fallen condition, so there is no question of falling down from a fallen condition. When fall takes place, it means falling down from the non-fallen condition.” (SPL , June 13th, 1970)

“[Someone may say that aside from devotees, who always seek shelter at the Lord's lotus feet, there are those who are not devotees but who have accepted different processes for attaining salvation. What happens to them? In answer to this question, Lord Brahma and the other demigods said:] O lotus-eyed Lord, although nondevotees who accept severe austerities and penances to achieve the highest position may think themselves liberated, their intelligence is impure. They fall down from their position of imagined superiority because they have no regard for Your lotus feet.” (SB 10.2.32)

They fall down to nitya-baddha, they do not go up to nitya-mukta.

Lecturing on isopanisad 13-15 Srila Prabhupada also condemns Brahman effulgence fall-vada

“Those who are not devotees, simply jnanis or demons... The jnanis and demons, they are offered the same place. The jnanis... Aruhya kricchrena param padam tatah [SB 10.2.32]. They practice severe austerities, penances, to enter into the Brahman effulgence. But the demons, simply by becoming enemy of Krishna, they immediately get that place. The demons who are killed by Krishna, they are immediately transferred to this Brahman effulgence. So just imagine, the place which is given to the enemies of Krishna, is that very covetable thing? Suppose if somebody comes who is my enemy, I give him some place, and somebody, my intimate friend, I give him some other place. Similarly, this Brahman effulgence is not at all covetable. Therefore Prabodhananda Sarasvatipada, he has composed a verse, that Brahman... Kaivalyam narakayate. Kaivalya means the Brahman effulgence, simply spiritual light. So kaivalyam narakayate. He says that this Brahman effulgence is just like hell. For a devotee, this Brahman... The jnanis who are trying to merge into the Brahman effulgence, for devotee it is stated as hell. Kaivalyam narakayate. Tri-dasa-pur akasa-pushpayate (Caitanya-candramrita 5)

(Sri Isopanishad, Mantra 13-15
Los Angeles, May 18, 1970)

Mantra 17, purport: “No living entity is originally formless.”

But according to this brahmajyoti-fall-vada the nitya-svarupa is/was eternally folded up or contracted.

Why the Lord would decide this eternal suffering of the living entity; eternally shrunk in a fetus state. This makes Him sadist. Or masochist since the suffering of the child is the suffering of the father.

Mantra 18 purport: “Thus the spiritual master, the Vedic injunctions and the Lord Himself from within—all guide the devotee in full strength. In this way there is no chance for a devotee to fall again into the mire of material illusion.”

“Fall again, ” we have once fallen into this material world, fallen from a non fallen condition. Now by the grace of Hari, guru, vaisnava, bhagavad gita this will not happen again. We will go back and not fall again.

Just like when you had a nightmare and wake up, you get out of the bed and don't go back to sleep again. Or at least you wish to never have a nightmare again.

Thus in this isopanisad t 16 p. “the brahman generating conditioned and liberated souls”, generating is metaphoric or figurative, because the soul is eternal (Bg 2.12-25) and never generated or produced. In this meaning, the dictionary defines the word generate as: to bring to view, to show, to exhibit, to form. This means that the brahmajyoti, Krishna’s effulgence is souls, jiva sakti.

This whole mantra 16 purport elaborates on Bhagavan, Paramatma and Brahman since the verse is about the Lord and His effulgence. The effulgence is covering the Lord. In Bhagavad-gita 7.25 naham prakasa sarvasya yogamaya samavritah the purport states “He is covered by His internal potency...He is covered by the internal potency of the brahmajyoti.”

Then in Bg 7.25 Srila Prabhupada quotes Srimad Bhagavatam 1.8.19 “In the prayers of Queen Kunti it is said that the Lord is covered by the curtain of yogamaya and thus ordinary people cannot understand Him.” Lecturing on this verse Srila Prabhupada says mAyA-javanikAcchannam: mAyA—deluding; javanika—curtain; Acchannam—covered. “the manifestation of this material world is the impersonal feature of the Supreme Personality of Godhead...Big scientists they cannot see what is behind this material nature because maya, this wonderful material energy, is acting in such a big curtain. They cannot understand that beyond this there is something else.” Thus the curtain of yogamaya includes her amsa, mahamaya (amsa is expansion).

After quoting SB 1.8.19 (in the Bg purport 7.25) he writes: “This yogamaya curtain (of yoga and maha-maya) is also confirmed in Isopanisad (mantra 15) in which the devotee prays – hiranmayena patrena satyasyApihitam mukham – Your transcendental form is covered by the yogamaya – the brahmajyoti.” Thus the Brahman effulgence covering our vision of Krishna in Goloka is the material energy and the souls in impersonal liberation.

The covering of the material energy means the bodies of the conditioned souls (clouds, trees) or the deities and their planets, stars, moon.

Alternatively, since the material energy is composed of paramanus which are ultimately, actually spirit souls in tamo guna or susupti, deep sleep, unconscious-the suksma jivas —the undeveloped living entities (CC antya lila 3.79), this covering is also souls.

This we have shown above.

Along with this “the brahman is conditioned and liberated souls” Srila Prabhupada states, in isopanisad t 16 p. “exists in all circumstances of waking and sleeping as well as in potential states”. This means that the brahmajyoti-souls are everywhere and in 3 states: 1. awake–liberated souls of the planets in the spiritual world and the brahmajyoti-souls, 2. sleeping - 8.400.000 species and 3. susupti -potential, atoms. Alternatively, the 3 states means: 1. waking – jagrat , the active state, in matter or in spirit, 2. sleeping -svapna, at night and 3. potential– susupti and sayujya-mukti. Or, 1. waking– material world, 2. sleeping– at night, 3. potential– liberated, since all jivas can fall, and susupti.

Brahman Paramatma Bhagavan

This is the meaning to this “the brahman is conditioned and liberated souls”. This must be so also since The Absolute Truth or Complete Existence or Being is according to SB 1.1.11 brahman paramatma bhagavan. Bhagavan and the Paramatma are the Lord, Krishna and His expansions. Brahman is all the saktis. The saktis must include also the material energy so that Bhagavan, Paramatma, Brahman together comprise the totality of Being. Thus Brahman is svarupa-sakti, the laxmi’s and souls, anu-atma’s, which are:

1. The spiritual world’s cintamanis or building blocks, which are souls (see Brahma-samhita 5.29 purport), 2. the spiritual world’s jyoti or brahmavadi’s (see Brahma-samhita 5.40) and

3. The material world's souls and material atoms. The material world has conditioned souls and material atoms- sat and asat. But all material atoms are also souls, since Brahman or the Brahmajyoti is only souls, see above.

In a broader sense, Brahman is everything expanded or generated from Parabrahman, who is Krishna. Sakti saktimatayor abhedha. Therefore Brahman is all the Visnu-tattvas (from Balarama, Krishna's first expansion till the Paramatma in the heart), sakti-tattvas, jiva-tattvas. All these are energies and servants of Krishna ekale isvara Krishna ara saba bhritya.

"brahma bhavo 'ham api yasya kalah kalaya

Great devatas like Brahma and Siva, and even the goddess of fortune and I, are simply parts of his parts." (SB 10.68.37)

Sri Balarama speaks this verse.

Again, generating is metaphoric; they didn't crawl out of Krishna, they are eternal extensions. We, souls, are His effulgence or energy, His sakti, see BB 2.3.41. But all the Visnu tattvas, purusa avatars are also this parabrahman-sakti or brahman. Only Krishna is saktiman energetic. The other Visnu-tattvas and sakti-tattvas are sakti, energy, dependent extensions. Thus the other Visnus and the saktis are all Brahman. Because there is only Krishna and His effulgence saktiman and sakti, His effulgence is ultimately all the various expansions.

This is from Krishna's viewpoint: Krishnas tu bhagavan svayam. And all else is Brahman or His servants, energies or extensions, expansions, emanations.

Sakti Saktiman

His effulgence can also mean only the saktis of the Visnu-tattva (headed by Krishna bhagavan svayam). That means the svarupa-sakti and the jiva-sakti, together often named sakti-tattva. The svarupa-sakti is the direct entourage of Krishna (or His expansions) – Radharani and her expansions (gopis, laxmis).

In general, as in this purport to mantra 16, His effulgence means all the cit-kanas, souls, jiva-sakti. Svarupa sakti is one and different, but mainly one, with Bhagavan and Paramatma being their inseparable companions. Brahman is the jyoti or effulgence, souls, not generally the svarupa-saktis. Because the Visnu-tattvas and svarupa-saktis are Himself as explained in CC Adi 1.5 – Radha and Krishna are one.

"The loving affairs of Sri Radha and Krishna are transcendental manifestations of the Lord's internal pleasure-giving potency. Although Radha and Krishna are one in Their identity, previously They separated Themselves. Now these two transcendental identities have again united, in the form of Sri Krishna Caitanya. I bow down to Him, who has manifested Himself with the sentiment and complexion of Srimati Radharani although He is Krishna Himself."

The Jivas are the separated parts and parcels (vibhinamsa). They are actually external or effulgence. Every Krishna or Visnu-tattva has His effulgence in the form of either liberated or conditioned souls.

The Gods in the spiritual world generate liberated souls – Brahman, brahmavadis and residents of Vaikuntha.

The Gods in the material world, the purusa avatars generate conditioned souls and matter, which is also souls– Brahman.

Thus souls generating from the brahmajyoti means that all that exists is Krishna and Krishna's effulgence, souls.

Isopanisad Bhasya's– The commentaries.

Also in the commentaries of our sampradaya-acaryas there is nothing mentioned that the brahmajyoti is the original position of the soul. In fact, the opposite is concluded.

First see their translations to T 16:

-Madhvacarya translates this mantra:

“O Visnu ! Your form is covered by the brilliant sun. Please remove the covering so that your devotee can see the form.” Hiranmaya-patram refers to the sun planet. The face of Lord Visnu (satya) is always covered by this.

-Vedanta Desika (Sri-sampradaya):

“The mind of the jiva is covered by a golden covering made of ignorance and passion. Please remove that covering for realizing You [the Paramatma].”

-Baladeva Vidyabhusana translates: “The form of the eternal Lord is covered by the brilliant rays of the sun...”and comments: “By the brilliant (hiranmayena) sun globe (patrena) the face (mukham - meaning also body) of the the Supreme Lord in the sun planet (Surya Narayana), is covered (apihitam).”

-Bhaktivinoda Thakura translates: “The form of Paramatma is covered by a vessel of light...” and comments: “I remain covered by the energy of maya...” and then quotes Narada Pancaratra 1.3: “There is an incomparable form of Syamasundara within the light.”

In mantra one Baladeva Vidyabhusana comments:

"The jiva and isvara are both endowed with qualities such as eternal knowledge .. true form and qualities.”

In mantra 3 Bhaktivinoda Thakura comments that the soul's tendency is to worship the Lord. Vedanta desika in mantra 15 translates "realizing You is the natural function of the pure jiva.”

“Prabhupada: Impersonal means if you have nothing to do, then you'll become mad.

And again you come back to this material world.” (Room Conversation—July 17, 1976, New York).

This Brahman is the worst naraka or hell. Because in mantra 10 Bhaktivinoda Thakura comments:

"Falling under maya's control, he begins to lament. Covered by avidya he experiences suffering in the darkness of matter. When he takes shelter of vidya to get relief from suffering, he falls into even greater suffering by contemplating the impersonal God without qualities."

Also in mantra 9 , “ andham tamah pravisanti ye 'vidyam upasate | tato bhuya iva te tamo ya u vidyayam ratah - One who is situated in ignorance (material life) goes to the region of darkness. One engaged in knowledge (seeking impersonal liberation) goes to an even darker region. “

Bhaktivinoda Thakura comments: "Those men engaged in avidya, their spiritual nature is covered by the darkness of matter. Those with vidya (impersonal knowledge) enter into a darker region where the atma seems to be destroyed."

Why would the Lord eternally cover this, with the jiva, eternally suffering a fetus state in the brahmajyoti, as the brahmajyoti-fall-vadis speculate. It is a wrong idea. We didn't originally come from there. We were eternally in bliss, in Krishna's Lila. And fell from there.

“One who is thus drawn to the Krishna consciousness movement and tries to keep himself in constant touch with such consciousness certainly gets the supreme salvation, going back to Krishna in Goloka Vrindavana.” (Bhaktivedanta purport of the Ninetieth Chapter of Krishna, “Summary Description of Lord Krishna’s Pastimes.”)

Hare Krishna.

Come back to Me and dance with Me. Why rot in this rotting dance?

Under discussion is SB 4.30.5 purport: “The conclusion is that the origin of all life is the bodily effulgence of the Supreme Personality of Godhead.”

Here is the verse and purport, this statement is part of:

“The Personality of Godhead, appearing on the shoulder of Garuda, seemed like a cloud resting on the summit of the mountain known as Meru. The transcendental body of the Personality of Godhead was covered by attractive yellow garments, and His neck was decorated with the jewel known as Kaustubha-mani. The bodily effulgence of the Lord dissipated all the darkness of the universe.

As stated in Caitanya-caritamrita (Madhya 22.31):

krishna—surya-sama maya haya andhakara
yahan krishna, tahan nahi mayara adhikara

The Lord is just like the effulgent sun. Consequently, whenever the Supreme Personality of Godhead is present, there cannot be darkness or ignorance. Actually this dark universe is illuminated by the sun, but the sun and moon simply reflect the bodily effulgence of the Supreme Lord. In Bhagavad-gita (7.8) the Lord says, prabhasmi sasi-suryayoh: “I am the illuminating energy of both the sun and the moon.” The conclusion is that the origin of all life is the bodily effulgence of the Supreme Personality of Godhead. This is also confirmed in Brahma-samhita: yasya prabha prabhavato jagad-anda-koti [Bs. 5.40]. Being illuminated by the bodily effulgence of the Supreme Personality of Godhead, everything is freed from all darkness.”

Our comment : This “the origin of all life is the bodily effulgence of the Supreme Personality of Godhead” doesn’t mean that the souls are originally, eternally in the Brahman effulgence and then fall or rise. This can’t be concluded from the context.

From Brahman only fall no rise

This text states that Visnu illuminated all directions by His Brahmajyoti. This is a set of liberated brahmavadis, according to Srila Sanatana Gosvami’s Brhad Bhagavatmrta 2.3.41 “Surrounded by the great perfected beings who were His devotees, at once different and nondifferent from Him. They surrounded Him in subtle spiritual forms, like beams of light around the sun.”

“The Supreme Personality of Godhead always invites His part-and-parcel jivas to share loving reciprocations with Him, even in the abode of liberation. He kindly considers the liberated souls who surround Him there His bhaktas, but actually they are hardly interested in personal service. The only bhakti they offer the Lord is to decorate Him as particles of His effulgence. Although they are eternal, indissolvable individuals, their separate personalities are now dormant and invisible.”

These souls always fall down to the material world, after some time, according to Srimad Bhagavatam 10.2.32

“O lotus-eyed Lord, although nondevotees who accept severe austerities and penances to achieve the highest position may think themselves liberated, their intelligence is impure. They fall down from their position of imagined superiority because they have no regard for Your lotus feet.”

The idea of the Brahman fall theorists, who think that the Brahman effulgence is the origin of the souls, is that the souls falling from brahman, fall into Maha-Visnu and are emanated out of Him at the time of the creation. Then these souls see the spiritual world and the material world and choose for one of these. But Brhad Bhagavatamrta and Srimad Bhagavatam write that these souls coming from the Brahman effulgence only fall down. No one rises to the spiritual planets.

“A spirit soul who falls down from the Brahmajyoti to the kingdom of maya may have a chance of associating with a pure devotee, and then he may be elevated to the spiritual planets of Vaikuntha or to Goloka Vrindavana. From the Brahmajyoti there is no direct promotion to the spiritual planets, and it is clearly stated in the Srimad Bhagavatam that such souls fall down: patanty adha”. (69-07-24, letter Srila Prabhupada)

Sun and moon originate life

Visnu also illuminated with the light of knowledge, according to the Bhaktivedanta purport. The sun illuminates the universe during the day and the moon illuminates at night. Thus they are the “origin of all life”, deriving their light from the Lord.

“The sunlight is also emanating from that light which is emanating from that Goloka Vrindavana. That is the real light, which is called brahma-jyotir. “ (7-12-66 CC Madhya 20.154-157).

The sun’s shine comes from Krishna, then to Balarama, then the two catur-vyuha’s of Dvaraka and Vaikuntha, then the three Visnu Purusa-avatara’s, then Surya-Narayana, then the devata surya-deva.

“The sunshine may expand all over the universe, but the source of the sunshine, namely the sun planet or the deity known as Surya-narayana, is the basis of such radiation. Similarly, the Supreme Personality of Godhead Lord Krishna is the basis of the impersonal brahma-jyoti radiation, or the impersonal feature of the Lord.” (SB 2.6.17 p)

“All the demigods are living entities who have been appointed to their various posts as the masters of the moon, the earth, Venus and so on because of their great service and pious acts. Only the predominating deity of the sun, Surya Narayana, is an incarnation of the Supreme Personality of Godhead.” (SB 5.23.3 p)

His first minister is the demigod surya-deva.

The sunshine are photons, also conditioned souls, in susupti, in tamo-guna, with some physical light. But no one of them will somehow glimpse at Vaikuntha and become liberated.

The Brahman fall vadi’s try to see their theory in this purport, but this purport is on the shine of the sun and moon, which don’t have these feats.

Also the moon gives never liberated souls as effulgence. It gives “ life”, literally and figuratively, to the universe, not in the form of souls, with a choice for maya or Krishna.

Srila Prabhupada explains at many places how the moon gives us light at night, not the stars and quotes

ekas candras tamo hanta / na ca tara-ganair api

Innumerable stars cannot dissipate the darkness, but one moon can illuminate the darkness. (Niti sastra, Canakya Pandita)

And he explains that the moon gives coolness or “life” after an exhausting, hot tropical day. And it gives taste and “life” to the vegetables. Srila Prabhupada also explains many times how the sun is the cause of the “life” in the universe; that the other planets originate from the sun and that they revolve because of the sun’s heat (SB 4.31.16) and rest on the sunshine (conversations 13/2/75) and that the whole material world is product of sunshine. No word on falling or rising souls.

See the following lecture with all these points:

“ Jyotisham api taj jyotih, param. There are different kinds of illumination, sunshine, moonshine, electricity, fire. But that jyoti which is directly emanating from Krishna’s body, that is the real jyoti. So on account of Krishna’s bodily rays, the whole creation is coming out. That is Krishna’s inconceivable power, brahma-jyotir. Janmady asya yatah [SB 1.1.1]. Athato brahma jijnasa. In the Vedanta-sutra, you have to inquire about that param jyoti, brahma-jyotir. And from that param jyoti, everything is coming out. Just like from the sunshine.

What is this material world? This material world is resting on the sunshine. Because the sunshine is there, therefore all the planets are rotating. There is a small machine. You’ll find it. As soon as it is heated, within that machine the balls begin to rotate. Similarly, the certain temperature of the sunshine, the whole planetary system is rotating on the orbit, on account of the sunshine. This is scientifically true. And because there is sunshine, there is vegetation, there is water, there is rainfall, and from the rainfall, there is agricultural products.

So as the sunshine is the cause of all material variegatedness, similarly, the sunshine is also due to the brahma-jyotir. ... It is only dependant on sunshine. Not only this planet, all the planets, unless there is sunshine... Because it is darkness. This material world is simply darkness.

..So people do not think of their imperfectness of the senses, how the senses working, dependent on the laws of material nature. Still, one is very proud of his senses, especially of the eyes. Adhyakshina—everything dependent on his eyes, although his eyes are completely useless without being helped by the light of the sun. So actually these eyes are useless. The eyes of the eyes is the sun. Yac cakshur esha savita sakala-grahanam. Every planetary system there are many millions and trillions of living entities. They can see only when there is sunrise.

This gayatri-mantra is, therefore, offering prayer to the savita. Om bhur bhuvah svah tat savitur varenyam bhargo devasya dhimahi.... But there are many suns, not only one sun. As there are many universes, yasya prabha prabhavato jagad-anda-koti [Bs. 5.40]. Koti means innumerable. Numberless universes. And in each and every universe there is sunshine.

So this sunshine is reflection of the brahma-jyotir. Yasya prabha prabhavatah [Bs. 5.40]. When the bodily rays, shining rays, of Krishna is there, then all these universes are generated. In another place, yasyaika-nisvasita-kalam athavalambya jivanti loma-vilaja jagad-anda-nathah [Bs. 5.48]. Jagad-anda-nathah means... Jagad-anda means universe. Each universe has a principle living being. That is Lord Brahma. So there are many innumerable Brahmas also,

innumerable Sivas, innumerable suns, innumerable moons, because there are innumerable universes. And each and every universe, there are innumerable planets. Yasya prabha prabhavato jagad-anda-koti-kotishv asesha-vasudhadi [Bs. 5.40]. Vasudha means this planet. Vibhuti-bhinna. Each planet has got different atmosphere. Nakshatranam aham asi. Nakshatranam: "Among the stars and planets," Krishna says, "I am the moon." So jyotisham api jyotis tamasah param. So this jyoti, this illumination, is beyond this material world. And because there is illumination, that illumination is reflected in the material world. You will find the reflection, bluish reflection, in the sky. It means that brahma-jyotir is bluish because it is coming out from the blue body of Krishna. Therefore it is bluish. We see the sky bluish, and in darkness we see, although it is darkness, there is some brightness in the sky. .. The sky is everywhere, but the covering is... seven times covered by different types of material elements, and that brahma-jyotir is penetrating through the covers, and little reflection we can see in the sky. (Lecture BG 13.18, 12-10-73 Bombay)

Also he says that the sun purifies the mind and brings it to suddha-sattva– the superior 'life' (11/3/75 morning walk). In one conversation, (14/3/75), to elaborate, he says: "In the material calculation the heat and light is the cause of material creation. Just like at the present moment there is not sufficient heat therefore the trees have no leaves. And as soon as there will be little more heat they will be all green. The creation of the foliage is due to the heat. Similarly light. So heat and light is the cause of this material creation. Similarly there is another light brahmajyoti, spiritual light. That is the original light. This is reflection."

And the sun evaporates the water from the earth. That becomes cloud and when you deserve it, rains. (NOD 8/1/73).

Continuing on this SB 4.30.5, then Srila Prabhupada quotes the Bg 7.8 the energy of the sun is Surya-Narayana.

Therefore: "The conclusion is that the origin of all life is the bodily effulgence of the Supreme Personality of Godhead." means that the Lord, who is beyond the moon and sun, is the ultimate source of the 'life', the sun and moon are giving.

No maya to see from the border while flying out of Maha-Visnu

Then Srila Prabhupada quotes Brahma-samhita that the Brahman light powers the illuminators of the material world.

Again, there is no hint or mentioning of the jiva sakti coming from the Brahman, and falling or rising from the brahmayjoti.

"The origin of all life is the bodily effulgence of the Lord" also refers to the souls coming from the pores and eyes of Maha-Visnu as pencils of His effulgence (Brahma Samhita T 5.20, 21). This brings life, souls to the pradhana or original matter and the universes are created.

These souls cannot see maya nor the spiritual world, as the Brahman fall theorists assume, because these souls are in a coma– susupti- since the last maha-pralaya, 311.04 billion years ago, and they wake up from that 2000 demigod years after they are emanated from Maha-Visnu. Then lord brahma starts creating material bodies. There are therefore also no material forms to be seen at the time the souls emanate from Maha-Visnu. See

SB 3.20.15 bhasya Visvanatha, SB 2.9.8, Brahma samhita 5.20 and jiva gosvami's purport. The egg of Brahma is for 1000 years of the demigods bobbing on the causal ocean (SB 3.20.15). And after 1000 years of the demigods meditating, Brahma starts the process of creating the content of the universe (SB 2.9.8, SB 3.6.38).

Back home to Krishnaloka, Goloka Vrindavana

Nor do we find in this chapter 30 canto 4 any statement that the jivas come from the brahmajyoti -spiritual light.

To the contrary, in SB 4.30.1, Srila Prabhupada purports: "The highest perfection is to return home, back to Godhead", which is according to his purport on SB 4.30.2 Vaikuntha-loka (loka = planet) and in SB 4.30.3 purport he states "According to Madhvacharya, the living entity is called puranjana because he has become an inhabitant of this material world." – having descended from a Vaikuntha-planet.

SB 4.30.10 – going back home, back to Godhead

Srila Prabhupada explained to a French BBT devotee that Godhead means Krishna. It doesn't mean indefinitely anything spiritual.

"Prabhupada: God means Supreme Person. But these advaitavadi, Mayavadis, they have made God everyone. God means Supreme Person, that is the dictionary word. "Supreme Being." God does not mean ordinary, but they have made ordinary, anyone God: "I am God, you are God, he is God." Then what is meaning of God?

Devotee: Therefore we say Godhead.

Prabhupada: Yes. Head man. There are many men; He is the head man. Godhead word is also there in the dictionary. You find out.

Devotee: "Godhead: being God or a God, divine nature, Deity, the Godhead, God."

(Room Conversation with Professor Francois Chenique, August 5, 1976, New Mayapur [French farm] Lucay de La Male– go back home, back to Godhead)

SB 4.30.18 – return home, back to Godhead

The Pracetas were given special material facilities to enjoy.....at the end of their material enjoyment they would be promoted to the spiritual world and return to Godhead, which is Vaikuntha-loka according to SB 4.30.2 purport. The Pracetas came from the Vaikuntha-loka and returned to the Vaikuntha-loka.

Later in the purport we read: "...return to Godhead, the abode of the Lord, mam upetya, My abode and then will never take birth again, never return to the material world."

This can never be the brahmajyoti because from the brahmajyoti one will fall.

SB 4.30.27 "...all the living entities who died on the Battlefield of Kurukshetra attained their original constitutional position (svarupa)..."

SB 4.30.28 "...the Lord in Vaikuntha immediately sent a chariot to bring the brahmana back home, back to Godhead."

The home of the Lord of Vaikuntha is Vaikuntha-loka. The brahman effulgence is compared to hell.

“Those who are not devotees, simply jnanis or demons... they are offered the same place... Aruhya kricchrena param padam tatah [SB 10.2.32]. They practice severe austerities, penances, to enter into the Brahman effulgence. But the demons, simply by becoming enemy of Krishna, they immediately get that place. The demons who are killed by Krishna, they are immediately transferred to this Brahman effulgence. So just imagine, the place which is given to the enemies of Krishna, is that very covetable thing? Suppose if somebody comes who is my enemy, I give him some place, and somebody, my intimate friend, I give him some other place. Similarly, this Brahman effulgence is not at all covetable. Therefore Prabodhananda Sarasvatipada, he has composed a verse, that Brahman...Kaivalyam narakayate. Kaivalya means the Brahman effulgence, simply spiritual light. So kaivalyam narakayate. He says that this Brahman effulgence is just like hell....The jnanis who are trying to merge into the Brahman effulgence, for devotee it is stated as hell. Kaivalyam narakayate. Tri-dasa-pura akasa-pushpayate [Prabodhananda sarasvati, Caitanya-candramrita 5], (Sri Isopanishad, Mantra 13-15, Los Angeles, May 18, 1970)

Our comment: Hell cannot be our home.

SB 4.30.30 “...one returns home, back to Godhead.....Liberation begins with merging into the Brahman effulgence, realization of the Supreme Personality of Godhead is higher...One has to approach the Supreme Personality of Godhead through the impersonal Brahman effulgence just as one has to approach the sun through the sunshine.”

SB 4.30.38 – return home, back to Godhead

SB 4.30.41 – return home, back to Godhead

SB 4.31.1 – return home, back to Godhead

– going home to the Kingdom of God

SB 4.31.24 “...Then, meditating on the lotus feet of the Supreme Lord at the end of their lives, they advanced to the ultimate goal, Vishnuloka...” where they came from according to SB 4.30.11 purport.

SB 4.31.30 – the path home, back to Godhead

SB 4.31.31 – the path home, back to Godhead

Now we will turn to the previous chapter

SB 4.29.4 – Originally the living entity is a spiritual being, but when he actually desires to enjoy this material world, he comes down.

SB 4.29.5 – ‘return home, back to Godhead’ – which is according to SB 4.29.13 the Vaikuntha planets.

SB 4.29.6 – krishna bahirmukha hana bhoga-vancha kare

nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare

krishna-bahirmukha—inimical to Krishna; haiya—becoming; bhoga—sense gratification; vancha-kare—desires; nikata-stha—standing nearby; maya—the illusory energy of the Lord; tare—him; japatiya-dhare—slaps down.

Translation: As soon as one becomes inimical to Krishna and desires sense gratification, he is immediately struck down by the illusory energy of the Lord. (Jagadananda Pandita)

SB 4.29.8 – “Because of long association with material objects, he forgets his real spiritual activities...”

The souls had lilas, spiritual pastimes with Krishna, back home. According to brahmajyoti-fall-vada there was only some gazing at Maha-Visnu or the spiritual world, from far away. That is not described here. There were full spiritual activities at the home of the soul and the Godhead, that were rejected: krishna bahirmukha hana, the soul turned his face away. Even if one proposes that the soul had lila at the border, while being emanated or flying out of Maha-Visnu, and then turned away, then this is the same as the situation in the spiritual world– lila with the Lord. Then the soul can also fall down from the spiritual world.

SB 4.29.22 – ‘returns home, back to Godhead’ – which is according to verse 20 purport ‘My eternal abode.’

SB 4.29.23 – ‘return home, back to Godhead’ 2x

SB 4.29.27 – The living entity’s constitutional position is very minute, and he can be misled in his choice. He may choose to imitate the Supreme Personality of Godhead. A servant may desire to start his own business and imitate his master, and when he chooses to do so, he may leave the protection of his master...Material bondage is caused by deviation from the service of the Lord”

SB 4.29.28 – Qualitatively the living entity is the same as the Supreme Personality of Godhead, but because of his forgetfulness he gets different bodies in different planetary systems.

SB 4.29.28 – “The living entity is never material, and his material conception is simply a mistake due to forgetfulness. He is as brilliant as the Supreme Personality of Godhead. Both the sun and the sunshine are very brilliant. The Lord is like the full shining sun, and the living entities are like the small particles of that sun which constitute the all-pervasive sunshine. When these small particles are covered by the cloud of maya, they lose their shining capacity. When the cloud of maya is gone, the particles again become brilliant and shining. As soon as the living entity is covered by the ignorance of maya, or darkness, he cannot understand his relationship with the Supreme God. Somehow or other, if he comes before the Lord, he can see himself as shining as the Supreme Lord, although he is not as extensive as the Lord. Because the living entity desires to imitate the Supreme Lord, he is covered by maya.”

In the brahmajyoti one has only a little light; one is in sat. The cit and ananda aspects are not developed.

“...again becomes brilliant and shining...in his relationship with the Supreme Lord...he comes before the Lord.”

In the brahmajyoti one cannot see the Lord and desire to imitate the Lord.

“Again becomes brilliant and shining as the Lord” means that his position before losing his shining capacity was not the brahmajyoti (of little or no cit: shining) but fully shining as the Lord, as there is a difference between the brilliance of the sun planet and the brilliance of the sunshine on the earth.

“We cannot imitate the Lord nor become the Supreme enjoyer ...(then) we become conditioned by maya...The engagement of the living entity under the clutches of maya is brought about by forgetfulness of his relationship with the Supreme Lord.”

“Under the influence of maya, the living entity becomes exactly like a person haunted by a ghost.” One was a normal person and then by a ghost one turns crazy. One was in one’s nitya-svarupa, a devotee and then maya turns one into a madman.

“The living entity forgets his position as an eternal servant of the Lord... forgetting his real contact with the Supreme Lord, he becomes a servant of maya.”

SB 4.29.34 – ‘return home, back to Godhead’ 2x

SB 4.29.47 – The purpose of life is to go back home, back to Godhead.

SB 4.29.48 – The verse is “They do not know their own abode (svam lokam), where in fact there is God, Janardana. Those who have smoky intelligence say that the Veda facilitates fruitive activities because they do not know that [Veda].”

In his commentary, Sridhara Svami states:

atad-vido ‘veda-jnah. yatas te svam svarupa-bhutam lokam

atma-tattvam veda-tatparya-gocaram na viduh. yatra devo ‘sti.

“‘They do not know that’ means ‘they do not know the Veda’ because they do not know svam lokam, ‘their own abode,’ which means their constitutional position, the truth about themselves, which is the real purport that one is to perceive in the Vedas. [And that constitutional position] is where God is.

Bhaktivedanta purport: “...their interest of life – to return home, back to Godhead.”

“...their real home in the spiritual world... there are many Vaikuntha planets, and the topmost planet is Krishnaloka, Goloka Vrindavana.”

Comment: the Brahman effulgence is also in the spiritual world, but that part is worse than hell, so that is not considered home. “The pure devotee would rather go to hell than merge into the effulgence of the Lord.” (CC Madhya 6.268-269 p.) Returning to one’s real home thus means Goloka. One came from the Vaikuntha planets, not from Brahman.

‘return home, back to Godhead’ 2x

‘return to Godhead...the spiritual Vaikuntha planets, and in particular the planet known as Goloka Vrindavana.’

‘One can go to the supreme planet (param vrajet) simply by chanting the Hare Krishna mantra...return home, back to Godhead.’

Conclusion of this 4.29.48: Go back home, Svam lokam, meaning one’s own and Krishna’s home, the Vaikuntha planets or Goloka Vrindavana.

SB 4.29.54 – Materialistic life means forgetting one’s constitutional position as the eternal servant of Krishna...has to return home, back to Godhead... ultimately return home, back to Godhead.

SB 4.29.61 – ...attains his sat-cid-ananda form... returning home, back to Godhead.

SB 4.29.65 – krishna bahirmukha hana bhoga-vancha kare nikata-stha maya tare japatiya dhare

krishna-bahirmukha—inimical to Krishna; haiya—becoming; bhoga—sense gratification; vancha-kare—desires; nikata-stha—standing nearby; maya—the illusory energy of the Lord; tare—him; japatiya-dhare—slaps down.

Translation: As soon as one becomes inimical to Krishna and desires sense gratification, he is immediately struck down by the illusory energy of the Lord. (Prema-vivarta, Jagadananda Pandita)

“The Supreme Personality of Godhead, Krishna, is the supreme enjoyer. When a living entity wants to imitate Him, he is given a chance to satisfy his false desire to lord it over material nature. That is the beginning of his downfall.”

SB 4.29.69 – returning home, back to Godhead

SB 4.29.75 – “...originally the living entity was as good as the Supreme Personality of Godhead in his pure, spiritual existence...drops into the material conditions... The process of Krishna consciousness, by which one always thinks of Krishna, is the transcendental process by which one can revert to his original, spiritual existence.”

Comment: “As good as Krishna.”

The Supreme Personality of Godhead is/was never in a contracted form as is the soul in the brahmajyoti.

“In his pure spiritual existence,” that cannot have been the brahmajyoti because that is described as avisuddha-budhaya impure and vimukta-manina one thinks he is in mukti. This impurity is not the modes of material nature but a covering of yoga-maya.

“Original” means for the Brahman fall vadi’s the brahmajyoti, not the brief meeting or seeing the spiritual world at the border. This meeting never happened, but, ‘go back to the original’ means that the origin was not the Brahman effulgence.

SB 4.29.83 – “...when the spirit soul wants to imitate the Supreme Personality of Godhead, he is put into this dreamland of material creation.”

To end, this is Krishna’s invitation:

Why don’t you come back to Me and dance and sport with Me?” “Why you are rotting in this rotting dance, in false lila, temporary lila, or hellish lila?

“Krishna’s business is rasadi-vilasa. He’s busy in dancing with the gopis. He has no other business. Just like we try to imitate Krishna. Big, big rich men, they go to the ball dance, to the night club for dancing. So wherefrom this propensity comes, dancing? That comes from the Supreme Lord. Rasadi-vilasa. Because Krishna has the business of dancing and we are part and parcel of Krishna, so we have got the same spirit of dancing. But because we are in the material world, the material covering has perverted the dancing propensity. ..But this dancing, our dancing, ball dancing, and that dancing is not the same. This is perverted reflection with inebrieties, dissatisfaction, frustration. But in the dancing of Krishna there is no such things. No inebrieties, no frustration. Because that is not false; that is real... Krishna’s rasa dance is not ordinary ball dance like that. No. The ordinary dance is an imitation, perverted imitation...we do not know how to enjoy that dancing spirit...to take part in that dancing, it requires many, many millions of years tapasya. It is not ordinary thing. Ittham brahma-bhuta...There is a verse that krita-punya-punjah, sakam vijahruh krita-punya-punjah [SB 10.12.11]. To join with the rasa dance of Krishna, or to play with Krishna as cowherd boy, it requires krita-punya-punjah, many, many millions of births’ pious activities.... in rotation, after some lakhs of years, again Krishna comes on this planet. Therefore Krishna’s lila is nitya-lila. So just to attract us, that “You are fond of dancing. Why don’t you come back to Me and dance with Me?” this is Krishna’s business. “Why you are

rotting in this rotting dance? You want association. You want sporting. Why don't you come to Me and take part in My sporting with the cowherds boys?" This is invitation of Krishna.

So one who has got intelligence, they will try to enter into the pastimes, transcendental pastimes of the Lord, either as a cowherd boy or as a servant or as a flower, as a tree, or the water of Yamuna, or the land, or the father and the mother and the conjugal lover. Or it may be as enemy, as Aghasura, Bakasura, Putana. They are also blessed because they are acting with Krishna. This is the sum and substance of Vrindavana lila. Krishna comes, He exhibits His lila in Vrindavana to attract the conditioned souls, who are engaged in false lila, temporary lila, or hellish lila."(Sri Caitanya-caritamrita, Adi-lila 7.8, Vrindavana, March 15, 1974)

Liberated souls don't expand fallen amsas

Liberated souls can expand into many forms, but they are of one consciousness and one soul.

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana comments in his Govinda Bhasya on Vedanta-sutra 4.4.11 that the liberated soul can manifest many different bodies simultaneously and quotes Chandogya Upanishad 7.26.2 to support this: "The liberated soul is one, he (can) become(s) or is three, five, seven, nine, eleven, one hundred and eleven, twenty thousand", Nimbarkacarya and Ramanujacarya in their Vedanta bhasya also quote Chandogya Upanishad 7.26.2 interpreting this enumeration 1, 3.....20.000 as meaning ad infinitum, endless variety; the liberated soul can manifest unlimited bodies.

Gg. dasa wrote: the liberated soul "first chooses in full consciousness" to fall from Krishna-loka.

Thus the soul is fully fallen or falling. Later on he writes "marginal living entities manifest as their inferior secondary baddha-jiva state."

So there is a baddha-jiva or bound soul state of the marginal living entity.

Then he writes that these jivas are projected into the material creation; those souls enter Maha-Visnu's body and the impersonal Brahman. Later he repeats this concept needlessly again and again, without any news.

Thus there is a soul, an atma, an I, expanded from the soul who is still in Krishna-loka (somehow as per Gg. dasa's dvitiya-atma-patana-vada (there is a double soul or there are two souls who are one) or ardha-atma-patana-vada (the second half soul or half soul falldown vada - the first half remains in Goloka).

This is not possible according to the Vedanta-sutra commentators quoted above. A liberated soul manifests expansions of the same quality (Ved. Sutra 4.4.15)

Another flaw of this ekatma-patana-dvau-atma-vada (one soul falls of the double soul fall vada) or ekakala-patana-apatana-vada (simultaneous falldown-non-falldown vada) is that the original soul in the spiritual world is "fully" fallen according to Gg's description.

He writes "there is choice in full consciousness." The soul fully means completely, wholly convinced decides to go away but then the soul is not allowed to go and doesn't go away!?! The soul remains serving in its rasa and svarupa in full Krishna consciousness?! Although it fully decides to leave. One soul is 100% demon and 100% lover?! This is an unsolvable contradiction.

Or he means one soul in Goloka is in Krishna consciousness and one's other self of one's double one- self is in non-Krishna consciousness. Both are vAk-cAturyam, word jugglery, without substance or possibility.

Then he gives us another theory, the manasika-patana-vada (only the mind not the soul falldown vada) (of another self of Gg. dasa?) contradictory to his previous one. Only something "subconscious" splits off and leaves the spiritual world. On this point that only the "sub-consciousness falls"

Sri Ramanujacarya writes in his Sri bhasya on Vedanta sutra 1.1.1:

"Consciousness is the attribute of a conscious self. That there exists pure consciousness devoid of a substrate (soul)...is refuted on the ground that of a thing of this kind we have absolutely no knowledge or experience..."

[As] where there is light it must belong to something as shown by the light of a lamp...words such as consciousness are relative.”

The consciousness that falls must have a conscious self, soul, atma. According to one of Gg. dasa's selves this soul is not the soul that is in the spiritual world because then this soul would be the sense enjoyer here. But, the nitya baddha consciousness must have a soul also, a soul who is not the one in Goloka; there has been a split in the soul. The soul which is indivisible (Bg 2.24). One can't solve this by saying that there has been an expansion created; the so-called expansion must be of the same nature as the original in Goloka.

Another flaw in the theory is that when one becomes Krishna-conscious while in the mahat-tattva there is a soul here which is Krishna conscious and a soul there in the spiritual world which was already Krishna conscious.

So there were and are 2 souls. And when the soul goes back to Godhead it merges with the soul there, into one double (!) But if his theory is that only a subconsciousness leaves and there is one soul, then there is a Krishna-consciousness in Goloka and non-Krishna consciousness in the material world; schizophrenia. Even if you call the consciousness in the material world some 'sub' consciousness, it dominates here. Thus, there are 2 contradictory conscious states of one soul, which is schizophrenia.

Then another of Gg dasa's selves has another, impossible theory. He writes: the nitya-baddha sub-consciousness originates from the jiva and not from the nitya-siddha svarupa "body".

Who is this jiva apart from the nitya-siddha svarupa "body?" Aren't these the same in the spiritual world? He creates another type of split in a spiritual being; this soul is with some part in maya, but still (!) in the spiritual world, a place where one can only be if one is 100% pure.

Gg dasa's personality structure is: one subconscious self of him is thinking that there is two souls and another of his selves thinks it is not two.

He explains(!): "the nitya-siddha spiritual body and the sub-consciousness are totally separate conditions of the jiva". But the nitya-siddha spiritual body must have or is the soul. And the sub-consciousness has a soul. These cannot be the same soul, since one is in maya. How there is then *the* jiva. There is not "one" jiva. And if there is one jiva for the two types of consciousness, then this jiva is with some part in maya, and thus cannot be in the spiritual world. If the nitya-baddha awareness is the same as the awareness of the soul in the spiritual world; this soul is in the mud of maya to control and enjoy with its consciousness. Such entities do not exist in the spiritual world.

We will discuss a few more of his different fall of the soul theories.

"There are really no two states of consciousness...where one's consciousness is placed...there is no secondary self as long as one experiences the full potential of nitya-siddha."

If one falls away from Krishna lila then there is a secondary self falling; two selves are in the two worlds, the spiritual and the material.

This is faulty. Nowhere in scripture we read of such an entity. Srila Prabhupada describes in a letter 27-2-72 a split-personality or schizophrenic soul "There are no 2 personalities.

There is only change of mind...from one personality to the other.” With one part desiring to be in maya, one is simply not serving and loving with one’s full potential. This is the actual state of such a soul. Such a soul is an imperfection in the spiritual world; the world without birth, death, old age and disease (including mental disease). Such souls are sent to the material world. As Srila Prabhupada explains:

“The yoga processes are simply ways to elevate oneself to enter into that abode. Actually we belong to that abode, but being forgetful, we are put in this material world. Just as a madman becomes crazy and is put into a lunatic asylum, so we, losing sight of our spiritual identity, become crazy and are put into this material world. Thus the material world is a sort of lunatic asylum, and we can easily notice that nothing is done very sanely here. Our real business is to get out and enter into the kingdom of God.” (The Perfection of Yoga, ch 3, Yoga as Meditation on KRISHNA)

The first position the falling soul takes is the post of Brahma, who is the most sane. Then one becomes Indra. Then one further falls down (see Brahmana and Vaisnava by Srila Bhaktisiddhanta ch 2. P. 86)

Another of Gg dasa’s teaching: ***“The selfish desires of the marginal living entity cover its awareness of nitya-siddha nature.”***

Here we learn that:

There is a soul in the mahat-tattva who is in maya, who has selfish desires. And there is a same soul who is in Krishna loka in full Krishna consciousness; how the nitya-siddha nature in Krishna loka could be soul-less. When that soul in maya becomes Krishna conscious then “it melts away like darkness melts away in the presence of light.” But the soul is indestructible and eternal according to Bg 2.20, 21.

After this sentence, that the marginal living entities’ awareness of nitya-siddha is covered due to selfish desires, he contradicts himself stating that there is only a nitya-baddha consciousness in the mahat-tattva (and not a soul, substantially).

The next sentence he contradicts that theory again by stating “the rebellious marginal living entity becomes overshadowed with the concept of past, present and future...” Now again there is actually a soul in the mahat-tattva.

Then he writes “we will enter Goloka again by becoming aware of our nitya-siddha nature...beginning to distinguish who we really are separated from nitya-baddha consciousness.”

The faults are:

- “We will enter Goloka” so there is no soul in Goloka?!
- “We will enter Goloka.” And “We are already there, in a perfected form.” There is another I who is in maya; who begins to distinguish who he is. The same I. He stated that the “I” in Goloka “long ago chose to forget Krishna and nitya-siddha.” And thus must leave Goloka. The I now in maya. Thus he states that the I in Goloka falls away in maya. But the soul is still in Goloka.

“...devotee regains, reestablishes the awareness of nitya-svarupa.”

This means the I in maya has to remember himself who is not in maya, himself who is in full awareness(?!); but he already is in perfect awareness! Because there is always at least one of the (double) souls or one of the two halves soul or something, in Goloka in perfection; this is the basic dogma; we are with something still there; something perfect and complete. But not complete, because there is something gone to maya. This is not an acintya bheda abheda but an impossibility.

“There are really no two states of consciousness...there is the extended sub-consciousness of the (one) marginal living entity.”

There is no soul in the mahat-tattva but only a ray of consciousness of the nitya-siddha. A nitya siddha is sometimes for some trillions maha-kalpas a siddha focusing (in) on the sense enjoyment of illusory matter. That soul is focusing on pleasing Krishna’s senses in Goloka and fixed in enjoyment of the rotting mahat tattva. This is like walking with one body north and south. Or as a cup filled with milk and arsenic simultaneously. This is not a paradox as Gg dasa tries to euphemistically dress up or cover up this contradiction. It is debauchery. It is a non-existence as the egg of the horse, the son of a barren woman or a sky-flower.

Here also he mixes in his other opposite theory that there *is* a soul in maya and a soul (the same) in the spiritual world.

He says: “Not really two states of consciousness,” because the dreamland of the material world doesn’t really exist, according to Gg. Dasa. This is his svapna-fall-vada (we dream we are gone from Goloka, actually we are still there. This world is false). This is not so. The dream of Maha Vishnu is factual reality (SB 1.16.26-30 purport)

We quote some ancient acaryas because Gg’s ideas come from Buddhist and Mayavada sources which long ago have been successfully battled in our sampradayas.

Gg dasa downloaded these ideas from his sub-consciousness having been sunya or/and mayavadi in previous lives.

Our acaryas rejected that we are dreaming off-shoots of a higher spirituality. Srila Madhvacarya writes in his Sri Tattva-muktavali or Mayavada-satadusani 101:

“The Mayavadis compare material existence to a dream, but in truth it is not at all like a dream. The dreaming condition is full of many faults. In a dream one may eat and drink unlimitedly, but he will never become satiated, although in the waking condition one quickly becomes satiated by eating and drinking. The use of this analogy by the Mayavadis is a great blunder, for the waking condition is not at all like a dream.”

And the Vedanta sutra 2.2.29 states – vaidharmyAc ca na svapnAdi-vat – it is not like a dream because of the difference.

This is from the section refuting the Yogacara Buddhists.

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana explains the difference (in his Govinda bhasya 2.2.29) as follows:

“The objects experienced in a dream and in waking perception are not the same. They are different. In a dream there is a remembering of what was experienced in the past. In waking there is direct perception. In a dream experiences change moment to moment. When one

awakens he is immediately convinced that the dream was unreal. The object seen when one is awake do not change from moment to moment, as they do in dream. In the waking state some objects remain virtually unchanged for hundreds of years.”

“We were with Krishna...we forgot Krishna and our nitya-siddha nature...we regain, re-establish our original Krishna consciousness.”

But in another place he says that we didn't lose our nitya-siddha original Krishna consciousness. In other words, we left Krishna but we didn't. We go back to Krishna but we are already there.

The soul is stationed in Goloka. It's consciousness is on Sri Sri Radha-Krishna. But also on the dream of Maha Visnu; on one of the clouds-like material forms. Consciousness can have only one objective at one particular moment. So one cannot be conscious of Durga-lila and Krishna-lila at the same time. Assuming the soul in Goloka has the ability to be conscious of Durga lila; the soul is “fully fallen” (at a particular moment, as we noted above), an thus an ordinary conditioned soul. Will Goloka allow sense gratifiers present? Will a king and queen allow criminals in the palace?

It is one thing to be conscious of Durga lila, but another to actively participate in Durga lila. Activity has to be done by an atma, who is thinking, feeling, willing and activating at that location. We do not act in this world, physically and mentally, from a subconscious self. Without the soul a subconscious self alone cannot act. When we act, we act consciously, from a conscious subject, I, atma (as Sri Ramanuja defines (see up), situated in the heart; we feel we operate from there. We know we are now here in this world, in this body, (dehino'smin yathA dehe), seeing, witnessing, experiencing etc. with the five knowledge acquiring senses and doing, acting etc. with the five working senses. We know the Lord is the main doer, present here, all-pervading. We are not in a false dream.

We have free will here now, acted out by a conscious person. We are not an extension operated from Goloka. According to Gg dasa the soul in Goloka is “totally separate” from the entity here. But Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana describes in his purport to Bhagavad-gita 18.14 quoting Prasna Upanisad Esa hi drastA srastA – he is the seer and doer; the soul here sees and acts.

This is on the verses of Bg 18.13-14 where Krishna says: “learn from Me the five causes of action.” This is about the jiva in this world. Sri Baladeva Vidyabhusana makes it clear that there is a jiva in this world and not only a consciousness. He comments:

"The jiva is the substratum of the body, senses and pranas which are supplied by the Lord, and which operate through powers bestowed by the Lord alone. Being the possessor of these bestowed powers, the jiva rules over his body and senses by his own desires alone, for accomplishing his actions. The Supreme Lord, situated within all the jivas, giving His permission for the jiva's action, sets the actions of the jiva in motion.”

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana's purva-paksa, opponent, says:

"But then at least the liberated jiva should not be the agent, because he no longer has a body, senses and pranas." (This is about the soul in the spiritual world)

Baladeva answers:

"No, that is not so, because the liberated souls have spiritual senses and body, by which to accomplish their (spiritual) desires."

Thus, there is a soul here, and it became liberated; it has gone from the material to the spiritual world.

"Jaya Vijaya choose to be in material bodies as demons...offense was atoned...they were re-established in their original svarupa in Vaikuntha."

Again Gg. dasa is wrong. The irony is that what actually happened to Jaya and Vijaya is very similar to what Gg. dasa thinks happens as the fall of the soul from the spiritual heaven.

Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura states in his Darsini commentary on SB 3.16.29 and SB 8.21.16-17 that they had spiritual bodies, amsas, expansions in the pastimes of the Lord in the material world:

"The expansions of Jaya and Vijaya fell in to the material world...the original forms remained in Vaikuntha. Their expansions playing the roles of demons stayed in the material world until Krishna liberated them."

"When the 4 Kumaras cursed Jaya and Vijaya, these doorkeepers wept and wailed. The Lord spoke, His heart softened by compassion: "do not fear. May you two have good fortune. Do not go there. Always remain serving me in Vaikuntha."

"As Garuda sacrificed an expansion of his wing to maintain the inevitability of the thunderbolt's power you should take on the role of demons in one of your expansions and at the same time remain in Vaikuntha in your svarupa."

They could expand an amsa because they were liberated souls. But internally they were always aware that all this was a drama, lila for the pleasure of the Lord. We are different. If we can expand an amsa, then if our amsa is envious of Krishna, then the original is also to be like that. What Gg. dasa describes about Jaya Vijaya is the Vedic scenario of how we fell: Offense – material bodies – atonement – re-established in nitya-svarupa– returning back to Godhead.

"They leave Vaikuntha as their nitya-baddha secondary self"

Here he states that a secondary self (atma) leaves Vaikuntha, and a (primary) I remains. So there are 2 souls. Gg dasa has many theories, so this he could assume here.

The secondary self is I, a soul, completely. We have experience of being an I, atma, conscious of and different from the body. Not that I am a subconscious entity. I am a conscious entity. Now we learn that there is an I in the spiritual world, who is (also) me. A co-existing, double self who is the same I, but I have no experience of this I, although we are one.

This is also an apasiddhanta. Liberated souls have many forms but there is one soul, and the many bodies are as their limbs. This is in the Vedanta Sutra 4.4.11-15 confirmed by all our four sampradayas: Sri Baladeva Vidyabhusana, Sri Nimbarkacarya, Sri Ramanujacarya and Sri Madhvacharya.

"The impersonal brahmajyoti...is souls in their baddha-jiva feature."

Baddha jiva means a soul bound by the tri-guna, the three modes or qualities of material nature. But there are no material qualities in the brahmajyoti. Thus no baddha-jivas either.

“Nitya siddha and nitya-baddha are 2 characteristics of each (one) individual marginal living entity.”

We, here, discussing persons, are “characteristics” of souls. We are not souls, persons. Our soul is somewhere else, because if our soul would be here, we would be fully Krishna conscious. This theory of Gg dasa is only for speculation’s sake. In reality Srila Prabhupada taught us 1000’s of times the ABC: “You are not the body. Wake up spirit soul, by Hari bole!”

Then Gg. dasa changes this theory: he now thinks that there are two souls. He can deny that there are two souls or that he didn’t mean it like that, but he does write it. Again and again. With this theory he writes “nitya baddha consciousness is trapped in a material body.” Consciousness is never without a subject as Srila Ramanujacarya writes (see above). This subject is not the liberated soul in Goloka because we, here, now, have the experience and knowledge that we are in maya, in the mahat-tattva, as a soul, the subject of consciousness. And we know that we are not in Goloka, as a conscious subject, located there, and controlling, enjoying, hearing, tasting, smelling, thinking, knowing (doing all sensual activities) from there to here, like a long-range rocket. This is Gg. dasa’s subconscious self theory.

So there are 2 souls, or subjects of consciousness.

Also scripture teaches there is a soul in this body:

isvarah sarva-bhutanam
hrd-dese arjuna tisthati
bhramayan sarva-bhutani
yantrarudhani mayaya

"The Supreme Lord is situated in everyone's heart, O Arjuna, and is directing the wandering of all living entities, who are seated as on a machine, made of the material energy." BG 18.61

dva suparna sayuja sakhaya
samanam vriksham praishasvajate
tayor anyah pippalam svadv atty
anashnann anyo 'bhicakashiti

"The individual spirit soul and the Supersoul, the Supreme Personality of Godhead, are like two friendly birds sitting on the same tree. One of the birds (the individual atomic soul) is eating the fruit of the tree (the sense gratification afforded by the material body), and the other bird (the Supersoul) is not trying to eat these fruits, but is simply watching His friend. (Svetasvatara Upanishad 4.6-7)

Thus the fallen soul is *in* the body, not in the spiritual world. B dasa is not correct saying “I am two souls. I am in the material world, not Krishna conscious and I am also in the spiritual world, Krishna conscious.”

“The nitya-siddha is the full perpetual expression and potential of the marginal living entity.”

Then, if an extended sub-secondary consciousness falls into the mahat-tattva there is no more full perpetual expression and potential on or in the Krishna-consciousness of the nitya siddha jiva. Then the soul is no more nitya-siddha. The center of the non Krishna consciousness present in the mahat tattva is in Goloka. Part of the nitya-siddha’s potencies are in rebellion, in the mahat-tattva. That is not siddha or perfection. But Gg dasa thinks there is still a nitya-siddha.

“the nitya-siddha Krishna conscious soul in Goloka and the expansion non-Krishna consciousness are totally separate.”

How can that be? Krishna says:

“O son of Bharata, as the sun alone illuminates all this universe, so does the living entity, one within the body, illuminate the entire body by consciousness.” (Bg 13.34)

If the soul and consciousness are totally separated and have no relation at all, than whose consciousness is it, when the consciousness gets withdrawn back to Goloka, when it becomes Krishna conscious? And whose consciousness is it, when this consciousness is totally separated, gone off, to maya.

“When one again becomes aware of the nitya siddha...they are in their original position in Goloka.”

Gg. dasa states: “One again becomes Krishna conscious.” But this “One” can only be a person, a soul. So there is a soul who becomes Krishna conscious. “Characteristics,” “sub-consciousness” don’t become Krishna conscious. These are not conscious. They cannot change themselves. Only a conscious subject, doer, can do that. Gg. dasa concluded that the center of consciousness is in Goloka. In this conscious I, the states of consciousness are witnessed and registered. That soul was “fully, perpetually” Krishna conscious but here we learn that this soul has “to again become Krishna conscious” and had become “non Krishna conscious” or maybe partially “non-Krishna conscious.”

“Come down as their subconscious dream state known as the baddha jiva. Baddha jiva souls become impregnated in the Mahat-tattva.”

Here again the theory he rejected is formulated as truth: he says: “baddha-jiva souls.” Jiva means soul. “Baddha-jiva souls” and “the marginal living entities” foolishly choose to leave Vaikuntha.” This is the plain truth mother Sarasvati mercifully put in his mind. But then he is immediately grasped by asuri Asarasvati and writes in the next sentence: awareness is placed into the mahat-tattva.

This means the following hodge-podge:

“The personality center is again in Goloka, this soul is 100% Krishna conscious, in full knowledge and bliss. But not 100% also (!); he is also aware of himself having gone off into the cloud of maya, roaming around there to control and enjoy.” The awareness of the soul is not any longer absorbed on Krishna’s svarupa vigraha, i.o.w 100% aware of Krishna and less than 100% aware, in one soul.

“The jiva in the spiritual world is the body. This we can realize even now while trapped in our lower nitya-baddha dreaming self if one again turns to Krishna consciousness.”

Here again the theory of a “double one soul” which he denied earlier to be correct. A soul here in the mahat-tattva becomes again Krishna conscious. This soul remains in the material tabernacle, but is situated in its svarupa vigraha, spiritual body. This is called jivan-mukta. There is a soul here in the mahat-tattva, perfect again, and there was all the time a soul, the same (!?), but always perfect, in Goloka.

In the next line he confirms this same “two souls one” as true what he thinks a foolish faulty theory.

Gg. dasa: “the rebellious marginal living entity trapped in their selfishness can’t realize...if they continue to choose to remain nitya-baddha...”

There is a soul in the mahat-tattva because the soul is “rebellious...can’t realize...chooses to remain nitya baddha.” That is not the soul in Goloka because that soul is according to Gg dasa always unblemished. But his descriptions here are only applicable to a soul, being in the material world.

Again his other theory comes in, when he copies over and writes “as soon as the (material) dream is over the seen (nitya baddha mundane consciousness-surrogate) disappears. But the seer (nitya-siddha body) remains.”

The seer is the liberated soul in Goloka who sees and enjoys the sense objects. There is no person, soul, witness, conscious subject in the consciousness in that place, in the mahat-tattva, in the surrogate in the material world.

There is remote control from Goloka; the so-called liberated soul stationed in Goloka is enjoying sense gratification through its agency or extended senses (there is no soul in the agency in maya’s world) in the mahat-tattva.

Another impossibility he writes 2 paragraphs later: “the living entity is fresh and youthful forever...even if their awareness of reality is off dreaming.”

Now the soul’s consciousness is “off,” away from Goloka. No more loving service. The soul is enjoying matter. The soul in Goloka has no consciousness of Goloka and Krishna but is dreaming. In the dream going on here in the mahat-tattva we see this soul trying to be the lord of all he surveys. So the soul in Goloka must be on a bed, horizontal or in another way inactive. Gg. dasa may say this is a “foolish belief” but this is what he depicts: no consciousness of Krishna loka, but conscious of and enjoying the sense objects of the material world (because the consciousness is gone off, busy elsewhere).

The soul is in Goloka. The soul has no more higher taste with Radha-Krishna, so he sends his senses out of Goloka. There is no spiritual substance as atma in maya’s domain. The soul in Goloka is enjoying though the senses, from matter, but these senses are out/off with the sense objects in the mahat-tattva through some extended nerve channel from Goloka to devi dhama.

“One’s nitya spiritual body is eternally in Goloka...nitya badda consciousness possesses a material body.”

Material bodies have souls not “consciousness.” It is not that the soul of that consciousness is in Goloka. Because Srila Prabhupada in Bg 2.20/22 purports: “Consciousness is the symptom of the soul...the soul is situated in the heart...it is the source of energy from the heart.”

One is conscious all over the body and the source of that consciousness is the soul in the heart. Not that this consciousness in the body comes from the soul in Goloka.

Then Srila Prabhupada writes in Bg 2.24 purport: “After liberation from matter, the atomic soul may prefer to remain as spiritual spark in the rays of Supreme Personality of Godhead, but the intelligent souls enter into the spiritual planets to associate with the Personality of Godhead.”

Not that the soul was already in the spiritual planets, nor that the consciousness only leaves Goloka and later is withdrawn to the soul in the spiritual planet.

And in Bhagavad Gita 2.12 Srila Prabhupada purports on a spirit soul, atma, present in the body. This soul is according to Krishna’s gita 2.12 till 2.30, eternal, indestructible, deathless, ever-existing, immutable, everlasting, unchangeable and eternally the same. Thus this soul doesn’t dissolve as Gg dasa states and will not lose its individual existence, having individuality only in the conditioned state.

“Some living entities have manifested as their inferior secondary baddha jiva state are sent into matter...many baddhajivas enter Maha Visnu’s body or Brahman.”

Here again the “double but one soul fallacy”, a fallacy also according to Gg. dasa himself, but here it is written again as true; there is a baddha-jiva.

The souls in their bound soul state are sent into matter: there is a soul going into matter. Not just some elongated connected nerve tube and sense but a spiritual spark.

Gg. dasa quotes something of Srila Prabhupada to substantiate this “dream fall vada” but nowhere does Srila Prabhupada literary states the wordings and terminology of this speculation. Where are these words in the Bhaktivedanta Vedabase: “only the subconscious falls,” a “lower subconscious self,” a “secondary consciousness falls’ a “nitya-siddha body remains in Krishna loka,” “a ‘characteristic or disposition bleeps,’ not the atma.” All these are rejected in the Vedanta sutra 1.1.1 and 4.4.11-15.

Liberated souls expand lila amsas

If the soul in this material world is an expansion (amsa) of the liberated soul (mukta) in Goloka then this is a kind of a lila-avatara, a pastime expansion.

The mukta enters the amsa through the spreading out of its prajna, the aura of consciousness. The liberated soul itself is in only one place.

This is in the Vedanta sutra 4.4.15 which states that the pervasion of many bodies by the released soul is like that of a lamp, which is in one place but the illumination is in many places.

In other words, the consciousness in all the bodies (amsa's) is the same. There can be various activities of the different parts or bodies but they are with the same thinking, feeling, willing. Not that the original soul is Krishna conscious and the amsa is in maya. Just as in one's own body, the hand and feet have different activities but they act with the same purpose or consciousness/mind.

One can't be a liberated soul there in Goloka and here have the experience of being in maya. It is like a puppet on the string of the puppeteer. There is no independent initiative.

B. dasa in his article "expansion of the soul" speculates a subconscious fall-vada (=the speculation that the soul doesn't fall from the spiritual planets but that only its subconscious expansion goes to the material world. The original, of the person in maya here, is a mukta-purusa, who is always in the spiritual world). This makes all the activities of all the conditioned souls, the lilas of the residents of Vaikuntha. This is similar to the Brahmavada philosophy, which teaches that this world and its activities are the lila of the Lord.

Prabhupada: They have no knowledge. Avisuddha-buddhayah [SB 10.2.32], always impure. Otherwise how they are thinking, so 'ham: "I am the same. I am God. I am moving the sun." Such rascals, they remain always in ignorance. "If I am the same, then why I have fallen down in this maya?" They say, "It is my lila. I have become a dog. It is my lila. I have become hog." (Morning Walk, July 2, 1975, Denver)

So according to this subconscious fall-vada, we do pastimes here just as they go on in the spiritual world. There is no difference between the material and spiritual world. All the activities here are orchestrated from above. The script is written in Vaikuntha and we execute it. The first and second world war with all its horrors gas-chambers atom-bombs was lila. The Stalin amsa killing 30 million other amsas was lila among the amsas of the nitya siddhas. The Mao amsa killing 40 million other amsas was lila. The 42 million abortions every year worldwide is the lila of Vaikuntha. The 1 million suicides worldwide every year is the lila of some or 1 million Vaikuntha residents. The up till now registered more than 120 million abductions by the aliens is the lila of Vaikuntha and it could also be staged in Vaikuntha, since all is one.

This is a wrong understanding. The scriptural proof is in the Vedanta sutra's Sri Bhasya 4.4.15 of Sri Ramanuja:

"The pervasion (of many bodies by the released self) is like that of a lamp; indeed, it (i.e., the scripture) shows it to be so.

Just as there is pervasion of other places by a single lamp existing in one place, through its own light, similarly, in the case of the individual self also, which is seated only in one body, through its own light (of attributive intelligence) the pervasion of all bodies appropriately

results. Just as also, although in the heart, through the pervasion of consciousness there is the sense of one's own in regard to the whole of the body; similar to it is the case there.”

Sri Baladeva Vidyabhusana comments on this point: “Those muktas, who through spiritual (Brahmic) bodies always wish to carry out the will of the Supreme Brahman, manifest in their acts the cit-sakti of the Lord, and with that sakti they work simultaneously in different places. The muktas always possess this cit-sakti and always follow the will of the Lord...they have become satya-sankalpas, beings whose mere will is action. (Govinda bhasya 4.4.12)

Then he writes in his commentary on Vs 4.4.18 (about the mukta, and this is also for the amsa because they are one) that “every mukta has the power to get to the spheres of cosmic rulers like Brahma etc...through the permission of the Supreme Ruler. But he doesn't become an ordinary samsari jiva because the mukta ever abides in that who is changeless. The mukta dwells in all spheres, fully knowing all the laws that govern those spheres.”

In other words, when the amsa comes here, it can never fall in maya and become non-Krishna conscious, independent of the origin. Baladeva continues: “Through the might of his vidya he knows both the nature and the attributes of the Lord.”

Then he concludes “Thus the dwelling of the mukta in these spheres, differs from the dwelling of the samsari jivas in them.”

This is also described in the VS Sri Bhasya 4.4.14-15:

“The individual is of the size of an atom. How, as regards of this soul having many bodies, there can be the idea of one's own, on the part of a single thing which is an atom?

Answer: The pervasion (of many bodies by the mukta) is like that of a lamp.

Just as a lamp, although abiding in one place only, enters through the light proceeding from it into connection with many places; so the soul also, although limited to one place, may through its light-like consciousness enter into the soul. Although abiding in one spot of the body only, viz. the heart, pervades the whole body by means of its consciousness and thus makes its own.”

Similarly is the explanation of the Vedanta-parijata-saurabha and Vedanta-Kausthuba the commentaries of Nimbarkacarya and his disciple Srinivasa.

““The entering” of the freed soul, atomic in size and abiding within one body, into many bodies,—i.e. its complete entering into those bodies as their soul with the thought: 'This is my body and that as well'—is possible through its attribute of knowledge. "As in the case of a lamp." That is, just as a lamp, though placed in one place, pervades many places through its attribute, viz. rays, so is the case here.”

Thus, the original is of the same nature as the amsa, but if the origin falls in maya, the ability to create amsas is gone. Unless the jiva tries to get back some yoga-siddhis, through astanga-yoga, but he is fallen out of the spiritual world.

The soul can also be in the amsa. Then the amsi (the original) is soulless. The Lord keeps the original (and the amsa) going.

The amsa is of the same quality as the original because “the soul can never divide or be created. There is an expansion of consciousness.” (comment by His Holiness Bhanu Swami)

There is no scriptural reference to conditioned souls being amsas of nitya siddhas. Paramatma sandarbha says souls or jivas are of two types: nitya muktas and nitya baddhas. The nitya mukta is not simultaneously a nitya baddha. (comment by H.H Bhanu Swami)

Some more points of B. dasa and our comments:

**puraiva pumsavadhrito dhara-jvaro
bhavadbhir amsair yadushupajanyatam
sa yavad urvya bharam isvaresvarah
sva-kala-saktya kshapayams cared bhuvi

Lord Brahma informed the demigods: Before we submitted our petition to the Lord, He was already aware of the distress on earth. Consequently, for as long as the Lord moves on earth to diminish its burden by His own potency in the form of time, all of you demigods should appear through plenary portions as sons and grandsons in the family of the Yadus. (SB 10.1.22)**

The devas came themselves as amsa to krishnas dvaraka lila on earth. The devas entered the nitya-parsadas.

On SB 10.1.22 there are also other interpretations e.g. the words amsa yadu is explained by Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura as: The demigods should appear along with the Lord's associates such as Uddhava and Satyaki, who are expansions of the Lord (amsaih) in the family of Yadu, the Kurus or more specifically the Pandavas.

Thus his translation of this verse will be: “He will by your good selves as His parts expand Himself in the family of the Yadus.”

Also in the Krishna Book, Srila Prabhupada doesn't write that the expansions of the devatas participated in the Lord's Bhauma-Vrndavana lila. But that can be to keep it simple; the amsa is anyway the same as the original.

“The message was: The Supreme Personality of Godhead will appear on the earth very soon along with His supreme powerful potencies, and as long as He remains on the earth planet to execute His mission of annihilating the demons and establishing the devotees, the demigods should also remain there to assist Him. They should all immediately take birth in the family of the Yadu dynasty, wherein the Lord will also appear in due course of time.

The Supreme Personality of Godhead Himself, Krishna, personally appeared as the son of Vasudeva. Before He appeared, all the demigods, along with their wives, appeared in different pious families in the world just to assist the Lord in executing His mission. The exact word used here is tatprijartham, which means the demigods should appear on the earth in order to please the Lord. In other words, any living entity who lives only to satisfy the Lord is a demigod.” (KB – Advent of Lord Krishna)

SB 10.1.23 states that the devis expanded; that would be natural; if the devas have an amsa there, that the devis also come as amsa.

“The Supreme Personality of Godhead, Sri Krishna, who has full potency, will personally appear as the son of Vasudeva. Therefore all the wives of the demigods should also appear in order to satisfy Him.” (SB 10.1.23)

And on SB 10.1.23 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura comments:

“sura-striyah: wives of the demigods; refers to expansions of Krishna's eternal female companions, who were present in the heavenly planets. Examples are the wives of the Manvantara Avatars and Lord Vamana. They performed worship to attain friendship and intimacy with Krishna's most dear lovers (Vraja-gopis). Because of this worship they took birth (sambhavantu) in the Yadu dynasty as different priya sakhis of Krishna in Bhauma Vrndavana to enrich the Lord's transcendental pastimes.

When Krishna appears in the family of the demigods in partial form (as e.g. Vamanadeva), His beloveds also appear in the forms of demigoddesses to please Him. When Krishna appeared on earth, these devis appeared as young unmarried gopis, priya sakhis of the nitya-priya sakhis.”

By the will of the Lord devatas can expand or separate an amsa into His lila as for example when the Lord appears. A perfect amsa good for Krishna's pastimes is only of a liberated soul. Or by Krishna's mercy and ability or empowerment of a conditioned soul. So when demigods expand an amsa into Krishna's lila, that is not their kama-rupa-siddhi solely because that kama-rupa-siddhi amsa is limited in time and activity, being connected to the modes of nature. (comment by H.H Bhanu Swami)

There is a distinction between kama-rupa-siddhi in suddha-sattva or that siddhi in the modes. The Vedanta-sutra describes specifically the qualities of liberated souls. The qualities of the conditioned soul are different.

In SB 11.15.3 Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura comments that ‘the mystic siddhis are perfect in Krishna, arising from His svarupa-sakti. They are not material.’

This is so also for the liberated souls, of course on their level of perfection, as finite souls. In others, by sadhana, the siddhis manifest to lesser degree and are material.

Especially about the group of ten siddhis, in which is the kama-rupa-siddhi, he writes that they are caused by gunas like sattva. This kama-rupa-siddhi, assuming any form one desires, in its pure form, is described in Vedanta sutra 4.4.11

As the mystic siddha is lower in the modes so the mystic power and the amsa is more limited in time and activity. But still one in consciousness.

The dream/amsa fall vada tries to explain the existence of human species (and animal, plant species below the human forms), as amsas of the muktas, but fact is that most conditioned souls have no godly and mystic powers. The human, subhuman and lower species are low in the modes of nature but they are supposed to be amsas of the mukta-purusa's, liberated souls who can't fall, but dream off some conditioned existence— so these dreamers dream. But, the 8.400.000 living being are supposed to be one in consciousness and ability with the nitya-siddhas. All the 8.400.000 should be the highest consciousness/modes of nature species, who have mystic powers and everything spiritual as the muktas, as they are amsas of liberated souls in the spiritual world. The amsa or expansion can be only of the same quality of consciousness. They should also have siddhis and be Krishna conscious.

Unfortunately for this theory, we find that the conditioned souls have none of the qualities of the muktas.

Garga samhita 1.3.1 proves dreamvada; devas expand amsas, so the soul is still on the spiritual planets and dreams off a dream-self

These devatas had gone from the Lord of Svetadvipa to Vaikuntha to ask Sri Narayana to become avatara. Then they came to Sri Krishna in Goloka Vrindavana. The whole journey out of the universe was possible by the mercy and mystic potency of the Lord of Svetadvipa, who accompanied them. This is in the purport 1.3.1 of the Garga Samhita. It doesn't prove that the devas are powerful as the muktas, nor that we all fallen souls here are all liberated souls.

****Brahma Vaivarta Purana proves dreamvada****

18.119-125 is about the yajna-patnis, the wives of the brahmanas (Krishna book (SB 10.23)) who fed Krishna, Balarama and the gopas with great devotion while their husbands, the Vedic brahmanas only surrendered later. The text of Brahmavaivarta Purana is for another kalpa.

This fact is stated in the Skanda Purana, which lists which Purana belongs to and describes which kalpa, day of Brahma.

The complete picture we get when reading the earlier passages of ch. 18 of this Brahmavaivarta Purana.

“The yajna-patnis had served Krishna Balarama and the gopas very nicely so Krishna said: “ask for any boon.”

They said: “We do not want a boon. We are the followers of your lotus feet. Kindly grant us the inaccessible slave-hood of your lotus feet. We don't intend to go back to our abodes.”

Krishna: “All right.”

A chariot came from Goloka. The brahmana women shed their human forms, showed their original forms of cowherds and left for Goloka. Then the Lord created the shadow brahmana women and sent them back to their abodes in place of the original ones.

The brahmanas in the meantime had started to search for their wives. They came across the shadow brahmana women on the path and spoke: “You are so graceful because you have had an audience with the Lord. The lives of us people are of no consequence, besides the reciting of the Vedas. It has been ordained in the Vedas and the Puranas by the intellectuals that the entire universe is the tejas (power, energy) of the Lord. Whosoever has adored Lord Krishna, would not be in need of the reward for performing his tapas, yajna etc. The one, in whose heart Lord Krishna dwells, does not need to perform any deeds. The one, who has drank the ocean, the digging of a well is of no consequence for him.”

Thus speaking, the brahmanas returned to their respective abodes together with their shadow wives.

By enjoying their company, the brahmanas were much more delighted as compared to their earlier enjoyment. But the truth about this excess of the same, the brahmanas could not realize.

Thereafter, Lord Krishna, accompanied by Balabadhra and other cowherds returned to their respective abodes.

These yajna-patnis were (in their previous lives) the wives of the saptarsis. They were very beautiful so in one yajna, Agni touched their limbs with his flames and thus fainted. These women didn't know Agni's trick but Angira rsi (one of the saptarsis) realized the mind of Agni and cursed him. He also cursed the wives of the saptarsis to be born as humans in the house of brahmanas.”

The shadow body created for the husband was done by Krishna. This hasn't involved the kamarupa siddhis of the souls.

“Through your digits you will become our wives again.”

The translation we have here says: “Lord Krishna will create your shadow body with the illusion of yogamaya.”

“All of you should go to the earth and be born in the human race.” Verse 126 is left out. Half truth is published. This clarifies everything. The text is:

“Thus speaking, the sage got infatuated with grief and the damsels reached the earth, where they became the wives of the brahmanas.”

The wives of the sapta rsis, including Angira rsi, went themselves, personally. If they would have only send an amsa and personally remained there why would the sage be infatuated with grief?

He was glorifying the wives and happy that they would get purified, getting an audience with Krishna and achieve Goloka (verse 123).

This will be a boon to you (verse 125).

On this “a digit will become my wife”. The translation we have here says:

“Then again you would become my spouses”

Therefore Angira rsi was infatuated with grief. He would lose his spouse not just an amsa of her.

Vasista Muni in the Mahabharata, Santi Parva section 305 proves dreamvada.

Ganguli’s translation is tinged with mayavada. This is clear from the following 3 footnotes in this same section.

Santi Parva CCCXIX footnote

This is a very difficult verse. Pasya and apasya are drashtri and drisya, i.e., knower and known (or Soul and Prakriti) Kshemaya and Tattwo are drik and drisya, i.e., knowledge and known. One that sees no difference between these that is, one that regards all things as one and the same, is both Kevala and not-Kevala, etc, meaning that such a person, though still appearing as a Jiva (to others) is in reality identifiable with the Supreme Soul.

Santi Parva CCCXXXIX footnote

The commentator explains that by Mahayajna--great sacrifice--is meant Yoga. The Jiva-Soul is like the libation poured in the sacrifice, for by Yoga the Jiva-Soul is annihilated and merged into the Supreme Soul.

Santi Parva CCCXL footnote

The idea of Eternity without any conceivable beginning and conceivable end was so thoroughly realised by the Hindu sages that the chiefdom of Heaven itself was to them the concern of a moment. Nothing less than unchangeable felicity for all times was the object they pursued. All other things and states being mutable, and only Brahman being immutable, what they sought was an identification with Brahma. Such identification with the Supreme Soul was the Emancipation they sought. No other religion has ever been able to preach such a high ideal. The Hindu's concern is with Eternity. He regards his existence here as having the duration of but the millionth part of a moment. How to prevent re-birth and attain to an identification with the Supreme Soul is the object of his pursuit.

Therefore for Ganguli this section means: “Brahman the bimba (=the original) is absolute immutable beyond matter. There is an apparent but illusory asat non existent jiva, the

pratibimba (=reflection) in the asat mahat-tattva. Actually only Brahman exist etc etc.“ (We all know their word-jugglery)

This has made B. dasa glide or fall down into his “soul is still in Goloka-vada.” Here is a Vaisnava translation.

“Vasistha said

1 evam apratibuddhatvAd abuddha janasevanAt / sarga koti sahasrAni patanAntAni gacchati
evam-in this way; apratibuddhatvAd lack of intelligence; abuddha-unintelligent; janasevanat-serving people; sarga-dissolution; koti sahasrani–millions and millions; patana-falling (or death); antani-ending; gacchati-goes

Due to lack of intelligence and the association of unintelligent people one has to go through millions and millions of deaths and endings with dissolutions.

2 dhAmnA dhAma sahasrAni maranAntAni gacchati / tiryagyonau manusyatve devaloke tathaiva ca

dhamna-with the abode; dhama sahasrani–millions of abodes; marana-death (or cessation); antani-ending; gacchati-goes; tiryagyonau-nonhumans; manusyatve-humans; devaloke-planets of the demigods; tathaiva-similarly; ca-also

The jiva goes through millions of abodes and millions of species like humans, nonhumans and devatas all in which death is the end.

3 candramA iva kosAnAm punas tatra sahasrasah / liyate 'pratibuddhatvAd evam esa hy abuddhimAn

candrama-moon; iva-like; kosanam-waxing-waning; punas-again; tatra-there; sahasrasah-thousands of times; liyate –vanished; pratibuddhatvad-perfect knowledge; evam-thus; esa-this; hi-certainly; abuddhiman-ignorant

Just like the moon is waxing and waning again and again thousands of times, so is certainly the perfect knowledge lost of the ignorant persons.

4 kalAh pancadasA yonis tad dhAma iti pathyate / nityam etad vijAnihi somah sodasami kalA

kalAh – portion; pancadasA – fifteen; yonis – cause, source; tad – this; dhAma – abode; iti – thus; pathyate – read, described; nityam – always; etad – this; vijAnihi – kindly explain; somah – the moon; sodasami – sixteen; kalA – portions.

It is described that only [one] the sixteenth portion of the moon is always the same. Its other stations, fifteen portions are changing [waxing and waning].

5 kalAyAm jAyate 'jasram punah punar abuddhimAn dhAma tasya payunjanti bhUya eva tu jAyate

kalAyAm – portion [in locative case]; jAyate – birth; ajasram – perpetually; punah punar – again and again; abuddhiman – not very intelligent, foolish, dhAma – abode; tasya – his; payunjanti – unsuitable; bhUya – again; eva – certainly; tu – indeed; jayate – takes birth.

The unintelligent, indeed is subjected to perpetual unsuitable rebirths in the fifteen portions.

6 sodasi tu kalA sUksmA sa soma upadhAryatAm / na tUpayujyate devair devAn upayunakti sA

sodasi – sixteenth; kalA – portion; sUksmA – subtle; sa – together; soma – moon; upadhAryatAm – united, kept; na - not; tu – indeed; upayujyate – useful, suitable; devair – by the demigods; devAn - demigods; upayunakti – utilize; sA – it

The jiva, the sixteenth portion, becomes repeatedly united by the demigods (with material nature).

7 evam tAm ksapayitvA hi jAyate nrpasattama / sA hy asya prakritir dristA tat ksayAn moksa ucyate

evam – thus; tAm – that; ksapayitvA – leaving; hi – indeed; jAyate – birth; nrpasattama - best of kings; sA – it; hy – indeed; asya – of it, his; prakritir – material nature; dristA – seen; tat – that; ksayAn – annihilation, termination; moksa – liberation; ucyate – is called.

Oh best of the kings, the termination of the soul's [attachment] to material nature stops its rebirth. That is called liberation.”

On Mahabharata Santi Parva 305, His Holiness Hridayananda Maharaja wrote us:

1. Jiva transforming into cit with ignorance simply means that the jiva's original pure consciousness is covered with tamo-guna. Cit means consciousness.
2. Prakrti with cit's reflection means that the ahankara-covered soul functions as if a material creature. In that state the jiva's pure consciousness is covered and reflected as conditioned consciousness.

His Holiness Banu Swami on the same section of the Mahabharata wrote that “it merely describes jiva in ignorance.”

B. dasa quoted: “Cit in purity” is stainless from Vasistha Muni's teachings to prove that the soul remains in Krishna lila in the spiritual world.

This ‘the soul is always pure’ Srila Prabhupada quotes often from the Vedas: Brihad aranyaka upanisad 4.3.15 asango hy ayam purusa the text in full is:

sa va esa etasmin samprasade ratva caritva drstvaiva punyam ca papam ca, / punah pratinayam pratiyony adravati svapnayaiva; sa yat tatra kim cit pasyati ananvagatas tena bhavati; asango hy ayam purusa iti. evam evaitat, / yajnavalkya. so'ham bhagavate sahasram dadami, ata urdhvam vimoksayaiva bruhiti.

The gist of this sloka is that “whatever the soul sees in dream, deep sleep or awakening, he is not followed or affected by it for this person is not attached to anything.” But the soul is *in* matter dreaming, sleeping or awakened.

Srila Prahupada explains this asango hy ayam purusa in various places:

“The living entity is liberated. His material contamination is temporary, and his actual position is that he is liberated.” (SB 3.3.14 p);

“the soul is always pure and uncontaminated by material attachment.” (SB 4.3.23 p);

“the spirit soul is always unaffected by material arrangements.” (SB 5.10.6 p);

“The demigods said: Let Maharaja Nimi live without a material body. Let him live in a spiritual body as a personal associate of the Supreme Personality of Godhead, and, according to his desire, let him be manifest or unmanifest to common materially embodied people.

Purport: The demigods wanted Maharaja Nimi to come to life, but Maharaja Nimi did not want to accept another material body. Under the circumstances, the demigods, having been requested by the saintly persons, gave him the benediction that he would be able to stay in his spiritual body...a purely spiritual body, free from all gross and subtle material contamination....Thus he lived in his original, spiritual body as an associate of the Supreme Personality of Godhead.” (SB 9.13.11);

“Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura comments that the word siddha-deha, “perfected spiritual body,” refers to a body beyond the material gross body composed of five elements and the subtle astral body composed of mind, intelligence and false ego. In other words, one attains a completely spiritual body fit to render service to the transcendental couple Radha and Krishna: sarvopadhi-vinirmuktam tat-paratvena nirmalam [Cc. Madhya 19.170].

When one is situated in his spiritual body, which is beyond this gross and subtle material body, he is fit to serve Radha and Krishna. That body is called siddha-deha...when one is spiritually situated and does not desire a gross or subtle body, he attains his original spiritual body. As confirmed by the Bhagavad-gita (4.9): tyaktva deham punar janma naiti mam eti so 'rjuna.

One is elevated to the spiritual world by the spiritual body and is situated either in Goloka Vrindavana or in another Vaikuntha planet.” (CC Madhya 8.229 p)”

Thus, ‘asango’ means that the living entity is not connected with matter. As a diamond can be covered over by mud but is not actually stained, so similarly the svarupa of the soul is covered over, and contracted even, but not lost by being under the mud of maya. But, the soul is *in* the material world, out of the spiritual world.

This asango purusa gets repeatedly associated with different types of gross bodies. The subtle body, antah karana, the four inner faculties – citta, ahankara, buddhi, manah -is the same, during one maha-kalpa, lifetime of Lord Brahma, but its content changes; the soul has various types of thinking, feeling, willing.

Thus, this is no description that the jiva is still in Goloka.

Gangulis Mahabharata translation can be referred to but on finer, philosophical points we should check the sanskrit to see if the mayavada philosophical tinge hasn't covered the siddhantas.

In the same way we can use an impersonalist's translation of Brahmavaivarta Purana to analyze story or lila, where they generally make no mistakes. If in doubt, check the sanskrit original, at least the keywords with a dictionary or compare different translations.

You are liberated. Simply just a cloud has covered you. Drive away the cloud. There is no question that you were ever. You are ever-liberated.

The context of the quote from the CC Adi 7.108 lecture 18-2-67 makes it clear that Srila Prabhupada is not speaking of “part of us in a liberated state on some plane of existence.” He speaks of and to the soul here and now, who is temporarily in maya.

Bhaktijana: Has my soul ever been liberated? If I was once liberated...

Prabhupada: You are liberated. You are liberated. Simply just a cloud has covered you. Drive away the cloud. There is no question that you were ever. ... You are ever-liberated. The sky is always spiritual, but it is sometimes overcrowded with a cloud, this maya. This is called maya. Actually, you are not conditioned. You are thinking. Just like in the dream you are thinking that a tiger is eating you. You were never eaten by a tiger. There is no tiger. So we have to get out of this dream. Don't you sometimes dream that a tiger is eating you? Is there any tiger? You are simply thinking. So if you keep in Krishna consciousness, that nonsense thinking will go away. Therefore we have to keep ourself always in ‘Krishna-thinking’ so that this dream will never come. If you are always awakened, then dream never comes. So keep yourself always awakened by Krishna consciousness.”

The previous 15 questions, before this question, were on the soul falling from the spiritual world due to independence, Srila Prabhupada has explained, just as students come to his ISKCON and go away.

He has also just answered that the brahmajyoti is in the spiritual sky and here also. Just like the sunshine, when there is cloud in the sky, is under in and above the clouds.

Brahmajyoti means cit-kana, souls. These souls are Krishna’s and Visnu’s effulgence. I.o.w there are souls here, not just amsas.

Then Srila Prabhupada says: “a cloud has covered you...sometimes (you are) overcrowded with a cloud. This is maya. Keep in Krishna consciousness, that nonsense thinking will go away.”

Before this answer he has already explained that “The population of the prison house is nothing in comparison to the whole population...Vasudeva datta speaking to Lord Caitanya: ”You have come to deliver all the fallen souls. You please take all the conditioned souls of this universe, and if You think they are not competent, they are sinful, You can give me all the sin to me. Caitanya says: “ Even this universe is delivered fully, there is a big bag of mustard seeds. It is only one grain." There are so many conditioned souls, and these conditioned souls are only insignificant in comparison to the liberated souls. Just imagine what is the quantity of liberated souls.” Srila Prabhupada explains that some souls actually leave the spiritual world; there are less souls there, and now a few are here in the cosmic prison-house of Durga.

Then it is said that “ if the soul gets out of the material world and he goes to Kâñëaloka, there is possibility to again come here, but he does not come. Just like after putting your hand in the fire, you never put it again if you are really intelligent. So those who are going back to Godhead, they become intelligent.”

The soul came from, moved out of, Krishna loka to here, and then ‘goes back to Godhead’, Krishna’s planet. If the soul is already in Krishna loka, this ‘going back’ is not to be said.

“The individual soul naturally resides in Vaikuntha. If he somehow comes to the material world, the individual soul brings with him his spiritual form made of chit. Pervertedly reflected in the material world those things of chit are called by name “matter.... the soul loses (the memory) of the original form (or rasa) (he had) in the Vaikuntha world” (Prema-pradipa, p. 96)

We have another translation, from the Bhaktivedanta Vedabase: “In the liberated state we have a spiritual form. In the conditioned state we have a form of indistinct (mixed) matter and spirit.

In the liberated state Vaikuntha-rasa is enjoyed, and in the conditioned state it should be sought after.”

Thus “the soul loses (the memory) of the original form (or rasa) (he had) in the Vaikuntha world” of B. dasa’s translation means what is stated just above these lines: the soul “comes to the material world and brings with him his spiritual form made of cit.”

He doesn’t leave it in the spiritual world. The soul brought it here.

From this translation, B. dasa concludes that our spiritual body is still in Vaikuntha and is pervertedly reflected as the material body here. The translation we have says...”cit (pervertedly) reflect the substance named matter.” That is much more general, this Srila Prabhupada explains by quoting Bg 15.1:

“urdhva-mulam-adhah-sakhamasvattham-prahur vyayam
chandamsi yasya parnaniyas tam veda sa veda-vit

The Supreme Personality of Godhead said: It is said that there is an imperishable banyan tree that has its roots upward and its branches down and whose leaves are the Vedic hymns. One who knows this tree is the knower of the Vedas.”

And lecturing:

“Just like a tree, standing on the shore of a reservoir of water. You'll find the reflection of the tree downward. Everything is topsy-turvy. The trunk, the root is on the up, and the foliage, which is on the up, that has come down. Similarly, this material world is described in the Bhagavad-gita, Fifteenth Chapter: urdhva-mulam adhah-sakham. Generally, we see tree downwards, root, but in the reflection you will find the roots upward. Therefore urdhva-mulam adhah-sakham means these material varieties are simply an imitation of the original variety.” (SB 1.2.23, Los Angeles, August 26, 1972)

Thus this “perverted reflection” means that this world is a topsy-turvy of the spiritual world. This is already in the Katha Upanisad 4.10

yad eveha tad amutra
yad amutra tad anv-ihā

Whatever is down here, the same is over there,
and what is over there is replicated over here.

If the avatars or expansions of the souls are false or degenerated copies as B. dasa thinks then what about Krishna’s expansions (the 3 Vishnus) and avatars or descents into the material world. It is nowhere specified to refer only to the souls. And the other souls (also cit) who don’t fall, are they not mirrored along?

Therefore the translation B. dasa uses is correct if one understands from “the soul doesn’t lose his original form he had in Vaikuntha,” that it becomes shrunk or contracted. The soul doesn’t lose it. And it can be unfolded or evolved again. And “The soul loses the memory of his original spiritual form in Vaikuntha” is correct if understood to mean that the soul forgets the form he had in Vaikuntha (fully developed) and which he also has now here (dwarfed).

On this: “He forgets the Vaikuntha form.” To fit B. dasa’s explanation it should have been said “the soul loses the memory of his original form which still is in Vaikuntha.” But this “the soul loses the memory of his form in Vaikuntha” can’t be turned to B. dasa’s interpretation because then the next sentence would be redundant. “Still his Vaikuntha form doesn’t cease to exist.” Yes, we know that. This you already said.

We have another translation of these verses, graciously provided by Dr. Demian Martins: “Cit is said to be pure atma; it does not mean this (material) form. In other words, the original form of pure atma is a body made of cit. It is a constitutional structure called cit. It is eternally manifested by the acintya-sakti. It is in this substance that the places, the bodies, and other instruments become manifest in their eternal form in Vaikuntha. Atma is an element situated in Vaikuntha, by which the original cit comes to the material world. It makes the substances named material elements reflect.”

“The liberated state is our original constitution as consciousness (cit), while the conditioned state is a reflex of consciousness, which appears as conscious and non-conscious. In the liberated state we (naturally) enjoy the rasas of Vaikuntha, while in the conditioned state we have to search for rasa. That means, we have to look for enjoyable rasas like those (but which are perverted in this world).”

To summarize:

In the liberated state as atma in vaikuntha, we enjoyed the rasas of Vaikuntha. The original form of pure atma is a body made of cit. This is our original constitution as consciousness (cit). Then we come to the material world.

The soul, sat-cit-ananda-vigraha, left Vaikuntha. Nothing of the soul is there anymore, only a memory.

Srla Prabhupada is clearly saying here that we already have a spiritual body in Vaikuntha. He is indicating that we have to reawaken our consciousness to that body we have forgotten...

In the lecture quoted where Srla Prabhulada is supposed to have said this, he actually says “revive your spiritual body and in that spiritual body you go back to home, back to Godhead.”

The souls had a spiritual form in the spiritual world. That form became shrunk or contracted. Therefore, it has to become revived or reanimated from the conditioned diseased state. If the spiritual body is already in its complete glorious form in Vaikuntha then it doesn’t have to become revived. In Vaikuntha all the bodies are perfect. Thus our form is not in Vaikuntha. It is here and it has to become restored by the process of Krishna-consciousness.

To consider our conditional life a dream expansion of our liberated self in the spiritual world is another wrong idea. Srla Prabhupada in the purport to SB 4.29.64 writes:

“In dreams we sometimes see things that we have never experienced in the present body. Sometimes in dreams we think that we are flying in the sky, although we have no experience of flying. This means that once in a previous life, either as a demigod or astronaut, we flew in the sky. The impression is there in the stockpile of the mind, and it suddenly expresses itself. It is like fermentation taking place in the depths of water, which sometimes manifests itself in bubbles on the water's surface. Sometimes we dream of coming to a place we have never known or experienced in this lifetime, but this is proof that in a past life we experienced this.

The impression is kept within the mind and sometimes becomes manifest either in dream or in thought. The conclusion is that the mind is the storehouse of various thoughts and experiences undergone during our past lives.”

Thus the dreams of a liberated soul are expansions of the life experiences of the mukta and of the same quality.

So-called bad dreams are lila. The mukta will have no materialistic dreams.

If he has these, he cannot remain in the spiritual world.

The occasional– naimitika- lilas like the vanquishing of demons are absent in the spiritual world, being adverse to the eternal lilas. Killing demons as found in Bhauma-Vrindavana exists in the aprakata-dhama as a mere rumor or thought for the nourishment of rasa. This takes form and reveals itself in the prakata lilas displayed in the material world as the work of destruction of demons.

But our existence as conditioned souls in this material world is not lila or transcendental activity of eternal knowledge and bliss (sat cit ananda), as these dream-theorists invent. Srila Prabhupada writes in his introduction to Bhagavad– gita as it is, that our existence here is asat, acit and nirananda.

“Our present body is not sac-cid-ananda. It is asat, not sat. It is not eternal; it is perishable. It is not cit, full of knowledge, but it is full of ignorance. We have no knowledge of the spiritual kingdom, nor do we even have perfect knowledge of this material world, where there are so many things unknown to us. The body is also nirananda; instead of being full of bliss it is full of misery.”

To conclude, if a demigod expands an amsa, that will not save all the faulty theories of subconscious fall vadis; demigods can only expand an equal or double or extension of themselves, but this is not a new soul. One of the same internal consciousness. The external form can be different. The same for the mukta.

Fallen souls don't expand fallen amsas means in the context of this subconscious self-fall-vada, that, a soul becoming envious of Krishna, cannot separate or expand an amsa who falls down and suffers the conditioning of 8.400.000 bodies or prison cells of the material world while an original envious soul remains in pure Krishna consciousness in the spiritual world.

Also fallen souls cannot expand fallen souls because the soul is not created and is indivisible. Not even the liberated soul can expand a soul. The mukta can expand only its consciousness. A fallen soul with mystic siddhis can expand a fallen amsa and this will act according to the will of the soul and be one in consciousness. A liberated soul can expand a liberated amsa but not a fallen amsa.

Gopis don't dance in Durga's rasa-lila even in dreams

In the spiritual world are only liberated spirit souls. They may manifest many different bodies simultaneously. But then there is only one spirit soul who shines the same Krishna consciousness in all these bodies like a lamp in one place shines the same light all around, pradipa-vada avesa (=as a lamp enters other places by its light, Vedanta-sutra 4.4.15).

Thus gopis and gopas dancing with Krishna in the spiritual world don't have sometimes some chaya, shadow entity, in maya, dancing, as a mirage-like form in this world, thus circling in the samsara (=circle) from birth to death to birth to death etc. Then they would have a materialistic part in themselves.

Thus there are flaws in B's article "expansion of the soul." His and G.G dasa's theory is bahu-atma-patana-eka-atma-vada -many souls fall of the one soul; the soul in Goloka has also many parts of himself in the material world, enjoying matter. Another name: ekakala-patana-apatana-vada -simultaneously falls and falls not or is 100% in Krishna consciousness and 100% maya. These theories means some kind of split personality, schizophrenia-vada; the soul is up in heaven and down in hell experiencing both simultaneously.

To assume this B claims that the soul can divide itself but Sri Baladeva's Govinda bhasya on Vedanta-sutra 4.4.5 describes that the soul is indivisible, being already atomic, the smallest and Ramanuja's Sri Bhasya states that the ordinary conditioned soul has no amsas or expansions. Here are the quotes:

"The soul can assume various bodies simultaneously and as the soul is atomic in its essential form, its becoming many can be only by assuming diverse bodies."

Sri Ramanujas Sri Bhasya 4.4.15

"Just as a lamp, although abiding in one place only, enters through the light proceeding from it into connection with many places; so the (mukta-) soul also, although limited to one place, may through its light-like consciousness enter into several bodies. As in this life the soul, although abiding in one spot of the body only, viz. the heart, pervades the whole body by means of its consciousness."

The same is in Vedanta-kausthuba, Nimbarka sampradaya's Vedanta-sutra-bhasya 4.4.15

Sutra: "The entering (into many bodies is) as in the case of a lamp, for (scripture) shows thus."

Vedanta Parijata – Nimbarka

The soul's entering into many bodies takes place through its attribute of knowledge, as of the lamp through its ray,—"for" the scriptural text: "It is capable of infinity" (Svet. 5.9) shows thus

Vedanta-kaustubha – Srinivasa

Apprehending the objection, viz. The manifoldness, mentioned in the text: "He becomes three-fold " (Chand. 7.26.2) and so on, is not possible on the part of the freed soul even though it may have a body, since it is never possible for one and the same soul, which is atomic by nature, to pervade many bodies,—the author replies:

"The entering" of the freed soul, atomic in size and abiding within one body, into many bodies,—i.e. its complete entering into those bodies as their soul with the thought: 'This is my body and that as well'—is possible through its attribute of knowledge. "As in the case of a lamp." That is, just as a lamp, though placed in one place, pervades many places through its attribute, viz. rays, so is the case here. "For thus " Scripture shows, "The individual soul is to be known as a hundredth part of the point of a hair, divided a hundred times, yet it is capable of infinity " (Svet. 5.9).

In other words B dasa is wrong in stating that the soul is simultaneously in Goloka Vrindavana and has one or many selves or souls in maya in conditioned material bodies.

The soul cannot divide itself in many parts who are all complete souls. Only Krishna can do that but even then they are all of the same consciousness. There is no schizophrenia or a split off self as materialist, in the spiritual world.

Another flaw: B dasa writes:

"The quote from the Vedanta sutra 4.4.15 on the example of the shining lamp is a basic one about how the consciousness in the body spreads to different limbs."

No sampradaya commentator of Vedanta – Madhva, Ramanuja, Baladeva Nimbarka or Srinivasa interprets like that because the individual soul pervading the body by consciousness is already thoroughly discussed in the Vedanta sutra 2.3.16-43. The topic is the nature of the expansions of the liberated soul.

Sri bhasya 4.4.15 uses this analogy of the soul in the heart pervading the body by consciousness, to explain how the mukta expands.

Another fault of B. dasa:

"Original jiva consciousness has connection with amsa expansion just like a person who has his body operated on and goes out of his body and is simultaneously in both gross and subtle body."

There is no two souls in this case because the soul cannot split (Vedanta sutra 4.4.5).

The soul remains in the heart otherwise the heart would stop pumping. The mind gets the power for these feats.

As e.g. SB 11.15.4-5 describes: "Through prakamya siddhi one experiences any enjoyable object".

Or in SB 11.15.6 the siddhi "hearing and seeing things far away."

Next mistake is on misunderstanding Srila Prabhupada's letter 31-8-71:

"...Krishna can expand so His devotee can also expand."

But His devotee does not expand conditioned souls, non-devotees.

As we have proven above, Vedanta sutra 4.4.15. Nor can jivas in lower human forms (those in passion and ignorance) and in animal or plant forms expand other "fallen jivas that misused their free will." There is no proof that this ever happened. And according to scriptures it is not possible, because they are not "His devotee who can expand." They are non-devotees.

On this he writes “Srila Prabhupada clarifies “Krishna can expand so His devotee can also expand” since His devotee refers to any jiva because Srila Prabhupada has said that “originally every jiva is a devotee of Krishna. But circumstantially being covered by the coat of maya, he is playing like a demon.”

But that is the difference; this soul is in maya and therefore cannot expand amsas anymore, unless he is an elevated yogi. Besides, the subject is if souls remain in Goloka and have amsas here. Now we discuss if an ordinary soul here can expand amsas, or if that soul is an amsa. The answer to all three proposals is: “No”

Srila Prabhupada says that the jiva is covered, he doesn't say an expansion of the jiva is covered. “Playing like a demon” doesn't mean it is a lila similar to what the mayavadis teach: ‘there is only a lila of liberated souls. No one is actually imperfect, in maya.’

Thus this is a wrong conclusion. Bhagavad-gita 16.6 also says:

“O son of Prtha, in this world there are two kinds of created beings. One is called the divine and the other is the demoniac. I have already explained to you at length the divine qualities. Now hear from Me of the demoniac.”

Thus some jivas are non-devotees actually. Acintya-bheda-abheda-tattva is Sri Krishna Caitanya Mahaprabhu's philosophy. All the souls here are actually fallen devotees. They will become devotees again. But now they are covered over. Srila Prabhupada states these eternal truths in practically every lecture, letter and purport.

As Srila Prabhupada says lecturing on SB 3.26.19:

“...again go back to home, go back to Krishna and dance with him in rasa-lila.”

We came from the rasa-lila. We left, because Srila Prabhupada says: go back to Krishna's rasa-lila. In the conditioned state down here, we are not also dancing in the rasa-lila up there.

Another fault:

“Sanjaya by the mercy of Vyasadeva was able to expand himself into two forms therefore all souls even the fallen one's in the lowest modes of nature have that ability, now, in this state of illusion.”

Our comment:

All souls have the ‘potential’ to create expansions just like Sanjaya but then they have to get kamarupa siddhi by meditation on Paramatma for 1000's of years, generally. This is for yogis of the caliber of Satya yuga: paramahansas. Or Krishna can bestow this mercy on His pure bhakti-yogi.

If B. dasa assumes that these expansions or fallen souls come from the power of a liberated counterpart other self, and has the same power, again “no”, since this is never shown. The fallen soul is always another one then a mukta. They are to be the same person as B. dasa states “the original jiva consciousness has connection with amsa expansions.”

Scriptures say that schizophrenia is not possible in the perfect spiritual world. You are to be pure 100% or you are put out of Vaikuntha for reformation, to the lunatic asylum of Durgadevi.

As Srila Prabhupada said:

“Niskincanasya bhagavad-bhajanonmukhasya. Caitanya Mahaprabhu says, niskincana. One has to be completely freedom, completely freedom about this material world. One should be

disgusted. Then there is possibility of being transferred to the spiritual world. So long one has got a pinch of desire that "If I would have become like Brahma, or like king, like Jawaharlal Nehru," then I'll have to accept a body." (Srila Prabhupada's lecture on Bhagavad-gita 2.20)

"If you want to go back to home, back to Godhead, then at the same time, if you remain attached to this material world, so-called society, friendship and love, then it is not possible. So long you will have a pinch of attraction with this material world, there is no possibility of being transferred to the spiritual world." (Lecture by Srila Prabhupada on Bhagavad-gita 1.26-27)

Even if you have a pinch of material desire you have to come back and take rebirth.

As Srila Prabhupada lectures on Bg. 17.1: "if you don't stick to the spiritual principles even if you are in Vaikuntha you will fall down...in Vaikuntha no contaminated soul can stay."

It is not that you become envious or offensive and then you don't really go but only a part or division of you. You want Krishna's position as enjoyer you have to go out.

If he proposes that the souls are totally separate then how they are this soul's expansions. Then if the pastimes in the material world get wound up and the expansions come back to which original they come in.

So, yes "by the mercy of Krishna, ultimately He allows His devotees, who ultimately all jivas are, to expand in the universes."

Ultimately – this word B dasa forgets. Ultimately the jivas can/may expand if they by meditation for 100.000 years acquire this ability. Or Krishna's ability given to a pure devotee.

– Then another mistake: "The full aspect of the soul is in Vaikuntha or Goloka."

This is not so. The soul and its expansions are all the same full – Vedanta sutra 4.4.15.

– Another: "The amsa has the same attributes as the original but the expanded amsa has his divine qualities covered."

There is only one soul and one consciousness in a soul in the liberated state. This is in Ramanuja's Sribhasya on Vedanta sutra 4.4.11:

"As a self, which is atomic, and thus incapable of being cut or divided, cannot possibly have many forms, it is made out that his becoming threefold, fivefold, sevenfold etc. is due to the body or bodily expansions."

And then in Vedanta sutra 4.4.14 he makes the purvapaksa object: "It has been stated above that the individual self is of the size of an atom. How as regarding the many bodies, there can be the idea of being of one's own on the part of a single thing (i.e. self) which is an atom.

To this objection the srutakara (Vyasadeva the writer) replies thus

"The entering (into many bodies is) as in the case of a lamp, for (scripture) shows thus."

Then Sri Ramanuja's Sri Bhasya 4.4.15:

"Just as a lamp, although abiding in one place only, enters through the light proceeding from it into connexion with many places; so the soul also, although limited to one place, may through its light-like consciousness enter into several bodies. As in this life the soul, although

abiding in one spot of the body only, viz. the heart, pervades the whole body by means of its consciousness.”

I.o.w. there are not many souls as B dasa proposes. There is one soul and one consciousness in all the different bodies or bodily expansions or forms.

- Next flaw: “The spiritual body is contracted/shrunk in Vaikuntha if the jiva comes here.”

The spiritual body of the jiva comes here in a contracted form. This is in Vedanta sutra 4.4.1-3 commentaries.

"[Is it understood by this statement of the Upaniñads that (at the time of liberation) the soul comes into touch] with a form that is sādhyā [to be gained, produced, etc.], or rather is there the appearance of a form that is of the soul's own nature? This is the doubt.”

"It is said here that although the precise form of the soul's constitutional form was in fact previously known and existed in perfection, still [at the time of liberation] there is the appearance of that constitutional form, with unlimited knowledge, freed from the bondage of karma.”

"And so it is logical to say that upon the destruction of bondage in the form of karma, [the soul] having attained to the highest light, there is the appearance in expanded form of the qualities of knowledge, bliss, etc., which due to karma had been shrunk within the soul.”

- Another: “You have to be revived to reconnect to the spiritual body which is also you.”

Then the ‘material’ expansion is annihilated. We are a soul now here we experience. That one becomes revived. Then we go out or are put out, extinguished? One soul dies? Or if they merge then there is two spiritual atoms or souls, at one place. Which one is you?

Then Srila Prabhupada has told G.G dasa (is this recorded? G.G dasa may have misconstrued as he has done many times, see our replies on his dream-fall-vada articles) “your bodily form is in Vaikuntha.”

Our spiritual body ‘was’ in Vaikuntha, now it is here, in seed form, not in its full form, and concealed, imprisoned in a material body. When we become liberated the spiritual body will again go back to Vaikuntha.

Our spiritual form is now covered over by the material body.

When we are Krishna conscious this material body becomes spiritualized and is no longer material. The spirit soul within becomes blossomed again into its original spiritual form of the spiritual world.

Srila Prabhupada explains this in a lecture on SB 6.1.1, 21-5-'75, Melbourne.

Madhudvisha: He is asking if they were actually covered in the spiritual world as well.

Prabhupada: Not in the spiritual world. There that is voluntary. Some devotee wants to serve Krishna as flower; they become flower there. If I want that "As a flower I shall lie down at the lotus feet of Krishna," he becomes flower, voluntarily. And he can change his..., from flower to human body. That is spiritual life. There is no restriction. If some devotee wants to serve Krishna as cow, he serves Krishna as cow, as calf, as flower, as plant, as water, as ground, field, or as father, as mother, as friend, as beloved, anything. Ye yatha mam prapadyante tams tathaiva bhajamy aham [Bg. 4.11]. That is Krishna's all-powerfulness, spiritual life.

Srila Prabhupada doesn't speak of two persons one in the material world and one in the spiritual world, who are the same, but of a different mind.

Srila Prabhupada states split person in a letter (2-27-1972).

“Your third question, what is the explanation of split-personality, actually, there are not two personalities, there is only change of mind. Therefore, the mind has to be fixed up in Krishna and then there is no more extreme change in the mind from one personality to another. There is always only one personality, it is just that if the mind is very disturbed, it may change in extreme way; if such person is devotee; best remedy is to sit down very tightly and chant Hare Krishna very loudly and hear for a long time until he feels himself one-minded and fixed on Krishna's Lotus Feet.”

So, there is only one soul.

The same person or soul cannot be simultaneously in Krishna consciousness in the spiritual world and in Maya, not Krishna conscious, elsewhere.

Even if one claims “subconsciously” one is in maya, then this is not a liberated soul, who is to be 100% pure.

Nor are we conditioned souls, here, now, “subconscious.” We are conscious, with a center and substrate of consciousness an “I” in the physical heart here now. We have many subconscious activities going on, but that is also now, here, and connected to the soul.

– Next: “The original consciousness is Krishna consciousness; there is no difference between the soul and the consciousness like in the material world.”

Therefore there cannot be a part of the consciousness in maya and an original in Krishna consciousness. They are the same as the soul, who is pure. B dasa contradicts himself here.

He says that there is a difference between soul and consciousness in the material world. Now he says there is also a soul in the material world. And there is also one in Goloka. Two souls. One is in Krishna consciousness and the other who is the same with a different consciousness?!

- B dasa quotes a letter of Srila Prabhupada 12-12-68:

“Just like Krishna is always in the spiritual world, so similarly He is always in the material world and His Pastimes are going on there also. In the material world, Krishna also has eternal associates, such as Arjuna and Kunti Devi. There is a difference between the body and soul of Arjuna and Kunti Devi. But although Arjuna is with Krishna in innumerable different material universes at one time, still there is only one spirit soul who is Arjuna. This spirit soul expands into many different bodies and thus you can understand that there are also incarnations of devotees as well as incarnations of Krishna. This is the power of the spirit soul, that it is unlimited.”

B dasa changed Srila Prabhupada's words;

It is not “The spirit soul expands” but “This soul (of Arjuna, the liberated soul) expands”

“This is the power of the spirit soul” means in the context of this letter the power of the liberated spirit soul, not of the conditioned soul. And the expansions are of the same consciousness (Vedanta Sutra 4.4.15)

Conditioned souls don't expand amsas, it is a siddhi for advanced yogis (SB 11.15.6)

Then Srila Prabhupada confirms that this is only for liberated souls saying “such conceptions can’t be understood by conditioned souls.” They cannot understand it, what to speak of executing it (expanding amsas). If Srila Prabhupada would mean all souls, he would or should have said “This is the power of all conditioned spirit souls also at the time they are conditioned. Any human, animal, plant on this planet can do it,” because he had changed the topic. The topic was the liberated soul. He continued speaking on that and says this is the power of the spirit soul, the same spirit soul who he speaks of in the sentence before, “this spirit soul (of Arjuna) expands into many bodies.”

He says never anywhere: conditioned souls have unlimited power. He always says that the conditioned soul is limited in power, if he becomes liberated he gets that power.

The topic to the answer on the second question is Arjuna and Kuntidevi, liberated souls, eternal associates. “This” kind of souls expand into many bodies. “This is the power of the spirit soul” is the soul who is liberated.

Because that is what the question and the answer is about.

The first question and answer of this letter was also about the liberated soul.

Here is the rest of the letter.

My Dear Saradia,

Please accept my blessings. I am in due receipt of your recent letter and I have noted the contents with pleasure. Your kind thoughts which you expressed are very nice and encouraging to me. Also you have asked some intelligent questions and I am answering them here.

You have asked how Krishna is with the spirit soul in the spiritual world and the answer is that Krishna is in the heart of the spirit soul, or spiritual body, So Krishna is never apart from us. Either He remains in the heart of the material body, or He remains in the heart of the spiritual body. This is Krishna's Causeless Mercy to all of His beloved children, or living entities.

To answer your second question, you should know that Arjuna and Kunti Devi are not in Krishna Loka. They are eternally associated with Krishna only in the material world. Just like Krishna is always in the spiritual world, so similarly He is always in the material world and His Pastimes are going on there also. In the material world, Krishna also has eternal associates, such as Arjuna and Kunti Devi. There is a difference between the body and soul of Arjuna and Kunti Devi. But although Arjuna is with Krishna in innumerable different material universes at one time, still there is only one spirit soul who is Arjuna. This spirit soul expands into many different bodies and thus you can understand that there are also incarnations of devotees as well as incarnations of Krishna. This is the power of the spirit soul, that it is unlimited. Such conception cannot be understood while one is still in the conditioned state.

Regarding your third question, both incidents are correct. I hope these shall answer your questions. Please convey my blessings to Satsvarupa, Jadurani, Devananda, Rukmini and all others. Hope you are all well.

Your ever well-wisher, A.C. Bhaktivedanta Swami

- Then B dasa says: “Arjuna is showing the soul’s capability in this world...Arjuna is expanding while in this material world.”

What Arjuna is showing is what the liberated soul – as Arjuna is – can do.

- Another fault: “A nitya mukta can become a nitya baddha therefore a nitya mukta is simultaneously a nitya baddha.”

That is not the same. Because a nitya mukta soul can fall down to become a nitya baddha soul that doesn't mean that a nitya mukta soul has an expansion as a nitya baddha.

Nitya mukta becoming a nitya baddha means the soul in the spiritual world leaves from there and goes to the material world. This is not the same as that the soul splits and one soul or entity of the same (double) soul stays in the spiritual world and one soul of that soul goes to the material world. And that one soul present in two places is only aware of his presence in two places in his soul in the spiritual world. One soul knows he is in the spiritual world and one soul knows he is in the material world but the one in the material world doesn't know that he is also in the spiritual world, although he is the same soul.

This is not an esoteric subject as B dasa names it. It is a nonexisting subject. How am I the same soul as the one in the spiritual world, if I don't know and experience him although it is me. I am a soul, an “I”, the substratum or center of consciousness here and now. That I experience. I am not a reflection, shadow or sub-I.

And the sub-I here, should have the same experience of and as my “I” up there.

If Krishna expands, the expansions may not know each other due to yoga-maya. That is lila and under the control of the Supreme controller. But our souls here are not in lila or pastimes of pleasure. We are actually suffering, no ananda, full of ignorance, no cit and temporary, no sat.

- Then B says: Plenary portion of the demigod is acting in an independent way, separate in thinking from the demigod in heaven.

Vedanta sutra 4.4.15 establishes that they are of the same soul and consciousness. The activities may be different but are of the same one person, with one mind. No schizophrenia even in the bhoga-lokas.

Just as the hand, feet etc. the karmendriyas of a person here act differently, but all act on the basis of the same consciousness. Not that the plenary expansion is e.g. in animal consciousness tada-rajas-tamo-bhava, kama-lobha-krodha-moha-matsarya-mada.

Demigods may display kamarupa siddhi but the ant or mosquito in your room cannot do that.

Now, Srila Prabhupada's lecture on SB 2.9.1.

Srila Visvanatha Thakura comments on this verse SB 2.9.1:

“Verse 2.8.7 asked whether the jiva's relation to the body is with or without cause. This verse answers. A relationship of the jiva with the body and senses (artha) does not actually occur (through the beginningless avidya-sakti (maya) of the Lord (atma)), just as there is no relation of the dreamer with his dream body (except through ignorance), because the jiva is superior (parasya) to the body, being composed of knowledge (anubhavatmanah). The relationship occurs by the inconceivable energy of the Lord which is expert at doing the impossible.”

In other words, as a man has connection with the dream objects, and both are at the same place, so the soul, transcending all material coverings, is in this world, has a connection with the phenomena of this world, but through the Lord's maya. Thus, no connection, in one sense, asango'hy ayam purusa, but the connection takes place, but it is asat, temporary.

In Srila Prabhupada's lecture he also says "many people inquire how the living entity who was with Krishna became fallen down in contact with this material qualities."

So the jiva "was" with Krishna not that he is still with Krishna and is also fallen away. The jiva became fallen down. The soul is not any more in Goloka.

Then, Sila Prabhupada says "It is simply the influence of the material energy actually he is not fallen." This means asango'hy ayam purusa.

Srila Prabhupada uses this sloka 17 times according to the Vedabase. It means the soul is like a diamond in the mud, inherently or intrinsically not muddied. It is covered over.

Govinda bhasya of Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana quotes in 2.3.26 Saunaka rsi from the Puranas.

yatha na kriyate jyotsna mala-praksalanan
maneh dosa-prahanan na jnanam atmanah kriyate tatha

"As by washing away the dirt that covered a jewel, the jewel's splendor is not created but merely uncovered, so by removing the dirt of materialism that covered the soul, the soul's splendor is not created, but merely uncovered.

yathodapana-khananat kriyate na jalantaram
sad eva niyate vyaktim asatah sambhavah kutah

"As by digging a well, water is brought forth but not created, so by spiritual activities the nature of the soul is brought forth but not created. How would it be possible to create the soul and the soul's qualities from nothing?

tatha heya-guna-dhvamsad avarodhadayo
gunah prakacyante na janyante nitya evatmano hi te

"When material faults are destroyed, the soul's qualities become revealed. The soul's qualities are eternal. They are never created."

In other words the soul is covered over. There is no material energy in the spiritual world, so the soul who fell and is covered, is here in the material world. Then Srila Prabhupada speaks how the moon covered with scattered clouds seems to move. Srila Prabhupada doesn't specify (anywhere) that he means the double or more soul construction. No sastra or mukta teaches: "you are not actually fallen. You are still in the rasa-lila in Krishna-loka. But also in all these human animal and plant species. Please descend and free yourself. Actually, I will give you also a list of my amsas who got fallen in different lower modes of nature species. Please expand some amsas there for them also. Please relief me of some duties to my many selves who are bewildered and ignorant and distribute books and preach to my many selves or myself.

What you say?

You don't have the kamarupa siddhi yet because you are only on the bhakta program? Then tell yourself in Goloka to expand. Why tell him, it is you. What you say: "You don't know yourself there and don't know how to reach yourself." "You are in maya." (End of the story.)

This is some kind of schizophrenia, or a multisyncretic personality disorder impossible in a liberated jiva.

Then Srila Prabhupada says: "Because he is a spiritual spark of the supreme it has not fallen. But he is thinking 'I am fallen, I am material, I am this body.'" This means that the body has no connection with the soul, just as the moon is far away from the cloud.

Note that the soul is here and thinking I am this body. But constitutionally he has nothing to do with matter. Srila Prabhupada doesn't say he is up, not fallen and down fallen. He says that the soul is fallen here but actually not part of the material world, not in the fallen world. "In this world but not of this world."

Srila Prabhupada doesn't specify that there is a moon above the clouds and another moon down, or one moon above the clouds and another far above the clouds.

He says that by the maneuvering of the illusory energy we, souls, think we are of this material world. This is because of the modes of nature. But we are from beyond matter. These modes don't work on the soul in Goloka.

Srila Prabhupada next compares the relationship of the soul with the material world to a dreamer and his dream of e.g. a tiger attacking.

Again he doesn't say there is a soul in the spiritual world and a soul in the material world. He could have easily put it in. "There are two you's or souls. One is in maya and the other is awake, always in the spiritual world, you are one." Srila Prabhupada is always very precise, clear and frank. And he will repeat it from all angles, many many many times.

- Then he says: "Actually the dreamer has no contact with the tiger."

In one sense, but there is contact, also. The (original) soul is in the dream. So the soul is in matter really, but temporarily.

A person in a dream, is fearful of a tiger in the dream, but another man who is awake by his side sees no tiger there. The tiger is a myth for both of them namely the person dreaming and the person awake, because actually there is no tiger: but the man forgetful of his awakened life is fearful, whereas the man who has not forgotten his position is not at all fearful of the so-called tiger. (Bg. 2.20 p)

When you sleep at night, then you dream, means subtle body. So these activities of this gross body stop. You again work in the subtle body. You dream that you have gone to somewhere or in the forest or somewhere, somewhere, somewhere. But you forget that "My real body is lying in this bed." You do not remember. This is practical. So I change this, myself. I am soul. I change from this gross body lying on bed in a very nice apartment, skyscraper building, but I have gone to the forest, and I am affronting a big tiger and I'm crying. In this bed I am crying. The friends say, "Why you are crying?" "Tiger, tiger, tiger." Where is tiger? This is called subtle body. So you are changing daily at night from this gross body to the subtle body. And again the dream is over, from the subtle body, again to the gross body. Every one of us has got this experience. (Bg. Lecture 3.27 / 7.27.1974)

I am soul, I change at night, this myself, from this gross body to the subtle body. There is no two souls. The one soul changes its consciousness or vision from the gross to the subtle body so we the soul have changed our position from the spiritual to the material world.

In the same lecture he states: "So we have got almighty father and leaving His place, I have come to this material world."

Just before this analogy of the nightmare, Srila Prabhupada says: "By forgetting God you are in this material world and in this material world you are changing from one body to another.

That you can experience practically daily. When you sleep at night you dream means subtle body...changed from the gross body...then immediately after this analogy he says "Therefore I am the enjoyer. I am changing simply body...why you are placed here. Because I wanted to enjoy life like that...forgetting our father, God we are criminal within this material world. Therefore our only business is to get out of this prison house and go back to home, back to Godhead...liberated from changing one body to another...go back to your father...if you persist "I must go and enjoy independently," God says "All right you go" and you come and enjoy beginning from Lord Brahma down to the worm in the stool." Srila Prabhupada doesn't say something like "but actually one part of you stays although you want to go, you don't go, only a part of you. Although you wanted to go to enjoy, You are not allowed but must stay to serve what you don't want."

In the beginning of the lecture Srila Prabhupada says: "we don't belong to the material world just like a person in the prison house is a citizen but when he goes to the prison house he gets a different dress."

Again, we are criminals. How we can still stay in the spiritual world, even partially.

So, to summarize, he is saying, (in this SB 2.9.1 lecture) we are spirit soul, we have to wake up now to our real identity. Stop identifying with all the material temporary illusions. You are a spirit soul. You can ascend to a spiritual life right now. You are not fallen; you are not part of the material energy. Chant Hare Krishna and keep chanting and you'll never dream off anymore.

Then Srila Prabhupada says "We are not fallen but Krishna has given us a situation. Because we wanted to imitate Krishna." We are not fallen because we are spiritual souls. We are not material fallen energy. We are here only a split second of eternity. So we have left Him and became covered over. He doesn't say that "you are still in Goloka." He stresses or inspires to wake up to your real nature. You are spirit soul, right now you can start Krishna consciousness again.

He continues: "Because actually we are not fallen at any moment we can revive our Krishna consciousness." If we were not actually fallen why should we revive our Krishna consciousness?

He doesn't say: "join yourself who is already liberated. You fallen one, join yourself who is already in Krishna loka." Srila Prabhupada confirms this: "We can break this material connection at any moment." I.o.w. we are connected to maya.

Then the purport to SB 2.9.1 is read: "The child cries to have the moon and the mother gives a mirror so the child has a shadow or reflection of the moon."

There are no two moons and similarly there is only one soul. Nor are we shadows or reflections literary; we experience we are soul here, now.

This is an analogy which is not explained as "you are free. And half of yourself is bound. Please save half of yourself. Descend and preach to yourself. You don't know it is also you, although it is you and you are one."

Next we read in the purport:

"The living entity's first sinful will is to become the Lord. The consequent will of the Lord is that the living entity forgets his actual life and thus dreams of the land of Utopia where he becomes one like the Lord."

It is not said here: "There was only a part of you sinful. That Krishna kicked out of the spiritual world. Your expansion forgot his actual life. But you are ok. Only your other self or

you parted. But because you are one, all is ok. Still although the expansion is the same soul but he is in the land of utopia. Preach to him and became one again.”

Then Srila Prabhupada says: “the crying child of the Lord is given over to the shadow of the material world.” The soul is given/sent to the material world. Not that the soul is also kept in Goloka. Because the soul desired to go, why he should be still in some form in Krishna-loka, against his first sinful will. “The soul, thus dreams of the land of Utopia where he may become one like the Lord.”

The soul wishes to go to the land where he can try to become God. He will never be enjoyer and controller.

He explains these points again in the questions and answers after the lecture.

He says: “you are fallen means you have some certain desires except service of Krishna...if you keep yourself tightly in Krishna’s service there is no question of falling down or maya.”

So the soul is actually here and fallen. But constitutionally not fallen. He says that you have to gradually rise to the non-fallen platform, not artificially. “Just like when you are feverish, actually you are healthy, but it has come.”

This is clear. The soul is not fallen because he is not part of the matter surrounding him. “That is external.”

He says then. “The feverish condition will not stay. You will come to the healthy stage.”

He is clearly saying: you are completely in the material world as when you get sick; the disease is covering you, who are here and sick. There is not a healthy you in another dimension or world. Similarly there is no non-fallen you in the spiritual world.

The analogy is explained in the same purport “the crying child of the Lord is given over to the reflection or shadow the material world, to lord it over as karmi...”

And “the dream is that the conditioned soul thinks of his material body as I and that everything in connection with the material body is mine, or falsely thinks that he is the Lord.”

Nothing is esoteric. Everything is defined clearly. Nothing is left to the imagination. The conditioned soul thinks of the material body as ‘I’, and thinks ‘mine’ of everything in relation with the body. Not that the soul is in Goloka and is dreaming this. The soul is given over to the reflection, the material world. He is put out, he is not anymore in Goloka because of his sinful will to become the Lord. How a sinful soul can be in Goloka.

One cannot argue that the soul is in Goloka and the sinful consciousness is in the material world.

Because Ramanuja’s Sri Bhasya 1.1.1 states:

“Consciousness is the attribute of a permanent conscious self...the character of consciousness is that it renders things capable of becoming objects to its own substrate...consciousness is an attribute belonging to a conscious self...that there exists a consciousness devoid of substrate we have already refuted on the ground that of a thing of this kind we have absolutely no knowledge.”

There cannot be a split in soul and consciousness. If the consciousness is sinful it is the soul who is sinful. A sinful soul cannot be in Goloka. The soul is thus “given over to the reflection, the material world.”

If one argues: “the soul splits and one, the soul in the material world, is sinful”, then sin still is part of that one double soul. The soul in Goloka is connected to sin, but no impurities are possible in Goloka; he will be put out.

If we look B dasa in the eyes, which are the mirrors of the soul, we should see the soul in Goloka also, not only the soul here, in the mahat-tattva. And he should be aware of both.

What we actually see, is you, spirit soul, Hari bolo, with us, under us. Here in the mahat-tattva.

All the senses lead to the center of consciousness. So we see into the soul, the inner chambers of the self, all the way down. The eyes are the gateways.

But if the soul in Goloka is also seen, do we see through a long tube channel or wire also into that soul? Or is it wireless?

We should see by looking into his eyes, all the way into his nitya svarupa soul in Goloka because the soul in Goloka and the soul in mahat-tattva are one and the same and connected. But this is not so, and he knows, that he is here in the material world, fantasizing about being deeply within dancing in Goloka.

**O, Hare, O, Krishna, kindly accept me again.
I am fallen in this material world.**

Introduction

It is said that the souls in the spiritual world are nitya-siddha, eternally liberated souls, and no one falls from the spiritual world. The souls in the material world are nitya-baddha, eternally conditioned – thus they can never become liberated – and that their conditioned state is anadi, or without any beginning; But it is also said that we conditioned souls have fallen from our original position we can regain our original Krishna consciousness and in so doing go back to Godhead. How to harmonize this.

Muktas become baddha, again become mukta

This word 'nitya-siddha we read in SB 3.3.26 purport
“The nitya siddha devotees never fall down to the region of the material atmosphere.”
But then in SB 3.2.2 we read “Human life is meant for reviving one’s eternal relation with the Lord,.. awakening this dormant instinct of the living entity.....revive one’s sense of God consciousness.....”

Revive means, according to the Oxford dictionary, ‘it was there and it has to come or brought to health, strength or consciousness, to be recovered, come or brought back into use, activity, fashion. Stage again a play etc. that has not been performed for some time.’

And in SB 3.2.11 purport “If one takes a fish from the water and puts it on the land, it cannot be made happy by any amount of offered pleasure. The spirit soul can be happy only in the association of the supreme living being, the Personality of Godhead.....in the innumerable Vaikuntha planets in the brahma-jyoti sphere of the spiritual world, and in that transcendental world there is an unlimited arrangement for the unlimited pleasure of the living entities..... The Lord Himself comes to display His transcendental pastimes, typically represented at Vrindavana, Mathura and Dvaraka. The Lord appears just to attract the conditioned souls back to Godhead, back home to the eternal world.”

The soul is as the fish out of the water, out of the Vaikuntha planets and has to go back to that home, where he came from. Krishna comes with His home, Vrindavana, to this world, to attract us back to His home. And later in the purport, he says: “.....go back with Him to His kingdom.....go back home, back to Godhead.”

Then SB 3.2.12 purport “In the Vaikunthalokas the Lord is merciful toward the liberated or nitya-mukta living entities, but in His pastimes in the mortal world He is merciful even to the fallen souls who are nitya-baddha, or conditioned forever.” The nitya siddhas are home in Vrindavana or the Vaikuntha planets, but can fall. As nitya baddhas are not forever fallen and will rise back to the spiritual planets, as the fish out of the water is to go back to the water. Nitya-baddha is not so literally ”nitya” or eternally bound. So, nitya-siddha can also be ending or changing.

As we read in the SB 3.2.30 “Love of Godhead is dormant in every living entity, and the entire process of devotional service unto the Lord is meant for awakening this dormant, eternal love of Godhead.....go back to the Goloka Vrindavana planet in the spiritual sky.....or the Vaikuntha planets.”

This means, 'Get back, get back, get back, to where you once belonged', the Goloka Vrindavana planet or Vaikuntha planets. We were nitya-muktas there, became nitya-baddhas and can become nitya-muktas again.

And in SB 3.2.27 "to go back home, back to Godhead."

SB 3.3.18 purport, Srila Prabhupada states ".....the entire manifested cosmic creation, which presents a chance for the conditioned souls to revive their eternal relationship with the Lord and thus go back to Godhead, back home."

SB 3.4.25 purport we find again this word revive ".....revival of his self-knowledge is essential."

Therefore, the nitya siddha jivas of 3.3.26 became conditioned and can revive their nitya-siddha-deha, the nitya-svarupa.

SB 3.5.1 purport "The Lord is ever infallible, whereas the living entities are prone to fall under the illusory energy." We, souls, are fallen from home, Krishna's planets, because of our "fallible nature."

But we are also called infallible, "We want to close these nonsense places of sinful life: brothels, illegitimate sense gratification, sex relationship, prostitution. If we are embarrassed with this sinful life, there is no possibility of becoming again acyuta.. So to become Krishna conscious means acyuta-gotra. .. So we have to become acyuta-gotra, again belonging to the family of Krishna. Now we are fallen. Therefore we have forgotten that we belong to the family of Krishna...we revive our Krishna consciousness, that "I belong to the Krishna's family..." (Bhagavad-gita 1.21-22, London, July 18, 1973)

Comment: Again figurative language. The soul is called acyuta, and also vicyuta or cyuta

SB 3.5.3 in the purport, we read "...bringing souls back to Godhead, back to home."

SB 3.5.3 ".....the ultimate destination of going back home, back to Godhead."

SB 3.5.10 ".....reviving their God consciousness, now forgotten in the conditional life of material existence.....revive the people's sense of God consciousness."

According to Oxford dictionary to forget means 'fail to remember or recall, lose the memory of, neglect stop thinking about, put out of one's mind.'

SB 3.5.24 ".....dormant in forgetfulness.....go back to home back to Godhead.....enliven the sleeping conditioned souls.....to take part in His eternal rasa-lila"

Back to the rasa-lila. We came from the rasa-lila, and should go back to the rasa-lila.

SB 3.5.26 "The mistaken living being, out of forgetfulness of this original condition of life.....remind one.....situated in the same spiritual life as the Lord."

SB 3.5.29 purport "A pure living entity in his original spiritual existence.....called nitya muktas.....The material creation is meant for rebellious souls who are not prepared to accept subordination under the Supreme Lord."

The nitya-muktas, originally in the Vaikuntha planets or in the rasa-lila, have become rebellious.

Nitya-baddha jivas also will have an end to their conditioned state; thus it is not nitya-baddha, eternally conditioned. When the soul gets materially exhausted and has experienced all of matter (which is a limited area) he naturally inquires "athato brahma jijnasa." (Srila Prabhupada conversations 12-12-1970) (SB 10.51.53).

Similarly, nitya-muktas are sometimes not fixed forever in mukti.

SB 3.5.31 purport "forgets his constitutional position as an eternally subordinate part and parcel of the Supreme Personality of Godhead and wants to be happy independently,

SB 3.5.42 ".....go back home, back to Godhead."

SB 3.5.44 ".....go back to Godhead."

SB 3.5.51 “the vishnu-tattvas, the jiva-tattvas and the sakti-tattvas (the Personalities of Godhead, the living entities and the different potential energies)—are different offshoots from the same one Supreme Lord...Some of the jivas, however, wanted to lord it over material nature in imitation of the lordship of the Personality of Godhead...due to misuse of this independence...the nitya-baddhas, the conditioned living entities, a chance to improve, and those who take advantage of such transcendental knowledge gradually regain their lost consciousness of rendering transcendental loving service to the Lord.”

The nitya-baddha was a nitya-siddha who now regains his love for the Lord, and becomes nitya-siddha once again.

Srila Prabhupada states the same in other places

“We are nitya-baddha-ever conditioned, eternally conditioned... Then we, again, become nitya-mukta. We revive our original condition of life.” (Bhag. lecture, Mayapur, June 20, 1973)

“When he comes to his senses, jnanavan (Bg 7.19), that “I am falsely trying to lord it over. Rather, I am becoming implicated with material energy,” when he comes to that, then he surrenders. Then again his liberated life begins. (Columbus, Ohio, on May 14, 1969)

“...there are millions and millions of liberated souls who are engaged in Krishna. They never misuse their independence. And we small quantity, we misused our independence. We wanted to enjoy separately. Therefore we are conditioned...liberated souls. They are never conditioned. They never become conditioned. Yes?

Devotee: You mean they never were conditioned at any time or...

Prabhupada: Eh?

Devotee: You said there were millions of souls...

Prabhupada: Yes. They were never conditioned. They were never conditioned, never conditioned. They are called nitya-mukta, eternally liberated. We are only simple few, this material world. Just like I have several times told you that the prison house. The population of prison house is nothing in comparison to the whole population. ..

Bhaktijana: How could we make a poor choice if we were part and parcel of Krishna? How could we have chosen the material world?

Prabhupada: Oh, because you have got independence. Don't you see so many students come. They go away again. Yesterday Kirtanananda went to call Ranchora. He said, “Oh, I have forgotten this!” So you can forget. There is another student. He was also our student, Wally. “Oh, you can go immediately!” .. “Oh, I don't care for this Krishna consciousness Society. Who calls you? You can go.” That independence is there. We can misuse.

Bhaktijana: But Krishna will always be there if we want to go back?

Prabhupada: Eh? Krishna is always prepared to accept you. He's always prepared. But because He has given us independence, we misuse it and we fall under the clutches of maya. That is our misfortune. We create this misfortune, and we can create our good fortune. “Man is the architect of his own fortune.” So if you become Krishna conscious, it is to your good fortune. If you become maya conscious, it is to your bad fortune. You are the creator.

Bhaktijana: When the souls that were never conditioned at all..., do they also have the independence?

Prabhupada: Yes, but they have not misused. They know that “I am meant for Krishna's service,” and they are happy in Krishna's service.

Bhaktijana: Could they ever misuse it?

Prabhupada: Yes, they can misuse it also. That power is there. (Lecture, CC Adi 7.108, February 18, 1967)

Our comment: He says many times that those in Vaikuntha never fall, but then a little later he says they can fall, and these few, rare exceptions are the one's here. Never, with a footnote. 'No one' is not a categorical absolute.

Non-literal

In our western languages we also use the terms forever, always, eternal, never also in a figurative, non-literal sense.

In the GBC book 'Our original position' there is a list that in scripture the words sat, anadir, ananta, nitya, sasvata can also be non-literal.

"When the sun-god and moon-god exposed the plot of wicked Rahu to steal the celestial nectar, a lasting (sasvata) enmity was sealed among them, which endures to the present day." (Mbh. 1.17.8)

"The five sons of King Vasu each became kings in their own right, all five establishing permanent (sasvata) dynasties bearing their names." (Mbh. 1.57.30)

"Defeated by his old friend Drona, King Drupada diplomatically solicits from him his 'constant (sasvata) favor' (Mbh. 1.128.13)

"The brahmana host of the Pandavas at Ekacakra condemns the incompetent king of the region who cannot provide the people with sasvata safety from harm." (Mbh. 1.148.9)

Jaratkaru assures his forefathers that he will marry and beget a son who will preserve the family line and keep the forefathers in heaven:

"Surely for your deliverance offspring will arise in that [marriage]. May my forefathers enjoy, having reached the permanent status (sasvata-sthanam)!" (Mbh. 1.13.28)

When King Indra of heaven convinces the earthly King Vasu to give up the attempt to take Indra's position, Indra promises that by sticking to his earthly duties, Vasu will eventually attain to the sasvata worlds:

"Ever protect the dharma that will take you to higher worlds, engaged and with attention, for being so engaged in dharma you shall then attain the pious, everlasting worlds (sasvatan lokan)." (Mbh. 1.57.6)

The sage Mandapala attempts to enter heaven on the strength of his pious credits, but he is turned back by the gatekeepers with these words:

"These very worlds are concealed from you because of [your lack of] progeny. Beget progeny and then you shall enjoy these everlasting (sasvatan lokan) worlds." (Mbh. 1.220.13)

After begetting good sons, the same Mandapala then offered this prayer to the fire-god, Agni, when the blazing inferno of Khandava threatened to consume his young sons:

"Offering obeisances unto you, the sages go with their wives and sons to the everlasting destination (sasvatim gatim), won by their own work." (Mbh. 1.220.25)

"After having ruled the citizens according to dharma for endless years (sasvatih samah), King Yayati, son of Nahusha, accepted a very ghastly old age that ruined his beauty." (Mbh. 1.70.33)

The Rakshasi Hidimba refused her hungry brother's order to kill the Pandavas, reasoning that:

"If they are killed (and eaten), there will be but a moment's satisfaction for my brother and me. But by not killing them (and thus marrying Bhishma), I will enjoy for endless years (sasvatih samah)." (Mbh. 1.139.16)

When the Pandavas are defeated at dice, the wicked Duhsasana declares that Pritha's sons have now been driven to hell for a long, virtually unlimited time, and that they are bereft of their happiness and kingdom, and ruined for endless years (sasvatih samah). (Mbh. 2.68.5)

“Having achieved the worlds of the pious doers, and having dwelt there for endless years (sasvatih samah), a fallen yogi takes birth in the home of pure and opulent persons.” (Bg. 6.41)

“One should eat very frugally and should always (sasvat) remain secluded so that he can achieve the highest perfection of life.” (Bhag. 3.28.3)

“O Lord, with a corpseslike body that is always (sasvat) fearful, we bear the burden of the dreamlike happiness of kings.” (Bhag. 10.70.28)

“O almighty Lord, we shall no longer desire a mirage-like kingdom that is to be attentively served by a material body that is always (sasvat) declining, and is the source of sufferings.” (Bhag. 10.73.14)

“The Pandavas have been driven into hell for an endlessly long time-dirgha-kalam anantakam. They have been deprived of their happiness and their kingdom. They are lost forevermore.” (Mbh. 2.68.5)

“As a friend of Krishna, I alone with my chariot, crossed over the ocean of the Kuru army, an invincible ocean with no end [of the distance] to its far shore (ananta-param).” (Bhag. 1.15.14)

(Bhag. 5.5.17), Lord Rishabhadeva warns His sons that a blind materialist does not see his own unlimited (or unending) misery (ananta-duhkham).

Sukadeva Gosvami announces the benefits of the pumsavana vow, which is said to cause “unlimited satisfaction (ananta-triptih) for the forefathers and demigods” (Bhag. 6.19.27).

“Formerly, O King, that very Supreme Lord expanded the reputation of Rudra, after that god’s fame had been struck down by Maya Danava, who possessed unlimited (ananta) mystic power.” (Bhag. 7.10.51)

-In Srimad-Bhagavatam 11.10.37, Uddhava says to Lord Krishna:

“The same, single entity is said to be eternally liberated and eternally conditioned. That is my confusion.” One answer is that ‘eternal’ is figurative; the nitya-mukta can become bound, and the nitya-baddha can become liberated.

– anadih—the firstborn, Lord Brahma

“After being born, Daksha, by the superexcellence of his bodily luster, covered all others’ bodily opulence. Because he was very expert in performing fruitive activity, he was called by the name Daksha, meaning “the very expert.” Lord Brahma therefore engaged Daksha in the work of generating living entities and maintaining them. In due course of time, Daksha also engaged other Prajapatis [progenitors] in the process of generation and maintenance.” (SB 4.30.51)

Lord Brahma is anadi, “the beginningless one.”

-the demigods are amara, immortal.

No one

On "no one falls": The spiritual world is unlimited and the material world is a limited area (see Srila Rupa Gosvami’s Laghu-bhagavatamrta 5.286). Millions, trillions, etc., of souls in the material world means "no one" compared to the *unlimited* souls in the spiritual world.

This is also concluded in the following statements of His Divine Grace Abhaya Carana Bhaktivedanta Swami Srila Prabhupada, savior of the all the Brahmandas, where he states that only a few fall down:

“..The majority of the population, they are outside the prison house. Similarly, majority of living being, part and parcel of God, they are in the spiritual world. Only a few fall down...”

(Srila Prabhupada Conversation, June 23, 1975)

The same in “We are only simple few, this material world...The population of prison house is nothing in comparison to the whole population.” (Lecture, CC Adi 7.108, February 18, 1967)

Anadi is not literal

“anadi karama-phale, which means that these actions and reactions of one’s activity cannot be traced, for they may even continue from the last millennium of Brahma’s birth to the next millennium.” (Bhag. 3.31.44, purport)

“Eternally conditioned means we do not know when we have been conditioned like this...Many, many Brahma’s life. Not only one Brahma’s. There are so many Brahmas changed, and we are conditioned. So therefore we are called eternally conditioned.” (Cc. lecture, January 9, 1967, New York)

anadi karama-phale. Anadi. Anadi means... Adi means the creation. Creation... before creation, I contaminated this desire, iccha-dvesha samutthena.” (Bhag. lecture, January 1, 1975, Bombay)

Our comment: He simply explains here anadir as before the adi, beginning or creation.

“Constitutionally every living entity, even if he is in the Vaikuntha Loka, has chance of falling down. Therefore the living entity is called marginal energy. But when the falldown has taken place for the conditioned soul is very difficult to ascertain. Therefore two classes are designated: eternally liberated and eternally conditioned. But for arguments sake, a living entity being marginal energy, he can’t be eternally conditioned. The Time is so unlimited that the conditioned souls appear to be eternally so, but from the philosophical view he cannot be eternally conditioned. Since we cannot trace out when we have become conditioned, there is no use of arguing on this point.” (letter 69-10-27)

Krishna’s time

One dreamvadi wrote: “As one ascends from Martya-loka, through Svarga-loka and further through Mahar-loka and so on to Brahma-loka, time progressively dilates. Thus, as 360 years go by here in Martya-loka, only a year passes for the devas in Svarga-loka.”

Note: dreamvada is the vada, theory that the soul is forever on the spiritual planets. The fall is of an alternate dream-self or alternatively, a figment of the imagination.

Comment: The “clocks”– i.e., of atomic reactions, biological processes, and other natural phenomena, as well as ordinary clocks - change or are different in other realms, because matter acts differently

They will also change in other yugas. They live longer in higher realms, because the guna’s of nature are different, as in Satya/Dvapara/Treta-yuga, they lived longer because in Satya-, Treta- and Dvapara yuga the decay of matter is slower due to matter being of a better quality. Experiencing different times at other places in the universe has to do with the experience of their “100 years”

The puranas state that for the inhabitants of hell: “A day in hell is equal to 100 years of the manusya (mankind).” In other words, when souls are in hell, one day for them, is experienced as 100 years.

And at the level of Brahma, the duration of the universe is 100 of his years.

See, SB 4.25.43

“My dear King, those two—the man and the woman—supporting one another through mutual understanding, entered that city and enjoyed life for one hundred years.

Purport: One hundred years is significant in this connection because every human being is given the concession to live up to a hundred years. The span of life is different on different planets, according to the planet's distance from the sun. In other words, one hundred years on this planet is different from one hundred years on another planet. Lord Brahma lives for one hundred years according to time on the Brahmaloaka planet, but one day of Brahma is equal to millions of years on this planet. Similarly, the days on the heavenly planets are equal to six months on this planet. On every planet, however, the span of life for a human being is roughly one hundred years. According to the life-spans on different planets, the standards of living also differ.

Thus to describe the clock paradox or twin paradox as a literal slow-motion or ‘freezing’ in higher realms of the universe is wrong. As one dream-theorist wrote: A live television broadcast on Satya-loka of events on Martya-loka would disclose everything moving with dizzying speed, peoples and civilizations rushing on and off the earth. By the same token, a live broadcast on Martya-loka of current events on Satya-loka would transmit motion so slow as to be undetectable by normal human vision.

One scientist Phd devotee friend of us wrote us:

“Time dilatation applies only when comparing two different systems (say A and B) that move relative to each other. From system A one can observe system B to be moving and measure a dilated time on system B. The opposite also applies, from system B one can observe system A to be moving and measure a dilated time on system A. Otherwise in each individual system, time flows in a normal way.”

Thus, the descriptions of scripture comparing the time of different realms are figurative.

This is also in Brhad Bhagavatamrta 2.4.115-117

(115)“Sometimes the Lord would secretly go somewhere with a few of His intimate associates. Then everyone else who had been near Him would lament, unable to see their master.

(116)When I would ask what the Lord was doing on these outings, everyone would keep the facts from me like privileged secrets. No one would disclose anything clearly.

Commentary (by Srila Sanatana Gosvami): Despite his earnest inquiries, no one told Gopa-kumara where Lord Narayana had gone or why. Anyone who knew was unwilling to discuss the subject openly, because making public news of the private pastimes of the Supreme Lord could disrupt the reverential mood of Vaikuntha.

(117)Then, at the very moment I inquired, the Lord of the universe would reappear before us, putting our distress to an end and enlarging our joy to an ocean.

Commentary: From Gopa-kumara’s description it might seem that Vaikuntha has unhappiness just like everywhere else. But as we see here, the Lord’s absence was only

momentary. As soon as the devotees felt distress, the Lord returned. Time is subtler in Vaikuntha than in the mortal realm; an instant in Vaikuntha equals the largest span of time in the mundane world. Sri Maitreya describes this in Srimad-Bhagavatam (3.11.38):

kalo 'yam dvi-parardhakhyo
nimesha upacaryate
avyakritasyanantasya
hy anader jagad-atmanah

“The duration of the two parts of Brahma’s life is calculated to equal one nimesha [less than a second] for the Supreme Personality of Godhead, the unchanging, the unlimited, the cause of all causes of the universe.” This scale of comparative time is only metaphorical, yet such a figurative sense of spiritual time contributes to the charm of the Supreme Lord’s lilas in Vaikuntha. In reality, time in Vaikuntha is not the kind of force it is in the material world; time does not delimit the lifespan of residents in Vaikuntha, because everything there is eternal and infallible.”

Sub– everywhere going gacchati iti jagat

Our friend devotee scientist wrote :

“In modern science, time is used for measuring movement. One rotation of the Earth is called one day or 24 hours. Time is a dimension of space. The flowing of time can be considered as movement through the time dimension.”

In Srimad Bhagavatam, we read:

“Time is astronomically and mathematically calculated in relation to the speed, change and life of a particular object..” (SB 3.10.11 p.)

Thus, time never stops flowing, even in the Brahman effulgence. There is not the "now moment of eternity, an everlasting instant without past or future", as one dream-vadi wrote; meaning that in Brahman, nothing measurable is going on; no movement of, or in, the substances takes place, so there is nothing going on, to measure as time..

This is not so.

The Brahma-jyotir is composed of fallen souls (Room Conversation—August 17, 1971, London).

”Because he falls down from brahma-sayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krishna... in His lila or sport.” (SPL, 1973)

Souls rise up into the Brahman effulgence at sayujya-mukti and fall again– patanty adha (SB 10.2.32); there is a constantly coming and going of little gods-jiva’s.

Conclusion: Time is eternal, being the infinity of single instants, metaphorically describable as a one way flow, and goes on even in Brahman.

Srila Prabhupada also says so:

” Jagadisa means the Supreme Lord, Krishna. Jagat means this world, material world or spiritual world, all worlds. Jagat. Jagat gacchati iti jagat: "Which is progressing, that is called jagat." So Jagat-isa, the supreme master of this jagat, going concern.” (Sri Caitanya-caritamrita, Madhya-lila 20.142, New York, November 30, 1966)

The same in Ratha-yatra lecture, San Francisco, July 5, 1970

“Jagannatha. Jagat means the moving world. Gacchati iti jagat, Sanskrit word, gacchati means which is moving. So all these planets, this universe, even the sun, everything is moving. Even inanimate things are moving, but they are moving under the control of some

animate object. Therefore it is called jagat. Jagat means moving. And Jagat-natha, means the proprietor or the master of all these movements, He is Jagannatha.”

“The so-called scientist, philosophers, they don't see that who is pushing on this button. This material world is going on. Jagat means going on. Gacchati iti jagat. Every planet is going on. This planet is going on. One thousand miles per hour, going on. The sun is moving sixteen thousand miles per second. This is called jagat. Everything is going on. Your motorcar is going on. You are going on. We have a big city, especially in Europe, America, simply going on. This way, this... Whoosh, whoosh, whoosh. No rest. This is called jagat.” (Srimad-Bhagavatam 1.1.2, London, August 16, 1971)

“Apara and para. Apra means inferior, or material, and para means superior, or spiritual. The spiritual force behind is moving the material world. Yayedam dharyate jagat. Jagat means gacchati iti jagat, which is moving or going forward. Everything is moving. All these planets are moving. Your earthly planet is also moving—within twenty-four hours covering 25,000 miles, day and night. The whole material planets, earthly planets, you have 25,000 miles, and this is rotating. Similarly every planet is rotating. The sun is also rotating. Yasyajnya bhramati sambhrita-kala-cakrah. The sun is also having a duration of life, and it will rotate, then it will be finished. Everything in the material world, it has got a date of birth, it lives for some time, it grows or changes the body, and produces some by-products, then dwindles, and then vanishes. This is called shad-vikara, six kind of changes of anything material. That is called jagat. Gacchati. But there is a moving force. Just like the motorcar is going, gacchati. But the motorcar is not moving without any driver. There is a machine, first-class machine, Rolls-Royce car, Cadillac car, good machine, but the machine is useless unless there is a driver. The aeroplane is moving, but without the pilot it cannot move.” (Bhagavad-gita 7.5, Bombay, February 20, 1974)

Last one on this; let's not forget a diversion to theology, since another name of the Paramatma feature of the Lord is kala, or eternal time (SB 1.8.28).

(Bhagavad-gita 16.6-8, Tokyo, January 28, 1975) “...”by chance.” This is childish reason. A child will say, “[By] chance, it has come.” You must give solid reason. Chance, you can say anything as chance. Everybody can say like that. That is not reason. When you bring in chance, that is not logic. That is not knowledge. If somebody says, “By chance, I have come in this world,” that is not logic. I must have my father. I must have my mother. This is scientific. This is common sense. An airplane flying has a pilot; similarly the planets are orbiting because Krishna is within.

gam avisya ca bhutani
dharayamy aham ojasa

‘I enter into each planet, and by My energy they stay in orbit ’(Bhagavad-gita 15.13)...This is the atheistic theory, asatyam. They say that this material world is false. Brahma satyam jagan mithya. Jagat, jagat means this cosmic manifestation which is gacchati, going. In the material world, everything is going. Just like in your city you see the cars, motor cars. They are going here and there, gacchati, very busy. Every man is going here and there. Similarly, the whole planetary system also, beginning from its birth up to the annihilation it is going, moving, orbit. It is going. Everything is going, moving. Even the sun, it has got its orbit. Yac-cakshur esha savita sakala-grahanam raja samasta..., asesha-tejah, yasyajnya bhramati sambhrita-kala-cakrah. Just like the earth has its orbit—it is rotating—similarly, every planet is rotating. The sun is also rotating. It is sixteen thousand miles every 8/5 second.

So this is called jagat. Everything is going on. But it is going in such a way... Just like these cars are moving with high speed, but they are very careful to pass within the lane. Otherwise there will be collision. Similarly, all these planets, they have got their own speed for rotating,

and there are hundreds and thousands and millions. They are rotating, but there is no collision. Now, how it is made? Who has made this lane? A car is moving in sixty miles, seventy miles speed, but they are ordered just to remain within the lane, the marking line. Who has made it? The police department, the government. So how can you say there is no control? This is called upama, analogy, the points of similarity. Analogy means the points of similarity. Then you can conclude some idea.”

Conclusion: Jagannatha, Jagadisa, God exists.

Conclusion on Krishna’s time: Everywhere, also in the spiritual world there is time:

Prabhupada: That is called jagat. Gacchati. Everything is going on, forward. That is called jagat.

Syamasundara: Even the activities of the spiritual world are like that?

Isn't there motion?

Prabhupada: Yes. Why not motion? Because there is living entities. Living entities means life force. There must be motion. (Sri Prabhupada Philosophy discussions— The Evolutionists: Thomas Huxley, Henri Bergson, and Samuel Alexander)

That there is no time in the absolute world, that there is no begin and end is also based on a misunderstanding and mistranslation of Brahma Samhita 5.56 - nimesArdhAkhyo vA vrajati na hi yarapi samayah - "not even a moment of time passes". Samayah na vrajati “time does not proceed for even half a second”, means according to Jiva Gosvami’s purport that “the inhabitants in Goloka do not know time at all because they are absorbed in Govinda. Or the meaning can be ‘the faults of time do not exist there.’”

Also, Bhaktivinoda Thakura’s Jaiva Dharma (Chapter Fifteen), cij-jagatera kala akhandarupe nitya-vartamana", is distorted to “every event in the spiritual world is eternal”. Yet in fact the Bengali words quoted mean "the time (kala) of the spiritual world is ever-existing in unbroken form." The words "every event" simply do not occur in the Bengali that has been cited. Indeed, this quotation is not even speaking about events.

The text explains this cit-kala: “In the material world time has three phases: past, present and future. In the spiritual world time is not broken in that way. In the spiritual world things do not come into being, nor are destroyed; things are eternal; they remain present and don’t move into oblivion.

Sri Prabhupada also says that: “All living entities there are eternally associated without any break... there is no deterioration... the cycle of birth, growth, existence, transformations, deterioration and annihilation—the six material changes—are not existent there.

In the spiritual world there is undoubtedly time, but it has no control over activities.” (SB 3.11.38 p)

“The residents of these planets are free from all anxieties. For them there is no question of birth, death, old age and diseases, and therefore they are not anxious. In those planets there is no difference between the body and the soul, nor is there any influence of time as we experience it in the material world. And in addition to there being no influence of time, the planets...due to being spiritual, are never annihilated.” (SB 3.15.13 p)

“How are Krishna’s pastimes transcendental? What are the ingredients of such pastimes?

The material world is the perverted reflection of the spiritual world. Here everything is polluted by maya. In the spiritual world, maya and the three modes of material nature do not

exist. There everything is impeccable and made of pure goodness including time, place, and all other objects. The pastimes of Krishna are transcendental to material nature, and therefore they are fully spiritual. Krishna's pastimes are nourished by faultless time, place, sky, water, and so on. Within spiritual time, which is unlike material time, the pastimes of Krishna are eightfold. They take place at dawn, morning, pre-noon, noon, afternoon, evening, night, and late at night. In this way Krishna's pastimes are divided into eight, according to the different times of the day and night, and thus they are nourishing the eternal uninterrupted rasa." (Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura – Caitanya-sikshamrita 6/5)

Thus Srila Prabhupada explains that no time in the spiritual world means that the destructive feature of material time is absent. There is spiritual time. The astakaliya-lila revolves on and on, day after day. Astakaliya means the 8 periods of the day with pastimes at the end of the night, morning pastimes, forenoon pastimes, midday pastimes, afternoon pastimes, dusk pastimes, evening pastimes and midnight pastimes, as described in Krishnahnika Kaumudi, Govinda lilamrta, Krishna bhavanamrta. There is beginning and end of every period. But there is no death and old age. And the spiritual forms of the houses and kunjja's- forest huts do not get broken down by time. By the arrangement of Sri Krishna's lila-sakti there is eating, cooking, making of new flower garlands etc. This means blissful changing of services of the souls (= the cintamani's or spiritual atoms, the building blocks of the spiritual world). See Brahma Samhita T 29 purport.

In the CC Adi-lila 5.53 we read: "The earth, water, fire, air and ether (Solid, liquid, radiant, gaseous, ethereal-ed.) of Vaikuntha are all spiritual. Material elements are not found there". It is a real substantial world, the original of the perverted reflection here, the material world. We can read in Srimad Bhagavatam the nature of the spiritual world.

Sub– the spiritual world

SB 2.9. 9: The Personality of Godhead, being thus very much satisfied with the penance of Lord Brahma, was pleased to manifest His personal abode, Vaikuntha, the supreme planet above all others. This transcendental abode of the Lord is adored by all self-realized persons freed from all kinds of miseries and fear of illusory existence. The inhabitants of the Vaikuntha planets are described as having a glowing sky-bluish complexion. Their eyes resemble lotus flowers, their dress is of yellowish color, and their bodily features very attractive. They are just the age of growing youths, they all have four hands, they are all nicely decorated with pearl necklaces with ornamental medallions, and they all appear to be effulgent. Some of them are effulgent like coral and diamonds in complexion and have garlands on their heads, blooming like lotus flowers, and some wear earrings. The Vaikuntha planets are also surrounded by various airplanes, all glowing and brilliantly situated. These airplanes belong to the great mahatmas or devotees of the Lord. The ladies are as beautiful as lightning because of their celestial complexions, and all these combined together appear just like the sky decorated with both clouds and lightning. The Personality of Godhead, seen leaning favorably towards His loving servitors, His very sight intoxicating and attractive, appeared to be very much satisfied. He had a smiling face decorated with an enchanting reddish hue. He was dressed in yellow robes and wore earrings and a helmet on his head. He had four hands, and His chest was marked with the lines of the goddess of fortune. The Lord was seated on His throne and was surrounded by different energies like the four, the sixteen, the five, and the six natural opulences, along with other insignificant energies of the temporary character. But He was the factual Supreme Lord, enjoying His own abode.

SB3. 15.15-22: In the Vaikuntha planets is the Supreme Personality of Godhead, who is the original person and who can be understood through the Vedic literature. He is full of the uncontaminated mode of goodness, with no place for passion or ignorance. He contributes religious progress for the devotees.

In those Vaikuntha planets there are many forests which are very auspicious. In those forests the trees are desire trees, and in all seasons they are filled with flowers and fruits because everything in the Vaikuntha planets is spiritual and personal. In the Vaikuntha planets the inhabitants fly in their airplanes, accompanied by their wives and consorts, and eternally sing of the character and activities of the Lord, which are always devoid of all inauspicious qualities. While singing the glories of the Lord, they deride even the presence of the blossoming madhavi flowers, which are fragrant and laden with honey; this breeze is so nice that it also carries the honey of the flowers. When the king of bees hums in a high pitch, singing the glories of the Lord, there is a temporary lull in the noise of the pigeon, the cuckoo, the crane, the cakravaka, the swan, the parrot, the partridge and the peacock. Such transcendental birds stop their own singing simply to hear the glories of the Lord. Even the trees, the ground, the plants, the flowers, the birds and the beasts are all on the level of Krishna consciousness. The special feature of Vaikunthaloka is that there is no question of sense gratification. In the Vaikunthas such nice birds as the peacock, the cakravaka and the cuckoo prefer to hear the vibration of the glories of the Lord from the bees. The inhabitants of Vaikuntha travel in their airplanes made of lapis lazuli, emerald and gold. Although accompanied by their consorts, they cannot be stimulated to passion by their mirth and beautiful charms. The goddesses of fortune worship the Lord in their own gardens by offering tulasi leaves on the coral-paved banks of transcendental reservoirs of water. The Lord is bearing all paraphernalia, such as an umbrella and a camara fan, the white bunches of hair moving very gently, like two swans, and due to their favorable breeze the pearls garlanding the umbrella also moved, like drops of nectar falling from the white full moon or ice melting due to a gust of wind. The Lord is the reservoir of all pleasure. His auspicious presence is meant for everyone's benediction, and His affectionate smiling and glancing touch the core of the heart. The Lord's beautiful bodily color is blackish, and His broad chest is the resting place of the goddess of fortune, who glorifies the entire spiritual world, the summit of all heavenly planets. Thus it appeared that the Lord was personally spreading the beauty and good fortune of the spiritual world. He was adorned with a girdle that shone brightly on the yellow cloth covering His large hips, and He wore a garland of fresh flowers which was distinguished by humming bees. His lovely wrists were graced with bracelets, and He rested one of His hands on the shoulder of Garuda, His carrier, and twirled a lotus with another hand. His countenance was distinguished by cheeks that enhanced the beauty of His alligator-shaped pendants, which outshone lightning. His symmetrically elevated nose was attractively formed, and His head was covered with a gem-studded crown. A charming necklace hung between His stout arms, and His neck was adorned with the gem known by the name Kaustubha. The exquisite beauty of Narayana, was so attractive that it defeated the pride of the goddess of fortune in being the most beautiful. The Lord's beautiful face appeared to be like the inside of a blue lotus, and the Lord's smile appeared to be a blossoming jasmine flower. The nails of His lotus feet resembled rubies. The Lord's lovely and illuminating speech was like a series of Vedic hymns.”

Envious but forced to stay

The dreamvadi we quoted noticed this movement in eternity, but then he, ice-cold, theorizes on that the nitya-siddhas are “frozen”, fixed there.

He wrote: “Vaisnavas, however, know of transcendental variegatedness and activities.

Although eternity is described as having no past or future, there is still sequence (for there are lilas, pastimes); and knowledge, bliss, and beauty eternally increase.” but “Every soul in that realm must accordingly be characterized as "nitya-mukta." This includes the souls that come from the material world. For if a soul enters that realm from the material world, can we ask "when did that soul arrive?" The question does not apply. "Once" the soul gets there, that soul can only be "nitya-mukta." He has, necessarily, "always" been there. This is the dictation of the logic of eternity.”

Where are the tenets of that logic. It is the zero-degree-cold logic of ice–eternity. Not the logic of Krishna’s Vaikuntha planets. There is spiritual, natural logic. This is in Tattva viveka (1.18-22)

That is also the logic of scripture, which is superior– Sabda Brahman.

We already wrote the meaning of spiritual time:

Brahma Samhita 5.56 - nimesArdhAkhyo vA vrajati na hi yarapi samayah - "not even a moment of time passes". Samayah na vrajati “time does not proceed for even half a second” means: “the inhabitants in Goloka do not know time at all because they are absorbed in Govinda.” Or ‘the faults of time do not exist there.’”

Bhaktivinoda Thakura’s Jaiva Dharma (Chapter Fifteen), cij-jagatera kala akhandarupe nitya-vartamana", "the time (kala) of the spiritual world is ever-existing in unbroken form." Means: “In the material world time has three phases: past, present and future. In the spiritual world time is not broken in that way. In the spiritual world things do not come into being, nor are destroyed; things are eternal; they remain present and don’t move into oblivion.”

Besides, scripture states that for example Gopa kumara left and came back.

Brhad Bhagavatamrta 2.4.81-87, When the gopa, Svarupa or Gopa kumara, came back in the spiritual world, Lord Narayana says to him:

"For so long I have been eager to see you... hope had Me dancing like a fool, thinking "perhaps in this lifetime, or this, or this, or this... "

Here Srila Sanatana Gosvami comments:

"The Lord had been waiting a long time for Gopa Kumara to come back to Vaikuntha. The gopa had forgotten the Lord for many life times.” Srila Sanatana Gosvami says: "the gopa had forgotten the Lord". That means he knew the Lord from before, from the spiritual world, because Srila Sanatana Gosvami comments: "in previous [material] lives Gopa Kumara had never chanted the names of the Lord, not even namabhasa" for which the Lord could have given him a birth near Govardhana.

But, one may counter, when Gopa Kumara comes to Krishna loka he is called "nutna", newcomer. This is because Krishna loka is the place of the Lord's nara-lila or human like pastimes. For example, Krishna again and again goes to Mathura to kill Kamsa etc., but this is forgotten again and again. The Brihad Bhagavatamrta 2.6.356/357/361 and commentary describes:

"Krishna subdues Kaliya time and again, in the same way, and time and again lifts Govardhana Hill. And again and yet again He performs His many other wonderful pastimes. Thus the Lord enchants the hearts of His devotees.”

Commentary: Since all of Krishna's pastimes, beginning with the killing of Putana, are eternal, Krishna enjoys them with His devotees in Goloka as often as they like. Yet each time a pastime is repeated, it seems completely new, as if never seen or heard of before.

“But the residents of Vraja, completely bewildered by the kalakuta poison of their supreme love for Sri Krishna, never think that any of these events has ever occurred before.”

Commentary: Because the Vraja-vasis are never aware that Krishna's pastimes are repeat performances, the attraction they feel for those pastimes is never impeded. The highest states of Krishnaprema have the power to create such bewilderment.

“And, oh, the most glorious thing is that the foremost of enlightened persons, the Lord Himself, while drowning in an ocean of love for His dear devotees, cannot always remember what He has done and what He is going to do.”

Commentary: Isn't perfect knowledge an automatic byproduct of love of God? Why then are the pure devotees of Goloka so forgetful? Yes, to one who has prema omniscience comes naturally, but prema, being all-powerful, can redefine what is knowledge and what is ignorance.

“The Personality of Godhead Himself, by the influence of His Yogamaya, also forgets what He did before. But though He often forgets, He sometimes remembers, if it serves the purpose of His pastimes.”

Alternatively, nutna newcomer means he had been off for a long, long, long time; so much had happened in that time. Remember “.. in each individual system, time flows in a normal way.” No slow-motions.

Alternatively, the gopa had left Narayana, and was new for Vrndavana:
Since, when the gopa arrived in Vaikuntha, Lord Narayana said:
“For so long (ciram) I have been eager to see you!” (BB 2.4.81)

Sanatana Gosvami's commentary: The Lord stated from the heart that He had been waiting a long time for Gopa-kumara to come to Vaikuntha.

Our comment: ‘so long’ means Gopa-kumara was before with the Lord.

“My dear friend, you have passed many lifetimes (bahuni janmani) without paying any attention to Me at all.” (BB 2.4.82)

Our comment: Here it does not say eternally not paying attention to Me (Narayana).

“For so long, hope had me dancing like a fool, thinking, “Perhaps in this lifetime, or this, or this, or this, he will finally turn his face towards Me.”

Commentary: Even though Gopa-kumara had forgotten his Lord for many lifetimes, the Lord had never forgotten him. The Lord wanted Gopa-kumara to know this, and also to know how eager the Lord had always been to regain the association of His devotee. (BB 2.4.82 + Sanatana Gosvami's commentary)

Our comment: ‘for so long’, the Lord was obviously not eternally dancing like a fool, in hope.

Gopa-kumara had forgotten his Lord for many lifetimes means he had been with the Lord before these “many lifetimes”

“But I could find no pretext on which to bring you to My abode, dear brother, and still follow the timeless laws that I Myself have created.”

Commentary: Since the Supreme Lord is all-powerful, why didn’t He simply find a way to bring Gopa-kumara to Him sooner? The Lord establishes the laws of the universe, which are enunciated in the Vedas and other scriptures, and He chooses to adhere to His own restrictions. Only when they show, by calling out His names, that they want to return to Him does He again reveal Himself. In previous lives, Gopa-kumara had never chanted the names of Lord Narayana, even unintentionally or in jest. Had he at least vibrated a shadow of the Lord’s name, he could have been delivered, like Ajamila. (BB 2.4.84 + Sanatana Gosvami’s commentary)

“Today you have at last fulfilled the desire I have harbored for so long.” (BB 2.4.87)
dirgha-tamam—long-held; cirat—after a long time.

Our comment: Again the Lord says that Gopa-kumara had been with Him before. All these verses and commentaries speak about Gopa-Kumara’s having been with Narayana on Vaikuntha-loka, before his fall into forgetfulness.

From these statements we must conclude that gopa kumara fell from Vaikuntha-lila originally and then by the mercy of guru, krishna and the holy dhama got elevated to krishna loka. So he was nutna– a new one, on Krishna’s planet.

One can change one’s nitya-svarupa. Srila Prabhupada says so:

“Some devotee wants to serve Krishna as flower; they become flower there. If I want that "As a flower I shall lie down at the lotus feet of Krishna," he becomes flower, voluntarily. And he can change his..., from flower to human body. That is spiritual life. There is no restriction. If some devotee wants to serve Krishna as cow, he serves Krishna as cow, as calf, as flower, as plant, as water, as ground, field, or as father, as mother, as friend, as beloved, anything. Ye yatha mam prapadyante tams tathaiva bhajamy aham [Bg. 4.11]. That is Krishna’s all-powerfulness, spiritual life.”

(Srimad-Bhagavatam 6.1.1-4, Melbourne, May 20, 1975)

No words in the whole Brhad Bhagavatamrtam like, ‘the dreaming gopa manufactured an alternate dream-self imagining himself undergoing all kinds of adventures.’ It is a true history.

Some more from the Puranas

Skanda purana 5.2.57.2

"Mahesvara to Parvati: "An excellent gana (associate) proficient in music, named Ghanta was my favorite. During the period of Caksusa Manu, once, out of curiosity, he proceeded to Brahma’s abode to see Brahma to show his musical proficiency. "I will propitiate Brahma, the Lord of the worlds, with my songs". Narada told this to Lord Siva. Siva angrily cursed the gana: " O Ghanta, as you have left Me and have gone to another abode for service, be fallen on the earth"...he became a Gana once again and attained the greatest position at My side with no cause for further rebirths."

and 5.2.77.34

"A brahmana did tapa to Lord Siva for a son not born of a womb. Lord Siva called the gana's and asked: "Who among you will offer himself as his son". All stood with faces turned downwards. Pushpadanta spoke: "The gana's will not leave You and go off to the earth. They will stay here forever in Your vicinity enjoying excellent joy and not enter the despicable human womb in the greatest hell". Lord Siva answered: "Displeasing Me, do fall into the mortal world"...Again attained the eternal position. I (Lord Siva) embraced him and placed him on My lap."

Know that according to Brhad Bhagavatamrta 2.3.48-65, Siva loka is transcendental.

"I heard some wonderful singing and music. Enlivened, looking all around, I saw someone riding on a bull—a unique person, arriving from a higher region. Three-eyed, white like camphor, dressed only by the sky, that exquisitely beautiful person carried a trident and bore the half moon on his head, his matted locks brilliantly adorned by the Ganga. His body was smeared with ashes and graced by a charming garland of bones.

Commentary: 'Lord Siva's garland of bones was in fact auspicious and beautiful because it was made from the bones of departed Vaishnavas.'

Sitting on his lap, a woman of beautiful golden fair complexion (gaurya), affectionately served him. Divine regalia surrounded him, more heavenly than the riches of heaven. And many followers attended him, their attractive forms and behavior just fitting for his service.

Commentary: 'The associates of Lord Siva appeared very handsome, including Sri Ganesa, with his large abdomen and elephant's head. And they all conducted themselves in an attractive manner.

By worship of Ganesa or other demigods one may attain a form with, for example, a protuberant belly and an elephant's head, can achieve this by worshiping Ganesa. But those who worship Lord Siva understanding that he is nondifferent from Sri Krishna attain beautiful bodily forms on Lord Siva's planet. This is affirmed in the narration of Lord Siva's battle with Andhaka in Sri Vamana Purana, Chapter fifty-nine.'

Feeling the greatest surprise and delight, I thought, "Who is this, accompanied by such an entourage, and appearing from above the abode of liberation? He looks more powerful than anyone in the material world, more excellent than all liberated souls, yet he seems to violate the rules of civilized behavior, like a great sense-gratifier.

Commentary: 'It struck Gopa-kumara as strange that even though this unique person appeared to be the supreme ruler of the material world, the defender of religious principles, he was ignoring the rules of proper behavior—by traveling naked, embracing his wife in public, and so on—enjoying all kinds of sense gratification even though he seemed a fully liberated transcendentalist.'

My mind was overcome by the weight of the supreme ecstasy I felt from seeing him. I bowed down to him and those who stay with him, and he gave me a compassionate glance.

Impelled by joy, I approached the leader of his companions, named Sri Nandisvara, and asked him in detail about this person and what he was doing.

Nandisvara laughed and said to me, "O cowherd boy, devoted worshiper of Gopala, don't you recognize Lord Siva, the lord of the universe?"

Commentary: 'By calling Lord Siva the lord of the universe, Nandisvara tactfully told Gopakumara that since Lord Siva is independent he can apparently violate the laws of civilized behavior without blame.'

He is the giver of material enjoyment and liberation, and he expands devotion to the Personality of Godhead. He is worshiped even by the liberated and is dear to the Vaishnavas.

Drawn by the devotion of his friend Kuvera, he is traveling with his beloved Parvati and dear gentle companions to grace Mount Kailasa with his presence. He came from his own planet, as transcendental as he, an abode reached through devotion by those who see him and Lord Krishna as nondifferent.

Commentary: 'Lord Siva's own planet, beyond the coverings of the material universe, is attainable by those who worship him and Lord Vishnu on the same level. That transcendental world is suitable for Lord Siva's pleasure, equipped as it is with all kinds of eternal and unlimited opulence. Yet Lord Siva gracefully accepts the friendship of the demigod Kuvera, the original proprietor of Mount Kailasa, and submits himself to Kuvera's devotion. And so Lord Siva is on his way to visit Kailasa in the company of Parvati, his consort. Since Parvati, the mother of the universe, is Lord Siva's supreme energy, Gopakumara should not be shocked to see her sitting on his lap in public. But why is Lord Siva traveling with such a small entourage? Although on his own planet he has many more devotees, for this trip he has chosen only his dearest associates because the Kailasa within the material world can accommodate only some of his opulence and entourage. There is nothing wrong with being attracted to Lord Siva. Since he is nondifferent from Lord Krishna, devotion offered to him is also devotion to Krishna. More precisely, when one satisfies Lord Siva by pure devotion to him, Lord Siva helps one become more devoted to Krishna.'

The great Lord Siva has one eternal transcendental form. Dwelling in his own abode, he is always visible to his exclusive worshipers, who are pleased to live there.

Commentary: 'According to Sri Nandisvara, Lord Siva remains always in one form, meaning that he is not like Lord Mahakala, sometimes formless and sometimes having a personal form, nor does he expand himself as Lord Vishnu does, into the different forms of a fish, a tortoise, and so on. In the pastimes Lord Siva performs for the pleasure of his devotees, he sometimes appears disguised as a hunter or a fisherman, but he does not transform into different species of life. Because Lord Siva's followers can rest assured he is not going to change his appearance, they are always satisfied. He is always visible on his planet, not like Lord Vishnu, who often leaves His abodes to visit other places. Lord Siva's dear devotees can always see their lord, unlike the devotees of Sri Vishnu, Sri Yajnesvara, and the other incarnations of the Personality of Godhead on Svargaloka, Maharloka, Tapoloka, and Satyaloka.

This is the explanation given by Sri Nandisvara, but more precisely Lord Siva is always in the same form in the sense that his body is always purely spiritual, sac-cid-ananda, and never subject to change. He is always present in his own abode, beyond the material creation, and so is always visible in that abode for the pleasure of his devotees.'

With festivals of singing, dancing, and so on, he always gives pleasure to his companions, as if to make them greedy for the Supreme Lord's devotional service, in which they see that he and Lord Vishnu are nondifferent.

Commentary: 'Lord Siva's festivals resound with congregational chanting of Lord Vishnu's names, and his devotees can be heard crying out in great reverence and love for Lord Vishnu. It appears that Lord Siva holds such festivals for the benefit of others, to induce them to take

up worship of Lord Vishnu as nondifferent from himself, but in fact Lord Siva is himself fully absorbed in vishnu-bhakti because like Narada Muni he is a bhaktavatara, an empowered incarnation of the Lord in the role of the Lord's devotee.'

Our point here is that souls come from there to here, and go from here back to there.

Srila Prabhupada also says so (lecture on Bhagavad gita 9.1 19-4-76): "Just like a thief in the prison house. How he becomes liberated? When his term of suffering in the prison house is finished, then he is again free man. And again if he is criminal, he is put into jail." He uses this analogy a few hundred times. See the BhaktiVedantavedabase. The relevant quotes, on this analogy are:

Imprisoned – 26 Prison – 88 Rebel – 11 Rebellious – 32 prison-house - 190 jail - 200.

The dreamvada also teaches that the soul is eternally in the material world:

"A soul "falls" from eternity and sojourns in the material world. When did he enter the material world? 'There was no time when he was not bound' How long has that fallen and restored soul been absent?", the answer is "He never left." Or, alternatively, "the question does not apply." For the logic of eternity dictates that, although it admits "bondage is not the soul's original condition".

This last theory is, they admit, "for the purposes of discussion", since it is even for them too inconceivable.

Therefore another theory is called in, dreamvada.

Srila Prabhupada states:

"In Vrindavana, in Goloka Vrindavana, somebody's serving Krishna as His friend, cowherd boy. Somebody's serving Krishna as gopi, as lover. Somebody's serving Krishna as father and mother, Mother Yasoda, Nanda Maharaja. Somebody's Krishna's friend as servant, as tree, as water, as flower, as land, as cow's, as calf. So many ways. This is our business. But somehow or other we did not like to serve Krishna. Therefore we have been put into the service of maya in three modes of nature. Just like criminal."

"We did not like to serve Krishna" but then, dream vada dreams, an alternate dream-self was send out, not me, the soul. That one is forced to stay.

This is countered by Prabhupada: "That is force. [indistinct] prema. In Bengali it is said "If you catch one girl or boy, 'You love me, you love me, you love me.' " Is it love? "You love me, otherwise I will kill you." Is that love? So Krishna does not want to become a lover like that, on the point of revolver. Love is reciprocal, voluntary, good exchange of feeling." (Evening Darsana—July 8, 1976, Washington, D.C.)

Amsas-expansions- are for muktas and elevated yogi's, not for the ordinary mortal. Liberated souls don't expand fallen amsas

Dreamvada says the soul is nitya-siddha, and some dream-self is in maya.

Liberated souls, though, can expand into many forms, but they are of one consciousness and one soul.

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana comments in his Govinda Bhasya on Vedanta-sutra 4.4.11 that the liberated soul can manifest many different bodies simultaneously and quotes Chandogya Upanishad 7.26.2 to support this: "The liberated soul is one, he (can) become(s) or is three, five, seven, nine, eleven, one hundred and eleven, twenty thousand", Nimbarkacharya and Ramanujacharya in their Vedanta bhasya also quote Chandogya Upanishad 7.26.2 interpreting

this enumeration 1, 3.....20.000 as meaning ad infinitum, endless variety; the liberated soul can manifest unlimited bodies.

But a liberated soul manifests expansions of the same quality (Ved. Sutra 4.4.15)

Liberated souls have many forms but there is one soul, and the many bodies are as their limbs. This is in the Vedanta Sutra 4.4.11-15

Sri Baladeva's Govinda bhasya on Vedanta-sutra 4.4.11 "The soul can assume various bodies simultaneously and as the soul is atomic in its essential form, its becoming many can be only by assuming diverse bodies."

Ramanuja's Sribhasya on Vedanta sutra 4.4.11:

"As a self, which is atomic, and thus incapable of being cut or divided, cannot possibly have many forms, it is made out that his becoming threefold, fivefold, sevenfold etc. is due to the body or bodily expansions."

And then in Vedanta sutra 4.4.14 he makes the purvapaksa object: "It has been stated above that the individual self is of the size of an atom. How as regarding the many bodies, there can be the idea of being of one's own on the part of a single thing (i.e. self) which is an atom."

To this objection the srutakara (Vyasadeva the writer) replies thus (VS 4.4.15)

"pradipa-vada avesa

The entering (into many bodies is) as in the case of a lamp, for (scripture) shows thus."

If the soul in this material world is an expansion (amsa) of the liberated soul (mukta) in Goloka then this is a kind of a lila-avatara, a pastime expansion.

The mukta enters the amsa(s) through the spreading out of its prajna, the aura of consciousness. The liberated soul itself is in only one place; the pervasion of many bodies by the released soul is like that of a lamp, which is in one place but the illumination is in many places.

There is only one spirit soul who shines the same Krishna consciousness in all these bodies like a lamp in one place shines the same light all around, pradipa-vada avesa (=as a lamp enters other places by its light).

In other words, the consciousness in all the bodies (amsa's) is the same. There can be various activities of the different parts or bodies but they are with the same thinking, feeling, willing. Not that the original soul is Krishna conscious and the amsa is in maya. Just as in one's own body, the hand and feet have different activities but they act with the same purpose or consciousness/mind.

One can't be a liberated soul there in Goloka and here have the experience of being in maya. It is like a puppet on the string of the puppeteer. There is no independent initiative.

Vedanta sutra's Sri Bhasya 4.4.15 of Sri Ramanuja:

"Just as there is pervasion of other places by a single lamp existing in one place, through its own light, similarly, in the case of the individual self also, which is seated only in one body, through its own light (of attributive intelligence) the pervasion of all bodies appropriately results. Just as also, although in the heart, through the pervasion of consciousness there is the sense of one's own in regard to the whole of the body; similar to it is the case there."

Sri Baladeva Vidyabhusana comments on this point: "Those muktas, who through spiritual (Brahmic) bodies always wish to carry out the will of the Supreme Brahman, manifest in their acts the cit-sakti of the Lord, and with that sakti they work simultaneously in different places. The muktas always possess this cit-sakti and always follow the will of the Lord...they have become satya-sankalpas, beings whose mere will is action. (Govinda bhasya 4.4.12)

Then he writes in his commentary on Vs 4.4.18 (about the mukta, and this is also for the amsa because they are one) that “every mukta has the power to get to the spheres of cosmic rulers like Brahma etc...through the permission of the Supreme Ruler. But he doesn’t become an ordinary samsari jiva because the mukta ever abides in that who is changeless. The mukta dwells in all spheres, fully knowing all the laws that govern those spheres.”

In other words, when the amsa comes here, it can never fall in maya and become non-Krishna conscious, independent of the origin. Baladeva continues: “Through the might of his vidya he knows both the nature and the attributes of the Lord.”

Then he concludes “Thus the dwelling of the mukta in these spheres, differs from the dwelling of the samsari jivas in them.”

Similarly is the explanation of the Vedanta-parijata-saurabha (fragrance of the heavenly wish-fulfilling flower of the Vedanta) and Vedanta-Kausthuba (The Lord’s jewel (on His chest, suspended from a necklace) of the Vedanta) the commentaries of Nimbarkacarya and his disciple Srinivasa.

Vedanta-kausthuba, Nimbarka sampradaya’s Vedanta-sutra-bhasya 4.4.15

Sutra: "The entering (into many bodies is) as in the case of a lamp, for (scripture) shows thus."

Vedanta Parijata – Nimbarka

The soul's entering into many bodies takes place through its attribute of knowledge, as of the lamp through its ray,—“for” the scriptural text: "It is capable of infinity" (Svet. 5.9) shows thus.

Vedanta-kaustubha – Srinivasa

Apprehending the objection, viz. The manifoldness, mentioned in the text: "He becomes three-fold " (Chand. 7.26.2) and so on, is not possible on the part of the freed soul even though it may have a body, since it is never possible for one and the same soul, which is atomic by nature, to pervade many bodies,—the author replies:

"The entering" of the freed soul, atomic in size and abiding within one body, into many bodies,—i.e. its complete entering into those bodies as their soul with the thought: 'This is my body and that as well'—is possible through its attribute of knowledge. "As in the case of a lamp." That is, just as a lamp, though placed in one place, pervades many places through its attribute, viz. rays, so is the case here. "For thus " Scripture shows, “The individual soul is to be known as a hundredth part of the point of a hair, divided a hundred times, yet it is capable of infinity " (Svet. 5.9).

Thus, the original is of the same nature as the amsa, but if the origin falls in maya, the ability to create amsas or dream-selves, is gone. Unless the jiva gets back some yoga-siddhis, but he is fallen out of the spiritual world.

Day-dreaming

Thus, to consider our conditional life a dream expansion of our liberated self in the spiritual world is a wrong idea. Srila Prabhupada in the purport to SB 4.29.64 writes:

“In dreams we sometimes see things that we have never experienced in the present body. Sometimes in dreams we think that we are flying in the sky, although we have no experience of flying. This means that once in a previous life, either as a demigod or astronaut, we flew in the sky. The impression is there in the stockpile of the mind, and it suddenly expresses itself. It is like fermentation taking place in the depths of water, which sometimes manifests itself in bubbles on the water's surface. Sometimes we dream of coming to a place we have never known or experienced in this lifetime, but this is proof that in a past life we experienced this. The impression is kept within the mind and sometimes becomes manifest either in dream or in thought. The conclusion is that the mind is the storehouse of various thoughts and experiences undergone during our past lives.”

Thus, dream-consciousness has a basis; the dreams of a liberated soul are expansions of the life experiences of the mukta and to be of the same quality. If he dreams of material activities, he'll be given the material realm to do material activities. So-called bad, spiritual dreams are lila.

Some branches of dreamvada make all the activities of all the conditioned souls, the lilas of the residents of Vaikuntha, since the activities of the mayic world are the dream-expansions of a mukta-purusa. This has some smell of the Brahmavada philosophy, which teaches that this world and its activities are the lila of the Lord.

Prabhupada: They have no knowledge. Avisuddha-buddhayah [SB 10.2.32], always impure. Otherwise how they are thinking, so 'ham: "I am the same. I am God. I am moving the sun." Such rascals, they remain always in ignorance. "If I am the same, then why I have fallen down in this maya?" They say, "It is my lila. I have become a dog. It is my lila. I have become hog.” (Morning Walk, July 2, 1975, Denver)

So according to this dreamvada, we do pastimes here just as they go on in the spiritual world. There is no difference between the material and spiritual world. All the activities here are orchestrated from above. The script is written in Vaikuntha and we execute it. The first and second world war with all its horrors gas-chambers atom-bombs was lila. The Stalin amsa killing 30 million other amsas was lila among the amsas of the nitya siddhas. The Mao amsa killing 40 million other amsas was lila. The 42 million abortions every year worldwide is the lila of Vaikuntha. The 1 million suicides worldwide every year is the lila of some or 1 million Vaikuntha residents. The up till now registered more than 120 million abductions by the aliens is the lila of Vaikuntha and it could also be staged in Vaikuntha, since maya and Vaikuntha are one, and the “conditioned existence is a figment of the imagination” (wrote one dream-vadi), meaning, according to the believer, either, these happen in some form in the spiritual world, or they are non-existent, sunya, zero or asat, false or my inexplicable subconsciousness with who I – who is in Krishna-lila– have nothing to do or inconceivable paradox– it is me and not me.

The world is not a dream

“The dream of Maha Vishnu is factual reality” (SB 1.16.26-30 purport)
Our acaryas rejected that we are dreaming off-shoots of a higher spirituality. Srila Madhvacarya writes in his Sri Tattva-muktavali or Mayavada-satadusani 101:

“The Mayavadis compare material existence to a dream, but in truth it is not at all like a dream. The dreaming condition is full of many faults. In a dream one may eat and drink

unlimitedly, but he will never become satiated, although in the waking condition one quickly becomes satiated by eating and drinking. The use of this analogy by the Mayavadis is a great blunder, for the waking condition is not at all like a dream.”

And the Vedanta sutra 2.2.29 states – *vaidharmyAc ca na svapnAdi-vat* – it is not like a dream because of the difference.

This is from the section refuting the Yogacara Buddhists.

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana explains the difference (in his *Govinda bhasya* 2.2.29) as follows:

“The objects experienced in a dream and in waking perception are not the same. They are different. In a dream there is a remembering of what was experienced in the past. In waking there is direct perception. In a dream experiences change moment to moment. When one awakens he is immediately convinced that the dream was unreal. The object seen when one is awake do not change so from moment to moment, as they do in dream. In the waking state some objects remain virtually unchanged for hundreds of years. True, the Lord creates objects in the dream state (sutra 3.2.1), but for a temporary purpose and for a particular soul only; while the external world He has created for all souls and for the Cosmic period, and given them greater fixity.”

Vedanta Kaustubha adds: “Cognitions in the waking state are due to attentive sense organs, those in dreams due to inattentive sense organs,” “...those in dreams due to sleep and other such misleading instruments”. Sri Bhasya states.

The material existence is in analogy sometimes described to be **like** a dream, but not literally a figment of the imagination or dream of a soul stationed in Goloka Vrindavana.

Soul dreams his dreams here

The dream theory is, ‘we have our soul still in goloka’.

The truth is that the soul is not Krishna conscious, in darkness, in the material world, and by taking to Krishna consciousness we can revive our eternal, original, spiritual form, *sat-cit-ananda-vigraha*, which is within these rotting material forms, and return in that *sat-cit-ananda-vigraha*, back to home, back to Godhead.

That is explained in several places: (we’ll give only a few)

“The demigods said: Let Maharaja Nimi live without a material body. Let him live in a spiritual body as a personal associate of the Supreme Personality of Godhead, and, according to his desire, let him be manifest or unmanifest to common materially embodied people. (SB 9.13.11)

Purport: The demigods wanted Maharaja Nimi to come to life, but Maharaja Nimi did not want to accept another material body. Under the circumstances, the demigods, having been requested by the saintly persons, gave him the benediction that he would be able to stay in his spiritual body...a purely spiritual body, free from all gross and subtle material contamination....Thus he lived in his original, spiritual body as an associate of the Supreme Personality of Godhead.”

“Srila Bhaktisiddhanta Sarasvati Thakura comments that the word *siddha-deha*, “perfected spiritual body,” refers to a body beyond the material gross body composed of five elements

and the subtle astral body composed of mind, intelligence and false ego. In other words, one attains a completely spiritual body fit to render service to the transcendental couple Radha and Krishna: sarvopadhi-vinirmuktam tat-paratvena nirmalam [Cc. Madhya 19.170].

When one is situated in his spiritual body, which is beyond this gross and subtle material body, he is fit to serve Radha and Krishna. That body is called siddha-deha...when one is spiritually situated and does not desire a gross or subtle body, he attains his original spiritual body. As confirmed by the Bhagavad-gita (4.9): tyaktva deham punar janma naiti mam eti so 'rjuna.

One is elevated to the spiritual world by the spiritual body and is situated either in Goloka Vrindavana or in another Vaikuntha planet." (CC Madhya 8.229 p)

"Anyone who understands Me, why I come here, what is My activities," tyaktva deham punar janma [Bg. 4.9], "he becomes liberated. After giving up this body, he does not accept any material body. In his own spiritual body he goes back to home, back to Godhead." (Sri Caitanya-caritamrita, Adi-lila 1.4, Mayapur, March 28, 1975)

For a devotee, however, there is no more karma, and so there is no more material body. Krishna confirms this in the Bhagavad-gita (4.9): tyaktva deham punar janma naiti mam eti. After giving up his present body, a devotee does not get another material body, but rather in his spiritual body he goes back home, back to Godhead. (Dharma: The Way of Transcendence ch. 16. When the Krishna Sun Rises in the Heart)

"If you want to stay in the material, then you change the material body just suitable for a particular place, atmosphere. But we have got our spiritual body. That spiritual body, without any material covering, you can transfer to the spiritual world. (Evening Darsana, July 7, 1976, Washington, D.C.)

"Everyone dies, so a devotee, after death, in his transcendental form, he goes, back to home, back to Godhead. (Room Conversation with Reverend Gordon Powell, Head of Scots Church, June 28, 1974, Melbourne)

"Our endeavor should be how to get again our original spiritual body. Spiritual body is there already. It is covered by the material body." (Venezuela, on February 21, 1975)

"...revive our original spiritual body. That spiritual body is within..." Bhagavad-gita 16.10, Hawaii, February 6, 1975

"When you go back to home, back to Godhead, you haven't got to accept this material body. Your spiritual body is already there within this material body. And in that spiritual body you shall exist along with God." (Bhagavad-gita 2.11—Edinburgh, July 16, 1972)

"we are helping people how to get out of this material body, and revive your own spiritual body and, in that spiritual body, you go back to home, back to Godhead." (Bhagavad-gita 4.13—New York, April 8, 1973)

"Mukta means we change this body not to accept any more material body, but we remain in our own spiritual body. Just like if you are diseased, you are suffering from fever, so when there is no more fever, but you remain in your original healthy body, that is called mukti. .. You are suffering from fever. To become free from fever does not mean that you become formless. Why I shall become formless? My form is there, but my form is no more disturbed

by the fever, feverish condition. That is called mukti. Roga-mukta, free from disease. Therefore it is called muktva kalevaram. Just like the snake. They sometimes give up the outer covering of the body...But he remains in the body. But the extra covering which had, he had grown, that is also gone once he gives up. Everything, every education, is there in the nature's study. We can see the, the snake give up the covering, but he remains in his form. Similarly, we... Muktva kalevaram means this extra... Just like this dress, this is covering. I can give it up, but I remain in my original body. Similarly, mukti means I have got my original body already. It is covered by this material coating” (Bhagavad-gita 8.1—Geneva, June 7, 1974)

Spiritual body is now covered with the material body... And when you haven't got to take dress, or this material body, and you remain in your spiritual body, that is called mukti. .. tyaktva deham punar janma: he doesn't accept any more material body. Mam eti. He becomes eligible to go back home, back to Godhead, and there he dances with Krishna. That is real mukti...no more accepts any material body, he is transferred to the spiritual world to play with Krishna, to dance with Krishna, to talk with Krishna. (Conversation with Yogi Amrit Desai of Kripalu Ashram, Pennsylvania, USA. January 2, 1977, Bombay)

“One’s identification with the material body will vanish and identification with one's spiritual body will predominate. In that spiritual body (svarupa-siddhi) one will always see Vrindavana and serve Radha and Krishna. This final stage is called sampatti-dasa. By Krishna's mercy, suddenly one's material body, mind, intelligence and false ego will be cast off and one will appear in a pure spiritual body, serving Radha and Krishna along with Their eternal associates. (Hari-nama-cintamani & Nama-bhajana by Srila Saccidananda Bhaktivinoda Thakura Chapter 15 - Bhajana-pranali)

“Sri Dhruva Maharaja went to Dhruvaloka in his spiritualized material body; seeing that, should one waste time hoping for the same? The general rule is a living entity gives up his material body and goes to Vaikuntha in his spiritual body.” (Sri Bhaktyaloka - The Six Faults and Qualities of Bhakti Dhairya -by Srila Saccidananda Bhaktivinoda Thakura – 9 Dhairya - Patience)

“Is the holy name a material sound vibration? Can a material tongue chant the holy name?
The holy name of Hari is not a product of the material world. A pure spirit soul situated in his constitutional position is qualified to chant the holy name of Hari in his spiritual body.
A materially conditioned living entity cannot chant the holy name through his material senses. However, when one’s constitutional propensities are awakened by the mercy of the hladini potency, one is eligible to chant the holy name of the Lord. At that time, the pure name mercifully appears in the devotee’s heart and then dances on his devotion-filled tongue. The mystery of the holy name is that it is not a combination of letters but manifests as a combination of letters when it dances on a material tongue.” (Jaiva Dharma by Srila Saccidananda Bhaktivinoda Thakura - Chapter 23)

“Does a great personality, who worships Krishna in his spiritual body, give up the rules and regulations?

Do swanlike persons engage only in spiritual activities and neglect material activities? No. Swanlike persons worship Krishna in the mood of one who is enjoyed, and they boldly take care of the external body. Eating, sleeping, enjoying, traveling, exercising, protecting society, protecting the body, riding in vehicles, engaging in industrial enterprises, and walking in the open air are seen in the lives of swanlike persons.”

(Sri Krishna-samhita by Srila Saccidananda Bhaktivinoda Thakura - Chapter 10/12)

(Vedanta sutra. 4.4.1-3) “(1) sampadyavir-bhavah svena sabdat

"Attaining, the appearance with one's own, from sound.”

Ramanuja's Sri Bhasya: "'This blessed soul, rising up from the [material] body and approaching the supreme light with his own form achieves [the Absolute].' (Chandogya Upanishad 8.12.2)”

Our comment: The soul's form, sat-cit-ananda-vigraha developed here, that form rises up.

Ramanuja continues: “Does the liberated soul achieve a body that is different from his self, just as the souls of demigods receive demigod bodies? Or is there the appearance of a svarupa, a constitutional form, which is derived from the very nature [of the soul]. Whether the soul, at liberation, achieves a thoroughly new spiritual body or simply manifests a spiritual form that the soul possessed all along.”

Answer: “He attains to a specific situation in the form of the appearance of the [soul's] svarupa, not in the form of [the soul] entering a bodily shape that did not exist before. How so? Because of the word svena, [in the sense of] svena rupena, 'by one's own form.' That is the meaning because of the use of the adjective (sva). Indeed, if we accept that [the spiritual body one acquires at liberation] is agantuka [extrinsic, added on, adventitious] and sadhya [to be gained, produced], then certainly the adjective svena [modifying] rupena would be meaningless ... Being liberated from the connection with karma and from the body, etc., created by it, [the liberated soul] is situated with a form that is of his own nature. Here is stated [from Chandogya Upanishad 8.12.2]:

‘With his own form, he attains the Absolute.’

There is cessation of the concealment of the svarupa, which, even though eternally present, was concealed by ignorance in the form of karma.

In his Vedanta-sara ("essence of Vedanta") he comments:

"It is said here that although the precise form of the soul's constitutional form was in fact (eva) previously (prag) known and existed in perfection (siddha) (siddhatve means "in the condition of existing fully or perfectly," or "in the condition of being known or understood,") still (at the time of liberation) there is the appearance of that constitutional form, in expanded form, of the qualities of knowledge, bliss, etc., which due to karma had been shrunk within the soul.

Sri Ramanujacarya in His Sri Bhasya 4.4.3 quotes Saunaka rsi in Visnudharma 4.55-57

“Just as the luster of a gem is not created by the washing off of the dirt, so the knowledge of the soul is not created by the removal of faults. Just as water is not created by the digging of a well, only what is already existent is brought to manifestation,— for how can there be the origination of what is non-existent,—so the attributes of knowledge and the rest are manifested, and not created, through the destruction of the evil qualities, for they belong to the soul eternally.”

Our comment:

The luster of the soul (sat-cit-ananda-vigraha, of its form of eternal knowledge and bliss) was shining, in the spiritual world. It is written here : ‘eternally manifest essential nature’ before bondage, and ‘The qualities of intelligence, bliss etc fully in perfection’. Then the qualities of the soul become shrunk within the soul. They manifest again, and then with that sat-cit-ananda-vigraha he goes back to Godhead. That means the soul's original position is in a shrunken or contracted state, and in bondage, in the material body (‘liberated from connection with karma and from the body’); it is not still shining in Goloka .

Upon delivering the King of the elephants from the clutches of the crocodile, and from material existence, which resembles a crocodile, the Lord awarded him the status of sarupya-

mukti. In the presence of the Gandharvas, the Siddhas and the other demigods, who were praising the Lord for His wonderful transcendental activities, the Lord, sitting on the back of His carrier, Garuda, returned to His all-wonderful abode and took Gajendra with Him. (SB 8.4.13)

Purport: muktir hitvanyatha rupam svarupena vyavasthitih. The word svarupa refers to sarupya-mukti—going back home, back to Godhead, and remaining the Lord's eternal associate, having regained a spiritual body exactly resembling that of the Lord, with four hands, holding the sankha, cakra, gada and padma.

Our comment: upon being delivered from the crocodile, the svarupa was given; this sat-cit-ananda-vigraha was on the back of Garuda, to go back to Godhead.

There is no amsa here

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana describes in his purport to Bhagavad-gita 18.14 quoting Prasna Upanisad Esa hi drastA srastA – he is the seer and doer; the soul here sees and acts.

This is on the verses of Bg 18.13-14 where Krishna says: “learn from Me the five causes of action.” This is about the jiva in this world. Sri Baladeva Vidyabhusana makes it clear that there is a jiva in this world and not only a consciousness. He comments:

"The jiva is the substratum of the body, senses and pranas which are supplied by the Lord, and which operate through powers bestowed by the Lord alone. Being the possessor of these bestowed powers, the jiva rules over his body and senses by his own desires alone, for accomplishing his actions. The Supreme Lord, situated within all the jivas, giving His permission for the jiva's action, sets the actions of the jiva in motion."

Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana's purva-paksa, opponent, says:

"But then at least the liberated jiva should not be the agent, because he no longer has a body, senses and pranas." (This is about the soul in the spiritual world)

Baladeva answers: "No, that is not so, because the liberated souls have spiritual senses and body, by which to accomplish their (spiritual) desires."

Thus, there is a soul here, and it became liberated; it has gone from the material to the spiritual world.

Nimbarka in his Vedanta-parijata-saurabha, 4.4.1 writes: “after leaving the material body, the soul in the spiritual world manifests its own natural form”. To prove he quotes Chandogya upanisad 8.12.3: “The soul is completed in or restored to his own form”. Then in his comment on Vedanta sutra 4.4.2 he writes:

“One's natural form is ever present. The soul is not completed in another adventitious form.”

On Vedanta sutra 4.4.4 he comments:

“Through the influence of nescience the individual soul comes to have a perverted notion about itself.”

This means in the material-spiritualized– body, the soul develops its original form, which becomes visible in full when it returns to the spiritual world.

“Comes to have” means the soul didn’t have the influence of nescience. It had its natural eternal form, this becomes veiled, overpowered, covered. The soul got, “came to have,” the tama, raja, sattva guna’s of maya.

Srinivasa ends: “By the repeated practice of hearing, thinking, meditating etc. all the obstacles to real knowledge are destroyed.”

He is all the time talking of a soul here in a material body

Comments on Bhagavad-gita 5.15-16.

nadatte kasyacit papam / na caiva sukrtam vibhuh
ajnanenavrtam jnanam / tena muhyanti jantavah
jnanena tu tad ajnanam / yesam nasitam atmanah
tesam aditya-vaj jnanam / prakasayati tat param

“Nor does the Supreme Lord assume anyone's sinful or pious activities. Embodied beings, however, are bewildered because of the ignorance which covers their real knowledge. When, however, one is enlightened with the knowledge by which nescience is destroyed, then his knowledge reveals everything, as the sun lights up everything in the daytime.”

Sri Ramanuja's commentary: "The atma is transcendental to material nature...How then is it that the atma is thus shrouded by this vasana. Lord Krishna reveals that it is because of ignorance. It is ignorance which shrouds and obscures spiritual knowledge. Ignorance and nescience is that which is opposed to spiritual knowledge and wisdom. By the shrouding of ignorance ...the consciousness of the atma becomes obscured and the intelligence compromised, allowing the living entity to enter the perilous predicament of believing they are the enjoyer..

Although the intelligence may be shrouded by the veil of ignorance still it has been seen that there are those whose consciousness becomes awakened upon receiving Vedic knowledge."

He speaks about the soul stationed here in the material world. “blooped,” as Srila Prabhupada would say. “Bloop” was the sound of the soul falling back into the material pool.

Oxford dictionary states “fall: come or go down from force of weight, loss of balance, descend or drop. Loose one’s position, office or power, sin, do wrong. Example: Eve tempted Adam and he fell.”

“Fall away: desert or leave, disappear, vanish, fall for, be attracted to, fall in love with, allow oneself to be persuaded by, esp. unwisely fall into, be trapped by.”

“Fall (noun) decrease in value, quantity, intensity, loss of innocence or state of goodness.”

Also scripture teaches there is a soul in this body:

Quotes:

isvarah sarva-bhutanam
hrd-dese arjuna tisthati
bhramayan sarva-bhutani
yantrarudhani mayaya

"The Supreme Lord is situated in everyone's heart, O Arjuna, and is directing the wandering of all living entities, who are seated as on a machine, made of the material energy." BG 18.61

dva suparna sayuja sakhaya
samanam vriksham praishasvajate
tayor anyah pippalam svadv atty
anashnann anyo 'bhicakashiti

"The individual spirit soul and the Supersoul, the Supreme Personality of Godhead, are like two friendly birds sitting on the same tree. One of the birds (the individual atomic soul) is eating the fruit of the tree (the sense gratification afforded by the material body), and the other bird (the Supersoul) is not trying to eat these fruits, but is simply watching His friend. (Svetasvatara Upanishad 4.6-7)

Thus the fallen soul is *in* the material body, not in the spiritual world

"O son of Bharata, as the sun alone illuminates all this universe, so does the living entity, one within the body, illuminate the entire body by consciousness." (Bg 13.34)

(Srla Bhaktivinoda Thakura, Prema Pradipa p.96) "Cit is said to be pure atma; it does not mean this (material) form. In other words, the original form of pure atma is a body made of cit. It is a constitutional structure called cit. It is eternally manifested by the acintya-sakti. It is in this substance that the places, the bodies, and other instruments become manifest in their eternal form in Vaikuntha. Atma is an element situated in Vaikuntha. The original cit body comes to the material world. Cit makes the substances named material elements reflect."

"The liberated state is our original constitution as consciousness (cit), while the conditioned state is a reflex of consciousness, which appears as conscious and non-conscious, a form of mixed matter and spirit. In the liberated state we (naturally) enjoy the rasas of Vaikuntha, while in the conditioned state we have to search for rasa. That means, we have to look for enjoyable rasas like those (but which are perverted in this world)." Another translation is: "The individual soul naturally resides in Vaikuntha. If he somehow comes to the material world, the individual soul brings with him his spiritual form made of chit. Pervertedly reflected in the material world those things of chit are called by name 'matter'.... the soul loses (the memory) of the original form (or rasa) (he had) in the Vaikuntha world."

To summarize this quote:

In the liberated state as atma in vaikuntha, we enjoyed the rasas of Vaikuntha. The original form of pure atma is a soul-body made of cit. This is our original constitution as soul-consciousness (cit). Then we come to the material world.

The soul, sat-cit-ananda-vigraha, left Vaikuntha. Nothing of the soul is there anymore, only a memory.

The soul "comes to the material world and brings with him his spiritual form made of cit."

He doesn't leave it in the spiritual world. The soul brought it here.

The souls had a spiritual form in the spiritual world. That form became shrunk or contracted. Therefore, it has to become revived or reanimated from the conditioned diseased state. If the spiritual body is already and still in its complete glorious form in Vaikuntha then it doesn't have to become revived. In Vaikuntha all the bodies are perfect. Thus our form is not in Vaikuntha. It is here and it has to become restored by the process of Krishna-consciousness.

”Jiva is a spiritual atomic part of Krishna. When he forgets his service of Govinda he is at once deflected by the attracting power of Maya in this world, who throws him into the whirlpool of mundane fruitive activity (karma) by confining him in a gross body resembling the garb of a prisoner. ..On getting rid of the subtle body, he bathes in the viraja and goes up to Hari-dhama.” (Brahma-samhita 5.44 purport)

“Krishna comes down and instructs us, "But why you are engaged in this foolish activity? Please come to Me, back to home, back to Godhead...So originally the spirit soul has got body, so these physical elements are just like a covering, exactly to the size of the hands, legs, everything...The future is to go back to home, back to Godhead.” (Srla Prabhupada philosophical discussions on Bergson)

Comment: The soul got its prison suit in this cosmic prison, according to its original form. Know that all spiritual forms are fully complete with all the karmendriyas, jnanendriyas, with spiritual mind and intelligence. That sat-cit-ananda-vigraha fell here, got contracted and has to be revived, then that soul and form can go back to the free world, back home to Godhead:

“Devotee: Srla Prabhupada, in our fully developed state in the spiritual sky, are we still one ten-thousandth the size of a tip of a hair like we are now in conditioned state?

Prabhupada: Your real dimension is mentioned there that you are a spiritual atom. The measurement is one ten-thousandth part of the tip of the hair. That is the seed, or basic principle. Now, on that small particle of spirit soul we have developed this body. We have got human bodies, other has got the elephant body, other has got the mountainous body, but this is external. The real seed is that one ten-thousandth part of the hair. Similarly, as you have developed this material body under different consciousness, similarly when we give up the material connection we shall develop our spiritual body, and in that spiritual body we shall be able to enter the kingdom of God, back to home, back to Godhead. .. "He comes to Me" means just like in your country one who comes to you becomes citizen. He must have some particular qualities or conditions fulfilled, then he will be accepted as citizen or immigrant. Similarly, if we want to go back to home, back to Godhead, then we must develop our dormant spiritual qualities. (Interview—July 5, 1972, New York)

Same in:

“Devotee (1): Will we ever get our memory functioning properly again?

Prabhupada: Yes. When the anartha, unwanted bodies, body’s covering of the spiritual body. We have got this spiritual body. When you get your spiritual body, then the natural memory is liberated. Everything is there. It is the diseased condition, anartha. In diseased condition... Just like in high fever one does not act memory...When you condition this material body, you have forgotten.

Devotee (1): Does the spiritual body grow gradually, Srla Prabhupada?

Prabhupada: It is already there; it is covered... It is there. Unless it is there, how we are moving? This is a fact—open secret. As soon as the spiritual body goes, this body has no value. Just like my..., this coat. If the coat is out of my body, then it has no value, although the coat has hands and body; it looks like another body. Similarly, the real body is supported by the spiritual body. That is already there. Otherwise how this body is moving? It is common sense only. Just like this coat is moving because it is on my real body, so far we have got. Similarly this real body, this is also another dress. This is also moving because there is spiritual body... This form out of this body cannot move. You hang it on the hanger, it will remain there for millions of years. But so long as this body... Because at the end it has got hand, it has got body. Similarly, because the spiritual body is there, this material body appears to be moving.... Devotee (2): Your Divine Grace, I understand that the spirit soul is

one ten-thousandth the size of the tip of the hair, and in the spiritual world, is the size the same size?

Prabhupada: No. When you get your spiritual body, you can enhance your body as you like. [laughter] Just like Krishna can enhance the body—Varaha murti—which can lift this Earth on the tusk of the [indistinct]. First of all, the Varaha murti came like a small germ from the nostril of Brahma. And the Brahma says, “What is this?” [laughter] And then became proof: “verrrhhh” [laughter]. So big that it covered the sky! Similarly, spiritual body means all freedom. You can increase; you can decrease. You can go anywhere; you can do whatever you like. That is spiritual body. (Arrival Address, Delhi, November 11, 1973)

You are liberated

“Cit in purity” is stainless. (Vasistha Muni teaches)

This Srila Prabhupada quotes often from the Vedas: Brihad aranyaka upanisad 4.3.15 asango hy ayam purusa the text in full is:

sa va esa etasmin samprasade ratva caritva drstvaiva punyam ca papam ca, / punah pratinayam pratiyony adravati svapnayaiva; sa yat tatra kim cit / pasyati ananvagatas tena bhavati; asango hy ayam purusa iti. evam evaitat, / yajnavalkya. so'ham bhagavate sahasram dadami, ata urdhvam vimoksayaiva bruhiti.

The gist of this sloka is that “whatever the soul sees in dream, deep sleep or awakening, he is not followed or affected by it for this person is not attached to anything.” But the soul is *in* matter dreaming, sleeping or awakened.

Srila Prabhupada explains this asango hy ayam purusa in various places: I am packed up with all these twenty-four elements?” Just like we are covering because it is cold, but actually as spirit soul, I am not affected. Asango hy ayam purusha. In the Vedas it is said that the soul is unaffected with this material condition. I have several times given this example, that a person has got a good car, and it is somehow or another broken, and he becomes upset, because his car. Although he knows that “I am not this car,” but his thoughts being absorbed by the attraction of the car, when the car is broken somehow or other he becomes almost unconscious. So this is due to our attachment... Therefore Krishna advises, matra-sparsas tu kaunteya. These pains and pleasure is due to this material skin and bone; it is not real. But because you are attached to the skin and bone, therefore you feel sometimes pain and pleasure. But that will not endure. Better tolerate it. (Srimad-Bhagavatam 7.6.8, Vrindavana, December 10, 1975)

Comment: The soul is here in the material world, packed up within twenty-four elements, within this material bag of skin and bone.

“Since the identity of the living entity is very minute, he is prone to be subjected to material nature, but when he is freed from this material body, which is false, he attains the same, spiritual nature as the Supreme Lord. At that time there is no qualitative difference between him and the Supreme Lord, but because he is not so quantitatively powerful as to never be put under the influence of material nature, he is quantitatively different from the Lord.

The entire process of devotional service is to purify oneself of this contamination of material nature and put oneself on the spiritual platform, where he is qualitatively one with the Supreme Personality of Godhead. In the Vedas it is said that the living entity is always free. Asango hy ayam purushah. The living entity is liberated. His material contamination is

temporary, and his actual position is that he is liberated. This liberation is achieved by Krishna consciousness, which begins from the point of surrender. Therefore it is said here, "I offer my respectful obeisances unto the Supreme Person." (SB 3.31.14 p)

Comment: The soul is in the material body, subjected to material nature, but is *constitutionally* pure:

"The living entity is constitutionally pure. Asango hy ayam purushah. In the Vedic literature it is said that the soul is always pure and uncontaminated by material attachment. The identification of the body with the soul is due to misunderstanding. As soon as one is fully Krishna conscious it is to be understood that one is in his pure, original constitutional position. This state of existence is called suddha-sattva" (SB 4.3.23 p)

"...The living entity lying down within the body is disturbed by many tribulations pertaining to providence, to other living entities and to his own body and mind. Despite all kinds of tribulations, the living entity, subjected to the necessities of the body, mind and senses and suffering from various types of disease, is carried away by many plans due to his lust to enjoy the world. Although transcendental to this material existence, the living entity, out of ignorance, accepts all these material miseries under the pretext of false egoism ("I" and "mine"). In this way he lives for a hundred years within this body.

Purport: In the Vedas it is stated: asango hy ayam purushah. The living entity is actually separate from material existence, for the soul is not material.... the internal or superior energy comes in contact with the external energy... because of the material body, the living entity is subjected to many tribulations, brought about by air, water, fire, extreme heat, extreme cold, sunshine, excessive eating, unhealthy food, maladjustments of the three elements of the body (kapha, pitta and vayu).. The living entity, however, is different from all these material elements.... get out of the material clutches and return home, back to Godhead. Actually the living entity is not at all happy in this material body. Because of the body, he suffers... Manifold miseries encircle the transcendental living entity simply because he desires to satisfy his senses in this material world... after giving up the body, will return home, back to Godhead." (SB 4.29.23, SB 4.29.24, SB 4.29.25 SB 4.29.23-25)

Comment: the transcendental soul is lying within the body (kunape tri dhatuke) for a 100 years.

"In the Vedas it is said: asango hy ayam purushah. The living entity is not really connected with this material world, but due to his tendency to enjoy the material senses he is put into the material condition." (SB 5.5.4 p)

Comment: the soul is not in Goloka, but not really here, but here; (acintya)bhedabheda at all levels. This dreamvada forgets; the material existence is a dream, in one sense, but not a dream also. We are in Vaikuntha but in the prison of Vaikuntha, the secondary kingdom of Vaikunthanatha. Vaikunthanatha's and our home is at another location, in the paravyoma– or Maha-Vaikuntha.

"The soul the body covers is different from the bodily construction; therefore anything favorable or mischievous done to the body does not affect the spirit soul. The Vedic injunction is asango hy ayam purushah: the spirit soul is always unaffected by material arrangements." (SB 5.10.6 p)

"Lord Brahma, who is carried by a swan airplane, at first could not see where Hiranyakasipu was, for Hiranyakasipu's body was covered by an anthill and by grass and bamboo sticks.

Because Hiranyakasipu had been there for a long time, the ants had devoured his skin, fat, flesh and blood. Then Lord Brahma and the demigods spotted him, resembling a cloud-covered sun, heating all the world by his austerity. Struck with wonder, Lord Brahma began to smile and then addressed him as follows.

Purport: The living entity can live merely by his own power, without the help of skin, marrow, bone, blood and so on, because it is said, *asango hy ayam purushah*—the living entity has nothing to do with the material covering.” (SB 7.3.15, SB 7.3.16, SB 7.3.15-16)

Our comment: The irony is that Jaya and Vijaya had as one *amsa* this Hiranyakasipu. Thus this is very similar to what dream-*vada* thinks happens as the fall of the soul from the spiritual heaven.

Srila Visvanatha Cakravarti Thakura states in his Darsini commentary on SB 3.16.29 and SB 8.21.16-17 that they had spiritual bodies, *amsas*, expansions in the pastimes of the Lord in the material world:

“The expansions of Jaya and Vijaya fell in to the material world...the original forms remained in Vaikuntha. Their expansions playing the roles of demons stayed in the material world until Krishna liberated them.”

”When the 4 Kumaras cursed Jaya and Vijaya, these doorkeepers wept and wailed. The Lord spoke, His heart softened by compassion: “do not fear. May you two have good fortune. Do not go there. Always remain serving me in Vaikuntha.”

“As Garuda sacrificed an expansion of his wing to maintain the inevitability of the thunderbolt’s power you should take on the role of demons in one of your expansions and at the same time remain in Vaikuntha in your *svarupa*.”

They could expand an *amsa* because they were liberated souls. But internally they were always aware that all this was a drama, *lila* for the pleasure of the Lord. We are different. If we can expand an *amsa*, then if our *amsa* is envious of Krishna, then the original is also to be like that.

“*Asango hy ayam purushah*.. The individual exists in darkness when he thinks that he is the material body and that everything in relationship with the material body belongs to him. This is called *aham mama* (*janasya moho 'yam aham mameti* [SB 5.5.8]). This is illusion. One must give up his illusory conception and thus become fully aware of everything.”(SB 7.7.19, SB 7.7.20, SB 7.7.19-20 p)

“The living entity is not subject to any material reactions. He can neither be burnt by fire, cut by sharp weapons, moistened by water, nor dried by the air. He is completely different from the physical elements, but by a superior arrangement he is put into these material elements. He is always aloof from material contact (*asango hy ayam purushah*) but because he is placed in a material condition, he suffers the reactions of the material modes of nature.

*purushah prakriti-stho hi
bhunkte prakritijan gunan
karanam guna-sango 'sya
sad-asad-yoni-janmasu*

"The living entity in material nature thus follows the ways of life, enjoying the three modes of nature. This is due to his association with that material nature. Thus he meets with good and evil amongst various species." (Bg. 13.22) Although the living entity is aloof from the material elements, he is put into material conditions, and thus he must suffer the reactions of material activities." (SB 8.17.23 p)

"The body [the total body and the individual body are of the same composition] may figuratively be called "the original tree." From this tree, which fully depends on the ground of material nature, come two kinds of fruit—the enjoyment of happiness and the suffering of distress. The cause of the tree, forming its three roots, is association with the three modes of material nature—goodness, passion and ignorance. The fruits of bodily happiness have four tastes—religiosity, economic development, sense gratification and liberation—which are experienced through five senses for acquiring knowledge in the midst of six circumstances: lamentation, illusion, old age, death, hunger and thirst. The seven layers of bark covering the tree are skin, blood, muscle, fat, bone, marrow and semen, and the eight branches of the tree are the five gross and three subtle elements—earth, water, fire, air, ether, mind, intelligence and false ego. The tree of the body has nine hollows—the eyes, the ears, the nostrils, the mouth, the rectum and the genitals—and ten leaves, the ten airs passing through the body. In this tree of the body there are two birds: one is the individual soul, and the other is the Supersoul.

Purport: ...the entire cosmic manifestation is a combination of two of Krishna's energies—the superior energy and the inferior energy. The living entities are the superior energy, and the inanimate material elements are His inferior energy... the living entity is completely separate from the material bodily structure. In Bhagavad-gita (7.5) the Lord says:

apareyam itas tv anyam
prakritim viddhi me param
jiva-bhutam maha-baho
yayedam dharyate jagat

"Besides this inferior nature, O mighty-armed Arjuna, there is a superior energy of Mine, which consists of all the living entities who are struggling with material nature and are sustaining the universe." Although the material elements emanate from the Supreme Personality of Godhead, Krishna, they are separated elements and are sustained by the living elements.... In the tree of the body there are two birds, or two living elements... Bhagavad-gita (13.3), the Lord says, kshetra-jnam capi mam viddhi sarva-kshetreshu bharata: "O scion of Bharata, you should understand that I am also the knower in all bodies." The kshetra jna, the owner of the body, is also called the khaga, the living entity. Within the body there are two such kshetra jnas—the individual soul and the Supersoul. The individual soul is the owner of his individual body, but the Supersoul is present within the bodies of all living entities... The living entity lives close to matter, but this does not mean that he merges or mixes with it (asango hy ayam purushah).. The Supersoul is present in every body (isvarah sarva-bhutanam hrid-dese 'rjuna tishthati [Bg. 18.61]), whereas the individual soul is situated only in his own body (dehi) and is transmigrating from one body to another. (SB 10.2.27)

Comment: 'completely separate' but 'in' the body. Again, the ABCD is stated, the ABCD, which dreamvada jumps over.

“As stated in the Vedas, asango hy ayam purushah: the spirit soul has no connection with the changes of the material body. The body undergoes six changes—birth, growth, sustenance, by-products, dwindling and then annihilation—but the soul undergoes no such changes... The living entity enjoys the material body, which appears and disappears.. As already discussed, the body is made according to the desires of the soul. The soul desires, and thus the body is formed. Krishna therefore says in Bhagavad-gita (18.61):

isvarah sarva-bhutanam
hrid-dese 'rjuna tishthati
bhramayan sarva-bhutani
yantrarudhani mayaya

"The Supreme Lord is situated in everyone's heart, O Arjuna, and is directing the wanderings of all living entities, who are seated as on a machine, made of the material energy." Neither the Supersoul, Paramatma, nor the individual soul changes its original, spiritual identity. The atma does not undergo birth, death or changes like the body. Therefore a Vedic aphorism says, asango hy ayam purushah: although the soul is conditioned within this material world, he has no connections with the changes of the material body. (SB 10.4.19 p)

““In the material condition, the living entity is sometimes raised to higher planetary systems and material prosperity and sometimes drowned in a hellish situation. His state is exactly like that of a criminal whom a king punishes by submerging him in water and then raising him again from the water.

Purport: In the Brihad-aranyaka Upanishad (4.3.16) it is stated, asango hy ayam purushah: the living entity is always free from the contamination of the material world. (CC.Madhya 20.118)

“I am thinking that "I am American," "I am Indian," or "I am this," "I am that." "I have to work, I have got business." So many you have created. But, our process is, our process is to cleanse the heart. That you are nothing of this, you are simply eternal servant of Krishna. You engage yourself as eternal servant of Krishna and become happy. Ceto-darpana-marjanam bhava-maha-davagni-nirvapanam [Cc. Antya 20.12]. Because we are ignorant of our constitutional position we have created all these problems.

Actually there is no problem. Exactly the same example, just like at night in dream we create so many problems, but actually there is no problem. But dreaming, that I am in such and such position, I am being harassed, somebody is taking my money, somebody is pinching me, so many things. I am in the front of tiger, there is ghost, there is so many things. So these problems, actually there is no problem, but by dreaming he is creating, mental. Asango hy ayam purushah, Veda says that this purusha, the atma, the soul has no connection with all these things. So we have created, by material concoction, so many problems. So the whole process is how to cleanse this dreaming condition of life.” (Sri Brahma-samhita, Verse 35, New York, July 31, 1971)

Comment: “Just like..”, there is analogy, but "I am this," "I am that." "I have to..”, is actually going on, and “I” the soul is ‘really’ within it.

Same in:

“the soul, as he is, he's pure. Asango hy ayam purushah. The spirit soul is not contaminated or does not associate with the material modes of nature. It is simply an illusion, misidentification. Just like water and oil does not mix, but it appears that oil is fallen in the water, similarly, although we are in this material world, in the material consciousness, our

identity is not actually in material consciousness. It is simply... Just like dreaming. The example is dreaming. Just like in dream I see so many hallucinations. Actually, dream is false. I am separate from the dream. But while dreaming, I think I am actually enjoying or suffering. Similarly, by the association of the modes of material nature, we are thinking like that. Otherwise, we are free from the contamination of the material nature.” (The Nectar of Devotion, Vrindavana, November 8, 1972).

This ‘asango’ means that the living entity is not connected with matter. As a diamond can be covered over by mud but is not actually stained, so similarly the svarupa of the soul is covered over, and contracted even, but not lost by being under the mud of maya.

This asango purusa gets repeatedly associated with different types of antah karana, the four inner faculties – citta, ahankara, buddhi, manah - and various gross bodies. The subtle body, antah karana, is the same, during one maha-kalpa, lifetime of Lord Brahma, but its content changes; the soul has various types of thinking, feeling, willing. There is no description that this means that the asango hy ayam purusa is still in Goloka.

You are liberated. Simply just a cloud has covered you. Drive away the cloud. There is no question that you were ever. You are ever-liberated.

The context of the quote from the CC Adi 7.108 lecture 18-2-67 makes it clear that Srila Prabhupada is not speaking of “part of us in a liberated state on some plane of existence.” He speaks of and to the soul here and now, who is temporarily in maya.

Bhaktijana: Has my soul ever been liberated? If I was once liberated...

Prabhupada: You are liberated. You are liberated. Simply just a cloud has covered you. Drive away the cloud. There is no question that you were ever. ...You are ever-liberated. The sky is always spiritual, but it is sometimes overcrowded with a cloud, this maya. This is called maya. Actually, you are not conditioned. You are thinking. Just like in the dream you are thinking that a tiger is eating you. You were never eaten by a tiger. There is no tiger. So we have to get out of this dream. Don't you sometimes dream that a tiger is eating you? Is there any tiger? You are simply thinking. So if you keep in Krishna consciousness, that nonsense thinking will go away. Therefore we have to keep ourself always in ‘Krishna-thinking’ so that this dream will never come. If you are always awakened, then dream never comes. So keep yourself always awakened by Krishna consciousness.”

The previous 15 questions, before this question, were on the soul falling from the spiritual world due to independence, Srila Prabhupada has explained, just as students come to his ISKCON and go away.

He has also just answered that the brahmajyoti is in the spiritual sky and here also. Just like the sunshine, when there is cloud in the sky, is under in and above the clouds.

Brahmajyoti means cit-kana, souls. These souls are Krishna’s and Visnu’s effulgence. I.o.w there are souls here, not just amsas.

Then Srila Prabhupada says: “a cloud has covered you...sometimes (you are) overcrowded with a cloud. This is maya. Keep in Krishna consciousness, that nonsense thinking will go away.”

Before this answer he has already explained that “The population of the prison house is nothing in comparison to the whole population. .. Vasudeva datta speaking to Lord Caitanya: ”You have come to deliver all the fallen souls. You please take all the conditioned souls of this universe, and if You think they are not competent, they are sinful, You can give me all the sin to me. Caitanya says: “ Even this universe is delivered fully, there is a big bag of

mustard seeds. It is only one grain." There are so many conditioned souls, and these conditioned souls are only insignificant in comparison to the liberated souls. Just imagine what is the quantity of liberated souls." Srila Prabhupada explains that some souls actually leave the spiritual world; there are less souls there, and now a few are here in the cosmic prison-house of Durga.

Then it is said that "if the soul gets out of the material world and he goes to Krishnaloka, there is possibility to again come here, but he does not come. Just like after putting your hand in the fire, you never put it again if you are really intelligent. So those who are going back to Godhead, they become intelligent."

The soul came from, moved out of, Krishna loka to here, and then 'goes back to Godhead', Krishna's planet. If the soul is already in Krishna loka, this 'going back' is not to be said.

Srila Prabhupada's lecture on SB 2.9.1.

Srila Visvanatha Thakura comments on this verse SB 2.9.1:

"Verse 2.8.7 asked whether the jiva's relation to the body is with or without cause. This verse answers. A relationship of the jiva with the body and senses (artha) does not actually occur (through the beginningless avidya-sakti (maya) of the Lord (atma)), just as there is no relation of the dreamer with his dream body (except through ignorance), because the jiva is superior (parasya) to the body, being composed of knowledge (anubhavatmanah). The relationship occurs by the inconceivable energy of the Lord which is expert at doing the impossible."

In other words, as a man has connection with the dream objects, and both are at the same place, so the soul, transcending all material coverings, is in this world, has a connection with the phenomena of this world, but through the Lord's maya. Thus, no connection, in one sense, asango'hy ayam purusa, but the connection takes place, but it is asat, temporary.

In Srila Prabhupada's lecture he also says "many people inquire how the living entity who was with Krishna became fallen down in contact with this material qualities."

So the jiva "was" with Krishna not that he is still with Krishna and is also fallen away. The jiva became fallen down. The soul is not any more in Goloka.

Then, Srila Prabhupada says "It is simply the influence of the material energy actually he is not fallen." This means asango'hy ayam purusa.

Srila Prabhupada uses this sloka 27 times according to the Vedabase. It means the soul is like a diamond in the mud, inherently or intrinsically not muddied. It is covered over.

Govinda bhasya of Srila Baladeva Vidyabhusana quotes in 2.3.26 Saunaka rsi from the Puranas.

yatha na kriyate jyotsna mala-praksalanan

maneh dosa-prahanan na jnanam atmanah kriyate tatha

"As by washing away the dirt that covered a jewel, the jewel's splendor is not created but merely uncovered, so by removing the dirt of materialism that covered the soul, the soul's splendor is not created, but merely uncovered.

yathodapana-khananat kriyate na jalantaram

sad eva niyate vyaktim asatah sambhavah kutah

"As by digging a well, water is brought forth but not created, so by spiritual activities the nature of the soul is brought forth but not created. How would it be possible to create the soul and the soul's qualities from nothing?"

tatha heya-guna-dhvamsad avarodhadayo
gunah prakasyante na janyante nitya evatmano hi te

"When material faults are destroyed, the soul's qualities become revealed. The soul's qualities are eternal. They are never created."

In other words the soul is covered over. There is no material energy in the spiritual world, so the soul who fell and is covered, is here in the material world.

Then Srila Prabhupada speaks how the moon covered with scattered clouds seems to move. Srila Prabhupada doesn't specify (anywhere) that he means the double or more soul or expansion construction. No sastra or mukta teaches: "you are not actually fallen. You are still in the rasa-lila in Krishna-loka. But also in all these human animal and plant species. Please descend and free yourself. Actually, I will give you also a list of my amsas who got fallen in different lower modes of nature species. Please expand some amsas there for them also. Please relieve me of some duties to my many selves who are bewildered and ignorant and distribute books and preach to my many selves or myself.

What you say?

You don't have the kamarupa siddhi yet because you are only on the bhakta program? Then tell yourself in Goloka to expand. Why tell him, it is you. What you say: "You don't know yourself there and don't know how to reach yourself." "You are in maya." (End of the story.)

This dream expansions theory means some kind of schizophrenia, or a multisyncretic personality disorder impossible in a liberated jiva.

Then Srila Prabhupada says: "Because he is a spiritual spark of the supreme it has not fallen. But he is thinking 'I am fallen, I am material, I am this body.'" This means that the body has no connection with the soul, just as the moon is far away from the cloud.

Note that the soul is here and thinking I am this body. But constitutionally he has nothing to do with matter. Srila Prabhupada doesn't say he is up, not fallen and down fallen. He says that the soul is fallen here but actually not part of the material world, not in the fallen world. "In this world but not of this world."

Srila Prabhupada doesn't specify that there is a moon above the clouds and another moon down, or one moon above the clouds and another far above the clouds.

He says that by the maneuvering of the illusory energy we, souls, think we are of this material world. This is because of the modes of nature. But we are from beyond matter. These modes don't work on the soul in Goloka.

Srila Prabhupada next compares the relationship of the soul with the material world to a dreamer and his dream of e.g. a tiger attacking.

Again he doesn't say there is a soul in the spiritual world and a soul or something subconscious in the material world. He could have easily revealed it here fully, "There are two you's or souls. One is in maya and the other is awake, always in the spiritual world, you are one." Or, "Actually nothing is going on here in Tokyo; we are in a literal asat or non-

existence, you are all liberated, no more sadhana". Srila Prahupada is always very precise, clear and frank. And he will repeat it from all angles, many many many times.

Then he says: "Actually the dreamer has no contact with the tiger."

In one sense, but there is contact, also. The (original) soul is in the dream. So the soul is in matter really, but temporarily:

"A person in a dream, is fearful of a tiger in the dream, but another man who is awake by his side sees no tiger there. The tiger is a myth for both of them namely the person dreaming and the person awake, because actually there is no tiger: but the man forgetful of his awakened life is fearful, whereas the man who has not forgotten his position is not at all fearful of the so-called tiger." (Bg. 2.20 p)

"When you sleep at night, then you dream, means subtle body. So these activities of this gross body stop. You again work in the subtle body. You dream that you have gone to somewhere or in the forest or somewhere, somewhere, somewhere. But you forget that "My real body is lying in this bed." You do not remember. This is practical. So I change this, myself. I am soul. I change from this gross body lying on bed in a very nice apartment, skyscraper building, but I have gone to the forest, and I am affronting a big tiger and I'm crying. In this bed I am crying. The friends say, "Why you are crying?" "Tiger, tiger, tiger." Where is tiger? This is called subtle body. So you are changing daily at night from this gross body to the subtle body. And again the dream is over, from the subtle body, again to the gross body. Every one of us has got this experience." (Bg. Lecture 3.27 / 7.27.1974)

In the same lecture he states: "So we have got almighty father and leaving His place, I have come to this material world."

Just before this analogy of the nightmare, Srila Prabhupada says: "By forgetting God you are in this material world and in this material world you are changing from one body to another. That you can experience practically daily. When you sleep at night you dream means subtle body...changed from the gross body...then immediately after this analogy he says "Therefore I am the enjoyer. I am changing simply body...why you are placed here. Because I wanted to enjoy life like that...forgetting our father, God we are criminal within this material world. Therefore our only business is to get out of this prison house and go back to home, back to Godhead...liberated from changing one body to another...go back to your father...if you persist "I must go and enjoy independently," God says "All right you go" and you come and enjoy beginning from Lord Brahma down to the worm in the stool."

Srila Prabhupada doesn't say something like "but actually one part of you stays, although you want to go, you don't go, only a part of you goes. Although you wanted to go to enjoy, You are not allowed but must stay to serve what you don't want."

In the beginning of the lecture Srila Prabhupada says: "we don't belong to the material world just like a person in the prison house is a citizen but when he goes to the prison house he gets a different dress."

Again, we are criminals. How we can still stay in the spiritual world, even partially.

So, to summarize, he is saying, (in this SB 2.9.1 lecture) we are spirit soul, we have to wake up now to our real identity. Stop identifying with all the material temporary illusions. You are a spirit soul. You can ascend to a spiritual life right now. You are not fallen; you are not part of the material energy. Chant Hare Krishna and keep chanting and you'll never dream off anymore.

Then Srila Prabhupada says “We are not fallen but Krishna has given us a situation. Because we wanted to imitate Krishna.” We are not fallen because we are spiritual souls. We are not material fallen energy. We are here only a split second of eternity. So we have left Him and became covered over. He doesn’t say that “you are still in Goloka.” He stresses or inspires to wake up to your real nature. You are spirit soul, right now you can start Krishna consciousness again.

He continues: “Because actually we are not fallen at any moment we can revive our Krishna consciousness.” If we were not actually fallen why should we revive our Krishna consciousness?

He doesn’t say: “join yourself who is already liberated. You fallen one, join yourself who is already in Krishna loka.” Srila Prabhupada confirms this: “We can break this material connection at any moment.” I.o.w. we are connected to maya.

Then the purport to SB 2.9.1 is read: “The child cries to have the moon and the mother gives a mirror so the child has a shadow or reflection of the moon.”

There are no two moons and similarly there is only one soul. Nor are we shadows or reflections literary; we experience we are soul here, now.

This is an analogy which is not explained as “you are free. And half of yourself is bound. Please save half of yourself. Descend and preach to yourself. You don’t know it is also you, although it is you and you are one.”

Next we read in the purport:

“The living entity’s first sinful will is to become the Lord. The consequent will of the Lord is that the living entity forgets his actual life and thus dreams of the land of Utopia where he becomes one like the Lord.”

It is not said here: “There was only a part of you sinful. That Krishna kicked out of the spiritual world. Your expansion forgot his actual life. But you are ok. Only your other self or you parted. But because you are one, all is ok. Still, although the expansion is the same soul but.... he is in the land of utopia. Preach to him and became one again.”

Then Srila Prabhupada says: “the crying child of the Lord is given over to the shadow of the material world.” The soul is given/send to the material world. Not that the soul is also kept in Goloka. Because the soul desired to go, why he should be still in some form in Krishna-loka, against his first sinful will. “The soul, thus dreams of the land of Utopia where he may become one like the Lord.”

The soul wishes, daydreams, to go to the land where he can try to become God. He will never be enjoyer and controller.

He explains these points again in the questions and answers after the lecture.

He says: “you are fallen means you have some certain desires except service of Krishna...if you keep yourself tightly in Krishna’s service there is no question of falling down or maya.”

So the soul is actually here and fallen. But constitutionally not fallen. He says that you have to gradually rise to the non-fallen platform, not artificially. “Just like when you are feverish, actually you are healthy, but it has come.”

This is clear. The soul is not fallen because he is not part of the matter surrounding him. “That is external.”

He says then. “The feverish condition will not stay. You will come to the healthy stage.”

He is clearly saying: you are completely in the material world, as when you get sick; the disease is covering you, who are here, and sick. There is not a healthy you in another dimension or world. Similarly there is no non-fallen you in the spiritual world.

The analogy is explained in the same purport “the crying child of the Lord is given over to the reflection or shadow the material world, to lord it over as karmi...”

And “the dream is that the conditioned soul thinks of his material body as I and that everything in connection with the material body is mine, or falsely thinks that he is the Lord.”

Nothing is esoteric. Everything is defined clearly. Nothing is left to the imagination. The conditioned soul thinks of the material body as ‘I’, and thinks ‘mine’ of everything in relation with the body. Not that the soul is in Goloka and is dreaming this. The soul is given over to the reflection, the material world. He is put out, he is not anymore in Goloka because of his sinful will to become the Lord. How a sinful soul can be in Goloka.

One cannot argue that the soul is in Goloka and the sinful consciousness is in the material world.

Because Ramanuja’s Sri Bhasya 1.1.1 states:

“Consciousness is the attribute of a permanent conscious self...the character of consciousness is that it renders things capable of becoming objects to its own substrate...consciousness is an attribute belonging to a conscious self...that there exists a consciousness devoid of substrate we have already refuted on the ground that of a thing of this kind we have absolutely no knowledge.“

There cannot be a split in soul and consciousness. If the consciousness is sinful it is the soul who is sinful. A sinful soul cannot be in Goloka. The soul is thus “given over to the reflection, the material world.”

Chant

Hare Krishna, Hare Krishna, Krishna Krishna, Hare Hare
Hare Rama, Hare Rama, Rama Rama, Hare Hare,

and be back with Hare Krishna Rama.

“Guest: What is the meaning of this mantra, Hare Krishna?

Prabhupada: Hare means, "O, Hare, the energy of God," and Krishna, "O Krishna, God, kindly accept me again. I am fallen in this material world." (Room Conversation—February 21, 1975, Caracas)